

THE PROTECTION AND PROMOTION OF MUSICAL DIVERSITY

A study carried out for UNESCO *
by the International Music Council
Richard Letts, Principal Investigator
June 2006

* *This study is made available to the public with the prior agreement of UNESCO.*

CONTENTS

Preface	6
Introduction	8
The countries from which information was received	13
Executive summary	15
ADDRESSING THE TERMS OF REFERENCE	28
1. Musical diversity and human rights	29
1.1 International human and cultural rights conventions	29
1.2 From the consultants' reports	33
1.3 Freemuse: a watchful ear	42
2. Musical diversity and sustainable development	44
2.1 Music in development, development of music	44
2.1.1 The developed and developing worlds	45
2.1.2 Cultural development vs. industry assistance	46
2.1.3 Musical diversity and development	47
2.2 Music in development	47
2.2.1 Music as a source of funds for non-music development projects	48
2.2.2 Music as a tool of advocacy for development	48
2.2.3 Music as a lure to involve people in development programs	48
2.2.4 Music as an element in non-music development	49
2.3 Development of a music industry	51
2.3.1 Some research studies and theoretical papers	51
2.3.2 Development projects	55
2.3.2.1 The forms of development	55
2.3.2.2 Targets for support	58
2.4 The use of music to alleviate poverty or the conditions contributing to poverty	66
3. Musical diversity and peace	72
4. The standards regulating musical diversity	79
4.1 Possible forms of regulation impacting on musical diversity	80
4.2 Examples of the current application of regulations to affect musical diversity	82
4.2.1 Broadcast	83

4.2.2	New media and e-commerce	91
4.2.3	Education	93
4.2.4	Subsidies	98
4.2.5	Copyright	102
5.	Musical diversity and the imposition of a monoculture	109
5.1	Evidence from the consultants' reports	109
5.2	The UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions	111
6.	Musical diversity, the musicians, and identity	114
6.1	Actors for musical diversity per se	114
6.2	An aversion to musical diversity	119
6.3	Local musics	119
6.4	Transplanted traditions: the Jews, Roma, and migrants	129
6.5	Hybridity	130
6.6	Music and identity	135
6.7	Research	137
7.	Musical diversity: challenges and responses	139
7.1	Private sector and civil society	
7.1.1	The challenge of the loss, potential or completed, of traditional musics	140
7.1.1.1	The challenge to collect, catalogue and make easily accessible the traditional musics that are endangered.	140
7.1.1.2	The challenge to find a way to restore traditional musics to the daily life of at least some of the people.	141
7.1.2	The challenge more broadly to local musics and musical diversity	145
7.1.3	The challenge of the loss of local musics to the forces of globalisation	150
7.1.4	The challenge of building financially successful local music sectors	150
7.1.5	The challenge of reasserting the primary value of culture over commerce	154
7.1.6	The challenge of transmitting the musical cultures through programs outside of the formal education system	154
7.1.7	The challenge of creating in the private sector the broadest possible access to musical diversity	156
7.2	Government sector	

7.2.1	The challenge of government ignorance or indifference: where the development of music and musical diversity is not even on the agenda	158
7.2.2	The challenge to governments to formulate and enact legislation and policies that protect and promote musical diversity	158
7.2.3	The challenge of formulating, enacting and enforcing the copyright legislation and regulations that will be most beneficial to music and musical diversity in a given country	159
7.2.4	The challenge of the lack of provision of an effective, long-term, sequential, diverse music education	160
7.2.5	The challenge of providing the broadest possible public access to musical diversity, including access to local musics	162
7.2.6	The challenge of evaluation of the effectiveness of measures taken by governments in support of music and musical diversity	164
7.2.7	The challenge of mounting adequate research into the factual situation concerning musical diversity	164
7.3	International sphere	
7.3.1	The challenge of sustaining local musics in the face of the incursions of international free trade agreements	165
7.3.1.1	The possible responses to the threats to musical diversity from international trade agreements.	169
7.3.2	The challenge of the use of the <i>UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions</i> to repress rather than protect and promote musical diversity.	171
7.3.3	The challenge to encourage the free cross-border flow of musics from other countries and cultures	172
7.3.4	A brief proposal for a global agency for musical diversity	174
APPENDICES		176
Appendix 1	Terms of Reference	117
Appendix 2	Elaboration of the terms of reference	178
Appendix 3	Human cultural rights and freedoms	183
Appendix 4	Music in development, music development: a literature survey	191

PERSONNEL	
Appendix 5 Biographies of the Consultants	201
CONSULTANTS' REPORTS	207
Appendix 6 Arab world: Algeria (Athmane Tadjenant-Trottet)	208
Appendix 7 Arab world: Morocco (Hassan Mégri)	221
Appendix 8 Asia: China (Zhang Xian)	231
Appendix 9 Asia: Indonesia (Santosa Soewarlan)	239
Appendix 10 Asia: Singapore (Joyce Teo)	253
Appendix 11 Asia: Vietnam (To Ngoc Thanh)	261
Appendix 12 Australasia: Australia (Richard Letts)	275
Appendix 13 Australasia: New Zealand (Ingrid Kamstra)	293
Appendix 14 Europe (Polina Proutskova, Mirjam Gericke, Maurice Mengel, Deniza Popova)	308
Appendix 15 Latin America (Graciela Agudelo, Leticia Montaña, Gabriela Soto)	412
Appendix 16 Sub-Saharan Africa: Cameroon (Luc Yatchokeu)	438
Appendix 17 Sub-Saharan Africa: Congo (Brazzaville) (Gervais Hugues Ondaye)	442
Appendix 18 Sub-Saharan Africa: South Africa (Caroline Van Niekerk)	452

PREFACE

This study was instigated by Katérina Stenou of UNESCO and undertaken by the International Music Council. It addresses an issue of great concern to many in the music world and provides a most fortunate opportunity to explore the many challenges and opportunities for musical diversity.

To assist in achieving a global perspective on a global issue, the IMC engaged consultants from what we hope are sufficiently representative regions on the five continents. Most of our consultants are associated with the IMC and bring a strong knowledge of the situation in their respective music sectors.

Relative to the scope of the subject, time and resources were limited. Some procedures that might otherwise have been pursued were not possible – for instance there was not time or ability to cross-check sources to ensure factuality. More discussion between Principal Investigator and consultants would have been useful. But in any study there is the possibility for improvement. This study has its limitations but I believe that it stands nevertheless as a very useful document.

I wish to extend thanks to Katérina Stenou for her initiative in proposing the study and to the Executive Officer of the International Music Council, Silja Fischer, for her support and assistance.

In particular, I state my great appreciation to our consultants and informants, who in some cases produced wonderfully detailed and comprehensive reports despite the time and resource constraints. They are:

Arab world

Algeria	Athmane Tadjenant-Trottet
Morocco	Hassan Mégri

Asia

China	Zhang Xian
Indonesia	Santosa Soewarlan
Singapore	Joyce Teo
VietNam	To Ngoc Thanh

Australasia

Australia	Richard Letts
New Zealand	NZ Ministry for Culture and Heritage

Europe ¹

Polina Proutskova (coordinator), Mirjam Gericke, Maurice Mengel, Deniza Popova; with contributions from Ardian Ahmenaja, Ethnomusicologist, (Albania), Gergana Baeva, Political scientist, Bulgaria; Marin Maria-Bălașa, Bucharest; François Besignor, IRMA, France; Christoph Borkowsky Akbar, WOMEX, German

¹ With detailed information on Albania, Austria, the Balkans, Belarus, Belgium, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, EU, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Lithuania, Netherlands, Norway, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Turkey, Ukraine, United Kingdom

Sounds; Luc Charles-Dominique, France ;
Edi Clijsters, Belgium; Adrian Farrell,
Ireland; Aris Fioretos, Sweden; Morag J.
Grant, Schottland; Gösta Grassman,
Sweden; Martin Greve, Turkey; Hilde
Holbæk-Hanssen, Norway; Roger
Hotermans, Belgium; Daniel Koglin,
Greece; Drago Kunej, Slovenia; Grozdana
Marosevic, Croatia; Prof. Dr. Franz
Niermann, European Association for Music
in Schools; Jens G. Papenburg, Germany;
Ole Reitov, Dänemark; Johannes Theurer,
Radio MultiKulti Berlin; Sergej Starostin,
Russia; Raimund Vogels, Germany. For
more information about contributors, see
appendix.

With the assistance of the European Music
Council

Latin America ²

Graciela Aguedelo, Gabriela Soto, Leticia
Montaño, with assistance from Beatriz
Bermúdez, Anthropologist, Venezuela and
a number of National Music Councils.

With the assistance of the Music Council of
the Three Americas,

Sub-Saharan Africa

Cameroon

Luc Yatchokeu

Congo (Brazzaville)

Gervais Hugues Ondaye

South Africa

Caroline van Niekerk

In addition, we have a number of informants for

East Africa

Emily Akuno, Kenya

Benon Kigozi, Uganda

Wanyama Mellitus, Kenya

Michael Mubiru, Uganda

Kezia Nakirya Uganda

Sylvia Nannyonga-Tamusuza, Uganda

Hellen Atieno Odwar, Kenya

Chrispo Caleb Okumu, Kenya

Biographical details for the consultants can be found in Appendix 5.

Richard Letts, Principal Investigator

May 31, 2006

² The consultants were based in Mexico

INTRODUCTION

Defining musical diversity

It is customary for studies such as this to define their terms. Among our consultants, it was the Europeans that made the attempt, with a 'triple definition' of musical diversity:

1. Musical diversity exists if there is freedom of musical expression. Although freedom of musical expression includes the freedom to refrain from expressing diversity, this understanding of the term is helpful since it is relatively easy to decide what interferes with the freedom of musical expression.
2. Musical diversity exists if there is a pluralism of musical structures (musical repertoires, musical forms, a wealth of traditions, hybrid forms etc.). Although this definition may appear technical in the sense that it employs technical terms of the academic musicological discourse, it does not provide objective means to decide which structures are more diverse than others. Similar concepts have been applied by evolutionist approaches in musicology since Darwin. Such approaches have often been criticized as ethnocentric and, thus, the corresponding criteria seem problematic in the context of the cultural relativism of UNESCO's understanding of cultural diversity. We still use a diversity of musical structures as an indication for diversity.
3. Musical diversity exists if there are different groups of people making music separately or together. To assume that different groups of people *naturally* or *automatically* have different musics seems to be an outdated concept in the academic discourse. This does not say that different groups of people *cannot* have different musics, of course. But it has been shown that music and people are two different spheres just as languages and the people speaking them. Discussions of musical diversity often treat the fact of coexistence of musics of different populations and social groups as an indication for musical diversity. In fact such a situation refers to diversity, but it is by no means certain, since many groups can make the same uniform kind of music – at least theoretically.

The Principal Investigator is grateful for this contribution, and offers some comment.

We might say that a state of minimum possible musical diversity exists if there were only one tune and its performance was very strictly prescribed. Think Suzuki violin students playing *Twinkle Twinkle Little Star*. There is double the diversity if we add a second tune. On the other hand, we might have a single musical tradition such as Japanese taiko drumming, with its set of rules and practices, with double the diversity if we add another tradition such as Western classical music of the Baroque period. There is great diversity within the collected works of Mozart, but not as much diversity as exists between taiko and Western Baroque.

What is the measure of diversity that is most pertinent to this study? We might roughly characterise the choice as one between diversity within a genre and diversity between genres.

It is suggested that it is diversity of a type included in the European consultants' second category: a diversity of traditions or genres. A richness or diversity of repertoire within a tradition may be desirable (if that is a value in the tradition) and in some circumstances may indicate the health of a tradition, but it is secondary to the existence and even possibly the viability of the tradition.

Diversity does not necessarily follow from freedom of expression. A tradition may not value such freedom and may discourage 'free' departures from its rules. Individual

freedom of expression may produce music that fits cleanly within a tradition or departs so far from tradition that its only dependable audience is its creator. But on the other hand freedom of expression is at some level necessary for the evolution of existing traditions or the creation over time of new traditions. In that sense, diversity can benefit from new creation as much as from preservation of existing traditions.

The Europeans' third definition comes with its own counter-arguments. People participate in any music that attracts them. In seeking the maintenance of musical traditions brought by immigrants, there can be an expectation that the young people will be the natural and enthusiastic bearers of their own ethnic musics. Dismay, when it is discovered that they prefer the current popular music – just like other young people. As the Europeans note, 'music and people are two different spheres'.

In the course of the study there were no references to definitional issues, even by the Europeans. There seems to be tacit agreement, roughly around diversity as a diversity of traditions or genres. There is, however, a recommendation for evaluation and research (by the Europeans) in which definitions may need to be made explicit.

The concern for cultural diversity

This study is intended to reveal the situation of musical diversity in the world. It has been commissioned by UNESCO, which has a position in support of cultural and therefore musical diversity. The UNESCO interest in cultural diversity has been present virtually since its inception. It has adapted to changing circumstances over the years but at present, it is probably fair to say that its current interest arises in part from a concern that diversity is being diminished.³

There are various ways in which musical diversity might be threatened. Especially in music, globalisation brings with it an ever-spreading power of a relatively homogeneous western-sponsored pop music, backed by enormous marketing budgets. This music can displace local musical traditions. Local musical traditions that grew from the circumstances of rural life can weaken as rural life changes or as rural populations drift to the cities. Governments faced with multiple ethnicities within their populations may seek their assimilation into a single cultural identity in the interests of national cohesion. Religious fundamentalism may seek to silence music completely.

As an indication of the content of the study, we introduce here a few of its themes.

The arguments for sustaining cultural and musical diversity

One argument presents a parallel to the arguments for biodiversity. In a situation of environmental change, organisms need to be able to adapt by mutation in order to survive. The richer the gene pool, the greater the possibility of hitting upon those new permutations and combinations that will allow successful adaptation.

³ See Stenou, Katérina, ed.: *UNESCO and the Issue of Cultural Diversity. Review and strategy, 1946-2003. A study based on official documents*. Revised version 2003. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO's website has an entire section devoted to cultural diversity. The organisation has instigated two international binding agreements in support of cultural diversity: the *Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* and the *Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage*, has organised conferences and commissioned or published a number of learned papers.

http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=2450&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

Similarly, when societies are subject to rapid change not only in their physical environment but also in their internal arrangements, it is said that the more diverse the range of cultural practices available to them, the more likely they are to be able to adapt successfully. Music in this case is a part of, an expression of, the broader culture. But the argument can also be made simply within the musical environment. (It is rather interesting that at a time of such rapid social and environmental change, we see so many hybrid musical forms emerge, along with, for instance, the collapse in the west of the idea of a single line of evolutionary progress of classical music.)

The traditions can decline or disappear for the reasons given above. Another way of looking at this is that they fail because people do not practise them, for whatever reason. In particular, we are told that the young are not interested. But some are upset by the situation and it is their desire that the conditions are continued even though it is beyond their capacities to make this happen. That simple desire is another reason to sustain the traditions.

Human rights instruments set out to guarantee the right of any person to the practice of his or her own culture. Excepting as musics disappear for reasons given above, if most people can exercise that right with respect to music, then a musical diversity will exist sufficient to satisfy most of those choices. This is not quite a circular argument because individual choices can form a collectivity in support of a particular tradition, which then is available for others exercising that choice in the future.

Over recent decades, many countries have received large numbers of immigrants from many cultures and ethnicities. In western societies, the old US paradigm of 'the great melting pot' was an ideal: many people come together and submerge their differences, assimilating to become one culture, one people. *E pluribus unum* appears on the Great Seal of the United States. But some of these societies later discarded the policy of assimilation in favour of a policy of multiculturalism. This still seeks societal cohesion, but sees benefit in supporting the old cultures of immigrants. If at the same time as making the transition to their new citizenship they are able to seek expression, relief, through their old cultures, they will be happier and less troublesome, and also will bring the benefit of this diversity (going back to the evolutionary argument) to their new country. These also are arguments for sustaining musical diversity.

Aspects of musical diversity for policy purposes

On the face of it, in most societies there is no shortage of musical diversity. A diversity of musical genres is provided by local traditions and current fashions. Furthermore, any population with easy access to the internet can find music from hundreds of traditions, from past centuries to the present. Even in countries less fortunate, the people almost certainly will have access to a variety of musical genres.

So the actions of governments or indeed, individuals, that in some way explicitly support musical diversity will tend mainly to be found where some aspect of this diversity is under threat.

Further, we might suppose that for the protagonists, the action is not one that is simply motivated by intellectual argument or by principle; it will be motivated emotionally by self-interest and perhaps, in particular, by an individual cultural identification with the music: because music is clearly a strong expression of cultural identity, whether it is the identity of teenagers in defiance of or distinction from their elders, or a tribal group, or members of a sub-group within society for whom an identification with a particular musical genre is an important bond or statement.

One threat to local music comes from globalisation and the international pop industry, as noted. Some governments have been persuaded to combat this threat by, for instance, requiring that broadcasters program at least a minimum quota of locally produced music and so ensure that local music retains a share of the local audience, even if the remainder is given over to imports. But this flies in the face of so-called free trade policies that are advancing through the WTO and bilateral and regional agreements. The US in particular attempts to have these regulations struck down when it negotiates free trade agreements. It is the threat from these agreements that caused the recent passage in UNESCO of the *Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions*, now awaiting ratification by national governments.

It may be that a government seeks to protect only a single genre of music (for instance an endangered local tradition). This in itself is then not a policy in support of musical diversity within that country. However, it does contribute to diversity as *between* countries, or to global diversity, if it ensures the survival of a genre that might otherwise be lost. So such policies are included in the task set out below.

A government may have policies that more literally promote musical diversity. For instance, a government may offer financial assistance for the continuation of the musics of immigrant societies under a broader policy of support to multiculturalism. Some countries have established a government broadcasting network devoted to the cultures of immigrant groups. Such policies may be directed specifically at support to the arts, or the arts may be beneficiaries of policies with wider objectives. Perhaps the multiculturalism might even be a somewhat inadvertent by-product of policies that give support separately to a number of tribal groups.

Multicultural policies may ask us simply to tolerate our culturally different neighbour. The result can be that there is a number of parallel cultural streams within a society that never interact. A more advanced policy may ask us to engage with our neighbour, understand the cultural differences and even benefit from them. More risky, more rewarding. Perhaps a musical consequence of the policy of tolerance is that one can search for and visit a Greek club in the Greek section of our community to listen to Greek music. A musical consequence of the policy of engagement with the differences might be that one can go to a club that seeks a broad audience for presentations of music from Greece along with musics from twenty other cultures.

The final section of the study lists the challenges to musical diversity and proposes constructive responses to these challenges.

Structure of the study

The study addresses terms of reference set by UNESCO, and these can be found in Appendix 1. The consultants were provided with a detailed interpretation and elaboration of the terms of reference, and it was to this document that they responded (Appendix 2).

As is apparent, the potential scope of a study that fully addresses these issues globally is vast. Given the limits of available time and resources, the study is not encyclopaedic but seeks to provide significant examples of a range of situations and practices around the world.

Consultants were engaged to provide information about various regions or countries. Because of some unavoidable haste in organising the project, the original plan to have consultants report on a number of regions was modified to include in some regions consultants for individual countries. The result is a rather interesting mix of detailed information about some countries and a bird's eye view of some regions.

The consultants were provided with a test response to the issues, written by the Principal Investigator for his own country, Australia. It was not intended that they emulate this approach so much as observe some possible treatments of the issues and perhaps use them as departure points. They were also sent a paper on human and cultural rights ⁴, a literature survey of projects involving music and economic development ⁵, and a previous study completed by the Principal Investigator that has some bearing on this one ⁶. The consultants were asked to include substantiation for the statements in their reports where appropriate and possible.

The circumstances in these countries or regions were predicted to be in such high contrast that there was no attempt to force the same approach on all consultants. However, when the drafts were received, some were asked to respond to specific questions or observations by the Principal Investigator and this led to some consistency of approach.

Some of the information from the consultants is incorporated in the main body of the report. Since each of the consultants' reports is a valuable reference in its own right, the complete reports are included here as appendices.

The situation of musical diversity therefore can be viewed here in either of two ways: in the report itself, a compilation of information from around the world addressing certain issues, and in the appendices, the situation regarding those issues addressed country by country or region by region. We have a sort of matrix.

⁴ See Appendix 3

⁵ See Appendix 4

⁶ Letts, Richard: *The Effects of Globalisation on Music in Five Contrasting Countries: Australia, Germany, Nigeria, the Philippines and Uruguay*. International Music Council / Music Council of Australia, 2003 <http://www.mca.org.au/pdf/mmresfinal.pdf>

THE COUNTRIES FROM WHICH INFORMATION WAS RECEIVED

Information has come from the countries listed. In Europe, a team of consultants provided information and secured additional information from contacts in many countries. In Latin America, a team of consultants invited submissions from the national music councils of the region. It was intended to include a report for East Africa but this ran into difficulties. Nevertheless, we do have some information from a number of informants in Kenya and Uganda. Otherwise, the reports come from consultants each dealing with a single country, their own.

ARAB WORLD

Algeria
Morocco

ASIA

China
Indonesia
Singapore
Vietnam

AUSTRALASIA

Australia
New Zealand

EUROPE

Albania
Austria
Belarus
Belgium
Bulgaria
Croatia
Czech Republic
European Union
France
Germany
Greece
Ireland
Lithuania
Netherlands
Russia
Slovakia
Slovenia
Sweden
Turkey
Ukraine

LATIN AMERICA

Argentina
Chile
Colombia
Costa Rica
Dominican Republic
Guatemala
Mexico

Paraguay
Venezuela

SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA

Cameroon
Congo (Brazzaville)
Kenya
South Africa
Tanzania
Uganda

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Musical diversity and human rights

The complementarity or reciprocity between the protection of musical diversity and that of human rights

This section searches for situations where musical expression or musical diversity have been repressed by direct action of government or action by others directed by government, or by others acting to pre-empt direction by government – and whether, where there is such repression, there are other breaches of human rights.

We examine nine international conventions bearing on human rights and/or cultural rights, beginning with the relevant Articles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Repression of fundamental rights, such as those defined in Article 1:

Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person

can make it difficult or impossible to exercise cultural rights as defined in Article 27:

Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits

or the rights enunciated in Article 19 of the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights*,

'to hold opinions without interference'

and to exercise

'the right to freedom of expression; this rights shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of arts, or through any other media of his choice'.

Music is most frequently censored or suppressed because the content of song lyrics, rather than the music *per se*, gives offence to government. There also are instances where the music itself is suppressed. Censorship is most often on 'moral' grounds and such censorship is widespread. Where breaches of censorship are punished, habits of self-censorship grow.

In some countries, music is suppressed because the texts explicitly criticise or challenge the political power of the ruling party. This sort of suppression is perhaps even more malign. It may not be easy to separate clearly the moral and political censorship since the former may be imposed for political purposes.

We note in passing that some believe it is the role or even the duty of artists to dissent, a role that has been exercised across history.

Overall, one could say that the consultants from around the world do not perceive much repression of music or musical diversity *per se*, even where they note strong interference with human rights, as in Latin America. Indeed, in later sections of this report, there are descriptions of programs specifically encouraging the protection and promotion of musical diversity even in countries that are generally perceived to be strongly in breach of human rights.

Some consultants describe regimes where musical expression is perfectly free – except for a list of constraints and prohibitions which perhaps appear customary and reasonable to them, but can easily be argued to be in conflict with the various human rights conventions. We do not regard it as appropriate to point up these

conflicts where our consultants have not done so, and leave it to the reader to draw his or her own conclusions.

Examples are given of suppression that is clearly politically motivated. The description of measures taken in Belarus would almost be comical if it were not so serious for its citizens.

2. Musical diversity and sustainable development

The links between musical diversity and economic development and the fight against poverty

This section explores the use of music to assist in non-music economic development, actions by governments or agencies to develop aspects of the music industry or the music industry as a whole, and the use of music to alleviate poverty or the conditions contributing to poverty.

The term of reference does not ask that we deal only with economic development that explicitly underpins musical diversity. Support to the development of musical diversity is in some cases at least strongly implicit – where, for instance, the development is about the rescue or promotion of local traditional musics, or world musics. But even where the target music practice is in the economic mainstream, diversity may be served inasmuch as *local* popular musics are supported. We find no example of music sector development where a government has set out explicitly to support the music imported from the multinational record companies, which in most cases would reduce musical diversity.

Gould and Marsh categorised the use of culture in development projects in four ways: as context, as content, as method and as expression. Here, the anthropological definition of culture is used. This music study, on the other hand, addresses the place only of one of the art forms in its relationship to development. In a survey of development projects, various relationships were discovered between music and economic development. They range along a continuum. At one end is music as a part of the cultural context (broadly defined) in which economic development takes place (music *in* development); at the other end of the continuum, the development of a music industry contributes receipts directly to overall economic development (music industry development).

Development may be assisted by government subsidies. We distinguish between subsidies for cultural development, which may not require as an objective the achievement of financial profit or self-sufficiency, and subsidies for industry assistance, which expect the achievement of profitability but for which the achievement of cultural objectives may be subsidiary or irrelevant.

Neither our literature search nor our consultants revealed a great wealth of examples of the use of music for non-musical development. The examples are categorised:

- music as a source of funds for non-music development (only one example);
- music as a tool of advocacy for development (two examples);
- music as a lure to involve people in development programs – here, there is a larger number of examples;
- music as an element in non-music development. The very common instance in this case is the use of music to build the tourist industry. While we may here regard music as a means to an end, its use in this way also contributes to development of

the music industry. There is some concern that since tourists are uninformed about local musical traditions, lowest common denominator adaptations of the music may be made in order to satisfy them, to the detriment of musical integrity.

Festivals are a special aspect of tourist development, and musical development too. Instances are given where a festival is used as a trigger to broad economic development.

The music industry itself can be a significant contributor to economic development. A number of significant research papers provide a theoretical background to support development projects. A very broad government study in the new South Africa is potentially of great interest, as are studies in Bulgaria, Australia, Cuba, Cape Verde, Senegal and the Arab countries.

While some governments offer no assistance to the economic development of music sectors, and others offer only the assistance available to any industry (as for instance in Germany or Sweden), there is no shortage of examples of targeted assistance that takes into account music's particular circumstances.

This assistance may come in the form of regulations, for instance to require broadcast of local music, which can then translate into increased sales of recordings of the music broadcast. Regulatory assistance is addressed further in section 4.

The forms of development assistance might be placed in the following categories:

- a) Assistance to a music sector more or less as a whole
- b) Support to music through state-owned companies
- c) Support through subsidies
- d) Support through tax concessions
- e) Support through public/private partnerships
- f) Support through financial instruments e.g. access to loan funds

Examples and commentary are offered briefly on all of these mechanisms.

The support could go to

- a) Live performance, including venues, cultural centres, festivals
- b) Record production and distribution
- c) Music video production
- d) Music publishing
- e) Broadcasting
- f) Internet and multimedia
- g) Training the professionals
- h) Improving businesses practices
- i) Building music exports
- j) Statistics collection

Collectively, the consultants and the literature survey offer instances of projects in all of these areas.

The consultants were able to give many examples of the use of music to alleviate poverty or more especially, the conditions contributing to poverty. There are initiatives that take a systematic and extended approach to the issue. The consultants more often cite one-off events that, for instance, raise funds to alleviate poverty in a particular situation.

3. Musical Diversity and Peace

The links between musical diversity and the promotion of peace

The consultants were invited to cite examples of the use of musical diversity to promote peace or conversely, to cite instances where musical diversity has caused or been strongly associated with social disharmony?

Music is an expression of identity; that identity may be personal but it is as likely to be group identity. In the act of sharing music we share emotion and identity. The sharing brings us together but it can also bring us together against others who share a different music. Discovering what one supports can be clarified and dramatised by finding what one opposes; what one is is made clearer by deciding what one isn't.

As our European consultants point out:

'...music can be associated with war and peace, with social harmony and with social disharmony. For example, not only the Ukrainian Orange Revolution was associated with music. The other party employed music as well.'

UNESCO has had an interest in the cultural diversity issue virtually since its inception after World War 2. Initially, UNESCO was concerned not with promoting diversity so much as ameliorating it. Cultural difference was seen as contributing to armed conflict. UNESCO wanted to ameliorate this source of conflict and its solution was to promote greater education about cultures, leading to greater understanding between them. Cultures that better understood and appreciated each other were much less likely to go to war.

One might guess that this perception forms at least part of the background for the continuing push for a multicultural music curriculum in schools. We can appreciate each other's cultures through our musics.

Our interest is of course the use of music to bring people together and to promote peace. That is an action that is feasible and can be successful.

The European consultants make the interesting point that 'Musical *diversity* (our emphasis), in contrast to music in general, however, tends to be associated with the promotion of peace and social harmony everywhere in Europe...'

A number of examples are provided of relevant projects associated with the promotion of peace and social harmony. Projects tend to be private rather than government initiatives.

4. The standards regulating musical diversity

We cite examples of government or government-induced regulations intended to promote musical diversity or freedom of musical expressions OR to limit them. We make special reference to the fields of broadcasting, new media, e-commerce, education and subsidy. A crucial issue is whether the regulations are enforced or exist mainly on paper.

We look also at the situation of copyright law in the various countries. Has it been enacted? Is it enforced?

This section is about regulations imposed by governments that may affect musical diversity in various settings. It is not about initiatives taken voluntarily by the private sector or about non-regulatory government interventions; for those, see the response to Term of Reference 6.

Governments may legislate to support or suppress musical or cultural diversity, and the legislation may be put into effect through regulations administered by governments and their agencies. There are many forms of regulation. These comprise:

1. Regulations that accord special, preferential, or more favourable treatment to indigenous or national cultural goods and services.
2. Regulations to foster the exchange of ideas, information and artistic expression regionally, nationally and internationally.
3. Regulations that prohibit or limit foreign investment in the cultural sector.
4. Where investment is made in musical or cultural undertakings, regulations that define and enforce requirements such as those intended to achieve a given level of local content, or to accord a preference to goods produced or services provided domestically, or others.
5. Regulations to ensure that investment activity is undertaken in a manner sensitive to concerns and policies concerning musical and cultural diversity.
6. Regulations for procurement policies and practices which favour or accord preferences to local musical or cultural goods and services in order to preserve or enhance cultural diversity.
7. Regulations to establish, sustain and further develop musical and cultural institutions, networks, programs and other mechanisms.
8. Regulations that establish, endow or empower government (all levels of government) enterprises, monopolies, and other publicly governed institutions to provide cultural goods and services, such as music education and funding, music or film development, production and investment, and public service broadcasting.
9. Regulations to support and foster cultural expression and its communication and delivery through forms and instruments yet to be developed as well as those already known.

Recall that the survival of a monoculture can add to musical diversity globally, even were there no diversity within the borders of the host State. Regulations that ensure that survival are to this extent benign.

Regulations that foster musical and cultural activity may be engendered simply by the perception of needs within a State's borders but without an eye to diversity. A culturally valuable but financially challenged activity might be subsidised to ensure its survival and development. And then there are examples of regulations actually intended to ensure that subsidies specifically go to support multiculturalism and musical or artistic diversity.

The need for regulation may arise because of perceptions that local cultural activity is endangered by an influx of cultural goods or services from foreign countries. There is, for instance, widespread concern that music and films emanating from the USA or from transnational corporations are overwhelming less financially robust local

productions. A common response is the imposition of regulations on broadcasters requiring that a minimum percentage of broadcast time should be assigned to local productions or artists.

The broadcast sphere is of special importance. It is still through broadcast that musical works get the greatest public exposure. It is broadcast exposure that can drive record sales and give financial underpinning to musical activity. For music, radio broadcast is probably the most important.

The radio sector generally can be divided into three subsectors: privately owned radio, public or government-operated radio, and community radio. Local content quota regulations apply especially to the private or commercial sector. Motivated by profit, it is likely to broadcast the most popular music regardless of source and this music is typically imported. The programs tend not to be musically diverse. The result of local content quotas may not be an increase in musical diversity but rather an encouragement to local artists to perform in the internationally popular genres.

In the developing world, quotas are in many cases legislated but not enforced and therefore not observed. Also, these quotas are challenged in free trade negotiations on the grounds that they 'distort trade'.

Government owned or 'public' radio in democracies runs continually into the dilemma that in order to offer a service distinguishable from the commercial services that appeal to the majority and cost governments nothing, they offer services that appeal only to a minority but are paid for by all voters. To appeal to the majority they would have to offer programs that are very similar to the totally unsubsidised programs of the commercial stations and thereby abandon their reason for existence. So they are pushed first this way, then that way, trying to prove their relevance through wider audience appeal -- or specialised programming with less audience appeal. In the latter lies the best possibilities for presenting a diversity of musics.

Public radio stations almost never have to meet numerical program quotas. Either they operate under a charter that sets out their responsibilities to meet certain criteria – e.g. to support the musical culture of their countries – or they have been established to serve the musical and other interests of a specified population group such as an ethnic minority. So they may in one way or another contribute to musical diversity.

New media and e-commerce are new fields for regulation. Because they come in a sense without a past, and are certain to take a dominant place in the future, free trade fundamentalists are attempting to keep them as free as possible from regulation. The cultural sector, on the other hand, would like to see a transposition of protective regulations from the 'old media'. However, while quotas applying to analogue free-to-air broadcasting can be reapplied without difficulty to digital free-to-air broadcasting, they make no sense in a digital music-on-demand service where the customer chooses one by one his or her preferred music tracks.

Crucially, we cannot know the nature of media that do not yet exist, nor therefore how they might be regulated to serve local culture. It is important that governments retain the prerogative to regulate when the need becomes apparent.

In the sphere of education, the issue of interest here is not so much the entirety of the education that is offered in any particular situation, but the *requirements* imposed by governments on educational providers.

There are educational issues that are relevant to musical diversity. Does the music curriculum introduce students to a variety of musical genres? Recalling the human

right to participate in one's own culture, is there a regulation requiring that students are instructed in the musics of their own culture. Must this range of genres include musics from cultures or countries other than their own?

Is music education accessible to all students? We might note that accessibility is often limited by resources rather than by regulation.

Concerning subsidies, the matter of fundamental interest is whether regulations covering government subsidies to musical activity permit, encourage or even require support to musical diversity. Subsidies might be directed mainly or exclusively to the support of a particular musical genre to the exclusion of others. There may even be a directive or regulation that requires this, with possible de facto exclusion of other genres.

Conversely, there may be a policy to support activities in a diversity of genres. The policy may simply be open, or it might seek the inclusion of a specific set of genres. At its most developed, in our terms, it might be a policy to support musical diversity. Such a policy seems to have a different flavour and might lead to different outcomes.

Consultants were also asked these questions: Are there regulations that require that government subsidy can only be given to citizens of the particular country, or regulations along those lines? Are there regulations that require that all applicants for subsidy must be considered equally, whether citizens or foreigners? Or are there variants on any of the above?

The essential prerequisite to any of the above is that there are in fact subsidies. We can include here any form of government financial support to non-government entities or to government entities at a lower level, whether it be in the form of cash, tax foregone, or in-kind support through for instance provision of services.

Considering copyright in the context of development, there is a dilemma for developing nations. An orderly and enforced copyright regime may be essential to the development of a music industry, but it also attracts the entry of the multinational record companies to the probable detriment of local music genres and a reduction in musical diversity. There are other issues to be considered on both sides of this argument and they are elaborated in the text.

Consultants from the developing world typically regret the inadequacies of their copyright regimes. The situation in many developing world countries seems to be part-formed or chaotic. Countries of the developing world are the main sources of pirated (physical) recordings and here again is a dilemma, because while the piracy may have prevented the development of a local music industry, it may be a source of some considerable if disreputable export income.

The reports from consultants raise many other copyright issues: the need for a form of collective ownership of the rights in traditional music; the virtues of technical protection measures (TPMs) in preventing unauthorised copying of digital materials, along with the damage caused to the exercise of fair use provisions – the provisions that allow copying of some materials for purposes of e.g. education or research. There are others. Also noted is that copyright law comes from the West and does not necessarily sit comfortably within the philosophies of other cultures.

A pervasive problem in developing countries is the lack of enforcement of copyright legislation once it is brought into existence. This is exacerbated by a lack of understanding by musicians and companies of their responsibilities under the law and the rewards to them if it can be made to work.

5. Musical diversity and the imposition of a monoculture

The tendency to favour a uniform and non-pluralistic interpretation of the notion of identity hindering the manifold and free expression of cultural diversity

We searched for examples of government promulgation of a single musical or cultural identity and any associated constraint on other musical or cultural identities – and examples of similar promulgation by the citizenry or sections of the citizenry.

We also asked whether in any region there are some states that are less likely to ratify the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity if issues of internal cultural diversity or open cultural borders are pressed. This might be the situation in countries that attempt to subdue cultural diversity.

There are very few instances in section 1, the relationship between musical diversity and the exercise of human rights, of direct suppression of musical genres. All consultants report that all of their target communities are filled with a great diversity of musical expression. It seems that on the evidence of our quite large sample of countries, a musical monoculture in today's world may not exist on a *national* basis and if monocultures do exist but have eluded our explorations, the reason would be either extreme isolation of a community from other communities and other musical input, or very heavy and intentional suppression by the state of all but the favoured musical genre.

A state might favour particular forms of music through its regulations or subsidies. But to withhold support from other forms is not quite the same as repressing them. The direction of the greater part of the music subsidies in many Western countries to Western classical music has hardly constrained the diversity of other musics available to listeners.

In summary, while governments in former times, or governments in countries other than those directly covered by this study, may have sought to favour a single, non-pluralistic cultural and musical identity through special support or targeted suppression, that does not seem to be an issue for concern in the territories described here.

Concerning support for or resistance to ratification of the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity, we have the impression that consultants by and large are not well informed about the detail of the Convention; this may have affected the response. However, no expectations of reluctance to support the Convention for the given reason were cited. A number of consultants noted that since support to a convention for cultural diversity would accord with national cultural policies, they would expect ratification.

6. Musical diversity, the musicians, and identity

The manner in which musical diversity is addressed by music workers and expressed in various forms of musical creation; the relationship to identity

We looked for examples of cultures in which musicians and/or the various participants in the music business (producers, presenters, record companies etc) are interested in musical diversity – in the sense of the simultaneous practice or presentation within a society of many forms of music. We also sought examples where they are averse to musical diversity.

Since the survival of traditional musics is a particular concern of those who would preserve and promote diversity, we sought instances where music workers support, or weaken, the practice of local traditional or indigenous music.

We also looked for examples of interest in developing hybrid musical forms – e.g. music that combines two or more ethnic musical genres, or combines an ethnic music with say, western popular music, or combines various forms of non-ethnic music.

Finally, we identify examples of the expression of personal or community identity through music, and especially through musical diversity.

This section is an important one because it deals mainly with the activities of musical citizens, rather than governments, in support of diversity. It begins by looking at the 'actors' for musical diversity per se, those who specifically and consciously support diversity rather than contribute to it unwittingly through activities for another purpose.

To this point in the study, only the regulatory actions of governments have been cited. Here, we do touch upon other actions of governments in support of diversity. One of the heartening aspects of our consultants' reports is that so many governments, at least in the countries subject to our study, do support cultural diversity, whether in the indigenous or immigrant populations, whether actively or at a benign distance. Against expectation, there are few instances of cultural repression on the basis of ethnicity.

Broadcasters, as noted already, are in a position to support musical diversity, although increasing segmentation and broadcasting according to a 'format' tend to narrow the range of genres available from any one station. Diversity is the province of national and community broadcasters, while the commercial stations seek profit through the broadcast of only the most popular genres.

Similarly, the main business of the major *record labels* is pop music and diversity is found in the catalogues of the small companies – not necessarily individually, but collectively. But there are some labels that are committed to diversity, chief of which is Peter Gabriel's Real World. *Record retailers* of any size offer the customer genre diversity, but reportedly they are under pressure from online sales and inventories are being reduced. It might be expected that they will mainly drop the diverse, low-sales edge of the catalogue. To find the diversity once expected at the record store, we now tend to go to the *internet*, although the offerings there are not as complete as might be expected, especially in the non-popular genres.

Festivals are a very important showcase for musical diversity and as noted in section 2, are in some cases a powerful developmental force for the music sector and even for the economy as a whole.

Concerning the *aversion to diversity*, our consultants did not present us with explicit examples although some do cite the increasing specialisation and stylistic narrowness of broadcasters, record labels and live music presenters as though it indicates a principled (or unprincipled) aversion to diversity rather than as collateral damage from the pursuit of other priorities.

Traditional musics are at risk and this is one of the key issues for consultants in most countries. The causes are various, but the most basic cause is the decline or change in the cultures from which they have grown. New technologies replace old manual work habits to which were attached work songs. People move from country to city

and an entirely different way of life. Foreign popular music lures listeners and they may even become ashamed of their own traditions.

In a number of countries, there are attempts to record and document traditions while the bearers are still alive. At least then they are not irrevocably lost. But for many this is not a sufficient solution. They want to restore the traditions to their place in everyday life.

Because of its importance, the issue of traditional musics is dealt with at length in the study. Most consultants are able to describe the particulars of the situation in their territories – often of some complexity. The Europeans point out that in some countries, it is too late: the traditions have died.

The music of the Jews and the Roma is in a special situation since in Europe neither of these cultures has a basis in a nation-state. These traditions to an extent assimilate or are partly assimilated into other cultures. According to the European consultants, these are probably the most successful and influential world music genres.

Migrants also take their musics with them and may become involved in an exchange with the musics of the new country.

This indeed is a major source of 'hybridity'. Society is rapidly changing and evolving, requiring adaptations at all levels. In such a context, it is not surprising that we find much musical experimentation and cross-pollination.

Musicians are involved with hybridisation through the need for survival – adapting their musical style to incorporate other forms more popular - or through taking the opportunity to create something new and different. Sometimes, such activity can be motivated by idealism, a desire to demonstrate an openness or a closeness to other cultures and their people. Nevertheless, these experiments must overcome some serious obstacles and are often unsuccessful.

Looking at the regions explored in our consultants' reports, there is not a single country in which hybridisation is not occurring. We give many examples.

Music and identity. There is simply no question that people and groups and nations identify with particular musics, that their identities are in a sense partly musical.

The issue of music and identity becomes very pertinent in considering the survival of traditional musics. The implication of the existence of a traditional music is that it is important to the people of whose culture it forms a part. After all it was from their life circumstances, their part of the earth, that it grew. It was they who created it. But if that is the case, why in so many places is its very existence endangered? If it is so much a part of these people, how can they bear to part with it?

Music creates, presents and strengthens individual as well as collective identity. The connection of music to particular spaces and cultures goes beyond symbolic representation by sounds, e.g. national anthems, songs, instruments or key systems, and includes situations of making or experiencing music, that are culturally specific.

Research is important to the maintenance of musical diversity. Among its uses: support to educational curricula, to media reporting, to the preservation of traditional genres.

7. Musical diversity: challenges and responses

[Section 7 addresses terms of reference 7 and 8, so as to directly link challenge and response.]

The obstacles or challenges to be overcome in order to ensure better protection and promotion of musical diversity

Bring to light those good practices and actions that need to be strengthened and widely practised in this field.

On an analysis of the situation as discovered in responses to previous questions, consultants were asked how they would you define these obstacles and challenges, and by what methods they envisioned them being overcome.

We consider both the international and national spheres. International issues include the challenges posed by trade liberalisation agreements, not previously considered at any length in the study.

There are special issues concerning the protection and promotion of traditional musics as the societal contexts from which they arose dissipate or evolve. Challenges include the attitudes of younger generations, the opportunities for musical evolution or innovation, the adequacy and structure of music education, the presence or absence of an economic basis for survival.

Although consultants were asked for examples of successful practice, they have in the main brought together their ideas for practices as yet untried. The report includes both.

This section addresses challenges and responses in the private sector and civil society, then in the government sector and then in the international sphere. Within each of these subsections are various categories of challenge.

This section is full of detail and ideas and any summary cannot do them justice. Some of the issues:

The threats to the survival of traditional musics are listed. Responses include proposals to collect and archive traditional practices and to find ways to restore them to daily life.

The threat is not only to traditional musics but more generally to local musics, including contemporary genres. Among the responses: a need to ensure a sustainable supporting infrastructure to underpin and catalyse small scale activity; support to amateur music making; the active promotion of musical diversity. A special threat to local music is from the forces of globalisation, primarily the incursions of the international pop music industry.

Related to this is the challenge of building financially successful local music sectors, a very complex issue. While this is primarily a task for the private sector, government intervention or assistance may be needed, especially if the sector is to contribute to musical diversity through productions of less popular music. In seeking a profitable private music sector, the question arises about sustaining cultural values in the face of commercial imperatives.

Civil society and the private sector have an important role in transmitting musical cultures, independently of the formal education sector. Indeed, music lives above all in the community and in private lives. There are wonderful examples of such transmission.

On the other hand, commercial motivations or inadequacies can limit private sector activity that would provide access to a diversity of musics. Examples are given of an insufficiency of access through the internet, which we might otherwise have thought of as the richest possible means of access.

The worst problem to confront in the government sector are those governments that are ignorant about or indifferent to cultural issues. The only apparent solution is effective advocacy.

But most governments do enact legislation or policies that affect musical diversity. Examples are given of both positive and negative interventions. Among the important issues for government is copyright legislation, addressed in section 4 of the report. Governments have the major responsibility in the provision of an effective, long-term, sequential, diverse musical education – a task in which, overall, they do not shine.

They have the ability to broaden public access to musical diversity. Cost is an issue and access through broadcasts is a cost-effective response – indeed, much can be achieved at little cost simply through regulation. The study proposes the need for evaluation of the success of government interventions, and for research more generally into the factual situation concerning music diversity.

The section addressing the international sphere examines in some detail the challenge of sustaining local musics in the face of the incursions of international free trade agreements. An argument is made for the exclusion of culture from these agreements and some detailed proposals are made for responses to the threats they pose. None of the consultants saw such agreements as culture's friends.

We note the fears expressed by some that the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity will be used to repress rather than protect and promote it – despite the statements in the Convention that specifically prohibit such use.

Musical diversity is served if there is free cross-border flow of musics from other countries and cultures. There is a dilemma, however, that such freedom allows dominance by the music sold by the most powerful international traders, and so musical diversity is not necessarily served.

The study ends with a brief proposal for a global agency for musical diversity, dealing as a priority with the situation of traditional musics, serving both as observatory and development agency.

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

ADDRESSING THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

In the following section, following the chapter headings in bold italics are the very slightly restated terms of reference as provided by UNESCO. The immediately following text in italics is the interpretation of the terms of reference by the Principal Investigator as supplied to the consultants in seeking their responses.

The terms of reference can be viewed in Appendix 1 and the elaboration can be viewed in Appendix 2.

1. Musical diversity and human rights

The complementarity or reciprocity between the protection of musical diversity and that of human rights

- *Cite examples where musical expression or musical diversity have been repressed by direct action of government or action by others directed by government, or by others acting to pre-empt direction by government.*
- *In the countries where there is such repression of musical expression or diversity, are there other notable breaches of human rights?*⁷

1.1 International human and cultural rights conventions

The existence of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights is known to most people and it is the principle point of reference in these matters. However, there is a number of other international documents that are concerned with specific sectors of the population such as children, or particular categories of rights such as cultural rights.

In addressing this term of reference, we must be concerned with the complete agenda of human rights but also, of course, have a specific interest in cultural rights. In Appendix 3 can be found excerpts from nine relevant international documents, along with links to those documents. The excerpts quote those clauses of the documents that bear on cultural rights, directly or at a close remove.

The documents are the:

Universal Declaration of Human Rights

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights)

Convention on the Rights of the Child (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights)

United Nations International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

UNESCO Declaration of the Principles of International Cultural Co-operation (Paris, 1966)

Declaration on Cultural Diversity, Council of Europe, 2000

UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity, 2001

UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage

UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions

Articles 1, 3, 4, and 5 of the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* state

Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person.

⁷ It should be appreciated that identified consultants to this study are in a delicate position concerning responses on this issue. The more severe the constraints on human rights in their regions, the less freedom they may have to report breaches.

No one shall be held in slavery or servitude; slavery and the slave trade shall be prohibited in all their forms.

No one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment.

Where such rights to basic security and safety are abused, the exercise of the right enunciated in Article 27 --

Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits.

-- may become difficult or impossible. Such basic rights – and others are enunciated in the Declaration - therefore are fundamental to any consideration of the protection of musical diversity. On the other hand, freedom from slavery or torture is no guarantee of other rights, cultural rights among them, and so these also are at issue and are addressed directly in this and other instruments.

Cultural participation for most people in the west, as it relates to music and the arts, is passive – the citizen as cultural consumer. But for the art creators, freedom of expression is fundamental. This freedom is of course fundamental not only to artists, but they are perhaps more likely to exercise it and to take it to its limits than are others. Article 19 of the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* states

1. Everyone shall have the right to hold opinions without interference.
2. Everyone shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of his choice.

A distinction might be made between rights directly enunciated and rights that can be exercised only after others are achieved. For instance, the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* states that 'States Parties recognize the right of the child to education' (Article 28.1) and in Article 29.1 they

...agree that the education of the child shall be directed to:

- (a) The development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;
- (c) The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own.

It could be argued that in order for a child to exercise the right to participate freely in his or her own culture, that culture must be transmitted to him or her and in some countries there may be a dependence on the schools for such transmission.

So in a sense, the failure to transmit the culture to children through the school program can lead to breach of another right. Many countries do not have, for instance, effective school music curricula or provision and fail to transmit the musical culture to their students. This is likely often to be a sin of omission rather than commission. The relevant authorities may be oblivious to the human rights implications and their decisions may be based on other practicalities or beliefs such as funding difficulties, curricular priorities, a lack of valuing of culture as opposed to material possessions or other such factors.

The implications of the *Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* are similarly elliptical when it comes to human rights. Like the *Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage*, it sets its course by referring immediately to the various human rights instruments. It has a set of 'Guiding Principles', the first of which says:

1. Principle of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms

Cultural diversity can be protected and promoted only if human rights and fundamental freedoms, such as freedom of expression, information and communication, as well as the ability of individuals to choose cultural expressions, are guaranteed. No one may invoke the provisions of this Convention in order to infringe human rights and fundamental freedoms as enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights or guaranteed by international law, or to limit the scope thereof.

This principle addressed the concern of many people that some states would invoke the right to cultural sovereignty that the Convention attempts to guarantee, in order to suppress rather than protect and promote cultural diversity within their borders.

Subsequent principles are not about guarantees of rights so much as the facilitation in various ways of cultural diversity. But of course, a consequence of more resilient cultural diversity is that people have greater opportunity 'to participate in the cultural life of the community', not to mention to gain access to the cultures of 'civilizations different from (their) own'.

These international instruments provide a detailed ethical background against which can be considered repression of 'musical expression or musical diversity ... by direct action of government or action by others directed by government, or by others acting to pre-empt direction by government'.

We might categorise the ways in which music gives offence to those who would repress it. The easiest to comprehend is the censorship or suppression of songs not because of the music *per se*, but because the *lyrics* are regarded as in some way dangerous to the interests of the state or offensive to the morals or taste of the rulers or the citizenry. To a degree, the basis for repression is the same for words in music as for words in newspapers or magazines or broadcasts.

Secondly, there may be repression of music without words. The basis for this is on the face of it much more abstract since music itself is abstract. There are two main possibilities – music that is condemned by its association with a disapproved social group, and music whose substance is in some way unappetising to the rulers.

Music can be categorised by style and style can be related to identity. A musical genre can be identified with a particular social group seen to be in opposition to the state. Particular tunes also can be so identified. The music could be suppressed as part of the more general suppression of that social group.

The state may regard specific genres as antithetical to its philosophy: the USSR approved of four-square consonant music as suited to the ethos of socialist realism; dissonant Western modernism was for a disapproved elite and its practice was life-threatening for its exponents. Various forms of state Puritanism pass judgement on musical content as implying some form of immorality. The judgement can be confirmed by association with the supposed identity or behaviour of exponents – e.g. drug-taking rock musicians, or simply people of a different hue or religious belief.

In many countries, suppression is not directed at political comment or allusion but at other matters related to supposed community or moral standards. The least oppressive actions probably are the classification systems. For instance, Australia has a review process, similar to a film review process, under which an industry committee reviews recordings and categorises them according to various criteria having to do with sex, violence, drug-taking and so on as expressed in the song texts. The classification is placed on the packaging of the discs to alert consumers who might then not buy (or buy!) according to the supposed offensiveness of the contents. Occasionally a disc is refused permission to be offered for sale. The latter constitutes censorship and denies the right of free expression, but it is not necessarily intended to suppress political opinion.

Artists including composers and musicians may offend the state inadvertently but in other cases the dissent is political and deliberate. Historically, the arts have had an important role in political dissent.

Says Julian Burnside ⁸:

It is in times of stress that dissent is most needed. It is in times of stress that the voices of dissent will be suppressed. But the voices at risk of suppression are those which are recognised by the State, and the State is not always literate in the language of dissent. Whilst politicians and bureaucrats may pore obsessively over political tracts, they are not always at home in music or painting or even poetry.

Generally, prose is considered by the authorities to be the most dangerous, perhaps because they are prosaic people.

Music with a text is a more obvious target. Burnside notes two famous historical instances of musical dissent, one through the music and one through the text:

The power of the hidden but recognized message is clear in at least two major symphonic works which come to mind. Shostakovich's *Ninth Symphony* – ostensibly a work of apology to the State – ends with a long slow movement which was widely understood by its audience as an extended, haunting reference to the wastelands of the Siberian Gulag.

Another interesting example, not well enough known, is the choral movement of Beethoven's *Fifth Symphony*. The text is drawn from Schiller's poem 'An die Freude' – To Joy. As Schiller originally wrote it, it was 'An die Freiheit' – To Freedom. This was in the days of Metternich whose reputation for oppression had grown progressively since 1815. He imposed harsh censorship in Austria. Teachers and writers suspected of liberal views were blacklisted. To speak of freedom was dangerously unacceptable. Whilst an Ode to Joy would pass the censors, an Ode to Freedom would certainly not.

Beethoven's liberal thinking emphatically supported the original spirit of the French Revolution, and in his use of Schiller's text – widely recognised for what it truly meant – was an act of defiance characteristic of Beethoven.

⁸ Julian Burnside: *The Art of Dissent, or, If you are crazy enough to be an artist, why not take on the establishment as well?*. Music Council of Australia Annual Address, 2004. <http://www.mca.org.au/pdf/BurnsideAddress2004.pdf>

1.2 From the consultants' reports

We will give detail of the situation in each country or region in sequence because that is where the devil lies. This will not be our method for every term of reference but it seems appropriate for this one.

While many consultants report suppression of human rights on political grounds, there are few accounts of political suppression of music per se. On the other hand, censorship or regulation on 'moral grounds' – for matters of sex, violence or unacceptable language as found in the lyrics – is common. This type of censorship may be more associated with parties of the right than the left and to that extent could be seen as politically shaded. However, unless it becomes an issue that is raised, for instance, as an element of an election campaign, such censorship is not usually an aspect of the direct assertion of political power.

Some consultants report what amounts to censorship in their countries in a matter of fact way and without offering any judgement. It is how things are in this country, they seem to say, and it is of course altogether appropriate and what one would expect. But the regulations would seem to put the respective governments in breach of various aspects of the human rights covenants cited above. We quote from such reports without further comment.

Arab World

Algeria. The consultant reports that before the 1980s, 'any so-called "committed/engaged" musical expression or production was subject to monitoring and censorship, even to repression of authors and performers (imprisonment for offence of opinion or intelligence against the nation's interest).' However, 'Since the 1980s, we had no repressions or any exaction by direct or indirect action of the government or another instrument of the political power in Algeria.'

Morocco. We quote the consultant:

'At present, the Kingdom of Morocco sees itself as a country of civil rights and democracy based on its constitutional monarchy which emphasizes individual liberties and equal chances on the basis of the moral principles of human rights and by refusing racial discrimination of any kind within a multicultural community comprising several ethnic groups (Berbers, Africans, Arabs, Saharawis, Andalusians, Jews and Christians) who live together in a climate of tolerance, solidarity and mutual respect.

'But if today Morocco favours cultural diversity for reasons of cultural identity, cohabitation and regional stability, it is certain that with the beginning of the Arab-Islamic conquest of this "Country of the setting sun" certain important parts were unjustly highlighted whereas others were marginalized for political, governmental or hegemonic reasons.

'Thus, Arab-Muslim art and Arab language were introduced to the detriment of other Amazigh dialects and to the detriment of a rich and varied Berber culture (in popular traditional or folk arts, in customs, literature, poetry, song, dance, choreography and music).

'Since that time, all the treasure of the Amazigh heritage have lived in lethargy during centuries, but transmitted by the Berber tribes from generation to generation. With Morocco's independence in 1956, some cultural and artistic reforms were introduced; the creation of a Berber radio station practically completely devoted to Berber culture gave new impetus to the Amazigh culture.

'The government encouraged however the Arab spirit by creating national orchestras and music schools with the aim of improving the playing of the musicians and performers for the development of the Moroccan Arab song and in particular, Andalusian music, which at that time was considered the only classical music to be representative of Morocco.

'Other anomalies were observed in the course of the last fifty years of independence concerning sectarianism and regionalism. Thus, for a long time, alawi and reggada music (ingredients of the ra'i) were marginalized in Eastern Morocco, a region which as we now know gave birth to the ra'i movement with its international impact. This was a costly error for Morocco, for Algeria was faster in exploiting this movement.

'Certain musical innovating currents (that of the Megri, the Nass El Ghiwane and ra'i) which had been stifled during the last few decades by the government or associations supporting Arab Moroccan song and Andalusian music, have been able to survive this form of discrimination, just like all the Arab-Amazigh folklore, aïta, melhun, alawi, the brotherhoods' gnawas and the Saharan guedra. This was possible thanks to their strong will and spirit to preserve their ethnic or regional identity. They are so many musical sources which will never run dry; it is to be believed that they fear neither decisions of the governments or of those who support these, nor the dangers of globalization.'

Asia

China: The consultant does not address this term of reference.

Indonesia: Like the consultant from Algeria, the consultant from Indonesia reports an oppressive past, now supplanted by a more open regime. As is most common, it was the texts that were under surveillance rather than the music itself.

'In the New Order period (from 1965 to 1997), even though the diversity of music in Indonesia was officially maintained, there were times in which repression from government could happen especially when musician sang songs with critical views. As a whole, musicians and singers are free to express their ideas through music performances, traditional, popular, classical, jazz, hybrid music, *dangdut*, ethnic music, etc. However, musical performances were not totally free from political domination because the government wanted that performances should follow their regulations. So, the government assigned some people to observe performances with potential critical views. Especially when the lyric criticized an important figures in government offices the musician will be investigated (musical performances with no words, or if the words were not understood clearly, would not get such irritating surveillance, however).

'*Tokohindonesia.com* cites that Iwan Fals, a singer musician who was thought of as the representative of the common people because of his critical views on behalf of the populace, was arrested when he sang a song telling the story that according to a government agency was associated with the life of important figures... He was often banned to perform in many regions in Indonesia due to his strong power to influence people's ideas and movements. Iwan Fals is (still) a well-known singer musician who consistently puts his critical views about political figures, social criticism, and the voice of the common people in his songs. However, because the new government (established only two years ago) wants to promote democracy in all aspects of life in Indonesia, there is less investigation upon such performances.'

Singapore. 'Singapore has the Internal Security Act which allows the authorities to arrest and hold a person without trial for a length of time, if that person is considered to be a threat to national security. While this Act has been enforced from

time to time for various reasons, there has been, so far, no direct relationship to suppression of any musical activity.

'Singapore also has the Religious Harmony Bill, where people are not allowed to conduct religious activity or evangelistic activity which may offend those from another religion. This law could have the impact of restricting those musical activities which have a religious purpose or content.

'There are also censorship laws which forbid the broadcast and performance of music which has lewd or abusive lyrics, lyrics which are defamatory and lyrics promoting socially unacceptable or illegal activity such as drug taking, etc. Some songs have been banned over the years because of this problem with content. Generally, music is the least censored of all the art forms in Singapore.

'All organisers of public music performances need to apply for a Public Entertainment License before being allowed to hold the performance. Normally, music performances have no problem obtaining such a license, although in the past year, there was a case of a concert being organised by the Falungong movement being rejected and another of the annual rave party for gays called "The Nation Party" being rejected as well.'

Vietnam: 'The people and artists have total freedom to express their own conception of culture and art unless the content of works destroys the solidarity between ethnic groups or damages the independence and the unity of the country or is against the current political regime or causes disorder in society or encourages violence, illegal sexuality, and using dirty language. They have also the freedom to choose any artistic style or express any artistic tools and method. The people have the right to choose and participate in any cultural or artistic activity, even the ceremonial-religious ones which 30 years ago were forbidden. The National Constitution adopted in 1992 states that '*The Vietnamese have the right to believe or not believe any religion or belief*' except it cause the above said prohibited things.

'The artists, especially those who are singers, dancers, players etc. are advised to have good behaviour in closing and in their performing style that corresponds with the traditional moral criterion of national and communities' culture.'

The Vietnamese consultant also reports a number of measures in support of the traditional cultures. These might be taken as supporting opportunities to exercise the right to participate in one's own culture.

- 'i. Encouraging and supporting the provincial and national musical troupes and theatres to perform traditional items
- 'ii. Encouraging to restore, revitalise traditional musical genres in community where they are created and developed in the past because they are historical evidence of creative talent of the Vietnamese people.
- 'iii. Enforce and realise the paragraph number 14 of the ***Law for protection of intellectual ownership*** which states that the law protects "***all kinds of folk literature and folk arts***"
- 'iv. The radio and TV must have a permanent program to introduce traditional cultural expressions of ethnic groups.
- 'v. Ratify as soon as possible the UNESCO Convention for safeguarding the cultural diversity of Humanity.'

Australasia

Australia: 'a) 'Anti-sedition' legislation has been passed recently that many fear will interfere with freedom of artistic expression. So far, the legislation has not been used to inhibit any artistic expression, so far as is known. But people can be arrested and held and forbidden to inform anyone, and it is an offence for the media to report on such arrests. So it is possible that the legislation could be used without any public knowledge. And indeed the prohibition on public reporting of these arrests severely limits freedom of expression whether artistic or not.

'So if this particular legislation were to inhibit musical expression, it would almost certainly do so on account of the lyrics.

'The anti-sedition laws are being reviewed by the Australian Law Reform Commission.⁹ Criticisms of the legislation can be found at www.ozsedition.blogspot.com The legislation itself can also be found through that site.

'b) A panel was set up two years ago to review and classify sound recordings for objectionable content. The process is one of self-regulation by the recording industry but occurs only because the government let it be known that if the industry did not take this initiative, the government would impose censorship. The purpose is to assess the verbal content for 'unacceptable' expressions of violence, sexuality and 'bad' language. The purpose is not at this time one of political censorship but rather a matter of preserving perceived 'community standards'. The record jackets carry a classification where required. Record companies are occasionally denied permission to release tracks assessed as too objectionable.

'As to more general suppression of human rights: In recent times, there has been objectionable treatment of unauthorised refugees – refugees who are not selected by government officers from e.g. foreign refugee camps, but arrive by boat under their own arrangements without an entry visa. Possibly the treatment of some refugees breaches their human rights.

'The anti-sedition legislation, a response to the threat of terrorism similar to legislation in some other countries such as the UK, may well breach human rights. Australia does not have a Bill of Rights, so there is not that clear formal standard against which to assess the legislation.'

New Zealand. The New Zealand consultant could identify no repression of human or artistic rights.

Europe

The consultants for Europe worked as a team and so we have a statement summarising the situation in Europe, along with details for a number of European countries. The consultants:

'All European countries have legislation that determines the freedom of opinion and the freedom of cultural expression. In most countries these laws are in force and enforced. In some countries laws are not enforced or their enforcement is problematic (Turkey, Belarus). In general, there is hardly any information about limitations on artistic freedom in Europe. Most of the European countries do not have official bans of music, though there may be cases of self censorship. Major violations of human rights and freedom of cultural expression are predominantly found in other parts of the world, though there is a tendency in Western and Middle Europe to

⁹ <http://www.alrc.gov.au/inquiries/current/sedition/index.htm>

increasing police violence, racists' attacks, violence against women and the worsening of the situation of refugees as well as a certain threatening of the protection of human rights by anti-terrorism-legislation.

'There are restrictions of the freedom of cultural expression and freedom of opinion through policies against harassment and the protection of moral principles. Freedom of speech can be limited by regulation for the protection of minors and personal dignity. Almost all states have titles that are not allowed to be aired. This is mostly due to violation of moral standards concerning sexuality, violence and bad or offensive language. Freedom of speech can also be limited through regulations concerning propaganda especially of the extreme right. This is especially important for Germany and Austria.

'In some migrant communities, especially Muslim communities, there seem to be hard debates about the issue, if music is allowed at all.'

The European consultants note the special situation in Belarus. It seems to be a compendium of repressions overt and covert:

Belarus: 'The Belarusian government limits the right of freedom of opinion and freedom of assembly. Some musicians, bands and media are in conflict with the Lukashenko regime after taking part in protest actions. Repression is directed at persons or media, but usually not explicitly at forms of musical expression.

'Legal and economic mechanisms like health and safety laws, housing regulation or tax regulations are employed to prevent rock and underground bands from performing. Municipal authorities have to grant special licences for cultural events and frequently revoke them without refund. Artists not favoured by government – irrespective of their popularity – are often limited to performing concerts in small private clubs with extremely little advertising, which limits their ability to express themselves as well as it severely reduces their earning potential. The biggest problem seems to be self-censorship. Promoters, journalists and private club owners are increasingly unwilling to risk their existence by supporting disfavoured artists.

'There are reports about smear campaigns against rock musicians, which portray the artists as 'undesirable' elements. At the same time state funds have been used to organise a series of expensive pro-Lukashenko concerts. There are also reports about radio blacklists, though some DJs on public radio stations continue to play blacklisted artists without repercussions.'¹⁰

Turkey is the other country singled out by the European consultants.

Turkey: 'The situation of Human Rights in Turkey is disputable. Despite several reforms there are reports about a broad range of restrictions to the freedom of expression and the freedom of press. Government, society and justice still have a tense relation to pluralistic diversity of opinion. The new penal law allows sanctions, e.g. article 305 bans activities against basic national interests, which can be prosecuted with 3 to 10 years of prison. Examples for this kind of activities are the expression of the claim for the pullout of Turkish troops from Cyprus, the diffusion of the idea of genocide on the Armenians and the violation of the memory of Atatürk. This law does in fact censor a critical debate about Turkish history.'

¹⁰ See Maya Medich: <http://www.freemuse.org/sw12630.asp>

So in music, the basis for these sanctions would again be the verbal content. But in the next instance, it was not the meaning of the lyrics but the language in which they were sung that brought retaliation.

'There are newspaper reports about the police having taken people into custody during a wedding because they were singing songs in Kurdish despite the fact that the Kurdish language is no longer forbidden.

'There are reports about prosecutions of journalists, musicians and TV producers as well as the ban on journals. RTÜK, the Supreme Institution for Radio and TV has the authority to temporarily ban radio or TV transmissions for days, months or years. This results in self-censorship so that direct censorship is not necessary at all. There are auditing commissions of the Turkish Ministry of Culture on the phonogram industry. Producers have to acquire a general producer's licence and a permission document for each production. They need a signed document declaring that nothing in the production contradicts the 'Rules of Audition' as well as accepting complete legal responsibility for the lyrics, if they are not in Turkish. (Freemuse)'

While the European consultants single out Belarus and Turkey, things do not go so well in some other countries.

France: 'At the end of 2005, the French government reacted to the riots in France's poor neighbourhoods. Measures included a clampdown on French rappers. A conservative lawmaker blamed music groups for stoking the riots. In 2005 a Jamaican reggae star's (Capleton) concerts were cancelled by six French music venues because of his lyrics against homosexuality.'

Here the right of free speech comes up against rights to gender freedom.

Germany: 'Due to regulations for the protection of minors, in 2004, the Bundesprüfstelle für jugendgefährdende Medien (Federal Inspection Authority for Youth-Endangering Media) listed 368 music titles as morally harmful to young people. These music titles could not be exhibited publicly in retail stores, and could be sold only to customers above the age of 18. They cannot be imported nor exported and cannot be promoted or advertised in media that are accessible to minors. This sort of regulation applies to almost all member states of the EU.'

Greece: 'In 2005, a private television station censored the performance of the known *rebetiko*-singer Agathonas Jakovidhis by covering "morally dubious" words in the lyrics that were about the smuggling of drugs with whistling sounds.'

And then there is the new flood of anti-terrorist and anti-sedition laws.

'In Germany (and Austria) authorities especially mind music being employed for sedition as well as insulting behaviour against minorities and religious communities. The denigration of Holocaust is a criminal offence, certain national socialist songs are forbidden...'

The situation in the United Kingdom sounds similar to that in Australia. Indeed, it is likely that the latter emulated the former.

United Kingdom: 'The situation concerning human rights is said to be the worst in Europe in the context of anti-terrorism legislation: imprisonment without hearing, imprisonment at home without access to mobile phone or internet.

'There are reports about single incidents limiting artistic expression: the British singer Steven Patrick Morrissey, previously lead singer of the rock group The Smiths, criticized the US-led war in Iraq and called the American president George W. Bush a "terrorist". At the end of February 2006, he said that the American the Federal

Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and the British intelligence 'Special Branch' had investigated him. (Freemuse)

'28-year-old US-based Deeyah is a Muslim pop singer born in Norway. Her new song *What Will It Be?* centres on women's rights and talks about the death threats she has received. Her video has been taken off air and banned by a British Asian TV channel as they received threats to their staff for airing her music video. (Freemuse)'

Latin America

As is the case for Europe, there is a consulting team for Latin America, able to give an overview of the situation there. The consultants comment on the situation with human rights generally:

'Concerning human rights, although there is no notable repression against musical diversity, in most Latin American countries there are commonly breaches of human rights:

- a) Police forces commit violations of the liberty of expression, the torture of imprisoned people, arbitrary detentions, intimidation and harassment of defenders of human rights, murders.
- b) There is violation to juridical processes' basic rights; justice is imparted in a slow way and favours politically influential classes.'

The consultants give some instances of repression of musical expression.

'As far as this investigation allows us to know, it seems that there is not any kind of repression of musical diversity by direct action of government in any of the Latin American countries. Nevertheless, not all musical expressions are treated with equality and not all styles have the same privileges. The result is a non-official but clear censorship from the media, and a violation of natural forms and contexts of musical expression. Generally, these breaches are not sanctioned or emended by government.'

We note that the consultants here describe circumstances in which certain forms of musical work cannot reach the public, but it seems to the author that there is some question as to whether the motivation is censorship. This situation might be interpreted to be, for instance, the exercise of choice by commercially motivated media organisations. We are not sure that we would classify such choices as censorship of the unchosen although, of course, they are unhelpful to the cause of musical diversity.

The consultants continue:

'Certain live musical performances on stage which are not supported by media events, for instance, some classical music, some ethnic music, bohemian singers, not famous groups, do not receive fair payment and in some cases, adjoining activities to the same presentation are not considered in the budget, like the one that occurred in Argentina in which the organizers of a concert didn't want to pay the expenses of a piano transportation, because transport is not a cultural activity! ¹¹ It should be noted that in many countries in Latin America, the government is often responsible for the support both economical and promotional of musicians and music.'

¹¹ Quiero un país con dignidad. La Cultura otra vez al cadalso. Cristina Castello.
<http://www.paginadigital.com.ar>

Here again, the consultants argue that this is a human rights issue. We agree that fair remuneration, however that may be defined in context, is a human rights issue. The refusal to pay for piano transportation could be seen as impinging on whether there has been fair remuneration or it might be seen as plain stupidity.

The consultants' next example is a much clearer instance of censorship, although one has a sneaking sense of approval of the motivation.

'On the other hand, there was a case in Mexico in which certain songs belonging to an ancient traditional music genre named "*corrido*" –which narrates real rural and urban stories- was considered objectionable and broadcast was forbidden because its content was about drug dealers' financial profit and their triumphs in incidents with the police.¹² The consultants refer specifically to an issue raised at the beginning of this section: If cultural education is not provided, is there by default a breach of a human right to participate in one's own culture?

'Some people do not have the opportunity to participate in the education in their own culture; music education generally is deficient, with the exception of Cuba.¹³

Sub-Saharan Africa

Cameroon. The consultant reports:

'The legislation in Cameroon does not foresee repression against free artistic expression. However, certain musicians who develop immoral texts in their songs are often censured by the CRTV (Cameroon Radio and Television), the national office for radio and television.

'In other aspects of human rights, media and journalists who undermine the notoriety (sic) of the State are often repressed and even put into jail.'

Congo (Brazzaville). 'The authors' rights and the freedom of expression being among the human rights, their protection encourages the creation in various musical expressions which is likely to generate financial resources in terms of rights and royalties on the production of their musical works.

'For the monolithic [before the fall of the Berlin wall] period, any work which was not in conformity with the lines of the ruling party was prohibited and the author put in prison.'

Examples:

- Until 1991, works of the artist Franklin BOUKAKA were prohibited of sale in Congo-Brazzaville because they were regarded as being counter-revolutionary.
- Works of artist KOUYENA underwent the same fate in DR of Congo (Zaire)
- Works of Myriam MAKEBA were prohibited in South Africa during the whole period of Apartheid.
- The embargo imposed on these works represented an enormous loss of income forcing the artists to become beggars. These are serious cases of non-respect of human rights limiting the range of musical diversity since while one observes the

¹² En México prohíben en las radios los narcocorridos.
<http://www.chalino.com/noticias/prohiben-narcocorridos.asp>

¹³ FUENTE: Forum Panamericano sobre educación musical. Memoria. Consejo de la Música en México/CIM

persecution of musics known as "engaged", the authorities protect and encourage the musics known as revolutionary that praise the parties and their leaders. Media spaces are guaranteed for the revolutionary musicians, such as in Congo-Brazzaville for the artist musician MANGOUNGOU Cléy.

'The analysis of Congo-Brazzaville also applies to the sub-region.'

South Africa. The consultant reports at length on the situation. For the full report, see Appendix 18. The following are excerpts.

'Under the infamous policy of *Apartheid* of the previous South African government, the following anomaly was found: on the one hand there was a policy of divide and rule, as evidenced for example by homelands for different ethnic groups. In one sense this demonstrated a recognition of diversity. On the other hand there was also repression of diversity, as witnessed by the insistence on the use of the Afrikaans language – this led to the well-known Soweto Riots of 1976. However, all was understandable in the context of the promotion of the position of the then ruling White minority, over, and at the expense of, other citizens of the country.

'Against this background it is interesting to read in Manda Tchewa's 2005 book *African Music: New Challenges, New Vocations*, published by UNESCO, "Generally speaking, almost the whole of this music zone (note: he is referring to Southern Africa, and specifically Angola, Mozambique, South Africa and Zimbabwe) has been dominated and influenced by South African music genres, which in turn have been nurtured by the imaginations of migrant workers who, under apartheid, came from all over the region to work in the mines .. A question, however, arises: how did this music manage to survive for so long in the repressive atmosphere imposed by racial segregation? In Franck Tenaille's opinion, it was 'apartheid, in its obsession to classify, that favoured the preservation of the body of music in the Bantustans and, at the same time, through the mines, the shebeens (clandestine ghetto bars), the churches, and led to the appearance of hybrid genres, such as *marabi*, *kwela*, *mbaquanga*, *mapantsula* and *kwaito*. These genres adapted many of the colonizers' instruments (pennywhistle, organ, accordion, guitar and brass) and went on to develop numerous imitative versions of American styles (from big-band to disco)'" (Tchewa 2005: 40).¹⁴

'...one of our most prevalent current problems is ... "the glaring gap between paper promises and raging realities in civil society which then often does not appear very civil!"... It is true that we now have a policy development process that is transparent, predictable and stakeholder-driven, and policies therefore enjoy a high level of legitimacy because they are developed consultatively with stakeholders...

'A further point in the South African context specifically relates to issues of affirmative action, and the question asked by some people as to whether what are generally known as the "previously/historically disadvantaged" (i.e. those formerly racially classified as 'Non-White') may not now be being specifically ADVANTAGED, at the expense of White South Africans. There is much debate in society as to whether this simply constitutes "levelling the playing field", or whether it is discrimination in reverse. An example which illustrates this phenomenon is the list of

¹⁴ Tchewa, Manda. 2005. *African Music: New Challenges, New Vocations*. Published by UNESCO, printed in Spain. ISBN UNESCO 92-3-103988-1. Page 40. See www.unesco.org/publishing. "Manda Tchewa is emeritus researcher in Afro-Caribbean and Afro-American musicography, Member of the IMC and Artistic Director of MASA (African Performing arts Market)."

"Investing in Culture Projects for 2004 – 05", where it was stated that the major focus would be on Black Economic Empowerment (BEE).. .

'... informant Shelley Childs of the Performing Musical Arts Association (PMAA – www.pmaa.co.za) noted in an email to the author... "I do not feel the State has done anything to suppress any music in which we are interested, other than that to end funding. Sound reasons exist for this. These include corruption and mismanagement of funds in the past, but also the need to correct previous skewed funding. I don't interpret this as a policy of suppression. The South African Bill of Rights, Item 31, as set out in our constitution, has built into it my right to practise my culture whatever it may be. It just so happens that what PMAA members may see as their musical culture is of little interest to most South Africans. ...Many of the (white) elderly and of the Afrikaans members of the PMAA tend to see things differently. From time to time, they express the opinion that the absence of funding expensive operas, etc. for the enjoyment of a handful of people, amounts to deprivation of their culture. ... I personally don't believe that the State is depriving me of my music culture or limiting the diversity. Rather, an absence of a supportive target market limits the number of concerts of interest to members, that are presented. Audience support for Western art music is very small. As far as I know, there is no State support for non-African folk music."

1.3 Freemuse: a watchful ear

Freemuse is a wonderful organization based in the relative safety of Copenhagen that draws public attention to acts of musical suppression around the world.¹⁵ The website gives a continually updated list of acts of musical censorship and suppression – and not all of them are acts by governments. For Freemuse, it appears that suppression of music or text for any reason at all is regarded as censorship and is to be opposed.

As an example, here are entries from the website on April 2, 2006.

¹⁵ <http://www.freemuse.org> From the website: Freemuse, the World Forum on Music and Censorship, is an independent international organization advocating freedom of expression for musicians and composers worldwide.

Freemuse is a membership organization with its secretariat based in Copenhagen, Denmark. For the establishment of a secretariat, Freemuse receives core funding from the Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs and SIDA, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency.

Freemuse was born of the 1st World Conference on Music and Censorship held in Copenhagen in November 1998. The conference joined together professionals from diverse fields and countries – musicians, journalists, researchers, record industry professionals and human rights activists – to examine, discuss and document a wide variety of abuses from the apparently benign to the overtly extreme.

The alarmingly widespread nature of censorship in music prompted the conference attendees to initiate the creation of a new organization, Freemuse. As its guide are the principles outlined in the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights as they apply specifically to musicians and composers. The Freemuse secretariat was established in August 2000.

FREEMUSE IN ACTION

Our objectives are to:

- Document violations and discuss their effects on music life.
- Inform media, human rights organisations and the public.
- Support musicians in need and observe at their trials.
- Develop a global network in support of threatened musicians and composers.

[China: Magazine featuring Cui Jian banned](#)

Three weeks after the first copies of a Chinese version of Rolling Stone hit the newsstands and were torn off the shelves, Chinese regulators said they would not allow it to publish a second issue.

30 March 2006

[Belarus: CD with blacklisted Belarusian rock music](#)

Most of the bands on the CD 'Belarusian Red Book – Music of Belarus' have been blacklisted or censored in their home country

28 March 2006

[Germany: Concert called off due to threats from right-wing radicals](#)

An anti-Nazi concert in the former eastern German border town of Halberstadt was cancelled after the National Democratic Party (NPD) applied pressure to local authorities

21 March 2006

[USA: America's first museum dedicated to freedom of expression](#)

America's first museum dedicated to freedom of expression opens in Chicago on 11 April 2006

20 March 2006

[Belarus election: Blacklisted bands play in Poland](#)

The hope amongst the organisers and artists is that music can fuel revolution and bring about democracy in Belarus

17 March 2006

[UK/Israel: Pink Floyd star rejects cultural boycott](#)

Pink Floyd's Roger Waters has been asked by Palestinians to cancel his show in Tel Aviv or to put on a separate performance for Palestinians

13 March 2006

[Officials detain musicians as possible terrorists](#)

Morrissey was questioned by the FBI and British intelligence after speaking out against Bush and Blair

03 March 2006

[Iran: Forbidden rap album becomes a hit](#)

A new album made by the group Dalu mocks the Islamic Republic's top clerics. It has taken the country by storm, reports Iran Focus

03 March 2006

[China / USA: The Rolling Stones accepts censorship](#)

Veteran rock star group The Rolling Stones will likely follow the beat of China's censors when they perform in China in April concert

03 March 2006

[Bob Titley: Artists afraid to speak out](#)

Bob Titley is one of the founding members of Music Row Democrats, which was born in December 2003 out of frustration and concern about the changing climate on Nashville's legendary music district, Music Row

02 March 2006

[Tunisia/Egypt: Najla too sexy for Egyptian tv](#)

The Egyptian music channel Mazzika will not air Tunisian singer and dancer Najla's new music video because it is considered pornographic

23 February 2006

2. Musical diversity and sustainable development

The links between musical diversity and economic development and the fight against poverty

- Cite examples of the use of music to assist in non-music economic development.
 - Cite examples of government or agency action to develop aspects of the music industry or the music industry as a whole
 - Cite examples of the use of music to alleviate poverty or the conditions contributing to poverty.
-

2.1 Music in development, development of music

This study looks broadly at music in non-music economic development on the one hand and economic development of the music sector on the other.

It might be noted at the outset that this term of reference does not ask that we deal only with economic development that explicitly underpins musical diversity. Support to the development of musical diversity is in some cases at least strongly implicit – where, for instance, the development is about the rescue or promotion of local traditional musics, or world musics. But even where the target music practice is in the economic mainstream, diversity may be served inasmuch as *local* popular musics are supported. We find no example of music sector development where a government has set out explicitly to support the music imported from the multinational record companies, which in most cases would reduce musical diversity.

A study by Gould and Marsh looked at 350 examples of development projects in which culture played a part. The authors were able to categorise the use of culture in four ways:

- Culture as context – the wider social environment and setting
- Culture as content – local cultural practices, beliefs and processes
- Culture as method – cultural and creative communication activities, mainly through artistic forms including music
- Culture as expression – creative elements of culture linked to beliefs, attitudes and emotions, ways of engaging the world and imagining the future.¹⁶

Generally speaking, the issue of culture in development is discussed around a broad definition of culture, such as that published in the Mexico City Declaration, Cultural Policies of 1982¹⁷: 'the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterise a social group...not only arts and letters but also modes of life, fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs.'

¹⁶ Gould, H and Marsh, M: Route-mapping Culture and development: a pilot research project for the Department for International Development. London, Department for International Development. www.creativexchange.org/html/projects/cultdev.html

¹⁷ At the World Conference on Cultural Policies, 1982

This study, on the other hand, addresses the place only of one of the art forms, music, in its relationship to development. In a beginning survey of development projects, various relationships were discovered between music and economic development. They range along a continuum. At one end is music as a part of the cultural context (broadly defined) in which economic development takes place (music *in* development); at the other end of the continuum, the development of a music industry contributes receipts directly to overall economic development (music industry development).

The Gould and Marsh typology can be applied directly to our findings. However, we have categorised the identified projects more directly from the nature of music's role.¹⁸

2.1.1 The developed and developing worlds

In the context of a study executed for UNESCO, by the International Music Council, the attention tends to go to developmental issues in the developing world. Music's place in the economies of developed economies, however unsatisfactory in some aspects, is perhaps more settled. Nevertheless, the economic development of the music sector is an issue in both worlds.

Perhaps the key difference is that developmental issues in the developing world invite beneficial international interest and intervention. Countries of the developed world, and the international institutions that they fund, are willing to contribute to aid programs in the developing world. Various projects are cited below in which the

¹⁸ Gould and Marsh have created the following Conceptual framework:

`Framework 1: The starting point for research in this field – and for the subsequent 1987-96 World Decade on Culture and Development was the assumption that development programmes required a cultural dimension if they were to be sustainable and effective.

`Framework 2: Culture contributes to participatory development. Projects that use cultural and popular media to promote communication, education, participation and dialogue can prove effective especially among the young and non-literate communities. There appears to be quite widespread use of arts activities in development (such as theatre, puppetry, dance, murals) and media (radio, television, video, photography) although the comparative impact of such activities has never been analysed.

`Framework 3: Cultural heritage (tangible and intangible) has been exploited for social and economic growth. In the UK alone the creative industries contribute £10.3 billion to the balance of trade – over 5 per cent of GDP, which is greater than the contribution by the UK's manufacturing industry. The World Bank and NGOs invested in the Virtual Souk, selling products from Tunisia, Lebanon and Morocco via the Internet, as a result of which artisans doubled their income. Projects based on traditional skills can provide an essential income base for poor people.'

In two of their key research hypotheses, Gould and Marsh note the lack of an adequate intellectual framework for existing development projects:

1. Rationale: Cultural approaches are used at field level in development agencies. But the rationale behind using these approaches is not clear, particularly in relation to gaining inclusion and participation of beneficiaries, of promoting more effective development communications, education and attitudinal/behavioural change, and of enabling some measure of social and economic development.

2. Management: The cultural approach is implemented at field level with varying degrees of skill and technical information, and often little understanding of expected outcomes. At the top of the management chain there is very little awareness of these methods and the role of culture in development.

music sectors in developing countries have been assisted with skill transfers and funds from wealthier countries.

However, wealthy countries are unlikely to take a beneficial interest in music development in other wealthy countries. They are more likely to see them as competitors, or to attempt to dominate them for commercial gain. A developed country's attempt to build its own music sector is usually seen as its private business. Cooperation is likely mainly in order to meet a common threat – as with the broad collaboration to put through UNESCO the *Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions*.

It is a routine matter for developed countries to provide subsidies to their own music sectors, whereas in developing countries there may be no cultural subsidies at all. Before proceeding further, it may be useful to make a distinction between two contrasting purposes of such financial assistance: it can be given to support cultural development or economic/financial development.

2.1.2 Cultural development vs. industry assistance

Say that in the Western world a subsidy is given to a symphony orchestra. This support is needed because while the orchestra's performances are deemed to be of great cultural value, a symphony orchestra could not survive in our era as a fully professional entity producing performances of high standard simply from the income it could earn from the box office. In order for it to exist and create high quality of performances, it must have financial assistance. The financial intervention will be counted as successful if the orchestra survives and its work is considered as of high standard. It can be expected that if this happens, the subsidy will continue so that the orchestra can continue to survive and make its cultural contribution.

On the other hand, say that a subsidy is given to assist a popular music group to market itself internationally. Success here would not be the production of high class rock music so much as market success as indicated by the sale of many recordings or live performances overseas and the realisation of a profit. If such a music group achieves a profit, there is no need for continuing subsidy. If within a reasonable time the profit is not achieved, there probably also is little reason for a continuing subsidy because the music group has not succeeded in its purpose – attracting sales. The purpose is not cultural, but to give assistance to move to a level of profitability. We might call it the industry assistance model.

It could be argued that support for cultural development, as with the symphony orchestra example, is not support for economic development inasmuch as the recipients probably cannot become financially self-sustaining. Nevertheless, they do create employment and economic activity and in that sense cultural subsidies assist the economy. Also in some cases, there are flow-on effects that are economically valuable. For instance, a festival may itself take a loss that can only be made up from some sort of subsidy, but if it attracts audience from outside the area, hotels and restaurants may see increased activity and profits.

Our European consultants have an observation about this issue which somewhat blurs our tidy distinction:

'One of the problems that often obstructs actions and initiatives to develop the music industry is the fact, that the actors – governments, music business, music workers and the economies – do not agree on whether music, particularly non-classical music, is to be seen as cultural expression, or as commodity or service. Whereon depends how the music industry is treated, e.g. if it is seen as part of the "normal economy", which does not need any special support apart from the usual economy

policies. The lack of clarity in this question or the unwillingness to agree on the fact, that music can be both – cultural expression AND commodity as well as service - can lead to a standstill or a neglect to deal with the special challenges of the music industry on the part of the national government (as is the case in Germany).’

There are two ways in which such subsidies in developed countries assist in sustaining musical diversity. Firstly, although most of the subsidy goes to sustaining western classical music (in part because orchestras and opera companies need a lot of money by virtue of their size and labour dependency), an array of other musical styles also may receive cultural subsidies on their own merits. Secondly, in some countries there are specific policies for support to a diversity of ethnic and indigenous musics and to further diversity arising from hybridisation.¹⁹

2.1.3 Musical diversity and development

The developmental projects so far discovered do not state as a primary interest the utilisation of musical diversity as a force for economic development nor as an important aspect of music industry development, except by implication in that latter case, if the audience sought for the music is a ‘world music’ audience. However, most of the projects cited below are concerned with the successful use of a local musical genre, and that success strengthens musical diversity as *between* countries but not necessarily *within* them.

There is something of a dilemma in some government-supported initiatives for economic development of the music industry. If economic objectives are to the forefront then development logically will attempt to address the largest possible public. This can mean placing the focus on a narrow rather than a diverse range of genres and possibly on genres that are promoted by the international music industry. The dilemma is that in the great majority of developing countries there is concern in the music community at least that traditional music genres appealing to minority audiences are in danger of extinction. This could well be accelerated by dragging even a larger proportion of the population to a few popular genres.

In fact, time and again in the consultants’ reports the problem of domination of local musical cultures by the musics promoted by the multinational record companies is raised and regretted. We will return to this problem throughout the report.

2.2 Music in development

An economic development program in some aspect of agriculture will take place in a context of existing agricultural practices. It may be that some of those practices are at odds with proposed innovations. Furthermore, the practices will be embedded in and linked to many aspects of the overall culture. Successful introduction of the innovations may well depend upon appropriate sensitivity to existing agricultural practices and their cultural context.

Insofar as it concerns a move from old agricultural practices to new, the relationship between tradition and innovation is in this example very direct and literal. The development of a music industry will similarly need to address the differences in the means of production and dissemination in old and new practices. But because of their ability to express and communicate, music and other arts are utilised also in

¹⁹ For instance, the Australia Council’s Arts for a Multicultural Australia policy -- http://www.ozco.gov.au/council_priorities/multicultural/ama_policy/

strategies for non-musical development. In such an enterprise, agriculture is unlikely to support music in the way that music can support agriculture; it is not a symmetrical relationship.

Following are some project descriptions, mostly in the words of or derived from the project reports (see Appendix 4).

2.2.1 Music as a source of funds for non-music development projects

Despite the broad geographical and cultural span of our consultants, none cited projects of this sort. However, the literature survey turned up one project that produces music recordings and sells them as a way of funding non-music activities.

The Greenstar project records traditional music and other art forms in small villages and markets the products globally via the internet. The funds support a solar-powered community centre that delivers electricity, pure water, health and education information to villages in the developing world.²⁰ While the objective is non-musical, there is a benefit also to the music and those who produce it.

2.2.2 Music as a tool of advocacy for development

Here again, our consultants provided no instances of this use of music. The literature gives us two examples.

The Story Workshop and Educational Trust uses music and other entertainment in advocacy for human rights, democracy, economic development and other objectives in Malawi.²¹

UVA Community Radio – Sri Lanka was launched by UNESCO and uses low-cost digital radio production technology to enable communities to produce media content that addresses their own development needs. The programming includes music, of course.²²

2.2.3 Music as a lure to involve people in development programs

These examples come from the literature survey.

Concerts attract youth then target them. Population Services International (PSI) is collaborating with MTV Russian on a series of music concerts and a website (www.zhivi.ru) which target youth with drug reduction messages. Music is used as a lure and as a vehicle for conveying the messages.²³

Music television shows in Gujarat, India, introduced same-language subtitling. Often, illiterate people sing along with TV music programs. The subtitling ran word-for-word with the lyrics, reinforcing the development of literacy skills.²⁴

²⁰ <http://www.greenstar.org/>

²¹ <http://www.storyworkshop.org/whatwedo.html>

²² <http://www.unites.org/cfapps/wsis/story.cfm?Sid=28>

²³ <http://www.psi.org/news/0304a.html>

²⁴

<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/OPPORTUNITIES/GRANTS/DEVMARKETPLACE/0,,contentMDK:20100393~menuPK:214469~pagePK:180691~piPK:174492~theSitePK:205098,00.html>

Entra en Accion / Act Now Website take a comprehensive approach to adolescent development by allowing young adults to express themselves online while having fun as they learn about health, sexuality, nutrition, democracy, environmental conservation, drug and alcohol prevention, vocational training, and life skills. ²⁵

From a slightly different angle: some countries report the use of music and arts in international trade fairs, as a lure to investors and customers for non-music products. They also can be used to demonstrate a country's sophistication or innovation: if the music is this good, perhaps so is the computer software and so on. This is old territory for the Europeans especially – so old, perhaps, that the consultants forgot to mention it. You will find some references in reports from Australia and New Zealand. See Appendices.

2.2.4 Music as an element in non-music development

Most consultants mention the use of music as a device to build tourism. Of course, since tourism is a source of employment for musicians and may also generate broader musical outcomes such as the production of recordings, this is a two-way street where music and tourism are mutually supportive.

Tourism can be a very important source of support for traditional musics. For instance, in *Vietnam* the former court music is heard almost exclusively in performances for tourists:

'For example, the traditional chamber music of the former aristocratic sphere now is performed by musicians and singers on the tourism boat flowing on the Parfum River, Hue city, Central Vietnam. The Nha Nhac-former Hue court music is now performed in the former royal hall for tourists. The music called 'Of Amateurs' in the southern area often attracts the tourists.'

Some concern is expressed that, presumably since tourists are uneducated in local traditions, lowest common denominator adaptations of the music may be made in order to satisfy them. This can affect the integrity of the music even in circumstances where tourists are not the target audience.

The *Algerian* consultant points to the pervasive role of music in traditional life and how this is being put to economic use in tourism:

'By tradition, music is closely related to the socio-economic life of the Algeria's regions, rural in most cases. Music accompanies every season-related event, linked to the collection of dates in the Sahara, the sheep feast in the high plateaus, the cherry feast in Kabylie etc. In light of a recently expressed will to revitalise the Algerian tourist sector, the traditional music has been involved as an essential vector of promotion and valorization of tourism. Thus artists and ensembles of traditional music and chant are often associated with touristic events (professional fairs, festivals).'

The Latin American consultants point out that in many Latin American countries, music is used to boost the tourist industry. 'In *Ecuador*, as in many other countries, traditional music is performed in tourist areas. *Bolivia* is planning to establish *Misiones de Chiquitos* (a city declared Cultural Patrimony of Humanity), a tourist destination, adding a wide artistic and cultural schedule. The International Festival Viña del Mar, *Chile*, although it privileges commercial music, is established to attract tourism. In *México*, the *Festival Internacional Cervantino* is a forum open to classic

²⁵ <http://www.entraenaccion.org/>

and popular arts, and it is an instrument to attract tourists. In Mexico, the national music is particularly used to promote tourism, and is used in commercial and governmental advertising. *República Dominicana*'s Festival del Merengue²⁶ is organized by the Tourism Secretary, and is a plentiful tourist attraction. (See Appendix for Latin America.)'

Consultants from *Morocco, China, Singapore, Australia, New Zealand, Croatia, Greece, Ireland, Siberia, Slovenia, Turkey, Cameroon, Congo, South Africa* and countries of *East Africa* mentioned the use of music to build tourism. The tourist industry is not only about travel. There are economic beneficiaries across a broad range of sectors: other art forms and entertainment, hotels, restaurants, retail stores and all their suppliers. (The music sector is similar in a way: it is not just about the performers and the venues, but the record companies, retail stores, broadcasters, film and television companies etc.) See the consultants' reports in the Appendices.

Festivals are a special instance of the use of arts and music to build tourism. A number of consultants brought festivals to our attention. *China's* Nanning Festival is a rather spectacular example – contributing to tourism and to musical development of the best kind, but also to much broader economic outcomes.

'The Nanning International Folk Song Art Festival in Guangxi Province, which has been held for 6 consecutive years, is a good example. The festival is aimed to promote the national culture and to expand the exchanges between Chinese and foreign cultures. This event attracts a large number of Chinese and foreign audiences, provides a platform for the communication and development of the Chinese folk songs, introduces many folk song singers with both national and modern characteristics, and promotes the creation of a lot of new folk songs combining strong countryside tinges and modern music elements.

'Focusing on the folk music, the Nanning Folk Song Art Festival has been expanded with the creation of many relative cultural and economic programs. Since 2004, the Festival has been held simultaneously with the China-ASEAN Expo and has therefore become an important platform for the cultural and art exchanges with the ASEAN nations. The Festival has created such programs as the Charming South East Asia, the Fashion Show of South East Asia, the International Travel to South East Asia, the Festival of Foods, the International Dragon Boat Contest, the China-ASEAN International Modern Dance Culture Development Symposium, the Nanning Trade Fair, which have greatly propelled the economic development of the city and the province at large.

'At the first China-ASEAN Expo, the Guangxi Province had 100 programs contracted with a total value of 30 billion RMB. To attract businesses and investments, Nanning offered 248 projects at the 2004 Folk Song Art Festival. Among them, there are 100 key projects worth 12.6 billion RMB and 148 major projects worth 8.55 billion RMB. These projects cover a wide range of fields from infrastructure, industry, agriculture, and real estate to tourism, public health, sports, industrial parks and trade items. Among these projects, the largest has a total investment of 2.184 billion RMB. At the contracts signing ceremony of the 2003 Guangxi Investment and Trade Fair, 21 foreign investment projects and 23 domestic investment projects concluded with signature of contracts, with total contractual funds reaching 731.34 million USD and 13.866 billion RMB, respectively.'

²⁶ <http://www.dominicana.com.do/festival-merengue.html>

From *Mali: Sustaining and Professionalizing the Festival in the Desert*, Division of Arts and Cultural Enterprise. This Festival now provides solutions to the pressing development needs of northern Mali and is a key event not only for culture but also for the development of cultural tourism and the Malian economy, while simultaneously serving as a factor for peace and security. However, the Festival in the Desert is facing several substantial challenges, which its organizers are finding increasingly difficult to cope with and which call into question the long-term viability of the event and the control of its organization by local communities. Against this backdrop, the Global Alliance and the Forum Francophone des Affaires, in close cooperation with the UNESCO Office in Bamako, are developing a project based on the technique of twinning, calling in professionals from the sector who have considerable experience in the management of world music festivals so as to facilitate the transfer of professional skills. The project thus aims to equip the organizers and partners of the Festival in the Desert with the tools and know-how that will enable the Festival to produce its own resources, and become established as a genuinely viable and dynamic cultural industry.²⁷

2.3 Development of a music industry

2.3.1 Some research studies and theoretical papers

Our focus is on the developing world. There has been research into the circumstances of particular countries or regions, and studies also of more pervasive issues such as the development of the creative industries and its applicability to cultural industries.

Our South African consultant draws our attention to a description of the overall situation in Africa by Mandla Tchebwa. He draws up an inventory of new *African* music genres from a commercial point of view, noting that "On the music industry level, one notices the existence of a few CD manufacturers (between five and eight), most of them falling in South Africa, and some fifty-odd recording studios (90 per cent of them falling under the 'home studio' category) ... Analysing the figures provided by the International Federation of the Phonographic Industry (IFPI), one also sees that Africa represents 0.4 per cent of the world market for sound media. The few countries that stand out from these statistics are Ghana, South Africa and Zimbabwe". Tchebwa also gives the average number of 'internationally recognized celebrities' per country as in the order of 22 per cent for South Africa, with the next closest competitor being the Democratic Republic of the Congo at only 8 per cent. These music industry aspects are important to this questionnaire, in the light of the statement Tchebwa (2005: 53)²⁸ makes that "When all is said and done, African music today is made up of a new generation of cultural entrepreneurs who have taken over the reins of the music industry". Although many South Africans themselves might dispute Tchebwa's claim (2005: 52) that "With the exception of South Africa, where the music industry appears to enjoy the best conditions for expansion (virtual absence of piracy, a macroeconomic structure that creates security, a large number of quality artists, etc.), the rest of the African music industry is

²⁷ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=23272&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

²⁸ Tchebwa, Manda. 2005. *African Music: New Challenges, New Vocations*. Published by UNESCO, printed in Spain. ISBN UNESCO 92-3-103988-1.

fragmented ...”, the privileged position of (South Africa) on the African continent is clear. (See Appendix 18.)

South Africa established a Music Industry Task Team (MITT) which first met in early 2000 in response to an expression of problems within the music industry by musicians and their representative organisations. The MITT comprised people widely representative of the industry.

Areas of investigation included the following – a check list of most of the things one needs to know about a commercial music sector:

- The adequacy of the legislative framework governing the industry;
- Contracts – comparison to international best practice and the education of musicians regarding their rights;
- Human resource development – coordination of existing efforts;
- Piracy – possible solutions;
- Distribution and marketing – profile of South African Music, e-commerce and establishing an export council;
- Wholesaling and retailing – concentration of ownership;
- Local content – quota level and monitoring;
- Music publishing – access, control, and copyright;
- Work permits;
- Royalty collection – transparency;
- Historical injustices – redress;
- Recognition of our musical legacy;
- Allegations of racism; and
- Recording – access to facilities, setting up of infrastructure and profit and not-for-profit partnerships.

This is a very interesting and elaborate effort potentially involving a number of government departments. There is more information in the South African report in the Appendices. You will see that this report describes a country virtually reinventing itself with new legislation and initiatives covering an enormous range of issues.

In the *UK*, there are several important research initiatives. The Live Music Forum includes representatives from the music industry, the Arts Council, grass roots music organizations, local authorities, small venue operators and Government. It aims to promote the live performance of music and works towards the implementation and monitoring of reforms relating to live music. It will commission and consider research on live music in Great Britain and make recommendations to the British government based on this research and expertise.²⁹ The Department for Culture, Media and Sport has funded a research project, undertaken by Kingston University's Small Business Research Centre, to look at the problems faced by small business in the music industry in accessing finance. The report aims to identify the finance options available, the barriers to accessing these options, and ways in which industry and Government might best overcome these barriers.³⁰ The department maintains a living document that serves as Music Money Map, which can help small and medium enterprises with finding funding.

The *Australian* government has a program called the Industry Action Agenda, available to any industry that can meet its criteria. It is an industry/government collaboration in which active participation is required from the industry, both in

²⁹ http://www.culture.gov.uk/creative_industries/music/livemusicforum.htm

³⁰ http://www.culture.gov.uk/global/publications/archive_2001/banking_on_hit.htm

research and implementation. The government undertakes a tip to toe analysis of the operation of the industry and makes recommendations for development. There may be some government financial participation in the development process but there is heavy responsibility on the industry. This particular project in theory includes all musical styles except classical music. In practice, because it strongly involves the recording industry, it is likely to be dominated by the most commercially successful genres.

The European consultants report that 'In the past few years, the culture industries in *Bulgaria* have been increasingly perceived as a sector with an important contribution to local, regional and national development, and an impact on the local labour market. A Council of Europe funded pilot project on "Cultural Diversity and Cultural Enterprise" was launched in Bulgaria in 2001. This project implemented in close co-operation with the Euro-Bulgarian Cultural Centre was designed to analyse Bulgaria's potential in the sphere of culture industries and identify possibilities for their development. Culture industries include traditional industries (radio and television, recording industry, filmmaking and publishing), as well as cultural activities which are on the boundary between traditional arts and new flexible forms of creativity in the media, advertising and design. Stage two of this project (carried out in 2002) targeted media and enterprise in this field; developing specific models of funding and, in the longer term, creating an agency for the development of the culture industries.

'The development of culture industries at the regional and local level is also a priority in projects under the PHARE Economic and Social Integration Program (education and establishment of information centres for the Roma population).'

The literature survey turned up a number of interesting examples. For more extensive descriptions go to Appendix 4 or to the links given for the complete studies.

Cuban Music Industry Development and Marketing Plan. A paper in the series *Developing Countries Becoming a Global Player: Opportunities in the Music Industry. Expanding the Economic Potential of Developing Countries: the Music Sector in the Caribbean Region*. World Intellectual Property Organization/ UNCTAD Unctad/Wipo Joint Project. ³¹

Singing All the Way to the Bank: The Case for Economic Development through Music in Cape Verde. This is an analysis of the prospects for development of a music industry in the Cape Verde islands, off Senegal. Two views of development: 'According to one view, development is a process of economic growth, a rapid and sustained expansion of production, productivity and income per head... According to the other, espoused by UNDP's annual Human Development Report and by many distinguished economists, development is seen as a process that enhances the effective freedom of the people involved to pursue whatever they have reason to value.' (p.10) ³² (What a very good concept!)

The Senegalese music industry: international production chains - Dakar and Paris. This is a research study in two parts. The first, funded by the United Nations Commission on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), seeks to explore the contribution of cultural industries to economic development in less developed countries. The

³¹ http://www.wipo.int/about-ip/en/studies/pdf/study_a_gray.pdf

³² <http://ideas.repec.org/p/wpa/wuwpdc/0505013.html>

project focuses on the music industry in Senegal (home of artists such as Ismael Lo, Baaba Maal, and Youssou N'Dour). The first phase of the work is to compile a report on the nature, structure and organisation of the music industry in Senegal. The second part of the project concerns the role that Paris plays in the francophone world music industry, in particular the Recording/Post-production/Festival aspects of the world music production chain: in short, how music from Senegal reaches a 'world' market.³³

Assuring the autonomy and viability of festivals as a vehicle for local economic and social development. In the framework of its strategy to strengthen the capacity of cultural actors in developing countries, UNESCO's Global Alliance for Cultural Diversity is initiating an analysis of the development of a festival and cultural events network in countries of the African, Caribbean and Pacific regions (ACP). In the initial stage, the Global Alliance is identifying the major obstacles in sustaining and professionalizing festivals, mainly dedicated to music, by distributing a preliminary questionnaire in order to devise a coherent pilot project. The ultimate objective will be to facilitate the collaboration of festivals within the network by offering a better exchange of know-how and relevant skills in order to assure the festivals' autonomy and their viability as a vehicle for local economic and social development.³⁴

Copyright-Based Industries in Arab Countries. This paper analyzes the economic performance of four key copyright-based industries (book publishing, music sound recording, film production, and software) in five Arab countries (Morocco, Tunisia, Egypt, Jordan, and Lebanon). Using the Porter (Diamond) model as its theoretical background, a survey was conducted in the years 2002-03 among 242 experts, covering firm representatives, industry, and government experts. The results were incorporated into five national case studies. The two major objectives of the study were to estimate the economic importance of copyright-based industries and to understand the factors affecting that performance.³⁵

Best practice cases in the music industry and their relevance for government policies in developing countries. Roger Wallis and Zelijka Kojul-Wright. This is a most valuable study that looks at a great number of the key issues to be addressed in any music industry development initiative.³⁶

Creative Industries and Development. The UN Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) published a report on Creative Industries and Development on 4 June 2004. It observes that, because the world's creative industry sector lies at the crossroads between the arts, business and technology, creative industries are forecast to grow, on average, by 10 percent a year. "Creativity, more than labour and capital, or even traditional technologies, is deeply embedded in every country's cultural context" yet sector players, states the Executive Summary, are often

³³

<http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/geographyAndEnvironment/whosWho/profiles/pratt/pdf/Senegal.pdf>

³⁴ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=26597&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

³⁵

<http://www.gdnet.org/cf/search/display.cfm?search=GDNDOCS&act=DOC&docnum=DOC18718>

³⁶ http://www.wipo.int/about-ip/en/studies/pdf/study_r_wallis.pdf

marginalized by a "combination of domestic policy weaknesses and global systemic biases."³⁷ The World Bank published an article about the growth of creative industries, based around Richard Florida's observations about a 'creative class'.³⁸

2.3.2 Development projects

While some governments offer no assistance to the economic development of music sectors, and others offer only the assistance available to any industry (as for instance in Germany or Sweden), there is no shortage of examples of targeted assistance that takes into account music's particular circumstances.

This assistance may come in the form of regulations, for instance to require broadcast of local music, which can then translate into increased sales of recordings of the music broadcast. Such regulatory assistance is important to the economic development of music sectors, but will be addressed in section 4.

The forms of development assistance might be placed in the following categories:

- a) Assistance to a music sector more or less as a whole
- b) Support to music through state-owned companies
- c) Support through subsidies
- d) Support through tax concessions
- e) Support through public/private partnerships
- f) Support through financial instruments e.g. access to loan funds

The support could go to

- a) Live performance, including venues, cultural centres, festivals
- b) Record production and distribution
- c) Music video production
- d) Music publishing
- e) Broadcasting
- f) Internet and multimedia
- g) Improving businesses practices
- h) Building music exports
- i) Statistics collection

2.3.2.1 The forms of development

- a) Assistance to a music sector more or less as a whole

We think here of single coherent development plans rather than the total collection of independent provisions such as would be found in most wealthy states.

The South African government, through its very broad approach, has laid an exemplary basis for development of the entire music sector, with the involvement of a number of government departments. Implementation will no doubt be an issue.

³⁷ http://www.unctad.org/en/docs//tdxibpd13_en.pdf

³⁸ <http://www1.worldbank.org/devoutreach/nov03/article.asp?id=221>

(Refer to the account under 2.3.1.) Likewise with the flow-on from the Australian Industry Action Agenda, and projects actual or potential in Bulgaria, Cape Verde and Senegal, reported in the same section. The European consultants claim that all musical life in Norway is sponsored by the government; we are not sure whether this is literally true nor whether there is therefore an overall developmental plan.

Some of the most interesting projects have been facilitated by UNESCO's Global Alliance for Cultural Diversity. Here are some examples from the literature survey, Appendix 4.

Musicians' cooperatives: a new model for developing the African music industry. Implementation of a first cooperative in Burkina Faso launched in November 2004. Initiated by the International Federation of Musicians (IFM), this project was launched on December 2003 in the Cape (Republic of South Africa) on the occasion of a workshop on the formation of musicians' cooperatives. Organized with the participation of experts from the South African Government's Department of Arts and Culture, the International Labour Organization (ILO), the non-governmental organization International Cooperative Alliance (ICA), the Musicians' Union of South Africa (MUSA) and the British Musicians' Union (BMU), the workshop identified the basic principles of the cooperative concept, stimulating the development of new forms of entrepreneurship which are better adjusted to local structures and offer new professional prospects for African musicians. Following this preparatory work, the Global Alliance and IFM, together with the UNESCO Offices in Bamako, Maputo and Windhoek, support the creation and supervision of the first musicians' cooperatives in Burkina Faso and Namibia to promote the grouping of local musicians, and in particular musicians working mostly in the informal sector, and the pooling of production resources, individually insufficient to ensure the economic viability of a small or medium-sized business but collectively able to constitute a foundation for sustainable activity. At the same time, if the model for musicians' cooperatives turns out to be an effective way of overcoming obstacles in the development of cultural industries in the music branch and helps to formalize and improve the status of musicians, the creation of cooperatives in the rest of the continent will be encouraged with a view to the constitution in the medium term of a pan-African network. Consultations of all stakeholders are underway in Namibia.³⁹

Development of a national strategy for the Jamaican music industry. National strategy approved. Projects under preparation.

The Jamaican authorities have been convinced since the 1990s that Jamaican music is not only an effective way of making the national culture known, but also a powerful engine for economic and social growth. Several initiatives have been undertaken by Jamaican agencies and regional and international bodies such as UNCTAD, WIPO and CARICOM to tackle the numerous obstacles, such as the lack of technical equipment and adequately trained human resources and weak enforcement of copyright, that stunt the music industry's growth. However, these efforts have not secured the long-term involvement and trust of the musicians, performers, producers and record labels, so that the accomplishment of the objectives pursued has constantly been hampered by the lack of cooperation and dialogue between the various actors in the sector as well as by private market participants' distrust of public intervention. In this context, the Global Alliance has commissioned a report

³⁹ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=25714&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

that has now been published, proposing a national strategy for the music industry that, while building on previous efforts, will adopt a genuinely inclusive approach to public policy decision-making. Based on a thorough review of existing studies on the Jamaican music sector and interviews with relevant stakeholders from the music industry, private and public sectors, banks and government bodies, the report suggests a number of general strategies to be followed and lists further concrete priority areas for immediate action.⁴⁰

Reinforcing the independent popular music industry in Colombia. Division of Arts and Cultural Enterprise. The Colombian Government is developing a national strategy aimed at improving the position of the Colombian popular music industry nationally and internationally. The project, based on coordinating the efforts of the main public and private partners in the sector, will help to professionalize and structure the branch, strengthen independent production and distribution and continue the introduction of pioneering anti-piracy policies.⁴¹

b) Support to music through state-owned companies

In many countries, there are state owned broadcasters that have a responsibility to give special attention or support to local music and other local culture. More of this under 'broadcasting' in 2.3.3.2.

Otherwise, on the evidence available here, support through state-owned companies is not widespread. In Vietnam, says our consultant, 'there are two big music industrial companies who receive State funding and tax support to produce mainly all kinds of VCD, DVD, books'. In Tanzania, a former socialist state, almost all of the many community festivals are organised and funded by the government.

c) Support through subsidies

Subsidy support has already been discussed more generally above. It seems that music subsidies are found in all the wealthy countries but may be totally unavailable in some developing countries. Our consultants in African countries state that subsidy assistance is almost or totally absent. Sometimes the subsidy is in the form of a capital grant (e.g. in Singapore, to the new symphony orchestra to allow it to earn operating costs through interest income).

d) Support through tax concessions

In most Western countries, donations to arts companies attract some form of tax concession. Governments lose tax income through such concessions, so commonly there are rules designed to govern and contain them.

The concessions reported by the consultants make up an interesting menu of possibilities: they include tax exemptions on musical instruments and reduced VAT on instrument builders (Algeria); on pedagogical equipment (Algeria); tax incentives to encourage the formation of new companies (Singapore); tax relief to investors in new and emerging music acts (Ireland); reduced turnover tax rate for cultural industries (Germany); waiving of payroll tax (Australia).

e) Support through public/private partnerships

⁴⁰ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=17176&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

⁴¹ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=22015&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

Governments shift some of the financial and operational responsibilities, while maintaining some continuing control, by entering into partnerships with private interests. In Australia, the Industry Action Agenda requires industry participation in return for government investment. In Germany, 'Strategic public-private-partnerships between the public and private sector are increasing on cultural projects. The cultural industry is seen as a factor of growth in times of economical decline. There are governmental efforts to promote the private cultural industry not only by tax relief or similar privileges, but also directly...'

f) Support through financial instruments

'L'Institut pour le Financement du Cinéma et des Industries Culturelles (Institute for Financing of Cinema and Culture Industries, IFCIC) supports the cultural industries (including the music industry), by facilitating financing by offering guarantees against loans given to the cultural industry. IFCIC also helps very small cultural enterprises by providing assistance in preparing loan demands. These guarantees help to limit the risk by entrepreneurs in the cultural sector. In 2003, 22 loans against risk were guaranteed to enterprises in the music sector, for a value of €1.9 million. The IFCIC is funded by the French Ministry of Culture and Communication.'⁴²

As noted in the Research section above, the UK Department for Culture, Media and Sport has a research project to look at the problems faced by small business in the music industry in accessing finance. The report aims to identify the finance options available, the barriers to accessing these options, and ways in which industry and Government might best overcome these barriers. Presumably, the report will lead to actions along those lines.

2.3.2.2 Targets for support

Subsidies and the other forms of support mentioned above can go to any of the entities or purposes mentioned below.

a) Live performance

Live performances are the traditional key target for government subsidies. The performances are given in the home town venues, in festivals, on tour domestically or internationally.

It is through subsidies to live performances that basic support can be given to non-mainstream music, with consequent benefit to musical diversity. As noted already, 21C economics make it impossible for large classical orchestras and opera companies to survive at a good standard from earned income, and so their existence depends upon subsidies. Traditional musics that have lost their social/economic bases also can be rescued through subsidies.

The EU supports ECHO, a network of concert organisations. ECHO brings together those in charge of 13 concert organisations and cultural centres in Belgium, France, Germany, the United Kingdom, Greece, Sweden, Austria and the Netherlands. ECHO is a forum for the exchange of ideas and suggestions as well as the conceptualization of international projects.

We have noted already the work of the Live Music Forum in the UK, promoting the live performance of music and working towards the implementation and monitoring of reforms relating to live music.

⁴² <http://www.ifcic.fr/pc/accueil.htm>

Support to live performance can come indirectly through subsidies to the performing venues. In many European cities this is the route by which funds reach the opera and dance companies and orchestras.

The Fonds voor Podiumprogrammering en Marketing (Fund for programming and marketing of venues, FPPM) subsidizes Dutch venues for theatre, cabaret, jazz, chamber music and pop music. Its aim is to increase quality. The FPPM is the first governmental institution that helps venues and wants to encourage collaboration between them.⁴³ One of the programs of the FPPM is the Nederlands Popmuziek Plan (Dutch Popmusic Plan). Venues' losses through concerts of newcomers or lesser known Dutch bands are covered up to a fixed maximum, so that the financial risk for the venues is smaller. This plan increased the possibilities for bands to develop their performances on stage and contributed to the professionalisation of venues. In 2001, the Dutch Pop Music Plan was extended with regulations for small venues, big venues and festivals.

b) Record production and distribution

There is very widespread support to recording. Some examples from our consultants.

In Argentina, the Discográficas de Buenos Aires is intended to strengthen the local independent recording companies. It provides policies to assist their presence in the national and international markets, financial assistance and support to new recordings.

The National Arts Council of Singapore also provides grants for non-profit music organisations embarking on recording, publishing.

In Australia, modest subsidy is given to production of recordings by less commercial artists of high accomplishment and by young emerging commercial artists attempting to break into the market. There is also assistance to indigenous artists, mostly performing their own version of rock or country music.

In France, MFA - Musique Française d'Aujourd'hui (French Music of Today) was started in 1978 to promote contemporary French composers by encouraging in particular the recording of contemporary music. The initiative for MFA was taken by the Ministry of Culture and Communication, Radio France, SACEM (collecting society) and SACD (Société des Auteurs et Compositeurs Dramatiques). FCM - Le Fonds pour la création musicale (Fund for musical creation) gives assistance to music professionals in all repertoires for recording, as well as performing, training, audio-visual presentation, national and international festivals etc.).⁴⁴

Music development opportunities for New Zealand's Māoris. Te Māngai Pāho is a Crown Entity established to make funding available to the national network of Māori radio stations and for the production of Māori language television programmes, music CDs and videos.⁴⁵

Many countries support the recording of their traditional musics – not necessarily for economic purposes, so we do not treat this at length in this section. But Indonesia is an interesting special case. Our Indonesian consultant tells the story; here is the short version. (See Appendix.)

⁴³ <http://www.fppm.nl/>

⁴⁴ <http://www.lefcm.org>

⁴⁵ <http://www.tmp.govt.nz/index.html>

'The government of Indonesia founded a recording industry, called Lokananta (literally: "the sound from heaven") in 1961 that was meant for documenting the music from all over Indonesia. Since the outset the company had recorded ethnic music from most parts of the nation, ethnic music, classical music, regional songs, storytelling, popular music, and hybrid music. Above all the major music and songs were represented in the recordings. This recording [program] portrayed the diversity of the richness of the nation and using the recordings people could get the overall "pictures" of musical expression of the country... Renewal of the recent repertoires and styles was also recorded in newer albums resulting in better representation of the musical expression of the state. At that time Lokananta was... the only recording company in the nation.

'In 1993 (May 5th), however, the government of Indonesia thought that the company should change the status from government-run company to private company (called Persero, still under government control), assuming that by using the new status the company can get more benefit. [The] reason behind the change of status was that Lokananta took financial losses... The budget for the production of recordings was high, especially when the company had to pay for musicians who had to come to Surakarta, Central Java because the recording equipment was not portable. The government saw this as material and budget lost rather than musical and cultural investment. As a result, Lokananta company now does not have authority to disseminate the diversity of music, and people now cannot listen to music of the nation...

'[Now], the company's responsibility is to produce music that is ordered by other companies... Now other companies - that have a different vision and mission about overall musical culture - replace Lokananta position as the "guide to overview" the life of music in Indonesia. Because most of the companies, if not all, do not have as good perspective as Lokananta in thinking of the diversity of music in the nation, this becomes one of the factors that weakens the strategy to promote the diversity of music in Indonesia. Consequently, now people tend to listen to popular music, the genres which the companies favour and prefer to promote and produce. Now, due to the "popular values" that are offered by the recording companies, people own the "instant values" and have lost the taste of the diversity in Indonesian music.'

So this is an excellent demonstration that the question for the economic development of the music sector can be to the cost of musical diversity.

In a number of African countries, copyright laws do not yet exist, or have been passed but are not adequately enforced. In the absence of enforcement and the strong presence of piracy, royalties are not collected and neither artists nor record companies receive royalty payments. Artists are given a one-off payment by the record companies and no further financial benefit. So the artists are supported neither with cash nor by legislation.

c) Music video production

A number of countries assist in the production of music videos as a marketing adjunct to record production.

d) Music publishing

Music publishing these days is not very much about the printed page. Rather it is about the exploitation of the neighbouring rights in musical works – for instance, the right to include them in film or television soundtracks. The countries with a strong interest in supporting production and marketing of recordings will also wish to see exploitation of the neighbouring rights.

The government agency, New Zealand Trade and Enterprise (NZTE), is aiming to leverage off New Zealand's high profile in film in Los Angeles, to get New Zealand music noticed and used by entertainment industry buyers, music supervisors, games developers, media and publishers. Successful placement of music in international feature films, television, television commercials, video games and other digital content can have a significant direct economic benefit for the artist.

e) Broadcasting

There is a very interesting story about *New Zealand*. In 1991, New Zealand music was heard on commercial radio only about one minute in every hour – 2% of broadcast time. It was the local music that was foreign to audiences.

This was the time of the negotiation of the World Trade Organisation's Uruguay Round. New Zealand's government signed on to deregulate anything with a heartbeat, including radio. Many governments have been faced with the problem that there is little of their own music on radio. Commonly, they respond with a regulation requiring that some minimum percentage of broadcast time should be given to local music. But the New Zealand government gave away the right to do that. Instead, it decided to provide funds to a new government agency, New Zealand on Air, to somehow increase the broadcast of New Zealand music.

By 1999, local music content had increased from 2% to 11% and was stuck there – better than before, although still very low. Around this time, a new government was elected. One of its promises was to abrogate its WTO agreement and introduce a local content quota for music on radio. However, it quickly discovered that the financial penalties would be so high as to make it infeasible. Seeking an alternative, in 2000 it set an objective of 20% local content on radio, and doubled the funding to New Zealand On Air. In the subsequent four years, local music content doubled to 22%.

New Zealand On Air funds the production of recordings and music videos, and some radio programs that feature new Zealand music. It also invests in promotional work. It produces promotional sampler discs that go to every radio station in New Zealand, and it employs a team of radio pluggers who promote the discs to the radio stations.

The success has been remarkable. From the 44 albums released over the last few years came 168 radio singles, of which 90% went on to be radio hits. 213 singles by new artists had been released, of which 50% made the top 40. The next phase is the international promotion of New Zealand artists.

It must be said that this New Zealand program would do little to advance musical diversity. These are recordings more or less in the international popular styles.

However, the New Zealand consultant points out that her government also funds Niu FM, a pilot National Pacific Radio Network. Niu FM was created to help reduce disparities and build the capacity of Pacific communities. It has been instrumental in providing critical exposure for aspiring Pacific musicians. Niu FM's programming is identifiably "Pacific", with Pacific artists and music accounting for 45% of the songs played every day. This music originates from Pacific artists within New Zealand and overseas. While a number of Pacific artists are among New Zealand's most popular "mainstream" artists, the amount of airtime exposure for Pacific artists overall on Niu FM is greater than that of any other national network.⁴⁶

⁴⁶ www.niufm.com/

China has established a broadcaster specifically to support non-popular musics. The objectives are probably as much cultural as economic.

'The Music Channel of CCTV (CCTV-16) went on the air on March 29 2003. Based on the function of music appreciation, the Music Channel puts more efforts into the popularization of music knowledge, guiding the citizens in increasing their music knowledge and appreciation ability by providing the TV audience with a platform to access and understand music. The Channel's broadcast time per day is 18 hours and 10 minutes, of which 70% is for Chinese music while foreign music programs take up 30%... Over the past two years, these Chinese music programs ... have played a very active role in popularizing, promoting and enhancing music diversity. Among them, "Folk Songs in China" is a very successful program...

'However, the Music Channel is also confronted with severe difficulties. First, it can not be watched in many provinces of China. Second, as it doesn't play pop music, it is less attractive to advertising agents, leading to its limited sources of income. Under such situation, the Channel often suffers from shortage of programs. The editors of the Music Channel have to either replay the old programs or simply to rearrange and edit the existing materials and broadcast them in other forms.

'The Beijing Music Radio, one of the seven professional radio stations of the Beijing People's Radio Company, which started broadcasting in January 1993, is the only radio station that is exclusively dedicated to music. Its programs include the coverage of big international music events, e.g. the Grammy Awarding Ceremony, the Salzburg Music Festival, the Berlin Forest Concerts, etc. For the Chinese music, it offers such programs as the Ranking List of the Chinese Songs, the Ranking List of the Global Chinese Songs, the Radio Arena for the Chinese Folk Songs, the Songs You Love, the Everlasting Charm, and Records in Memory.

'The audience of the Beijing Music Radio is mainly composed of young people aged between 15 and 34. Among them, 56% have received senior middle school education and 18% have college and university education...Nevertheless, the focus of the Beijing Music Radio is foreign music and pop music. Even in the Chinese music programs, there are mostly newly created songs. There are few folk songs and even fewer original folk songs. This is very disadvantageous to the protection and promotion of music heritage. Especially for the young audience, this important radio media has closed the window for them to access and to understand the brilliant Chinese musical culture.'

f) Internet and multimedia

There are government programs to support development of the 'creative industries', of which music is one. This tends to put weight on the involvement of music in the new digital technologies.

In Austria, IP ImpulsProgramm creativwirtschaft is a recently initiated support program funded with 3.8 million € up to the end of 2005. It focuses on music, multimedia and design. It is part of a national strategy that aims to encourage the innovation potential and competitiveness of Austrian enterprises in the CI-sector as well as increasing the number of enterprises and jobs in this field.

For individual artists and for developing countries, the internet offers a way to take music recordings to the international market without dealing with major record companies.

g) Training the professionals

The reports from consultants in Australia, New Zealand, Singapore and South Africa mention projects that train musicians or other music sector workers in business practices so that they become more effective in generating income or building music businesses. No doubt this sort of training is available in many countries. (See Appendices.)

The literature includes descriptions of some projects in this area that had more specific objectives.

Creating opportunities for Cuban musicians to develop their professional capacities
The Global Alliance, together with the Cuban Higher Institute of the Arts (ISA), has launched a pilot project to train musicians in the fundamental principles of copyright, neighbouring rights and the contractual practices applied both nationally and internationally in the music market.⁴⁷

Professional training programme for promoters of the African music industry with the aim of increasing their participation in international markets. Within the framework of the "Africa Fête" festival, held in Dakar in December 2003, the Global Alliance launched a pilot project to provide tailor-made training and on-site support for 12 professionals from the African music industry...to attend the MIDEM, the biggest international trade fair for music, in 2004. Trainers experienced in the promotion, communication and commercialization of world music made their expertise available for the professional training programme.⁴⁸

Training at cultural goods retail outlets in Cuba: strengthening promotional and marketing techniques Cuban culture represents one of the island's main attractions for the seven million visiting tourists each year. Nevertheless, this market, which has a significant potential for generating foreign exchange, is far from being adequately exploited, mainly owing to a lack of cultural goods retail outlets adapted to the needs and expectations of consumers. To remedy the situation, a partnership between the Santillana Group (a prestigious European business specialized in the distribution of cultural and leisure goods), the Cuban authorities and the main local distribution companies (ARTEX, EGREM, Ediciones Cubanas and Casa de las Américas) helped to realize a professional training and career development programme for cultural retail outlets in order to ensure better organization and management in music, book and multimedia stores. Twenty participants, including managers, salespeople and administrators of key tourist shops in the cities of Habana, Varadero, Trinidad and Miramar in addition to Cuban airports, all benefited from training that focused on improving marketing strategies that target tourists.⁴⁹

h) Building music exports

This is a strong objective for many countries in both the developed and developing countries.

It is a dilemma, perhaps, for developing countries that if they do not have an effective and enforced copyright system, it is difficult to build a modern, well-

⁴⁷ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28579&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

⁴⁸ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28581&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

⁴⁹ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28575&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

functioning music sector from which international careers can be launched. Furthermore, without the copyright system, they cannot be of great interest to the multinational record companies that are the main gateways to the international market, nor can they easily recover foreign royalties owing to artists based domestically. This probably is the case, for instance, for many African countries, even though their music is very strong in the world music market.

Argentina has two export-related programs. The Discográficas de Buenos Aires has already been mentioned. Cultura Exportas is a program to promote cultural small industry into foreign countries.⁵⁰

The *Brazilian* government and the music industry want to join forces to increase music exports. In January 2006 at the Midem international music trade fair in Cannes, agreements were reached to achieve trade of 2.6 million dollars in foreign countries. Music managers and government authorities are conscious of the great demand in the world for Brazilian music, so they trust in its capacity to aid economic development and social inclusion. In pursuit of the objective of increasing Brazilian music into the international market, in June 2005 the program *Musica do Brasil* was opened by the Ministry of Culture to independent recording initiatives and exporting organizations.⁵¹

Music exports seem to be a major preoccupation for many Western governments, so far as their music sectors are of interest to them.

The *European Union* supports music networks, especially the networking of national music export offices, which already exist or are about to be set up in a lot of European countries (e.g. France, Finland, Austria, Germany, Hungary, Spain, Norway, Sweden, United Kingdom). These offices are often set up on the initiative of the national music industries and often receive assistance from public bodies.

A good example is the FMEO - *French Music Export Office*, a non-profit organization aiming to promote French music abroad. It coordinates French representation at all the major international tradeshows, helps in creating links between French and international businesses in the music industry in a network of offices in 9 countries worldwide. It provides financial support to record companies for promotion, tours and the production and adaptation of videos for export markets. Funding comes from French record companies, the French government (the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Culture and Communication, and the French Association for the Promotion of the Arts), and many professional organizations.⁵²

The EU emphasizes especially the trial of new forms of Community action in the field of cultural cooperation, particularly through experimental projects that are meant to encourage the European music industry in its efforts to promote music produced in Europe.

Germany also has a small export office, "German Sounds",⁵³ though compared with the French Music Export Office, its size (2.5 employees) and government financial

⁵⁰ [Gobierno de Buenos Aires – Cultura – Industrias Culturales. – http://cultura.buenosaires.gov.ar/areas/cultura/industrias/](http://cultura.buenosaires.gov.ar/areas/cultura/industrias/)

⁵¹ Brasil desarrolla la exportación de su música al mundo entero. Caracas, 12 de febrero, 2006. – <http://tiempolibre.eluniversal.com>

⁵² <http://www.french-music.org>

⁵³ <http://www.germansounds.de>,

support are modest, considering that Germany is one of the biggest music markets in Europe.

In 2005, the *Austrian* Fund for Music (Österreichischer Musikfonds) was initiated. This is a public-private partnership initiative between the Arts department of the Federal Chancellery and main institutions in the music sector. The aim is to promote distribution and marketing of professional Austrian music productions in Austria and abroad with 600.000 € per year.

In the *Netherlands*, the music genre "Dance" is regarded as internationally viable genre and international Dutch success; it is said, that the government is very generous in the granting of licences to venues and events, because supposedly Dance creates about 11,000 jobs and produces a turnover of about 0.5 billion € every year. The minister of finance even speaks about "feest als exportproduct" - the party or event as an export product

For *Australia*, a section of the Department of Trade assists in export promotions by subsidising music companies that commit specified minimum sums from their own resources. It also gives some support to the appearance of Australian musicians at showcases such as the annual South by Southwest event in Austin, Texas. It employs a full time music officer based in Los Angeles, with the objective of opening up the US market.

The Australia Council organises regular artists' showcases to which it invites foreign entrepreneurs and critics. An objective is to build international touring for the showcased groups.

In *New Zealand*, music is regarded as an important future export earner, with exports of around NZ\$5 million annually, which are projected to grow to NZ\$50 million within ten years. In recognition of the music sector's potential, NZTE facilitated a Music Industry Export Development Group which reported to government in 2004. This report was entitled *Creating Heat: Tumata Kia Whita!*⁵⁴

Outward Sound is a grants scheme to assist in the development of new overseas markets for New Zealand music. Outward Sound arose from the report *Creating Heat: Tumata Kia Whita!* It focuses primarily on international music market development and works with individual artists' business managers. It provides assistance for market development initiatives and encourages the entry of New Zealand music and musicians into global markets.⁵⁵

i) Statistics collection

Without a statistical understanding of the economic performance of a music sector, it is not possible to plan expertly for its development. The quality and quantity of statistical information about the music sector varies greatly among countries, including developed countries. The process is expensive and developing countries by and large do not have statistics for their music sectors. Some statistics can be collected privately. For instance, the International Federation of Phonographic Industries publishes statistics on number and value of units sold in countries where it has members. It is unlikely to have members in developing countries where piracy makes it impossible for record companies to collect royalties. Similarly for collection societies for composers or performers.

⁵⁴ www.nzte.govt.nz/section/13673/10931.aspx.

⁵⁵ www.nzmusic.org.nz/index.php/pi_pageid/38.

The collection of statistics is mentioned only in the consultants' report for Australia.

2.4 The use of music to alleviate poverty or the conditions contributing to poverty

By contributing to economic development, music or music development can directly impact upon material poverty. Music as business earns money, employs people, can be a significant part of an economy.

However, it can also be a part of a slightly longer causal chain that contributes to the alleviation of poverty. It is used in various circumstances in redirecting or treating or empowering individuals; the objective here is not necessarily primarily an economic one. But there can be an economic consequence if the result is a better functioning individual who is newly capable of effective participation in the work force.

The European consultants agree, pointing out that 'any evaluation on the impact and the use of music to alleviate poverty and social inequity or injustice should take into consideration church musics, amateur musics as well as music therapy and the integration of music in health care, social and youth work...'

Because music involves so many aspects of human functioning – the intellect, the emotions, skilled movement, effective socialising and so on – it is a very effective tool in such rehabilitative activity. The discipline of music therapy has been created around these properties of music and much of the work of music therapists has consequences that can lead to economic outcomes. Music is used intensively in some social and youth work to bring meaning and direction into lives that have gone off the rails.

It is important that we acknowledge that there are other forms of poverty than material poverty. One is rich through participation in cultural life and personal wealth may not fill the emptiness in the culturally bereft. Community music activity – amateur music making – builds social capital and combats another sort of poverty.

Here are some examples.

This study has uncovered two forms of use of music to combat poverty: firstly, in initiatives that take a systematic and extended approach to the issue; secondly, through one-off events that, for instance, raise funds to alleviate poverty in a particular situation. We begin with some examples of the more systematic approach, found through the literature survey (Appendix 4).

It might be noted that many if not most of these initiatives are private rather than governmental.

A piece on the Development Gateway site says: 'The expressive arts -- such as drama, storytelling, music, and graphic arts – are used effectively in carrying a message to encourage certain types of knowledge or behaviour: for instance, to educate targeted populations about HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment.

'In this instance, they can also be useful as means to promote tolerance and compassion for victims and their families and can help decrease social exclusion and other harmful social effects of HIV. Learning a lesson from the advertising industry, the expressive arts are often more likely to result in behavioural changes than are more formalized or didactic approaches. As a result, they are now employed in development projects of all types. The approach can be executed in a culturally appropriate manner, especially when folk and popular arts and local languages are used. Techniques that use genres such as socio-drama, soap opera, and comics are

particularly successful with younger populations, commonly at highest risk for becoming HIV- positive.’⁵⁶

In the countries of *East Africa*, there is a great campaign being waged against the HIV/AIDS pandemic. Music is very important in the campaign. There are various strategies for the use of music. Song lyrics can carry messages. They can be presented in concerts that inform, motivate and console. These concerts raise funds as well as awareness. The funds are used to support AIDS victims and address problems in AIDS-affected communities. There is a special role for hip hop since it attracts the young people who are especially vulnerable. Many famous musicians lend their services to these activities.

The Rage for a Revolution Concert, organized by OppiKoppi, invited South African musicians to perform in Cape Town in an effort to deliver positive messages about awareness and responsibility concerning youth and HIV/AIDS. By inviting a diverse range of musicians to perform at the concert, the organizers sought to unify disparate sub-cultural followings for the common cause of identifying the major social harms affecting youth in South Africa today, and subsequently, addressing those issues using the positive and vibrant rhetoric of music. It is hoped that events such as *Rage for the Revolution*, will spark a series of open-minded, youth-oriented, socially conscious productions where South African youth will involve themselves directly in their development, and do so in unique and creative ways. The aim is to create an uplifting opportunity for socially aware musicians to identify some of the true enemies to social harmony and development.⁵⁷

From our Indonesian consultant: ‘In *Aceh*, music is being used to recover cultural, social, and psychological problems among kids who suffered from the tsunami in December 2005. Because the kids lost their family, friends, teachers, and neighbours, they suffered social problems. They had no place to stay, no school to go, and no one could help them to conduct social activity. Dancers, storytellers, singers and musicians also died in the disaster, taking with them their culture and music. These kids had no hope socially and culturally. To recover from their mental sickness a composer from STSI, Surakarta I Wayan Sadra, was invited to rebuild their culture and music. Sadra worked with these kids and tried to reconstruct music based on the local idioms. Not all idioms and vocabularies could be recalled, according to Sadra in his interview with me; most of them were buried with the late musicians. Sadra said that in order to rebuild the local music he used local symbols that may inspire to compose music. “Musical ingredients” were collected from interviews with the kids and all kinds of possible strategies to “re-compose” the music were used. These kids enjoyed the music that was “original” and based on their own values.’

Singapore has an interesting approach to musicians busking on the streets. The proceeds have to go to charity. Some of these musicians are charity cases themselves, and there is some flexibility where they are allowed to pay themselves and then give the excess to charity (if there is any excess).

⁵⁶

<http://topics.developmentgateway.org/culture/highlights/viewHighlight.do~docName=bExpressive%20Arts%20brAn%20Effective%20Tool%20for%20HIVAIDS%20Education%20and%20Pr eventionbr~activeHighlightId=7689> At the site there are links to a number of relevant projects.

⁵⁷ <http://www.comminit.com/africa/experiences/pds22005/experiences-2994.html>

Paraguay: 'The project *Vida y Comunidad* intends to improve the situation of street-children at the city Coronel Oviedo. It is directed by the town council, aided by social sectors, all of them supported and technically advised by the UNICEF. These children can take music lessons learning to play instruments, and participating in other educative and cultural activities. This project started in 2002, and since then 63% of the participating children decreased their work schedule, and 41 children could definitely stop working.'⁵⁸

A miraculous program in *Venezuela*: 'In a program to encourage peace and tolerance, since 1975 the *Fundación del Estado para el Sistema Nacional de Orquestas Juveniles e Infantiles de Venezuela* promotes the creation of symphonic orchestras (for youth and children) throughout the country. The same model is followed now by *Argentina, Brasil, Chile, Ecuador, El Salvador, México, Perú* and various *Caribbean islands*. The ideal of this program is to use music to integrate young people of low social and economical status, or to rescue them from delinquency and drugs. To fulfill this project 400,000 fringe children have been trained'.⁵⁹

Here is an interesting perspective from our Latin American consultants. In Latin America the illegal music market is one of the largest in the world. *Paraguay, Ecuador, México and Brasil* figure in the "black list" of the International Federation of Phonograph Industries, because those countries are assiduous producers, distributors and consumers of piracy. In a desperate and spontaneous self-regulation of the social economy and as a consequence of a high incidence of unemployment, this activity benefits a wide percentage of the marginalised community.⁶⁰

In *Australia*, some local authorities use music as an element in programs to assist at-risk youth, drug dependency, prison rehabilitation, the ageing and so on. Music can be used as a lure to participate. Musical skills may be taught as an option in employment programs, as may other skills that support musical activity.

Hip Hop Mobil in *Germany* is a youth project of the Arbeitskreis Medienpädagogik e.V. (working group media education) in Berlin. 'The Hip Hop Mobil does not make open youth work; the artists pass on their knowledge and skills. They see the advantage of their activities in the fact that they are not social workers, which eases the approach to the youngsters. The artists of the Hip Hop Mobile give workshops in DJ-ing, break-dancing, rap and graffiti arts in public schools. They also provide a small mobile sound studio for recordings of young rappers as well as recordings in schools and youth centers. The Hip Hop mobile cooperates with several crossover projects in- and outside Berlin and on international level, it is led by active performing MDs, DJs and breakers "from the scene". Despite the fact that rap music today is accepted as a contemporary form of black music, hip hop remains a minority culture that attracts particularly youngsters with a foreign or migrational background as well as socially disadvantaged persons. "Posses" and "crews" form social communities that defy external as well as governmental control.'⁶¹

⁵⁸ http://www.unicef.org/spanish/infobycountry/paraguay_24037.html

⁵⁹ Federación de Asociaciones Americanas en Catalunya (FASMCAT) – <http://www.fasamcat.com/proyectos>

⁶⁰ Blanco y Negro. Periodismo de Investigación. Quito, julio 2 de 2005. <http://www.hoy.com.ec/suplemen/blan352/negro1.htm>

⁶¹ <http://www.hiphopmobil.de>

The *French* CD-project "Opinion Sur Rue" (opinion on the street) presents "music of the street" like rap, reggae, R'n'B and Raï. 'It was produced in 2003 in the context of the "International Day of Children's Rights" and features five well known artists as well as nine new talents from all over France, amongst others Cheb Mami and the Saian Supa Crew. The CD was realized by Saïffallah, Saïffédine Ben-Younes and Mahdjoub Keddi from the group K.Libre 13 and was sold for the benefit of the humanitarian associations "Un Regard, un Enfant" that aims to help disadvantaged children in France and worldwide. In France, the association helps with school materials for the poorest families, abroad it helps renovating and constructing schools, e.g. in Morocco. A second volume of "Opinion Sur Rue" was released in 2005. The revenues go to the association "J'ai un rêve" (I have a dream), which aims to accompany youngsters with family or school problems in the context of schools, community houses and other public social structures, provide children with the tools to participate in sports or performing arts to help them to be able to express themselves and develop a vision for their future, encourage cultural exchange between French children and children with different cultural backgrounds by creating, organizing and producing sport and artistic events as well in France as elsewhere, help and accompany village projects in the Third World or developing countries, work for the funding of these projects etc.'⁶²

Rap4Rights, *Netherlands*, 'is an initiative committed to a global campaign of making the issue of children's rights known. It uses rap music and social activism to speak to politicians and educate them about the sometimes disastrous situation of children and the need to restore their dignity, protect the adherence of their rights. The rap artists travel to Africa, Asia and Latin America and make contact with children living under extreme circumstances, meet youth workers, war affected youngsters, child soldiers and youth gangs. They collaborate, create music and talk about the issues of recovery, rehabilitation, trauma healing, HIV/AIDS, conflict resolution, human rights and peace building. The tour includes, amongst others, Indonesia, Sierra Leone, Honduras, and Guinea.'⁶³

'The Kinetika Bloco is a group of some very talented and motivated young musicians in London who perform music on the road to accompany the carnival processions Kinetika, a mas(querade) band association. The young people are aged 14 and upwards and come mainly from schools and colleges in the quarters of Southwark and Lambeth. They mostly have a migrational and often disfavored background. The musical quality is very high, though the main demand and objective is to be a social project helping young people to develop self-consciousness, and social as well as musical skills.'⁶⁴

In *Algeria*, 'the annual Telethon instituted by the National Television Company is one of the occasions dedicated to the fight against poverty and to the support of poor, during which artists musicians and singers perform. A significant number of associations and national NGOs also receive an invaluable support from the artists,

⁶² <http://www.opinion-sur-rue.com>

<http://www.jai-un-reve.com>

⁶³ <http://www.learnsierraleone.org/pages/partner/partnerships.html>

⁶⁴ <http://www.kinetika.co.uk/pages/bloco/bloco.htm>

on the occasion of gala evenings and cultural events in support of the fight against poverty and exclusion.'

The one-off events to fight poverty are often concerts mounted by musicians. But there are other ingenious methods too. Some examples:

Aceh and the tsunami disaster. 'Groups of musicians are among those who are concerned with the victims of tsunami disaster in December last year. Some efforts had been made to help them by using music. Musicians including Lauryn Hill and Boyz II Man performed at a tsunami benefit concert. The concert was held by The Force of Nature Aid Foundation, a non-profit organization in Kuala Lumpur dedicated to raising money to rebuild communities devastated by the tsunami in Indonesia, Thailand, Sri Langka and India.'

República Dominicana: 'Thanks to the participation of various national entertainment stars, *La Música se pinta de solidaridad y esperanza* is a great concert inspired by the music of Juan Luis Guerra. The intention is to collect monetary aid (given to the first Lady) to instigate the development of social projects in diverse towns, satisfying basic necessities of the poorest populations.'⁶⁵

Charity concerts in *Croatia*. During the war 1991-1995 all concerts were charity concerts e.g. for the blind, for veterans, the deaf or for children. Today you find charity concerts for invalids and for hospitals.

Party Against Poverty, *Europe*. This is an initiative of different clubs, venues and DJs all over the world in support of the Global Call to Action against Poverty. On 10th September 2005 a party was celebrated in 16 cities across 8 countries in order to bring this movement to the dance floor and encourage activists.⁶⁶

Downloadday, *Netherlands*. 'On 29th November 2005, on the website <http://www.downloadday.nl> music lovers could download their favorite music for free if they signed a petition for fair trade. This was an initiative of the organization Novib and Download.nl, a site of ilse media. Novib has taken action for fair trade relations between rich and poor countries for a long while and has been supported by bands like Coldplay and U2. Downloaders were able to sign the "Big Noise" petition of Novib to be presented to the conference of the WTO in Hong Kong.'

United Against Malaria, *Switzerland*. The 60th birthday of the United Nations was celebrated with a special concert on October 8th 2005 in Geneva, with many international stars. It was an appeal to end one of the world's worst pandemics. Radio France produced a special program.⁶⁷

Netherlands recording. Marco Borsato, a famous Dutch pop musician, and the rapper Ali B, produced the single 'Wat zou je doen', that came out on 17 september 2004. It was in the charts in Holland on number 1 for 8 weeks. All proceeds of the single will go to War Child Holland.⁶⁸

⁶⁵ Presidencia de la República Dominicana – http://www.primeradama.gov.do/galeria/rueda_de_prensa_concierto_de_navidad_2005/galeria.html

⁶⁶ <http://www.partyagainstopoverty.org.uk>

⁶⁷ http://www.unitedagainstmalaria.org/index_e.html

⁶⁸ <http://www.warchild.org/artists/Music/music.html> www.borsato.nl or www.alib.nl

The biggest of them all, *Live 8, G8 nations and South Africa*, took place in July 2005. It was a series of benefit concerts, re-using the concept of "Live Aid" in 1985. The shows aimed to put pressure on world leaders and politicians to drop the debts of the world's poorest nations, negotiate fairer trade rules in the interest of poorer countries, and increase and improve aid. They were timed to precede the G8 Conference and Summit held in Perthshire, Scotland. More than 1,000 musicians performed at the concerts, which were broadcast on 182 television networks and 2,000 radio networks. ⁶⁹

⁶⁹ <http://www.live8live.com/>

3. Musical diversity and peace

The links between musical diversity and the promotion of peace

- *Cite examples of the use of musical diversity to promote peace.*
 - *Can you cite instances where musical diversity has caused or been strongly associated with social disharmony?*
-

The military marching band was not conceived as an instrument of peace.

Music is a vehicle for passion. Music is an expression of identity; that identity may be personal but it is as likely to be group identity. In the act of sharing music we share emotion and identity. The sharing brings us together but it can also bring us together against others who share a different music. Discovering what one supports can be clarified and dramatised by finding what one opposes; what one is is made clearer by deciding what one isn't.

As our European consultants point out:

'...music can be associated with war and peace, with social harmony and with social disharmony. For example, not only the Ukrainian Orange Revolution was associated with music. The other party employed music as well.'

UNESCO has had an interest in the cultural diversity issue virtually since its inception after World War 2. Katérina Stenou has written an interesting paper tracing this history.⁷⁰ Initially, UNESCO was concerned not with promoting diversity so much as ameliorating it. Cultural difference was seen as contributing to armed conflict. UNESCO wanted to ameliorate this source of conflict and its solution was to promote greater education about cultures, leading to greater understanding between them. Cultures that better understood and appreciated each other were much less likely to go to war.

One might guess that this perception forms at least part of the background for the continuing push for a multicultural music curriculum in schools. We can appreciate each other's cultures through our musics.

Our interest is of course the use of music to bring people together and to promote peace. That is an action that is feasible and can be successful. It would be good also to be able to prevent the use of music to drive people apart, but that seems no more than a concept. Both uses of music begin with bringing people together and we can hardly say that a priori that is good in one instance and not another.

The European consultants make the interesting point that 'Musical *diversity* (our emphasis), in contrast to music in general, however, tends to be associated with the promotion of peace and social harmony everywhere in Europe...'

A number of examples are provided of relevant projects associated with the promotion of peace and social harmony. Projects tend to be private rather than government initiatives. (As always, there are more examples in the Appendices.)

⁷⁰ See Stenou, Katérina, ed.: *UNESCO and the Issue of Cultural Diversity. Review and strategy, 1946-2003. A study based on official documents*. Revised version 2003. Paris: UNESCO.

From the consultants' reports

Arab World

Algeria. Our consultant gives this inspiring account:

'The most striking example of the use of musical diversity in favour of peace was no doubt the meeting of artists and ensembles who came together from all parts of Algeria, to perform with one voice, during an event organized on the occasion of the promulgation - by the president of the republic, Mr A.Bouteflika - of the law on the civil harmony. Artists performances occurred at the same time in several cities, Algiers, Oran, Constantine, Batna, Annaba, Bejaia Music again played the role of a federating link among the people, even in circumstances that were not always obvious nor comfortable. After what the Algerian people had endured, it was a beautiful lesson of maturity and wisdom.'

He states that 'Musical diversity has, to my knowledge, never caused any social disharmony'.

Morocco. Our consultant reports that 'Morocco is known for its option for peace in the world, in particular between the monotheistic religions (Islam, Judaism and Christianity). Proof of this are a number of artistic and cultural events where musicians or singers of the three religions are frequently grouped together in one piece.

Cohabitation between Berbers and Arabs might have created social conflicts on a linguistic or cultural level, if there had not been this spirit of nationalism, solidarity and respect strengthened by Islam.

Asia

China. No comments or examples offered.

Indonesia. 'Music can attract imagination that represents the "real situation" among audiences. Groups of musicians can send messages to their listeners to achieve ideas of prosperity, solidarity, humanity, and peace. When music is performed audiences perceive the message and experience both in a real or in figurative situation. A good example was Slank and God Bless, among the best music groups in Indonesia, when they 'hypnotised' an audience of 15,000 in Pekan Raya Jakarta on 18th December 2004. In the huge performance top government officers of Indonesia and ambassadors from foreign countries also attended. The Canada ambassador to Indonesia said that he was proud of the music groups who presented the 'Peace Theme' especially because one of the best bands came from his country. He said: 'Music is an alternative medium to promote peace for everyone in the world.'

'Another example would be Mangkunegara, the minor King of Surakarta, Central Java, who commissioned a *dangdut* (hybrid music for youth) music performance for promoting peace in the square in front of the palace on 5th and 6th June, 2004. The performance was free-of-charge and everyone could come to listen and dance with the music, the common practice when the music was performed. It was a kind of social music. In that event the music was meant to keep the people in the region intact and to maintain solidarities among them. In his speech in front of audiences the prince said: 'Even if now we are in the rivalry condition to vote President and the Vice President and we have different views to win our candidate, we should not fight one another. I hope that everyone can keep his/her head cool and the peace should be kept.' The performance featured noted singers from surrounding areas.'

Singapore. 'In Singapore schools, there is a component called National Education which is meant to inculcate in students national pride and unity. Annual activities to promote peace and harmony among the different ethnic communities in Singapore include performances of music from the many communities in Singapore.

'There is also a concerted effort to celebrate International Friendship Day in the schools and again music performances form a major part of these celebrations.'

Vietnam. 'We have not any example.'

Australasia

Australia. 'No current examples at official level in Australia – although perhaps we could say that the policy of multiculturalism serves to promote peace insofar as it ameliorates internal divisions in the population based on cultural difference or ethnicity.'

'There have been some responses from the music community to the plight of 'illegal' refugees– e.g. concerts in their support, and a conference on music and justice.'

New Zealand. 'Artists do donate their time and profile to various benefit concerts or causes; this can include issues such as non-discrimination for those with mental health needs, and a nuclear-free New Zealand; artists also performed at the Parihaka Peace Festival in March 2006 – see www.parihaka.com/event.htm.'

Europe

The consultants say that 'music can, of course, be associated with both: peace and war, social harmony and social disharmony. For example, the Ukrainian Orange Revolution was associated with music, but the opposite side, the party of Janukovich, employed music as well. Musical diversity in contrast to music in general, however, tends to be associated with the promotion of peace and social harmony everywhere in Europe...

'Our focus lies on projects, because here, the association with peace and war, harmony and disharmony is particularly evident.'

'This link between the two spheres becomes most obvious in projects aiming at the integration of people which have been or still are in a conflict situation, such as in former Yugoslavia or in the case of Israel/Palestine. Many projects of this kind are brought into life not by the government, but by NGOs, associations and other private organizations. There is a transitory zone between projects aiming to reduce social disharmony and projects seeking to fight poverty.'

Some of the European projects are described here; others can be found in the European report.

Albania. 'In 1997 with the collapse of the pyramid scheme many Albanians lost their savings, economy collapsed and riots broke out. Some 2000 people died. The situation was out of control and close to a civil war. An interviewee recalled a scene where music served as a symbol for peace and marked the beginning of normality after the riots had ended. In Vlorë, a city in the south of Albania, and at that time practically a ghost town, normal people of different backgrounds (policemen, a shepherd etc.) joined to perform a concert. The fact, that a concert was held, symbolized the end of the riots for the population of Vlorë. It was a dramatic event for them, and many people cried. Jehona Labe, the performing ensemble, is still known today.'

Belgium. 'Festival Ten Vrede in Diksmuide, Flanders. The Festival Ten Vrede, literally "to peace", is held annually in Diksmuide, Belgium, at the Ijzer Tower. This monument is the symbol of the Flemish struggle for emancipation. It was built after the First World War in memory of the Flemish soldiers resisting the German aggressor in the trench war behind the River Ijzer. During the war, most Flemish soldiers had become advocates of Flemish emancipation. In the army a majority of low rank Flemish soldiers were opposed to a small number of French speaking officers. In this location with its historical meaning the Festival Ten Vrede develops a strong pacifist message. The festival also criticizes suppression, oppression and violence in general.'

'The festival includes a competition wherein the participating young artists and bands have to present at least one song for peace or against war...'

Croatia. At the beginning of the war in the 1990s most repertoires called for peace in official media. On the battle fields, however, they were provocative songs. Later the provocative music was played in the official media because people demanded this music.

In today's Croatia so called "ethno music" or "world music" is associated with peace.

Germany. 'West-Eastern Divan Orchestra. The Israeli conductor Daniel Barenboim has been working in Germany for a long time. He was conductor in the Bayreuth Festival from 1981 to 1999. Since 1992, he is the art director and musical director of the Deutsche Staatsoper Berlin (German State Opera Berlin). He received awards for his political music projects aiming for a better understanding of the Israeli and Palestine population. One of his projects is the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra, an orchestra that Barenboim founded together with the Palestinian literary critic Edward Said. It is composed of young musicians from Israel and Arabic states. The project promotes the dialogue between different cultures.'

'Kreuzberger Musikalische Aktion. The private association "Kreuzberger Musikalische Aktion" offers music and dance facilities to children and adolescents in a problematic district of Berlin. 700 children and adolescents make use of this offer. Since 2005 the German rock star Marius Müller Westernhagen and an important magazine support the project giving the local project an enormous publicity. The project wants to integrate young people with different backgrounds.'

'Sachsen: Neonazis austanzen. In 2004, a CD sampler was produced in collaboration with the extreme right party NPD (National Party Germany), and distributed in German schools. This project was not illegal and could not be banned by law. In answer to this, several mainly local organizations like the Netzwerkstelle Döbeln or the Amadeu Antonio Foundation produced CDs or concerts which promote democratic, antiracist and cosmopolitan views. In some cases famous artists were involved; sometimes the project featured local musicians.'

Netherlands. 'Musicians without Borders is an international network of musicians who use the power of music to contribute to building open and peaceful societies. The organisation is based in the Netherlands. The organization runs several projects which promote peace such as the music bus in Srebrenica. A Dutch/Bosnian team of musicians and dancers visits villages and refugee camps in the Tuzla-Srebrenica area and offers children the chance to express and develop themselves by singing and dancing together.'

Latin America

Some examples from the consultants.

Argentina, Bolivia and Chile. 'Talleres Musicales de Integración Andina (Music Workshop for Andean Integration), congregates young people from those countries to perform Andean folklore, popular and traditional music and American baroque. With native and classical instruments they present themselves as a symbol of fraternity, peace and tolerance respecting their cultural heritage as part of a shared region.⁷¹

⁷¹ Diario "El Pregón". San Salvador de Jujuy.

<http://jujuy.com.ar/turismo/asociacion/esperanza/embajada.htm>

Colombia: 'Concerning the peace process, combat groups are using a peculiar "musical-weapon" called *escopetarra* (a term that uses the first part of the word *escopeta*, which means rifle, together with the second part of the word *guitarra*, which means guitar). It is a guitar that instead of the fingerboard has a 16 mm diameter barrel. A variation of swords into ploughshares. The government supports the maker to construct 100 of his *escopetarras*, and includes its symbol in promoting a campaign to end 41 years of armed conflict. This instrument is donated in an exchange with musicians who promise to demonstrate themselves as against violence and as promoters of good will for peace.

'César López, inventor of this *escopetarra*, is a musician from Bogotá who also presents a show called *La Resistencia* (The Resistance). Its songs are testimonies collected in trips around Colombian villages; the texts are about fear, dignity, memory, team-work, forgiveness.

'Another one of his ideas is a Neutral Orchestra, which is musicians' collective which arrives immediately in the zones where there is a violent situation or any type of aggression. The experience is described by him: "We used to round the place, make a sort of a vigil and then play our music. We discovered a beautiful impact in the victims. It was like an opportunity for them to exorcize their feelings of fear and indignation".'⁷²

Uruguay: 'The *Pro-tempore* chairmanship of MERCOSUR in August 2005 celebrated the 60th anniversary of the end of 2nd World War, the dropping of the atomic bomb and the creation of the UNESCO with music, poetry and dance for peace, in which artists demonstrated pacific ideals.'⁷³

Sub-Saharan Africa

Cameroon. 'In the 1990s, Cameroon went through a period of political trouble during which peace was threatened in the whole country. Some musicians who enjoyed a big audience gave popular concerts in order to convey a message of peace.'

Music occupies a much more important position in many African societies than on some other continents. In that light, it is interesting to read the account of the consultant from the Congo (Brazzaville).

Congo. It should be mentioned that that the Central African sub-region experienced many civil wars which, for some, still persist in certain countries.

The musicians, who are the opinion leaders, have a great role to play. For this reason the topic of music is always taken into account in the elaboration of plans of pacification.

For example, in Congo-Brazzaville, a mega-concert was organised under the title "concert for the national reconciliation" at the end of the war on 5 June 1997 gathering all big orchestras of Brazzaville who appealed to the youth to abandon their weapons.

⁷² "Escopetarra" que dispara música por la paz en Colombia – Yahoo Argentina – Noticias – <http://ar.news.yahoo.com/06125/4/o994.html>; César López: "Un nuevo símbolo de paz" – www.colombia.com

⁷³ Boletín de la Oficina Regional de Ciencia para América Latina y el Caribe. Representación de la UNESCO ante el MERCOSUR. <http://www.unesco.org.uy/newsletter/SEGNAL04-oct05.pdf>

Other examples:

The pacification of the South of Congo-Brazzaville required the contribution from artists who organised a train caravan "caravan of peace"; each stage was marked by the organization of the events of sensitization.

In Kinshasa (Democratic Republic of Congo), the authorities had recourse to the artist musician WERRA-SON to stop the rising of thousands of street children called Chégués. The artist created orphanages to house them.

On the other side, musical diversity in Democratic Republic of Congo reinforces the fundamentalism. The political authorities support only the groups of their area, which even gave raise to rumbles and riots in certain cities.

Each leader of a political party has his artist who makes propaganda for him.

South Africa: 'In response to this term of reference, and the question 'Can you cite instances where musical diversity has caused or been strongly associated with social disharmony?', informant Marianne Feenstra wrote 'None at all to my knowledge; it is where attempts have been made to stifle musical diversity that the strongest reactions have developed'.

'An excellent example of both the promotion of peace and of musical diversity is the work of the Palissander Choir, based in Pretoria, under the leadership of Dr Sarita Hauptfleisch (sari@mweb.co.za). Perhaps the words in choral music are particularly significant, but many musical groups, choral and otherwise, have as an aim to promote peace and reconciliation. Palissander is, however, a notable example, and has had a whole recent year's programmes specifically dedicated to the theme of Peace, with a wide range of music chosen, according to that theme. Further information on their work, aims and programmes, including the lyrics of many of the most meaningful songs, are found in the Palissander Addendum, at the conclusion of this document.'

4. The standards regulating musical diversity

- *Cite examples of government or government-induced regulations intended to promote musical diversity or freedom of musical expressions OR to limit them. Refer to the fields shown below. In each case, if possible, give briefly the rationale for the regulation. In each case, are the regulations enforced?*
 - *Broadcasting. For instance, are there examples of the use of regulations to require the broadcast of local music, or regulations to require the broadcast of some forms of music but not others, or regulations to prohibit the broadcast of some forms of music?*
 - *New media. Are there parallel requirements in the regulation of new media that would favour or disfavour some forms of music? (New media: for instance, the internet.)*
 - *E-commerce. Are there parallel requirements in the regulation of e-commerce that would favour or disfavour some forms of music? (E-commerce in music: trade in music digitally embodied or delivered. Overlaps with new media.)*
 - *Education. Are there regulations requiring education in local music traditions, or in a diversity of musical genres?*
 - *Subsidy. Are there regulations that require that government subsidy should be given to, or withheld from specific musical genres, or to a diversity of musical genres? Are there regulations that require that government subsidy can only be given to citizens of the particular country, or regulations along those lines? Are there regulations that require that all applicants for subsidy must be considered equally, whether citizens or foreigners? Or are there variants on any of the above?*
 - *Other. Are there similar regulations in areas of activity not mentioned above?*
 - *What is the situation of copyright law in the countries in this region? Has it been enacted? Is it enforced?*
-

This section is about regulations imposed by governments that may affect the level of musical diversity in various settings. It is not about initiatives taken voluntarily by the private sector; for those, see the response to Term of Reference 6. It does include private initiatives urged or required by governments.

Governments may legislate to support or suppress musical or cultural diversity, and the legislation may be put into effect through regulations administered by governments and their agencies. The regulations may set standards, sometimes defined numerically. For instance, there may be 'broadcast standards' for music content created or produced by citizens of the country, and these standards may require that a minimum percentage of music broadcast time or of the number of musical items broadcast should be local music under this definition.

Following is an array of possibilities for regulations that can affect musical (or cultural) diversity. For proponents of diversity, not every one of these regulations is necessarily benign. Nor would a cultural world subject to this entire set of possible regulations, even were they intended benignly, be necessarily a productive one. On

the other hand, neither are any of those listed here so inherently malign that it should be forbidden to a government – except possibly from the viewpoint of the advocates of trade liberalisation.⁷⁴

4.1 Possible forms of regulation impacting on musical diversity

1 *Regulations that accord special, preferential, or more favourable treatment to indigenous or national cultural goods and services.*

Regulations to foster the exchange of ideas, information and artistic expression regionally, nationally and internationally.

These two sets of regulations are not mutually hostile but are complementary. A state can set out to ensure a place within the national cultural life for local cultural expressions, but otherwise foster a free flow of cultural expression with other countries.

It should be noted, however, that such a free flow tends to result in domination of the exchange by the most powerful cultural traders, with a consequent constraint on the opportunity for citizens to experience a diversity of foreign cultures.

The above regulations may be asserted in these ways:

- a. qualification requirements and procedures, nationality requirements, technical standards and licensing requirements with respect to musical or cultural goods and services;

Examples: professional accreditation; eligibility for subsidies or to tender; certificates of authenticity for indigenous cultural products; broadcast licenses; rules defining what is and what is not local content; local content standards for television and radio broadcasting; local content regulations for pay TV drama channels; export of heritage art.

- b. limitations on the number of musical or cultural service suppliers whether in the form of numerical quotas, monopolies, exclusive service suppliers or the requirements of an economic needs test;

Examples: Allocation of broadcast spectrum; allocation of licences for cable or any other existing or future means of delivery of cultural product. Conditions on these licences, such as requirements for local content, local production.

- c. limitations on the total value of musical or cultural service transactions or assets in the form of numerical quotas or the requirement of an economic needs test;

Examples: requirement that subscription broadcasters that are providing a predominantly music channel should devote a minimum percentage of their total expenditure on programs to local musical content; local music content requirements for television and radio;

⁷⁴ These concepts are drawn in part from work undertaken by Steven Shrybman with the International Network for Cultural Diversity. The author formulated them as part of a policy position put to the Australian government when it was negotiating certain free trade agreements. http://203.98.79.137/fileadmin/user_upload/PDFs/accdsubmit15jan03.pdf

limitations on expenditures on foreign musical or artistic product or on the number of transactions or items involving such product.

- d. limitations on the total number of cultural service operations or on the total quantity of service output expressed in terms of designated numerical units in the form of quotas or the requirement of an economic needs test;

Examples: allocation of broadcasting licences; limitation of broadcasting hours; limitation on the number of productions.

- e. limitations on the total number of natural persons that may be employed in a particular cultural service sector or that a service supplier may employ and who are necessary for, and directly related to, the supply of a specific service in the form of numerical quotas or the requirement of an economic needs test;

Examples: regulation of the importation of foreign performers, technicians and the like; requirements to employ a specified minimum number of local artists as a proportion of the number of foreign artists granted performing visas.

- f. measures which restrict or require specific types of legal entity or joint venture through which musical goods or services are supplied.

Examples: investment controls requiring joint ventures in the film industry; restriction of eligibility for investment or grants from cultural agencies to nationals.

2 Regulations that prohibit or limit foreign investment in the cultural sector.

Examples: Media ownership

3. Where investment is made in musical or cultural undertakings, regulations that define and enforce any of the following requirements:

- a. to achieve a given level or percentage of local content;

Examples: quotas for music on radio and sub-quotas for named genres or new releases; overall transmission quota for free to air television and sub-quota requirements for particular types of program content such as music, drama or children's programs; TV advertising; pay TV expenditure requirement and the development of new local content; educational curricula; commissioning of new music, opera etc. works.

- b. to purchase, use or accord a preference to goods produced or services provided domestically;

Examples: cultural subsidies; public broadcast media's procurement of locally produced content; publicly funded libraries' resource development and collection sharing; government agency investments; festivals showcasing local work; requirement to showcase/ purchase/ conserve local work; all local content standards for broadcasters; online content; touring subsidies..

- c. to enter into independent, co-production, or co-distribution agreements with any country;

Examples: official co-production agreements are common in the film and television industries.

d. that members of a board of directors or senior management be nationals.

Examples: self-evident

4. Regulations to ensure that investment activity is undertaken in a manner sensitive to concerns and policies concerning musical and cultural diversity.

Examples: sensitivity to indigenous cultural beliefs and protocols, e.g. indigenous bans on filming in certain locations; export of heritage art

5. Regulations for procurement policies and practices which favour or accord preferences to local musical or cultural goods and services in order to preserve or enhance cultural diversity.

Examples: procurement by government bodies, favouring local products, services, organisations: calls for expressions of interest, tenders; investment in cultural projects or organisations; commissioning or purchasing of all types of musical or cultural works or services including the digital; purchase of educational resources

6. Regulations to establish, sustain and further develop musical and cultural institutions, networks, programs and other mechanisms.

Examples: music and performing companies, performing venues, museums, virtual museums, galleries, festivals, theatres, libraries, translation services, arts education institutions, cultural industry training advisory bodies.

7. Regulations that establish, endow or empower government (all levels of government) enterprises, monopolies, and other publicly governed institutions to provide cultural goods and services, such as music education and funding, music or film development, production and investment, and public service broadcasting.

Examples: Music or arts funding and policy bodies; tertiary music education institutions; national music and arts presenting institutions; heritage councils.

8. Regulations to support and foster cultural expression and its communication and delivery through forms and instruments yet to be developed as well as those already known.

Examples: forms based on/in new technologies; new methods of delivering cultural goods or services. The concept of 'technological neutrality' is important here – i.e. that for instance local content quotas in place under analogue broadcasting will transfer to new digital broadcasting operations.

4.2 Examples of the current application of regulations to affect musical diversity

Recall that the survival of a monoculture can add to musical diversity globally, even though for reasons fair or foul there is no diversity within the borders of its host State. Regulations that ensure that survival are to this extent benign.

Regulations that foster musical and cultural activity may be engendered simply by the perception of needs within a State's borders. A culturally valuable but financially challenged activity might be subsidised to ensure its survival and development, with the award and oversight of the subsidies regulated in some way to ensure that policy

objectives are met and the recipients are accountable for the outcomes. In most cases, there is a regulation of eligibility for the subsidy. Typically, only nationals would be eligible. There are examples of regulations to ensure that subsidies specifically go to support multiculturalism and musical or artistic diversity.

The need for regulation may arise because of perceptions that local cultural activity is endangered by an influx of cultural goods or services from foreign countries. There is, for instance, widespread concern that music and films emanating from the USA or from transnational corporations are overwhelming less financially robust local productions. A common response is the imposition of regulations on broadcasters requiring that a minimum percentage of broadcast time should be assigned to local productions or artists.

As is apparent above, consultants to the study were invited to comment on the regulation of a number of types of activity seen as currently of especial importance to musical diversity: *Broadcast, New Media, E-Commerce, Education, Subsidies, Other, Copyright*. There were effectively no contributions on 'Other' except from Europe, a page on the necessity of research. This did not address issues of regulation and has been moved to Section 6, although it retains its original position in the European report in the Appendix.

4.2.1 Broadcast

The broadcast sphere is of special importance. It is still through broadcast that musical works get the greatest public exposure. It is broadcast exposure that can drive record sales, as witnessed by the recurring payola scandals in the USA and, for instance, by research in Australia linking increased broadcast of local content to increased sale of recordings of local content.⁷⁵ For music, radio broadcast is probably the most important. Television music broadcasts are very important but generally form only a very small part of television programming. Of course, music is an element of most television programs but it is unlikely that there are regulatory requirements for the music in this context. Consequently, the following discussion is mostly about radio.

The radio sector generally can be divided into three subsectors: privately owned radio, public or government-operated radio, and community radio.

Some regulations may cover all sectors: for instance, the sort of moral regulation proscribing the depiction of violence, sexual activity or 'bad' language, or political commentary criticising the powers-that-be as discussed in section 1.

Privately owned, or 'commercial' radio exists to make a profit and therefore, on testimony very broadly across our consultants, it seeks the largest possible audience by broadcasting the most popular music. This generally means that there is little diversity. Furthermore, the view is often expressed that this music is not, in its particular context, of the highest integrity or musical value. And in many cases, the music is imported Anglo-American international pop as generated mainly by the multinational record corporations.

To support local musics or to gain greater stylistic diversity across the programming of the private radio sector, some countries require that private broadcasters conform to a quota system that allots some minimum percentage of music broadcast time to,

⁷⁵ Mason, Paul: *Assessing the Impact of Australian Music Requirements for Radio*. <http://203.98.79.137/index.php?id=37>

for instance, 'national' musics. We will look in more detail at the operation of these quota systems.

It should be noted, however, that regulations may not specify that specific genres are broadcast. The result may be, as in Australia for instance, the broadcast of local exponents of international pop genres. While some claim to be able to detect an Australian flavour or colouration in this music, it would be interesting to see whether the claims could survive a blindfold test. There is also a strong relationship between record company marketing budgets and programming choices. We do not necessarily imply anything untoward. Even if everything is ethically above board, these marketing budgets can help to sway audiences towards international pop and influence the circumstances in which broadcasters ally with genres, always in pursuit of profits.

The implicit deal in the regulatory requirements is that the broadcaster is allowed by the government to acquire the right to a piece of the broadcast spectrum in return for agreeing to be bound by the regulations. With the shift to digital broadcasting, which requires simultaneous analogue and digital broadcasting over a period while the public buys new equipment, a new section of spectrum must be allocated to digital broadcasters. An issue that can arise is that the existing broadcasters want to take up as much of the digital spectrum as possible so as to continue to hold their market. On the other hand, the new spectrum raises the possibility that additional broadcasters could be admitted and in one way or another, there could be greater diversity of programming.

In some countries there are regulations to restrict foreign ownership of broadcasters. There may be good reasons, especially political reasons for this, but the fact that a broadcaster is locally owned does not imply at all that it will favour broadcast of local music or any other music that is an impediment to profit.

Regulations such as these are contested by free trade exponents on the grounds that they 'distort trade' and close a part of the market to foreign traders. We will address this issue in section 7.

The majority of countries have *public radio* systems. In some countries, for instance the UK and Eastern European countries, at one time the only radio was government radio. This is no longer the case although that history sometimes still makes itself felt through present attitudes. In a context where public and private radio co-exist and private radio at no cost to governments meets the musical needs of a majority of the population, public radio needs to demonstrate that it is offering a valuable service that otherwise would not be available. Generally, in the musical sphere this need is met by broadcasting music seen to be of higher quality and/or music identified with the country, e.g. local traditional musics. As readers know, public broadcasters in democracies run continually into the dilemma that in order to offer a service distinguishable from the commercial services that appeal to the majority, they offer services that appeal only to a minority but are paid for by all voters. To appeal to the majority they would have to offer programs that are very similar to the totally unsubsidised programs of the commercial stations and thereby abandon their reason for existence. So they are pushed first this way, then that way, trying to prove their relevance through wider audience appeal -- or specialised programming with less audience appeal.

Public radio stations, on the evidence from our consultants, almost never have to meet numerical program quotas. Either they operate under a charter that sets out their responsibilities to meet certain criteria – e.g. to support the musical culture of their countries – or they have been established to serve the musical and other

interests of a specified population group such as an ethnic minority. So they may in themselves provide a musical diversity lacking in the private sector or at the least, add to the broadcast music menu in any location, some musics that are not available through commercial radio.

Public radio often works as a national network. This could mean that the whole country receives the same program and there is not room for diversity through the local. On the other hand, the national funding can provide for commissioning of new works, production of special programs, operation of symphony orchestras, choirs, all of which contribute to a diversity that otherwise would be lacking.

Very often, public broadcasting systems are set up under legislation intended to protect them from political influence on their programs. The exercise of this independence to allow a voice for critics of government policies can be an irritation to governments, which have the ability to manipulate the control structures through politically motivated appointments and the ultimate power of revenge through the budget. The legislation for public radio organisations commonly limits their freedom to engage in commercial activities, for instance by selling air time for advertising. This frees them from commercial pressures for instance in news reporting and we believe that generally this has public support. However on the other hand, it makes them very much dependent on government financially.

Perhaps when we find governments snipping away at the independence of their national broadcasters we are seeing a warning sign of a move to authoritarianism more generally.

A lack of independence can affect the programming of musical diversity. For instance, various rock bands have been banned from radio in Belarus and a quota of 75% Belarusian music has been imposed – perhaps too much of a good thing!

Some countries have a *third sector, community radio*. These stations usually are local, small, and with very modest financial resources, functioning mostly with volunteer labour. They address particular needs of a local community. These needs may be for non-mainstream genres of music. The stations may also give airplay to locally based musicians not yet well enough established to be programmed by commercial or public radio. Therefore, one way or another, community radio adds musical diversity.

Quotas

The European consultants quote the Capgemini Report: Regulations to promote a specific, usually national, music repertoire can be distinguished as follows:

- voluntary policy of the broadcasting societies
- non-binding agreements
- binding agreements between broadcasters
- binding agreements between broadcasting societies and government
- legal allocation of minimum quotas.⁷⁶

⁷⁶ *Music in Europe: Sound or Silence? Study of the position of domestic music repertoire and the impact of the social and cultural policies of collecting societies in the EU 25*, second revised edition 2005. www.soundorsilence.no/CapGemini.SoS.2005.pdf

We note this useful categorisation without necessarily having sufficient information to apply it to the reports provided by our consultants.

Our Latin American consultants have produced a roll-call of countries that have legislated some form of quota requirements for national musics on radio: Argentina 70% quota for national productions, and at least 35% music which is composed or performed by Argentinian musicians or residents; Brazil maybe, Columbia maybe, Chile maybe, Ecuador 25% quota, Nicaragua 10%, Peru 30%, Venezuela, Uruguay 30%. These make the large majority of countries from which they received information. The difficulty in Latin America is that the regulations often are not enforced, and regulations that are not enforced may as well not exist. In a previous IMC study, for instance, it was discovered that Uruguay had what looked on paper to be a reasonably and effective local content requirement, but that it was not enforced and so was ignored.⁷⁷ We do not have information about where the quotas are or are not enforced.

The consultants point out that 'Unfortunately, in Latin America it happens that laws are not totally observed and communication grants are given to private companies, who induce people from all ages to consume commercial music –with immediate lucrative interests- supported by big investments in promotion. These companies own record corporations and also schools for what they call "new talents" (focusing on young people) who are quickly over and done with, so another "talent" comes out and the cycle of lucrative activity continues its manipulative way. In consequence, other kinds of music –mainly ethnic and actual classical - remain dramatically on the fringe of society.'

There was a quota in Paraguay but the broadcasters believed that it reduced their profits and so chose to ignore it; the legislation was subsequently repealed. Other Latin American countries in which the profit motive is unchecked include Guatemala and Mexico. The situation in the remaining countries was not reported.

The European consultants report the findings of the Capgemini Report.⁷⁸ It says that countries with local content quotas include Belgium 27%, Denmark >30%, France 40%, Ireland 30%, Italy (50%?), Lithuania 50%, Netherlands 35% (agreement with one private broadcaster), Poland 30%, Portugal 50% but may not yet be enacted, Sweden 35-50% (for public channels but not binding for private broadcasters). We can add to this list, Bulgaria and Belarus; the latter has already drawn a mention for its excessive enthusiasm.

The German federal parliament has recommended a quota but it has to be enacted by the state parliaments and they have not done so. The protection of the local language is an issue in many European countries and this can make itself felt in local content regulations for music. Language issues are important in the rationale for quotas in French and German Belgium and in France, among others. In 2003, according to our consultants, only 1.2% of the music transmitted over German radio was in the German language; there was an overwhelming dominance of popular music of Anglo-Saxon origin and even the German bands sing in English.

Our African consultants report a mixed scene. South Africa has a local content quota of 20% which has been in place since 1997. The MITT report complained that the quota is not being adequately enforced and furthermore recommended that it should

⁷⁷ http://203.98.79.137/fileadmin/user_upload/PDFs/mmresfinal.pdf

⁷⁸ Ibid.

be increased to 50%. Cameroon reports that a quota has been legislated but not enforced. This also was the case in Nigeria according to our previous report.

There are no quotas in Congo, Kenya, Tanzania. We are given the rather astonishing information that in Uganda, musicians have to pay to be broadcast. An East African informant makes the interesting comment that 'proposed legislation to regulate the local music content levels to 25% will be harmful to diversity as the radio stations will be controlled to select from the regions where they are based.' You can be too local!

There are no quotas in the Arab countries Algeria and Morocco.

There are no quotas either in our Asian countries. China makes specific requirements only for some government channels. The government television music channel, CCTV, has a special music channel with a 70% requirement for Chinese music. Beijing Music Radio is a government-owned radio station with some Chinese programming but broadcasting predominantly foreign music and pop. In Indonesia and Singapore, there are no requirements for commercial radio. There is no privately owned radio in Vietnam.

There is a tiered quota system in Australia, with higher quotas for more commercially popular music. The highest quota is 25%, with decrements in 5% stages by various genres, down to classical and jazz at 5%, a fiction since no commercial broadcaster has a jazz or classical format. This system is self regulated by the commercial broadcasters' trade association, with the government over its shoulder with an implied threat that the alternative is direct government regulation. There has been a study showing a correlation between the operation of the quota system and record sales.⁷⁹

New Zealand cannot have a quota system because of its undertaking under GATS. The government there has persuaded the commercial broadcasters to achieve certain targets voluntarily and local content has risen from 2% in 1995 to over 20% in 2005. The government has backed this up with a program, reported above, for the production of local recordings suitable for commercial release.

We know Canada to have an excellent and enforced quota system, somewhat similar but superior to Australia's.

Public radio and musical diversity

As noted, public radio broadcasters generally operate under charter from their governments. These charters customarily require support to local culture and so at least as a by-product, add to the public's access to musical diversity.

Arab world. In *Algeria*, there is no regulation but radio is organised regionally and so broadcasters serve regional taste. 'Radio Tassili (greater south of Algeria) would a fortiori give emphasis to the Targui music rather than another musical genre, thus answering to the aspirations and the request of its listeners (songs in tiffinagh, imzad, tindé etc.).'

Similarly, in Morocco, 'There are neither legal texts nor regulations favouring or penalizing certain musical forms. However there are three kinds of specific national

⁷⁹ Mason, Paul: *Assessing the Impact of Australian Music Requirements for Radio*. <http://203.98.79.137/index.php?id=37>

satellite radio broadcasts which are centralized in Rabat with regional stations spread all over the country:

- a. Arab-language broadcasts (Arab music, Moroccan or Andalusian songs, melhun, gharnati, Arab folklore etc.
- b. Berber-language broadcasts (Berber music, songs and folklore in the Tachelhit, Tarifit, Tamazight dialects). Tassani (Saharawi) is tolerated by these stations.
- c. French, Spanish and English language broadcasts (Western, classical, jazz music, international varieties, Arab world music)...

'But if these national radio stations were created in order to promote Moroccan music in all its diversity, it must be said that they are "too" open to other musics and that they favour Egyptian and Western styles. This sometimes obstructs the national production claimed by Morocco's musicians' unions, without apparent result however as written rules have never existed in Morocco's entire history; there is a kind of "mafia" managing music programmes according to their own wishes, humour, tastes and preference for one kind of music or another.'

Programming in *Indonesia* is apparently also subject to individual decisions rather than public policy. 'Broadcasting music is problematic. The reason is that there is no "standard regulation" as to which music should be promoted. National policy intends to keep all of the music alive, so ideally government should provide equal chance to group of music to perform on public radio or television. However, in reality government officials often find it difficult to manage the goal. Because the budget for music is limited (most likely that the budget is for cultural or art performance, not for music performance) and yet there are many musics to promote at the same time, he/she tends to prefer the music that is familiar to his/her ears. Local radio (owned by the government) in Surakarta, Central Java, for example, prefers to broadcast traditional music (*gamelan* music) that people think represents the image of "classical culture" assuming that this policy expresses the mission of the regent. Solo (the popular name for Surakarta). as one of the cultural centers originated from the courts. must keep the classical music. This is to emphasize and to promote the image of Solo as "The Cultural City" (Kota Budaya). By broadcasting such music the listeners also can keep the identity of their town. In this example, the radio officer ignores other kinds of music (folk music, traditional singing, etc) assuming that these musics are not relevant to represent the regent's symbol: classical culture.'

On the other hand, the private media are totally unconstrained and chase the largest audiences, especially the youth audience. 'Thus, they tend to air popular music and ignore traditional music...creating distance between youth and local and native music.'

Asia. In *China*, we have the unusual proposition of a government-owned music TV channel, CCTV-16. 'The Music Channel of CCTV (CCTV-16) went on the air on March 29 2003. Based on the function of music appreciation, the Music Channel puts more efforts into the popularization of music knowledge, guiding the citizens in increasing their music knowledge and appreciation ability by providing the TV audience with a platform to access and understand music. The Channel's broadcast time per day is 18 hours and 10 minutes, of which 70% is for Chinese music while foreign music programs take up 30%. The representative programs introducing Chinese traditional music and national music include "Excellent National Music Works", "Folk Songs in China", etc. Over the past two years, these Chinese music programs have been well acclaimed and appreciated by both the music circles and the ordinary audience. They

have played a very active role in popularizing, promoting and enhancing music diversity.

'Among them, "Folk Songs in China" is a very successful program. [This] has such [series] as the *Map of Folk Songs*, *Local Folk Songs*, *Folk Song Stories*, *Folk Songs Museum* and so on...The program is committed to introducing real Chinese folk songs exclusive of the created songs and instrumental music. In consultation with music experts, the chief of the program organizes trips to the plateaus, prairies, mountains and villages to make on-spot interviews, and record a large amount of live and diverse folk songs and music materials...

'However, the Music Channel is also confronted with severe difficulties. First, it cannot be watched in many provinces of China. Second, as it doesn't play pop music, it is less attractive to advertising agents, leading to limited sources of incomes. Under such a situation, the Channel often suffers from shortage of programs. The editors of the Music Channel have to either replay the old programs or simply to rearrange and edit the existing materials and broadcast them in other forms.'

Australasia. In *Australia*, 'The public, or nationally owned broadcasters are governed by a charter, one clause of which gives them the responsibility to support the development of Australian culture. They are not legally obliged to meet any numerical local content quota, however...

'The main broadcaster is the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC). It maintains a number of radio networks and two of them are specifically devoted to music. ABC Classic FM broadcasts 'art music'. In addition to setting a general objective for Australian content, it offers a number of programs that present Australian music only. ⁸⁰Triple J specialises in contemporary music, attempting to broadcast greater genre diversity and good but lesser known artists. It has projects designed to unearth young local talent. ⁸¹

'The Special Broadcasting Service was created to serve the interests of immigrant communities as an aspect of the policy of multiculturalism and its charter requires multicultural programming. There is a national television network and a national radio network, both free to air. The radio network especially broadcasts almost entirely in foreign languages and many of the programs for different cultural groups include the relevant music...⁸²

New Zealand's 'Publicly-funded radio broadcaster, Radio New Zealand, operates under a Charter. This includes a requirement to broadcast a range of New Zealand programmes, including information, special interest and entertainment programmes, and programmes which reflect New Zealand's cultural diversity, including Māori language and culture. It is also required to broadcast programmes which encourage and promote the musical, dramatic and other performing arts, including programmes featuring New Zealand and international composers, performers and artists. ⁸³.

'The government funds Niu FM, a pilot National Pacific Radio Network. Niu FM was created to help reduce disparities and build the capacity of Pacific communities [i.e. the communities of immigrants from South Pacific island countries]. It has been

⁸⁰ <http://www.abc.net.au/classic/australianmusic/>

⁸¹ <http://www.abc.net.au/triplej/>

⁸² www.sbs.com.au/

⁸³ www.radionz.co.nz/about/charter

instrumental in providing critical exposure for aspiring Pacific musicians. Niu FM's programming is identifiably "Pacific", with Pacific artists and music accounting for 45% of the songs played every day. This music originates from Pacific artists within New Zealand and overseas.'⁸⁴

Europe. In *Belgium*, broadcasting is primarily a matter for the three linguistic communities, each of which has its own public broadcasting service.

In the Flemish section, 'The objective of public radio and television (VRT)... [is to provide] a high quality offer in the following sectors: information, culture, education and recreation. The VRT's priority is to bring viewers and listeners focussed information and culture programmes focussing on Flemish community.' There are agreed performance standards: '...television programming must include a varied range of culture, reaching on average 15 % of the population. Another performance standard is that the share of Flemish TV productions and co-productions must be at least 50 % of the total programme offer between 6 pm and 11 pm.' (ericarts Belgium, p. 21).

In French Belgium, 'The radio services authorised and controlled by the SCA of the French community are obliged to broadcast in French except for prerecorded music. Television broadcasters are obliged to broadcast a certain major proportion of European productions including productions of authors belonging to the French community. 10% of the broadcasting time has to be spent on productions whose original version is in French.'

'The Belgian Radio and Television Centre of the German-speaking Community (BRF)...has a remit to offer public radio and television broadcasting services in German and currently (2002) has two radio stations and one television channel (since 1999). Legal entities that broadcast radio or television programmes are obliged to ensure protection of and prominence to the German language in their broadcasts by moderating a certain proportion (75%) of their broadcasts in German...' (ericarts Belgium, p. 17, p.21) Also, 'the German speaking Community has set up a public broadcasting channel under private sponsorship, *Belgium* offering free, equal access and free, equal use. Access is denied, *inter alia*, to political parties; sponsored contributions are not permitted.' (ericarts Belgium 22f.)

In *Germany*, 'There is a general agreement among broadcasters...that the broadcast contents shall promote the cultural diversity of the regions and the country as a whole... Especially the public sector regulations see itself as guaranteeing quality standards promoting cultural diversity by resisting commercialization and market pressures.'⁸⁵ The state regulations are enforced by the supervision of the broadcasting council.'

In *Bulgaria*, 'According to the regulations of *Article 71* of the *Radio and Television Act*, Bulgarian National Radio (BNR) and Bulgarian National Television (BNT) shall provide assistance to the creation and dissemination of national audio and audiovisual productions; BNR allocates at least 5% of the subsidy received from the state budget and "Radio and Television" Fund for the creation and performance of Bulgarian musical and radio play productions; and BNT allocates at least 10% from

⁸⁴ See the report entitled *Evaluation of the Impact of the Pilot National Pacific Radio Network – Niu FM*. - www.mch.govt.nz/publications/niu_fm-report/index.html. Also www.niu_fm.com/

⁸⁵ http://www.miz.org/news_3092.html Open letter of the German Music Council, *Deutsche Musi Rat* and the conference of music councils of the federal states, KdLMR.

the subsidy received from the state budget and "Radio and Television" Fund for Bulgarian film and television productions.

'In relation with aim of supporting Bulgarian language the law recommends to reserve 50% of the broadcasting time for European productions. In practice, most of these productions are Bulgarian.'

'In *Russia*, about one third of the 3,200 broadcasting services are dependent on the state, and commercial services are accessible to only about half the population.

'Despite the withdrawal of direct state support to the media, the state provides funds for the production of cultural programmes, fostering cultural diversity. Particular broadcasting companies with cultural channels are supported, e.g. the radio station *Orpheus* transmitting classical music and reaching 8.6% of the population.

'The promotion of Russian culture is one of the explicit objectives of cultural policy (ericArts Russia, p.14)...The legal instrument for independent cultural organisations is the "National Cultural Autonomy" which was introduced by the relevant law in 1996. It supported 578 bodies in 2004. These organisations [engage in an array of cultural activities] Positive cultural presentation of diversity in the mass media, especially in broadcasting is supported by the state as a means of social integration and overcoming ethnic barriers (Ericarts Russia, p.12). Within Russia there are radio programs in dozens of languages next Russian such as Abazin, Avar, Adygei, Azeri, Altay (comp. CCult Russia).'

Latin America. While presumably there are public broadcasters, we do not have information about them.

Sub-Saharan Africa. There are public broadcasting stations in Kenya, South Africa, Uganda and Tanzania. An informant tells us that in the East African countries, both public and private stations broadcast many genres of music. Some stations serve the musical interests of particular geographical centres or population groups.

4.2.2 New Media and E-Commerce

In the United States / Chile Free Trade Agreement (FTA), e-commerce is defined as commerce involving digital products. 'Digital products' means computer programs, text, video, images, sound recordings, and other products that are digitally encoded and transmitted electronically, regardless of whether a Party treats such products as a good or a service under its domestic law'.

Under the FTA, e-commerce must receive 'national treatment' – i.e. both parties must treat the digital products of the other no less favourably than they treat the digital products of their own producers. In the context of e-commerce, Chile could not, for instance, give more support to digital sound recordings from its own composers, musicians or record companies, than it gives to those from the USA.

The general principle of 'e-commerce' is clear enough and is nicely defined above. We can expect many changes as e-commerce evolves, but they probably will be covered by that definition.

'New media' are another matter. 'Media' as tools of communication between, for instance, artist and audience, are easily comprehended and may possibly be covered entirely by the e-commerce definition. But we also think of media as media for expression, as when a composer creates a musical or audiovisual work entirely by digital means.

Our New Zealand consultant supplies a useful definition of a so far very flexible term:

'The term "new media", as used by Creative New Zealand, describes a variety of artistic practices that use analogue or digital technology within an electronic and/or internet domain. New media projects use new technologies as a tool to explore new modes of artistic expression. These technologies include computers, information and communications technology, virtual or immersive environments or sound engineering to create works of art.

'Types of new media projects include:

- developing a computer programme to make an artwork on the internet;
- working in modes that are not necessarily in a physical space (e.g. an online exhibition);
- internet-driven collaborative projects; and
- time-based art projects. '

Enter into this creative territory and we would have to say we have no idea of what lies ahead. Would the pop music audience in Frank Sinatra's heyday have any concept of the sounds of pop electronica, music that has claimed a large audience only decades later?

In our lengthy discussion of musical diversity and (mainly) radio broadcasting, we saw that in many countries, diversity is assisted by the imposition of regulations favouring local content. These rules were developed in the context of analogue broadcasting, but broadcasting is in the process of shifting into the digital realm and that means that it falls within the definition of e-commerce. Chile has local content regulations. Will these no longer be admissible under its FTA with the USA when Chilean broadcasting goes digital?

A number of free trade agreements, including GATS (General Agreement on Trade in Services under the WTO), incorporate a principle of 'technological neutrality'. If a certain outcome is agreed in one technological context, then the agreement holds if the same product is delivered under an alternative or successor technology. Generally, this probably is intended to ensure that free trade survives the evolution of technologies, but it also holds for the reservations to the agreements. So for instance, when free to air broadcasting changes from analogue to digital, technological neutrality says that regulations such as local content requirements apply unchanged.

Our European report says 'The sudden success of services such as Voice-Over-IP shows how fast conventional media can be replaced by the new technologies. If one takes such drastic changes into account it is paramount that the same regulations and standards are applied to the new media as to the old ones. Else one has to suspect the effective abolition of the old structures by the replacement of new technologies.'

However, it is not so simple, even with the current state of technological evolution. For instance, streaming broadcasting is being supplanted to a degree by various forms of music on demand. The Chilean government could require that a percentage of the music stream provided to Chilean listeners by radio is produced by Chilean musicians. It's another matter altogether to attempt to apply such a requirement when the listeners download – and pay for – the musical tracks of their choice. The government can hardly oblige them to pay for one Chilean track in every four tracks they purchase.

One concept that has been advanced to take care of this problem is to regulate to ensure at least that listeners have access to local music on pay-for-play. Borrowing

from conventional retail stores, the term 'shelf space' has been re-applied. The government could require that the providers of the service include 25% Chilean content in the catalogue they make available for purchase. But what if a Chilean listener buys pay-for-play from a provider in the US? How can the Chilean government regulate what a US provider offers? And even if that were in some way possible, how does the US provider cope with 50 countries each of which wants one quarter of its catalogue to be comprised of music from their own nationals? As our Latin American consultants say, given this situation 'it seems impossible to anybody to legislate about favouring or disfavouring any kind of music.'

There is another problem: we actually can have no idea of the nature of new media in 50, even 20, possibly even 10 years. There is no way that we can be sure that regulations put in place now will still be useful in the near or medium future.

If there were total flexibility in addressing these problems when they become apparent, this would not be an issue now. The difficulty is that free trade agreements, which are notoriously difficult and expensive to change, can remove a country's right to find new solutions to new problems of this sort. Countries that have signed their rights away now will be exposed not only to free trade but to the powerful countries that have managed to take a dominant position in this area.

New technologies affect musicians' lives at many levels. The ability to produce entire film scores on a computer has taken work from the musicians who formerly would have been called upon to record the music. Musicians who create music of interest only to niche audiences can find such audiences globally through making their music available over the internet; this may give them the support or motivation to continue making this music, and so contributes to musical diversity. Some consultants draw attention to such outcomes but we need to recall that in this section, we discuss only the regulation of new media and e-commerce as it may affect musical diversity.

Our consultants' reports show that beyond the affluent countries, the regulation of new media and e-commerce is simply not an issue because the technologies are not yet significant in commercial or artistic life. No relevant regulations are cited. But even the European consultants report that 'most of the experts interviewed for this report did not know about developments in the domain of the new media', let alone any relevant regulations.

Subsidies to artistic work in new media can result in an increase in diversity, as new forms of musical expression are encouraged. Generally the regulations governing subsidy make this sort of support available in some measure in the developed countries. But this is not regulation of new media but of subsidy. Similarly, there are relevant developments in copyright law that affect new media and e-commerce but do not in themselves regulate them. We will discuss such matters in a later section.

4.2.3 Education

In this chapter on 'the standards regulating musical diversity', we look at the relevant regulation of education. That is to say, the issue of interest under this term of reference is not so much the entirety of the education that is offered in any particular situation, but the *requirements* imposed by governments on educational providers.

The regulations for education must cover a plethora of issues. Those that are relevant to musical diversity would certainly need to address the music curriculum: does it introduce students to a variety of musical genres? Recalling the issue raised in section 1 about the human right to participate in one's own culture, we might ask whether there is a regulation requiring that students are instructed in the musics of

their own culture. But also, we could inquire whether this range of genres must include musics from cultures or countries other than their own?

By extension, there is an issue around the accessibility of music education: is it offered to all students? We might note that accessibility is often limited by resources rather than by regulation.

Regulations requiring that the curriculum introduce students to musical diversity do not necessarily have the effect of *adding* to diversity. They create an audience for a diversity that already exists. So we might also be interested in whether the regulations require, or at least offer the possibility, that students themselves create music. That could in due course lead to an increase in the sum of diversity.

We recall in passing UNESCO's early interest in ameliorating the divisions caused by cultural differences. It encouraged cross-cultural education and understanding in the interests of peace. We speculated that this has been one of the motivations for introducing a multicultural education in music into schools.

In a longer study, we could have pursued all of these issues, and they certainly are of interest. However, our consultants have focussed mainly on genre diversity in curricula – so giving a direct response to the question they actually were asked!

Reviewing our consultants' reports, we find that in Latin America, neither Mexico nor Guatemala have regulations for musical diversity. There is no regulation for musical diversity in the schools in our two Arab countries, Algeria and Morocco, and in any of the African countries other than South Africa and to a small degree, Tanzania. The African situation is interesting inasmuch as there is wide discussion in music education circles about replacing the traditional Western curriculum left from colonial days with a curriculum more solidly based in African music. We need always to recall, of course, that there are many countries not included in our sample.

By contrast, regulations or provisions (provision implies some sort of regulation) are in place in all four of our Asian countries. There is provision in some Australian states, and in New Zealand there is special requirement for Maori musics. In Latin America, the curricula in both Colombia and Chile provide for musical diversity. Our European consultants give no instance where there is no requirement for a musically diverse curriculum – possibly simply an error of omission – and state that generally across Europe there are such requirements or provisions. A few examples are offered – from Albania, Bulgaria, the German states, Latvia and the UK.

Some quotes from our Asian consultants:

'For *China*, a heavily populated country, education is the footstone for its development and progress. In the teaching schemes of middle schools and primary schools, there are specific items indicating music teaching contents and time of music courses. The music courses include singing and music appreciation. Chinese national and folk music take up 60% of the courses.'

At the Central Conservatory of Music in Beijing, the most prestigious in the country, the emphasis is on the teaching of Western music. Nevertheless, students are obliged to study Chinese music and this counts for 30% of their total grades.

From *Singapore*: 'About 4 years ago, there was a change in the music curriculum in schools to include music of the main ethnic communities in Singapore – Chinese, Malay and Indian as well as World Music, focusing on the music of China, Japan, Africa, Indonesia, Latin America and India. As such, students in our schools have the opportunity to be exposed to a variety of music, when in the past, it was only western classical music.'

From *Vietnam*: 'Besides the common-official part of primary and secondary schools' music curriculum, an additional part consisting of knowledge of local-ethnic music is obligatory. The content of this part will be chosen by the Teachers-Committee of each school and it can include some non-formal activities. The local music is also included in the curriculum of the High College of Arts in each province as official content.'

Our *Indonesian* consultant points to a rather complex and poignant situation and we quote him in full even though his description goes beyond our immediate topic: 'Musical expression among students of senior high school (and lower level) as well as academic level is dependent upon policy of the officers in the national level. However, the availability of programs and qualified teachers also become factors in deciding which music to study. Whereas at the national level the policy relies on the concept of "Unity in Diversity" mentioned before, not all of the ethnic musics in Indonesia (whose numbers are thousands) have qualified teachers to teach music from elementary to university levels. Among the small number of teachers are those with Western musical educational training, causing the system of music education to orientate itself on Western music.

'The members of the communities, on the other hand, due to the lack of knowledge and understanding of local music, think that their music is old-fashioned and not up-to-date, and some of them say that their music is not relevant to contemporary life. As a result, they orient themselves on "foreign music", the music that is originated from other countries... [E]verything comes from the West (technology, science, law, economy and political systems, etc.) is thought of as more valuable and has higher status than the similar concepts from their country. As a result they underestimate local products and cultures. With similar rationale they also think that local music is also lower in status.

'This issue eventually becomes serious when youth construct ideas emphasizing the "dichotomy" of West and East, where West is thought of as "superior" and East is "inferior." This situation affects the way they think of local music and eventually also influences their taste in music. I was told that in west Java youth are ashamed of listening to traditional music like *Degung*, they prefer to listen to (and play) popular music, the hybrid between Western element and the local music. They are proud of being able to play western instruments and are reluctant to play traditional instruments. Ironically, in our campus at STSI Surakarta, when I asked the new ethnomusicology students whose interest is to study and to keep the traditional alive, none of them said that he/she had ever played traditional instruments or sang traditional songs before they entered the school. The reason was like the one mentioned before, they are ashamed of being able to play traditional music.'

The attitudes and problems revealed here are echoed in many Asian countries. So whereas in Europe, the musical diversity issue often is about introducing music from non-European cultures, in Asia music education often teaches at core the classical music of the West and the progressive view is that there is a need to build a knowledge of local musics. None of the Asian reports suggested an interest in introducing music from Africa or Latin America nor indeed, excepting Singapore, from other Asian countries.

Australasia. In *Australia*, the responsibility for government-provided education resides in the eight states and territories. In addition, each of the eight has a Catholic school system, and then a group of private schools that do not really constitute a system. There is considerable variation in the regulations between each of these systems. There is a move towards teaching the musics that interest the

children, and this translates in most cases into some form of Western popular music. The curricula, which used to be based on classical music, are now much more open, so that choices and some level of diversity is commonly available. Despite the very large number of immigrants, we are not aware generally of any regulations that would require a study of, for instance, non-Western music.

From New Zealand: 'The arts (including music, dance, drama and visual arts) are included in the curriculum of New Zealand schools. Guidance for programme planning is provided in a document entitled *The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum*. That statement promotes learning about the musical heritages of New Zealand's many diverse cultures and about the genres and styles of traditional and contemporary Māori music.'⁸⁶

In *Latin America*, Chile has clear requirements for a broad curriculum: 'In the Musical Arts Curriculum it is required to give primacy to: a) music from all strata: concert, popular urban and oral traditional; b) national and Latin American music and music from other regions and cultures; c) music composed in the past and in the present.'⁸⁷

Columbia has an excellent program: 'Within artistic education, the music and rhythms of communities of Indigenous, Afro-Colombian and Mestizo background must be studied. It is the objective to affirm the Colombian cultural, musical, traditional and ethnic patrimony as well as the Latin American and universal music environment. Teachers and pupils are required to travel around and carry out research activities concerned with composers, repertoires, oral traditions of diverse cultural expression and the history of the technological transformation of music. They are asked to make recordings, interviews, and also to observe directly the work of non-academic poets and composers, and finally to contrast and evaluate their investigation. There is still a need to rescue the musical repertoire of children, such as contemporary classical music and traditional songs. Nevertheless, music education is not an obligatory subject at school.'⁸⁸

The *European* consultants write about the general picture in Europe: 'Most curricula all over Europe emphasise musical diversity and often explicitly named is a large array of musical genres that shall be taught. Although there is no concrete information about the actual situation, there are indications that these requirements are not realized in actual circumstances in the schools. One of the reasons for this shortage might be that teachers lack the appropriate skills. If this problem does not account for individual teachers, but is a more regular problem, it points to a structural problem in the education of music teachers.

'Comparing theoretical and practical training there are indications that practical training resists attempts of diversification even more than theoretical training.'

Despite the reservation about whether the curricula are actually taught, the consultants write in a little more detail about the nature of the scheduled diversity.

⁸⁶ See page 53 -www.minedu.govt.nz/web/downloadable/dl3519_v1/thearts.pdf

⁸⁷ Chile. Ministerio de Educación. Sector Curricular. Educación Artística.
<http://www.eduteka.org/pdfdir/LineamientosEducaciónArtísticaChile.pdf>

⁸⁸ Colombia Aprende. La red del conocimiento Mediateca.
<http://www.colombiaaprende.edu.com/html/mediateca/1607/article-92746.html>

'Everywhere in Europe music is taught in schools with a focus on music theory as developed in the context of 'classical' music or, for that purpose, with a strong focus on academic music theory. Similarly, the spectrum of musics dealt with in schools focusses on the repertoire of European art music. However, other musical genres are taught as well, such as popular music genres and national folk song.

'The tendency to favour national repertoire in European countries is often counterbalanced by the study of other traditions and, therefore, far from nationalism. For example, in Romania the Romanian repertoire receives greater attention than in other countries, but other traditions of music, mostly European traditions of art music, are dealt with as well. The degree in which national musics stand in the center of attention varies. In some countries this national tendency is strongly developed.

'In many countries there are explicit attempts to foster musical diversity and to integrate a multitude of musical genres in the curricula as for example in Germany.

'World music and traditional musics of the world are particularly strong in some parts of Scandinavia, such as Sweden, and in other countries, such as the Netherlands. Interestingly enough, interest in world music and the musics of "the Other" is particularly strong in cities (according to Franz Niermann). Perhaps this is due to fact that the urban situations tend to favor the encounter of many musical identities.

'Sometimes the focus on the musics of "the Other" is explained with a colonial past of some countries, but this explanation cannot cover all the cases, since some of the countries developing such a focus, like Sweden, do not have a distinct colonial past.

'Musical diversity is explicitly mentioned in many curricula, for example in those of Niedersachsen, one of Germany's federal states... Pupils are supposed to be made acquainted with a multiplicity of musical forms and styles.'

The Europeans go on to say that ,Music education in universities and conservatories mostly mirrors the situation in schools – at least as far as the musical practice is concerned. There is a clear concentration on classical music in most of Europe's countries. But other music genres are taught as well. They mainly come from the broad and economically relevant field of popular music such as jazz, musical and rock and pop. In some countries with a strong identification on folk music, such as Bulgaria, there are possibilities to study folk music and related styles. Non-western musical genres are taught more rarely in practice, for example at the SOAS in London and the World Music and Dance Centre of Codarts, University of Professional Arts Education in Rotterdam. There have also been some promising pilot projects searching for spproaches to multiculturality e.g. through introducing conservatory students to world music practices (www.aecinfor.org/connect).

While as mentioned, regulation of the music curriculum in favour of musical diversity is absent in most of our *African states*, as much due to lack of resources as anything, there are written requirements in South Africa. An informant to our consultant gives this information:

'Marianne Feenstra notes, in response to the question "Are there regulations requiring education in local music traditions, or in a diversity of musical genres?", "Yes, clearly spelled out in the FET National Curriculum Statement: Music and also in the Revised National Curriculum Statement: Music Grades 7 – 9 and earlier". (FET refers to the Further Education and Training Band, the last three years of schooling, corresponding with the internally known system of grades 10-12. GET, prior to FET, is the acronym for the General Education and Training Band.)

'The Revised National Curriculum Statement for GET and the National Curriculum Statement for FET include assessment standards for indigenous music. The RNCS (GET) for example requires

*for LO (i.e. Learning Outcome) 1 'Blends the styles of own choice from immediate cultural environment and those used in West, East, Central or North Africa'

*for LO1 'Uses ululation, vocalic lilt, crepitation and mouth drumming to create a climax in a musical situation'

*for LO1 'Identifies the constituent parts of an integrated African art form'

*for LO3 'Expresses own sense of identity and uniqueness in any art form' (to be read in conjunction with ethnic and cultural definitions in the same LO.

'Feenstra subsequently remarks: "There was great emphasis placed on exploring (South) African music and musical styles - many people interpreted this as representing such an emphasis on the indigenous that classical music would disappear completely! ... Added to that there is also the Tirisano Schools Choral Eisteddfod run by the DoE annually which features, as prescribed works, South African compositions for all categories. ... I personally think there is enough emphasis on indigenous art forms, including music, and that we don't need any (further) legislation in this regard. The more we legislate, the less attractive it becomes for anyone to explore what is available. Kids (and teachers!) are funny things - they'll do the exact opposite of what they're ordered to do, but exactly what is suggested ever so subtly...'"

4.2.4 Subsidies

(The reader is reminded of the discussion at the beginning of section 2 on the distinction between cultural subsidies and industry assistance.)

The very simple matter of interest in this section is whether government subsidies to musical activity permit, encourage or even require support to musical diversity. Subsidies might be directed mainly or exclusively to the support of a particular musical genre to the exclusion of others. There may even be a directive or regulation that requires this. The regulatory regime may not specifically exclude others but they are de facto excluded for whatever reason.

Conversely, there may be a policy to support activities in a diversity of genres. The policy may simply be open, or it might seek the inclusion of a specific set of genres. At its most developed, in our terms, it might be a policy to support musical diversity. Such a policy seems to have a different flavour and might lead to different outcomes.

In addition to the issues above, our consultants were asked these questions: Are there regulations that require that government subsidy can only be given to citizens of the particular country, or regulations along those lines? Are there regulations that require that all applicants for subsidy must be considered equally, whether citizens or foreigners? Or are there variants on any of the above?

Why are these issues relevant? For two reasons. If funding authorities are permitted to fund nationals from other countries, there could be wider support to musical diversity, especially if those other countries do not have the resources to subsidise their own people. Secondly, if the regulation applies only to a country's own nationals or residents, it is possible that at some time in the future it could be challenged in free trade negotiations because 'national treatment' is not being afforded to the negotiating partner. This is at least possible in theory. Under the WTO, all subsidies are supposed to be phased out, but there seems to be little

support for that in the cultural sector. And if subsidies survive, how likely is it that an affluent country would insist that its trading partner open up its subsidies to non-nationals when it would have to reciprocate? (Unless it were a wealthy country that is not much given to subsidising the arts. How many of those do we know?)

The essential prerequisite to any of the above is that there are in fact subsidies. We can include here any form of government financial support to non-government entities or to government entities at a lower level, whether it be in the form of cash, tax foregone, or in-kind support through for instance provision of services.

Consultants from some countries in *Sub-Saharan Africa* state flatly that there are NO subsidies. Cameroon has some subsidies but the criteria for their use 'are not clearly defined'. Says our man in the Congo: '...music, not to say culture, does not belong to the priorities, in spite of the creation of ministries in charge.' There are virtually no subsidies in the East African countries.

As *South Africa* reconstructs its governmental policies and legal structures, there has been a deliberate transfer of much (but not all) music funding away from classical music to other forms. As a consequence, professional orchestras, for instance, have disbanded. Presumably, African music forms are the beneficiaries.

Arab World: In *Algeria*, 'any legal association of artistic and cultural nature, domiciled in Algeria, is entitled, upon request, to an annual subsidy...regardless of the musical genre it is concerned with.' No information is given about the actual outcome of this open policy. In *Morocco* also, subsidies are available to music associations 'in order to promote certain musical genres [unspecified by the consultant]. So not open, but there is some diversity.

Asia. In *Singapore*: 'Generally government subsidies for the arts are only given to citizens and permanent residents. In terms of genres, there is no specific regulation favouring one genre above the other, although pop, jazz and rock music is seen as more commercial activity and so do not get as much subsidy as compared to other more 'cultural' genres of music.'

In *Indonesia*, there is subsidy, but it is insufficient to ensure the survival of traditional musics. Our consultant: 'According to a local newspaper in West Java *Pikiran Rakyat*, in West Java alone about 132 kinds of traditional arts die out and only 78 can stay alive in different levels. In order to stay alive some musicians in Solo, Yogya, Klaten, and in many cities in Central Java and East Java, adjust their music with the "instant taste" sacrificing the values of the music. This situation occurs because there is not sufficient subsidy given to local music groups to practise and create works in their own communities. As a result, only music that has strong supporters can survive culturally and economically.' That music, he says, is [by definition] popular music. We have been told about the special position of popular music vs. traditional music in the Education section.

The *Vietnamese* response to this question is extended and pertinent and merits inclusion in its entirety.

'Subsidy for preservation and promotion of folk culture generally and for folk arts such as music, dance, etc...particularly is one of the substantial key policies of Vietnam's Government. It was created on the bases of awareness that *the Vietnamese traditional culture is a multicolour diversity crystallised through many*

*thousands of years of creative activities of all ethnic groups.*⁸⁹ The subsidy was used for activities of some main aspects as follows:

- i. There was a National Research Program for the "Collection, Preservation and Promotion of the traditional intangible heritage of 54 ethnic groups". The program is operating from 1998 until 2010. The Vietnam Institute of Culture and Arts Studies (VICAS) was appointed to be the key organiser of the program with an annual subsidy around \$200,000 US (equivalent).
- ii. Since 1993 the Association of Vietnamese Folklorists received an annual subsidy around \$100,000 US (equivalent) for the same aim.
- iii. Special funding of around \$250,000 US (equivalent) was assigned annually for collecting and preserving traditional music and installing the collected materials in the DATABANK.
- iv. Special funding for the National Program "Collection, Preservation, Publishing all Epics of minorities living in the Highland of Central Vietnam." The Epics always are performed using the traditional musical tunes of each ethnic group. The Research Institute of Folklore from the National Academy of Social and Human Sciences was appointed as the key body for realising the program with a total subsidy around \$1,500,000 US (equivalent) in the years 1995-2005.
- v. Funding for all activities of Minorities Regional Music and Dance Troupes and Minorities Regional High Schools of Music and Dance in three minorities' regions, Western-North, Northern and Highlands of Central Vietnam. The funding is given also to Music and Dance Troupes and Secondary Schools of Music and Dance of 18 provinces where the minorities occupy a main part of provincial population.
- vi. The festivals of traditional music and dance are organized biennially in each of the three minorities' regions named above. Such festivals are organized annually at provincial level and each five years at national level. All such activities are organized with State funding.
- vii. According to the Clause 26 of the "*Law for safeguarding cultural heritages*" (cited material), and according to its own Rules, the Association of Vietnamese Folklorists (AVF) has implemented the regulation for "*awarding the honour title Master of Folklore*" to the most famous folklore masters-bearers of certain folklore knowledge or genres including music. The rewarded Masters receive annually a modest honorarium and medicinal insurance from the State subsidy which Government gives for all activities of AVF.
- viii. Subsidy is available only to indigenous people. As a poor country, we have no ability to subsidise foreigners.'

An example of a *Chinese* program of financial support for music diversity runs along similar lines except that here, the central government subsidises activities of local governments. 'In 2005, the Chinese Ministry of Culture established a "human oral and intangible heritage protection office" and earmarked 400 million RMB required to invest solely into this program within 5 years. To start up this program, the office first furnished facilities (audio/video recorders, computers, photocopy machines, etc.) for all the local governments, then developed a series of concrete programs specially designed for all local government and finally granted the necessary funding

⁸⁹ Extract from *Declaration and Decision of Fifth Meeting of CP's Standing and Executive Boards adopted in 10/1998.*

for each program accordingly.'

Australasia. In *Australia*, perhaps the most interesting program of subsidy for cultural diversity is that following on from the Australia Council policy initiative, Multicultural Arts Australia. This has precursors going back to the early 1980s. Early in its history, the various art form boards were required to meet financial targets for the support of multicultural arts (i.e. artworks from ethnic groups or ethnic artists, and hybrid art). This is no longer considered necessary and the policy works in more subtle ways.⁹⁰

Special initiatives have been taken in support of multicultural music and indigenous music. The Australia Council, the national arts funding body, has an Aboriginal Arts Board with funds to support the work of Aboriginal artists in all artistic forms and genres. Cultural production also benefits from other policies intended to support economic development for Aboriginal communities.

More generally, national and state arts funding authorities have gradually moved from funding mainly classical music to funding a wide variety of genres. Pressure from the popular music industry, using the argument that 80% of the population listens to popular music and therefore it should be subsidised, has led to more subsidy to these musicians, especially early in their professional lives.

Some government-funded programs in *New Zealand* in support of musical diversity were described above in the Broadcasting section. Concerning the eligibility of foreigners for funding, there is no outright prohibition: 'provided that a project benefits art in New Zealand, there is no restriction on the citizenship/nationality of applicants.' The national funding body, Creative New Zealand, has programs that support musical diversity, including the Maori Arts Board, Pacific Arts Committee and the Creative Communities Scheme.

Latin America. As reported, this is a mixed picture. Some examples:

Funding in *Argentina* goes primarily to classical music⁹¹. On the other hand, in *México*, the National Fund for Culture and Arts (FONCA) has an organized program to encourage diverse music genres, such as traditional genres and classical music. This program is open to Mexican citizens and in some cases to foreigners with a legal migratory status.⁹² *Paraguay's* National Fund for Culture and Arts also promotes equality of opportunity in access to diverse cultural manifestations. Subsidies are given to national projects, even if the artists are foreigners.⁹³ In *Argentina, Venezuela, Brasil, Chile, Argentina, Paraguay, México, Uruguay* and *Honduras*, although national projects have priority, subsidy is available to nationals and non-nationals alike. *Guatemalan* legislation stipulates that governmental subsidies must be given only to Guatemalan citizens.

Inevitably, since patronage and state subsidy have a long history in *Europe* and Europe in its affluence is the most capable of arts subsidy, the report from our European consultants was the most complex. The European report begins with a discussion of the purposes and procedures of subsidy, making points additional to those presented here. It can of course be read in Appendix 14, the European report.

⁹⁰ http://www.ozco.gov.au/council_priorities/multicultural/ama_policy/

⁹¹ Secretaría de Cultura. Presidencia de la Nación - <http://www.cultura.gov.ar>

⁹² <http://www.conaculta.gob.mx /CONACULTA>.

⁹³ <http://www.fondec.gov.py / Consejo Paraguayo de la Música / CIM>

The consultants observe that 'In the countries of Europe cultural subsidies are not distributed by a single institution of the state, but by a decentralized system of state institutions. Typically these institutions are found on a federal level, the level of districts or federal states and the local level (municipalities etc.). Often all of these levels have separate cultural departments. Although everywhere in Europe there are decentralized states, the level of decentralization can be very varying. In Belgium, for example, the expenditures for culture of the federal state are only 2.7% whereas in Eastern Europe central government bodies often spend more than 50% of all expenditures on culture (Albania 98% in 2000, Bulgaria 74.7% in 2003, Estonia 60% in 2003, Lithuania 56.7 % in 2003, all figures according to the relevant Ericart reports).'

So each one of these entities could have a support policy relevant to musical diversity, whether by commission or omission. Obviously, this report can deal in only a general way with a situation of such complexity.

The consultants take the view that 'For the promotion of musical diversity it is paramount that these mechanisms are not limited to specific kinds of music. Instead, they have to be open to a wide range of musics and musicians.'

The report on the funding activities of seven European countries gives only modest evidence of support to musical diversity. The consultants note that 'Reports on cultural subsidies in the countries of Europe rarely mention musical diversity explicitly. Instead the reports focus on subsidies in a more general context.,, The same holds true for most of the legal documents (decrees, acts etc.) in which the state regulations themselves are formulated... From what has been shown above, it seems that there is a tendency of structures favouring musical diversity...'

'The Belgium cultural legislation promotes equality. The Cultural Pact Act passed in 1973 prescribes that government aid – in whatever form– must guarantee the equality of rights between citizens, regardless of their conviction.' If this is carried through to the level of funding decisions, then subsidies should cover the wide array of music stylistic preferences of the citizenry.

The longish treatment of *Germany* does not reveal any inclination about diversity one way or another. The same applies for the Netherlands and Slovakia.

'The Media Support Foundation [in *Lithuania*] aims at dissemination of regional and ethnic culture, the development of cultural awareness of society, and unique cultural aspects of national communities. [There is funding and support to] festivals, performances, international cooperations etc... The World Lithuanian Song Festival, organised every four years, plays an important role in the development of amateur art in the country (the last one was held in 2003). The Lithuanian Folk Culture Centre, which functions under the Ministry of Culture, is the main state institution responsible for amateur art activity in the country...

'Main minorities in Lithuania are Polish and Russian (each about 6% of population). There are also about 3000 gypsies. The Law on National Minorities (1989, amended in 1991) guarantees the rights of national minorities to receive state support for fostering of their national culture, access to information and press in their native language and to establish cultural and educational organisations. The state provides financial support for institutions such as the Russian Drama Theatre of Lithuania and the Vilnius Faon Jeweish State Museum of Lithuania.'

4.2.5 Copyright

In the study, *The Effects of Globalisation on Music in Five Contrasting Countries*⁹⁴, the consultant for Nigeria reported that the multinational record companies had closed their offices and left. They had faced a level of piracy so high that they could not remain profitable.

Despite the loss of the multinational companies, the consultant reported a musical scene that seemed to have a lot of vitality, although of course it would have faced some crucial limitations.

Let us imagine that the problems of legislating and enforcing copyright in Nigeria could be solved, creating an orderly commercial environment in which the multinationals might again make a profit. What are the likely consequences? Let us speculate.

First of all, the multinationals return. They apply their marketing power to sell their product, produced and tested already in the developed world and more or less guaranteed some good level of interest from the Nigerian audience because of its origins in affluence. Sales would increase and so would royalties. The royalties and most of the profits would be exported. Nigeria would join the long list of countries with an international trade deficit in music because it will have only modest, if any, music exports.

Secondly, the strength of marketing by the multinationals probably will mean that local musics lose ground or even face extinction. There already is a problem resulting from urbanisation and the decline in aspects of rural life, the cultural basis for traditional musics. This is not all the responsibility of the multinationals. However, they could have a major additional negative effect.

There could be positive effects from the now-functioning copyright regime. Without copyright, musicians can earn only from live performances, from one-off payments by record companies or from selling recordings directly. The possibilities for composers are even more limited. With copyright, they can receive a royalty from record sales made at a great distance and in which they personally have no part, or from use of their music or performance in television or films. Record companies can receive income not only from sales but also from royalties for the use of their recordings by, for instance, broadcasters or online providers. Royalties make an *industry* possible.

An industry can grow. But on the evidence from elsewhere, the multinationals will buy any Nigerian record company that is successful enough to build to a good size. Typically, the recording industry in any country is comprised of small companies and the multinationals, with little in between. The multinationals will promote international pop or its local variants. They may sign local artists, but these will be performers of that music. Support to local musics or musics of niche interest will be left to tiny companies with no marketing power.

Say a Nigerian musician has international potential. With an effective copyright regime in place, s/he can sign with the appropriate local royalty collection agency and receive royalties. Royalties can flow in from foreign territories, if the collecting societies do their duty. The multinationals are the gatekeepers to the international market. If they have offices in Nigeria, there is the possibility – a very small possibility -- that if our musician is successful in the local market, a multinational will offer a contract and attempt an international promotion. Probably, the musician has

⁹⁴ Available at www.mca.org.au under MCA Research.

to leave Nigeria for much of the year but in theory it will be possible to be based in Nigeria and there to continue to receive an income from an overseas success.

If there is no orderly copyright regime and no multinational company, the musician probably has to move to Europe or the USA and somehow build a career there. With a lot of luck, s/he will sign with a foreign record company and with a collecting society in the new country of residence. If there are any royalties, none return to Nigeria except in the pocket of the visiting musician. So however successful the musician becomes, the benefit in Nigeria is likely to be minimal.

It's a complicated picture. Depending on the desired outcome, the choice to enact an effective copyright regime is not automatically the most advantageous, even though it might be argued by interested parties as the ethical imperative. If the desired outcome is support to musical diversity, it may not be a good choice at all. Time and again, the consultants to this study report the negative or even disastrous effects of big commerce on musical diversity. It is a major issue.

That said, they do not necessarily make the link between copyright and musical diversity as presented above. Consultants from the developing world more typically regret the inadequacies of their copyright regimes.

There is a lot of record piracy in the developing world. Again, this may present a rather disreputable choice to governments. The pirated recordings bring export income. Close the exporters and lose the income. Is pirating per se an issue for musical diversity? It is hardly worth the trouble to pirate a recording of niche interest. The pirated discs will tend to be the big sellers in the international pop styles, with international commercial value. The effect on diversity would result only from the even greater availability, at a lower price, of these discs. Perhaps there would be some negative effect on diversity on that account. On the other hand, piracy kept the multinationals out of Nigeria...

To our consultants' reports. The situation in many developing world countries seems to be part-formed or chaotic.

The *Algerian* consultant despairs of the situation there in copyright administration:

'The situation of the law on authors' rights law is indescribable. The Algerian artists suffer from a gap in law and legislation with regard to their protection and that of their works. The intellectual property rights, authors rights, tele-dissemination, performing rights, production, edition and neighboring rights are handled in an archaic way by one single organism called ONDA (Office national des droits d'auteurs). Exceeded by the only management of the collecting of phonographic rights from the publishers, the persons in charge at this public office have no other ambition than to perceive the right of diffusion. It often happens that the rights perceived by ONDA for a given work are only transferred to the author years later.

'The Algerian civil code does include legal texts about private and individual property, but does not integrate the protection of intellectual property. Only very few cases of jurisprudence were handled by Algerian law courts in this field. Proposals on the matter are the subject of a study carried within the Algerian Music Council. Insufficient and not-respected legislation.'

Morocco has had copyright law since 1916, is a member of WIPO and a signatory to the Berne Convention and the GATT Treaty of Marrakech. The law was modified in 2000 but the committee of authors to which administration was to be entrusted still does not exist.

The situation in Asia is mixed. Our Indonesian correspondent gives a typically interesting account, here of the situation in a country where copyright has not really taken hold and the musicians themselves do not understand the concept.

'Copyright law is new for Indonesian society. The government introduced it since 1980s and until at present many musicians do not really understand what the law really is. For that reason people do not know how to value intellectual rights. In addition, because law enforcement is weak in many aspects of life in Indonesia, even people who understand it would break the law for personal benefit. So, the practice of piracy is commonly done among people in music industry. According to Jakarta Post (March 17, 2003) Indonesia was said to become the Southeast Asia's principal digital piracy center, the second after China. ASIRI (The Sound Recording Industry Association of Indonesia) reported that the percentage of pirated CD's in Indonesia compared to originals amounted to 600 percent causing The United States warns Indonesia. This warning could be followed by economic sanctions. The ASIRI itself seems not effectively to work but since the US warned Indonesia on the case the illegal copying had been drastically reduced. The 105-member organization has since 1985 been responsible for collecting the government-authorized levy on each unit sold, known as the PPN tax. Some of the income goes towards the fight against piracy and as a result of several successful prosecutions the piracy rate of local music has fallen from a high of 90% in the mid 80's to the current figure of 9%.⁹⁵

'Another association Karya Cipta Indonesia (KCI, the Indonesian Composer Association) also works on the collection of royalty for their members. Founded in 1990 this Association owns an important figure as a patron Murdiono (the former Secretary of State) who became the key player in the Modernization of the Indonesian Music Business. KCI admits the difficulties of introducing the concepts of intellectual property but it is now collecting performances royalties from all TV and Radio stations and is concentrating on increasing revenues from restaurants, discotheques, karaoke bars, concert promoters, airlines, shops, supermarkets and franchise chains. As for mechanical rights royalties – the system whereby the record company pays a sum based on the number of units printed to the copyright society for distribution to the composers – KCI agreed on a rate with ASIRI in 1995.'

The consultant then makes a very surprising observation: 'But this is only for foreign composers and their publishers. Although KCI has 180 Indonesian composer members they have not yet been able to make an agreement to collect mechanical royalties for local product. KCI suggests that this situation is comparable to Europe thirty years ago. For most, business is still done on a flat-fee basis. The record companies pay the singers, composers and musicians a one-off payment. The record companies take the risks and the profits or losses.'

China also is known as a major source of pirated recordings. As it attempted to enter WTO, it came under increased pressure to clean up its performance in copyright legislation and administration. The Chinese consultant reports: 'The Copyright Law of the People's Republic of China went into effect on Sep. 7 1990 and was amended on Oct. 27 2001. The Chinese Copyright Law is an authoritative document for the Chinese government to protect intellectual properties. It provides legal stipulations for copyright and copyright-related publication, performance, audio-visual products, books, newspapers radio and TV. Although as demanded by people of the music circle for many years, the Article 43 (a radio station or a TV station may not pay

⁹⁵ <http://www.globalmusic.ti/garnews/colors.html/>

remuneration to the copyright owners for using their music works for non-commercial purposes.) was revised as "A radio station and a TV station may broadcast a published sound recording without seeking permission from the copyright owner, but should pay remuneration to the owner. It is not applicable if otherwise contracted by the parties. The measures thereof will be developed by the State Council," nevertheless, up to now, the copyright owners have not received any remuneration as the concrete measures to be issued by the State Council have not come out yet. The amended Copyright Law has not been actually put into force.'

In *Vietnam*, there is a copyright law and it is enforced but the consultant suggests that it needs additions and a more effective enforcement mechanism. In *Singapore*, copyright law exists but until recently has not been strictly enforced. But now there are raids on stores and internet infringers. There is a collection society for authors.

As one might expect, copyright legislation in *Australia* and *New Zealand* is more or less up to date.

Both the Australian and New Zealand copyright regimes used to give exclusive rights to copyright owners on a territorial basis. This makes some sense if you are located in a part of the world far removed from the physical sources of the copyright material you want to import. So for instance, if a company owned the New Zealand rights to the recordings of a particular foreign company, it had the exclusive right to import those recordings. Both countries have modified this legal structure so that under given circumstances, 'parallel importation' by another entity is permitted. The New Zealand consultant comments: 'There has been an argument that the more permissive legislation with regard to parallel importing affects the viability of specialist music importers thereby restricting the diversity of music available to niche consumers. This has yet to be proven and is probably more than offset by global internet purchasing.'

The Australian Record Industry Association (ARIA) has a subsidiary organisation that emulates the Record Industry Association of America in raiding and prosecuting copyright infringers – the importers of pirated discs, and unauthorised internet downloaders.

A related situation in Australia raises one of the current unresolved matters in many countries. The Australasian Performing Right Association (APRA) proposed a levy on the sale of blank audio recording devices, with the proceeds to be used to reimburse copyright owners for the loss of income through illegal online file-swapping. The record industry association, ARIA, has opposed this, arguing that it legitimises illegal use of copyright material and that effective Digital Rights Management (DRM) anti-copying Technical Protection Measures (TPMs) will become available and will be capable of preventing the illegal activity. With the industry divided, the government is unlikely to take any action – which is to say that ARIA's view wins by default.

The library sector is not happy with DRM because it can prevent access to copyright material that otherwise would be available under what is known in the USA as 'fair use' provisions (e.g. allowing copying free or charge of a percentage of a copyright production for purposes of study or research).

Organisations such as the Electronic Frontier Association also oppose DRM as an additional handicap to developing countries because it prevents research into the technologies involved and the production of alternatives that do not deliver large royalty payments to foreign owners. US trade agreements are signing countries up to adopt DRM technology and to make it a criminal offence to attempt to bypass it.

The survival of indigenous musics can depend partly upon giving them an economic base. At a regional level, this is also a major concern of the Council of Pacific Arts, based in Noumea, New Caledonia. The Council has a membership of 27 countries and territories and an executive board with representatives from Polynesia, Melanesia, Micronesia, Australia and New Zealand.

The reason to mention the Council in this context is that it is administered by the Secretariat of the Pacific Community⁹⁶ and that Secretariat has formulated a *Regional Framework for the Protection of Traditional Knowledge and Expressions of Culture*. The purpose is to provide copyright protection to traditional culture where ownership may be in the hands of the community or otherwise problematical in terms of usual copyright law. This is in the form of a 'model law' and is in the process of adoption by four countries and under discussion in a number of others.

The *Latin American* consultants report that copyright laws have been decreed in all of the countries investigated. They do not report on enforcement issues. They do describe at some length the royalty payment regime of the *Mexican* Authors and Composers Society and note that it has 'led to a consequence for some groups of composers and for composers of academic music, since it is a violation of their basic professional rights; so they have to subscribe to foreign copyright societies, mainly in the United States and Spain.

'This Mexican society gives the following benefits [but only depending upon the financial success of the composer according to the allegedly inequitable scheme]: Health and demise expenses, seniority rights, fiscal counselling, discounts, and voting rights in general assemblies.'

The consultants conclude that 'This regulation discriminates against all non-commercial musical genres.' It therefore does not support musical diversity.

In *Africa*, the picture is not reassuring. We have reports that copyright law exists in *Kenya*, *Tanzania* and *Uganda* but is not enforced. Worse, it is rumoured that in *Uganda* the record 'promoters' pirate their own recordings in order to avoid paying taxes. In the *Congo*, there is an authors' collecting society but 'it remains under the control of the Congolese State and therefore, there are always problems in the collection and the payment of the rights to the artists.'

There is a similar flavour to the problems in *Cameroon*, although a solution is evolving. Our consultant describes them in some detail:

'The creation of authors' rights societies was decided by the government, but their functioning has always encountered problems because of the bad management of funds collected. The first society: SOCADRA (Cameroon Society for Authors' Rights) was a state-owned society managed by inexperienced staff who cared little about artists' interest. Funds collected served more the functioning of the Society than the redistribution of rights to artists. That's why SOCADRA was dissolved and replaced by SOCINADA (Civil society of authors' rights) administered by the artists themselves. This second society has faced two problems: misappropriation of funds by the administrators and confusion with regard to the various artistic sectors. For the society represented visual arts, music, theatre and dance.

'In light of this confusion, the government decided to split up this structure and to create several authors' societies according to the artistic sector. The CMC (*Cameroon*

⁹⁶ www.spc.org.nc

Music Corporation) was founded two years ago but its leadership was kind of fighting each other. Today, however, the governing team seems to wish to put order into it for the benefit of the musicians. The expertise and technical cooperation from European societies and institutions (France and Belgium) has been contributing.'

'*South African* copyright laws are similar to those of most developed nations, and copyright is regularly enforced by South African courts' says our South African consultant. 'However, serious concerns [are] expressed by SAMRO, the Southern African Music Rights Organization ⁹⁷ in relation to the lack of a culture of intellectual property compliance amongst music lovers.' Customs authorities are active in the fight against record piracy and their activities indicate the dimensions of the problem.

The consultant argues that 'We need to work continuously and hard to establish our desired culture of voluntary governance compliance, which can be regarded, in the case of music and other art forms, as constituting respect for the creative effort of others⁹⁸. In some ways such an attitude is deduced from our value system and our "culture", but it can also be instructive/directional/guiding in that it can change our value system, hopefully for the better.

It is the South African consultant who points out that views of copyright can be culturally determined or at least, influenced. 'Lack of compliance is fuelled *inter alia* by inadequate understanding of the concept of governance and implementation of governance mechanisms, although here different cultural views also need to be taken into account. Philosophical tensions do exist, and with an issue of such complexity, "one size fits all" approaches are not necessarily appropriate. For example, the Hindu and African views are different to those of Westerners⁹⁹. After all, intellectual property law is a tool of strong Western states trying to protect their turf. Less developed states have just had to fall in – as, for example, in the medicine patent debate¹⁰⁰. Although Western thinking tends to prevail, internationally, there is

⁹⁷ www.samro.org.za

⁹⁸ What is being suggested is, of course, not a sort of compliance which would obviously be in conflict with the promotion of a questioning, creative attitude.

⁹⁹ The following was gleaned from a Hindu colleague, Dr Chatradari Devroop: "There is an agency that administers the copyright legislation of Indian media. However, there is a fundamental flaw with the process in that the issue of protecting one's rights conflicts with Indian philosophy. Indian philosophy clearly articulates that we are born into the world with "nothing", except for certain pieces of data we have brought with us from a previous life. From birth till death the world as we know it provides all our needs - nourishment, education, religion, etc. We therefore inherit a great deal from Mother Earth. All of these needs are given without any conditions/ monetary contribution. Generally there is a pool of data that nobody lays claim to. Upon exit from Earth we do not have the right to lay claim to anything we have contributed to this pool of needs because we have taken more (from Mother Earth) than we could possibly give back. Therefore to copyright one's contributions for monetary gain is in direct conflict with Indian philosophy". The African view is related to the underlying sharing principle implied by the philosophy of *Ubuntu* – a whole topic for discussion on its own.

¹⁰⁰ The current South African Minister of Health's approach to patent medicine has been notable and along the lines of "We will ignore patents in order to manufacture generics to save the lives of the poor". Interestingly, India is in the forefront of that industry!

still room to revisit positions and a sensitivity to alternative points of view which certainly was not found at the height of colonialism. In the meantime, irrespective of philosophical stances, governance issues in relation to music require ongoing attention.'

5. Musical diversity and the imposition of a monoculture

The tendency to favour a uniform and non-pluralistic interpretation of the notion of identity hindering the manifold and free expression of cultural diversity

- *Cite examples of government promulgation of a single musical or cultural identity and any associated constraint on other musical or cultural identities.*
- *Cite examples of similar promulgation by the citizenry or sections of the citizenry.*
- *Does it appear that in your region there are some states that are less likely to ratify the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity if issues of internal cultural diversity or open cultural borders are pressed?*

5.1 Evidence from the consultants' reports

There are very few instances in section 1, the relationship between musical diversity and the exercise of human rights, of direct suppression of musical genres. All consultants report that all of their target communities are filled with a great diversity of musical expression. It seems that a musical monoculture in today's world may not exist on a national basis and if monocultures do exist but have eluded our explorations, the reason would be either extreme isolation of a community from other communities and other musical input, or very heavy and intentional suppression by the state of all but the favoured musical genre.

A state might favour particular forms of music through its regulations or subsidies. But to withhold support from other forms is not quite the same as repressing them. The direction of the greater part of the music subsidies in many Western countries to Western classical music has hardly constrained the diversity of other musics available to listeners.

In summary, while governments in former times, or governments in countries other than those directly covered by this study, may have sought to favour a single, non-pluralistic cultural and musical identity through special support or targeted suppression, that does not seem to be an issue for great concern in the territories described here.

Consequently, citations from the consultants' reports can be brief.

Arab World

Algeria. At the inception of the democratic Algerian republic in 1962, the State has installed Arabic as the national language and Islam as State religion. A second national language was proclaimed in the 1990s. However, the government has never promulgated a single musical or cultural identity.

Asia

China. So far from proclaiming a single national cultural identity, the Chinese government has initiated programs to support diversity – e.g. in 1979, the program, The Great Wall of Chinese Culture, to rescue the ethnic cultural heritage. A special national TV music channel broadcasts a very diverse program including many traditional musics. School education similarly includes these musics.

Indonesia. The consultant cites only the focus of the formal arts schools on teaching Indonesian court music. But there is no accompanying suppression of other musical forms. Generally the state policy supports diversity, as already noted.

Singapore. This is a very small country with four official languages. There is a search for a national identity but this is not at the cost of favouring any of the constituent elements of the culture.

Vietnam. The consultant can cite the official efforts on behalf of diversity, and sees no attempt to promote a single identity.

Australasia

Australia. Government policies have explicitly favoured multiculturalism.

There are those in the electorate who are opposed to the policy of multiculturalism. They probably look back a half century to the time when there was less ethnic diversity and there seemed to be a simpler national identity. As we understand it, they believe that the consequence of multiculturalism is to create permanent ethnic divisions within Australian society. The present conservative government is not enthusiastic about multiculturalism. However, these concerns fall far short of attempting to enforce a uniform cultural identity.

New Zealand. The consultant could cite no example of government promulgation of a single musical or cultural identity.

Europe

The European consultants make the important point that 'Cultural and musical imbalances often take place in nations which are in the state of war. An example could be the use of the instrument *tambura* in Croatia. *Tambura* is traditionally associated with Northern Croatia whilst *mandolina* with Southern Croatia. During the war 1991 – 1995 when homogeneity was required, *tamburitza* was used to represent all Croatia, north and south. After the war, there was a trend against *tamburitza*, which enforced the *mandolina* (source Grozdana Marosevic).'

However, more generally they observe that 'all states in Europe allow the diversity of musical expression and one can observe a great diversity of musical forms everywhere in Europe. Exceptions are Turkey, where musics of national minorities as well as of some religious groups are restrained and Belarus, the last totalitarian state in Europe, where some repressions against rock musicians could be observed.'

The consultants note the strong official financial support of classical music 'and other kinds of "serious" music, like contemporary and medieval... Some European countries also support different kinds of "national" music, that are specific for each state. In Norway, this is a living tradition of rural music. In the Ukraine, it is rather a music which is a product of the transformation of a number of living rural traditions into one single musical standard, which has been exploited during the soviet era and still is associated with the Ukrainian national identity...'

But 'The involvement of the state with national music culture might not be predisposedly judged as non-pluralistic. In the most European countries today this involvement can be seen as balanced promotion, which restrains no other musical forms and often helps protecting and maintaining local traditions and counteracting international tendencies of globalisation in music.' The consultants seems to suggest, however, that Belarus is taking this too far with its 75% quota for Belarusian music on radio.

As for the EU, it 'considers the diversity of cultural expression to be one of its main focusses. There is a current debate on enhancing it within the Union and its member states. The main lobby organisations for music like the national music councils, which traditionally are very focussed on European and "serious" music, are now willing to put new accents and to promote musical diversity.'

The European consultants cite an interesting debate that originated in Germany.

'In October 2000, the leader of the German Christian Democratic Union/Christian Social Union (CDU/CSU) parliamentary group in the Bundestag (the lower chamber of the German parliament), used the term "Leitkultur von Deutschland" (leading, or hegemonic, culture of Germany) to describe what immigrants coming to Germany might aspire to. The debate and controversy surrounding this term has been enormous, it produced a broad public discussion about what this German "Leitkultur" and the cultural core values are. To this day the debate still re-inflames regularly in the media.

'The Term "European Leitkultur" originates from Bassam Tibi, who describes the values of "cultural modernity" in his book *Europe without Identity* (1988): Democracy is based on the separation of religion and politics, rationality is the governing principle and tolerance and pluralism are basic values. Thus cultural pluralism is not an arbitrary multiculturalism.

'One argument in the European debate about "Leitkultur" is, that on the one hand national cultural identities in Europe should be maintained, while on the other hand, Europe needs a joint cultural identity and a consensus about its cultural values which still needs to be developed. In the political debate on immigration policies, controlled "immigration" (Einwanderung) is seen as the opposite to the wild "migration" (Zuwanderung). The suggested rules for "immigration" and integration of immigrants often mean assimilation of the core cultural values which can be seen as danger to or even prevention of cultural pluralism.'

A footnote on Turkey: 'The still continuing oppression of Kurds and other minorities in Turkey is based on Atatürk's philosophy of the new Turkish state: "One nation, one language, one culture."'

Latin America

The Latin American consultants state simply that 'There is not any official promulgation of this type. Instead, the Constitution and Education laws in almost all of the Latin American countries decree that the State must protect cultural diversity, with a specific emphasis on Indigenous culture, inasmuch as it belongs to a national identity.' They also find that 'There are no groups opposed to musical diversity.'

Sub-Saharan Africa

Cameroon. The consultant expressed the view that in a country with multiple ethnicities and over 250 dialects, 'a policy of limitation to one musical identity would be a threat to peace.'

There is no such inclination on the part of either the *Congolese* or *South African* governments.

5.2 The UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions

Since at this time the ratification of this convention by nation states is important to the promulgation of cultural diversity, the consultants were asked this question: *Does it appear that in your region there are some states that are less likely to ratify*

the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity if issues of internal cultural diversity or open cultural borders are pressed?

We have the impression that consultants by and large are not well informed about the detail of the Convention and this may affect the response. However, no expectations of reluctance to support the Convention for the given reason were cited. A number of consultants noted that since support to a convention for cultural diversity would accord with national cultural policies, they would expect ratification.

The Latin American consultants give the most detailed response:

'There are several evidences which make us think that most of Latin American and Caribbean countries would ratify the Convention. These are the following:

- a) The plentiful cultural diversity that characterize the whole region and the presence of Indigenous groups and other marginalized ethnics.
- b) The United States is the only country in our continent that is strongly opposed to this Convention, so it might be ratified in order to avoid that country's cultural oppression.
- c) There are several civil society organizations against the Free Trade Agreements.
- d) All Latin American and Caribbean countries attended the UNESCO General Conference and only Honduras and Nicaragua did not vote in favor of the Convention.

Argentina	México	Surinam
Bolivia	Nicaragua	Bahamas
Brasil	Panamá	Barbados
Chile	Paraguay	Dominica
Colombia	Perú	Granada
Costa Rica	República Dominicana	Jamaica
Cuba	Uruguay	Saint Kitts y Nevis
Ecuador	Venezuela	San Vicente y las Granadinas
El Salvador	Haití	Santa Lucía
Guatemala	Belice	Trinidad y Tobago
Honduras	Guyana	

Thirty three countries in the world belong to the Coalition for Cultural Diversity. Nine of them are Latin American: Uruguay, Perú, México, Ecuador, Chile, Colombia, Brazil, Argentina and Venezuela. In Paraguay and Bolivia there are two coalitions about to be formed.¹⁰¹

But note that while the consultants say that 33 countries are members of this coalition, these are civil society organisations, not governments. Nevertheless, this is

¹⁰¹ Coaliciones en Movimiento. Un boletín de las coaliciones para la diversidad cultural. Vol. 4, No. 1, Enero 2006. http://www.cdc-ccd.org/Espagnol/bienvenido_2005.htm

a very strong measure of civil support and gives some indication of the context in which governments are operating on this issue.

Finally, from the Latin American consultants:

‘Montevideo, **Uruguay** - 24th MERCOSUR Summit: President Lula da Silva from Brasil, Néstor Kirchner from Argentina, Ricardo Lagos from Chile, Hugo Chávez from Venezuela, and other MERCOSUR ‘s assistants (Paraguay) and Associated States (Bolivia, Chile, Perú, Colombia and Ecuador) announced a Declaration with their promise to ratify and strongly support the Convention. ^{102,}

¹⁰² *Coaliciones en Movimiento. Un boletín de las coaliciones para la diversidad cultural. Vol. 3, No. 8, Diciembre 2005. http://www.cdc-ccd.org/coalition_currents/Dec05/coalition_currents_sp_dec05.html#3*

6. Musical diversity, the musicians, and identity

The manner in which musical diversity is addressed by music workers and expressed in various forms of musical creation; the relationship to identity

- *Cite examples of cultures in which musicians and/or the various participants in the music business (producers, presenters, record companies etc) are interested in musical diversity – in the sense of the simultaneous practice or presentation within a society of many forms of music.*
 - *Cite examples where they are averse to musical diversity.*
 - *Cite examples where they support, or weaken, the practice of local traditional or indigenous music.*
 - *Cite examples where they are interested in developing hybrid musical forms – e.g. music that combines two or more ethnic musical genres, or combines an ethnic music with say, western popular music, or combines various forms of non-ethnic music.*
 - *Cite examples of the expression of personal or community identity through music, and especially through musical diversity.*
-

6.1 Actors for musical diversity *per se*

Musical diversity exists everywhere, mostly through the simple concurrence of the activities of people who are acting for some special and narrow musical interest. But in this section we look at those actors in the music world who work directly in support of musical diversity.

Practising musicians need the specialised skills and understanding of particular styles of music – perhaps just one style. How many sitarists play the guitar? And of those who do, how many play the blues? Some musicians embrace a number of styles but relative to the totality of the diverse musical universe, there is only so much they can do. People in other roles in the sector are better placed. If your job is to play discs, you press the same buttons for Ghanaian ewe drumming and Los Angeles rap – although of course there are complications such as the preferred program format of your radio station, if that is where the buttons are.

So where are we likely to find actors in support of musical diversity?

Firstly, although for the most part we focus in this section on the actions of private parties, we should consider the political level because of the potentially broad influence of public policy.

Governments of many countries that are home to many indigenous ethnicities seek, for instance, to give them equal treatment and in that context, encourage the survival and expression of the indigenous art forms. Here, the support goes to one art form, one ethnic or population group at a time, within a context of an understanding that this is a multicultural society and not one that is to be forced into a single culture with all the ethnic anomalies disposed of.

Our Latin American consultants note, without elaboration, that 'Governments, through legislation, intend to sponsor multiple forms of diversity, even though some expressions remain always on the fringe.' As noted already, the Chinese Ministry of Culture established a 'human oral and intangible protection office' with a large

budget to be distributed to local governments. It also has supported a very large effort to collect traditional musics, described at length below. The Australian government, through its arts funding body, has a specific program, Arts for a Multicultural Australia, to support cultural and therefore musical diversity.¹⁰³ Some state governments in Australia have similar programs. There no doubt are equivalents in Europe and Canada.

Governments of countries with a culturally diverse immigrant population may opt for a policy of multiculturalism rather than assimilation. (See the reference in the Introduction.) In the realm of cultural expression, this translates into encouragement to each ethnic or cultural group to maintain the cultural traditions it has brought with it, while at the same time integrating itself more generally into the laws and customs of the new country.

From the Australian report: [After WW2] 'Australia relatively suddenly welcomed immigrants from many cultures, and some brought their music with them. However, in the early days of assimilation, the emphasis was on leaving the old ways behind them and joining their new society. Instruments were put into closets and musical skills went unused and unheard. Then multiculturalist policies took over and there were moves to bring these musics into the open.'

The consequence of this interest from the government was that 'Many musicians took an interest, both the immigrants, and Australians who decided they wanted to learn to play these styles. The interest was variously musical/aesthetic, or socially idealistic – wanting to bridge cultural divides, or political – wanting to give a voice to the underdog. Similarly, some musicians experimented with fusion or hybrid forms, because this was of interest musically and/or because it represented a reconciliation between cultures. There was a lot of idealism.'

One of the heartening aspects of our consultants' reports is that so many governments, at least in the countries subject to our study, do support cultural diversity, whether in the indigenous or immigrant populations, whether actively or at a benign distance. There are not too many instances of cultural repression on the basis of ethnicity.

In *civil society*, various aspects of musical activity lend themselves to the possibility of direct support to musical diversity. Broadcasters, festival producers, venue managers, music retailers are among them. And all of those activities can benefit from support by writers in the media.

Broadcasters. Concerning broadcasters, our European consultants give examples of world music stations in France, Germany, and the Netherlands, all of them intended to serve the diverse immigrant populations of those countries. In Australia, this function is served by the SBS radio and television networks. In East Africa, there are no world music stations per se, but many stations broadcast a variety of styles and some are committed to local musics and to broadcasting in the local vernacular. In China, although there is not a general policy among the state broadcasters to support musical diversity, the Music Channel, CCTV-16, sets out to broadcast a great diversity of Chinese traditional music as well as some foreign musical genres.

Interesting comment from the Congo: 'It is sure that Western music broadly occupies daily life through the zouk; the hip hop; the slow, etc... The local radios strive to reverse the tendency by imposing a good dose of local music, in vain,

¹⁰³ http://www.ozco.gov.au/council_priorities/multicultural/ama_policy/

because the night clubs do the contrary.’ [This is an interesting comment. Live music, not broadcast music, appears to be dictating or strongly influencing taste – the reverse of the situation in the West.] ‘To be noted, the appearance of other local currents such as religious music and the “coupé décalé” which, as we are sure, could overthrow the dominant currents as they are loved by young people.’

The European consultants have some very interesting observations about how market-think is affecting even public radio. ‘In Western Europe public sector broadcasters play an important role in maintaining musical diversity in public life: this is one of their main tasks which is absolutely crucial for their self-conception.

‘Johannes Theurer, editorial journalist at the German public broadcasting company Radio Berlin-Brandenburg, says:

‘ “Public sector broadcasters are guarantors of the representation of musical diversity in public life. They have the clear task to represent diversity, and they follow it. But the dedication to the diversity ends, when the listeners don’t want to have it.”

‘The diversity of musical forms being represented in the play-lists has been decreasing, since the notion of radio format¹⁰⁴ has been introduced by the public sector broadcasters. Today, prime time gives space to musical mainstream like pop music (mainly US-American) and classical music, or to the main profile of the station. This policy has been chosen to attract more listeners to these stations and to make them more profitable.

‘Ole Reitov, who has been working for public broadcasters in Denmark, describes the current situation with world music on Scandinavian public radios:

‘ “World music had become a broadcasting phenomenon, something that was considered worth dealing with, giving it an internal status similar to jazz and folk music.

‘But then “format radio” set in heavily in European radio. The idea was to streamline the channel structure and the program profiles, thus giving less influence to the music presenters and the producers and more power to “middlemen” and channel editors.

‘Several of the new bosses had no musical background and seldom any music policy ambitions that went further than mainstream. Music magazines (specialist programmes as they were called) were out. Music controllers were in and that trend is still dominating European Radio.

‘Most programmers have no freedom to choose the music they want. They are given a selection of tracks to choose from what has been pre-selected by various controllers and programme committees.

‘So whereas you could sneak in world music here and there in other programmes in the eighties and the first part of the 90’s, you can now hardly find world music in prime time radio, and several of the specialist world music programmes have been removed from the popular music channels.

¹⁰⁴ The ‘radio format’ comes from commercial radio: identify the broadcaster with a particular musical genre so the listeners can be guaranteed to find this music whenever they tune to that station. The subsequent even more restrictive formulation is to broadcast a small number of tracks ‘in rotation’, to create and satisfy the audience’s need for hit tunes.

'Thus neither Denmark nor Sweden has featured regular world music programmes on the P.3 channels for several years.'"

Record labels. The recording industry is motivated by profit and survives by it. While the market must vary a great deal between regions, and countries, we could generally assume that the great majority of recordings (let us guess for illustrative purposes 80%) sold in any territories reached by the multinational recording companies fall within a narrow stylistic band of 'popular' musics. Diversity is found in the sales in many genres in the remaining 20%, from which the multinationals are variously absent. So the market does not necessarily smile on those mostly small labels that venture into this territory. These '...labels are generally not committed to promote diversity', as our European consultants note. 'But since they are numerous, the final picture is, in fact, diverse.'

But we are discussing those actors that invest in diversity per se. Some record labels are committed to diversity and so get a mention here. The number one is 'Real World' – founded by Peter Gabriel, to create and to promote music of non-western musicians and collaborative projects with non-western musicians.' Others include Piranha, Network Medien and Connecting Cultures. There are many other labels that present the musical genres of niche interest and so add to diversity.

Retail. Retail record stores of sufficient size usually cater for a wide range of tastes. The stock on display is a catalogue of diversity. Most sales are, of course, of popular music discs, by definition.

Nevertheless, stores are under pressure as internet sales increase. It is said that inventories have been reduced, and it might be expected that this eats mostly at the diverse, low-sales edge of the catalogue.

A recent analysis of internet sales showed that titles that could not be placed on the shelves of a music store because of limited space, funds and the unlikelihood of a sale, could profitably be offered through an online catalogue. For this purpose, physical stock need not be held in a main-street location. It is mailed from a central repository or even from a dispersed repository, Amazon.com style, around the world. The catalogue is limited almost only by the existence, somewhere accessible enough, of the recordings. The important discovery was that the total sales from this niche interest 'tail' of the retail catalogue could in total equal the sale of the mainstream catalogue. Clearly, that could be an enormous benefit to public access to musical diversity.

Live music performances: festivals. Some festivals present programs specialising in a specific musical genre. Jazz festivals, for instance, are a very important phenomenon in the jazz world, bringing to one location jazz musicians from a country or region or the whole world. Some festivals specialise in the genre called 'world music', although this of course is not a genre but even in its narrow definition (which in the West would exclude for instance Western classical or pop music), encompasses thousands of ethnic musics and their evolutionary or hybrid derivatives. Of course, there are festivals which set no musical limits (or possibly, directions) at all and may by default present a program of musical diversity. Or not.

All of our consultants mention festivals as a force for musical diversity. The world music festival is an especially good vehicle for those who would promulgate musical diversity. The audience is offered the possibility of moving from performances of one culture to another to another. The diversity itself is held out as an exciting experience and to enjoy it one must decide to have an open mind and to seek out and enjoy the particular attributes of all of these genres. If you are convinced before

you arrive that the only music worth listening to is jazz, or Finnish yoicking, you probably are in the wrong place.

WOMAD is a world franchise in world music festivals, and has had great influence in developing the audience for this subsector.

'WOMAD stands for World of Music, Arts and Dance, expressing the central aim of the WOMAD festival - to bring together and to celebrate many forms of music, arts and dance drawn from countries and cultures all over the world.

'WOMAD was originally inspired by Peter Gabriel: "Pure enthusiasm for music from around the world led us to the idea of WOMAD in 1980 and thus to the first WOMAD festival in 1982. The festivals have always been wonderful and unique occasions and have succeeded in introducing an international audience to many talented artists.

'Equally important, the festivals have also allowed many different audiences to gain an insight into cultures other than their own through the enjoyment of music. Music is a universal language, it draws people together and proves, as well as anything, the stupidity of racism.

'As an organisation, WOMAD now works in many different ways, but our aims are always the same - at festivals, performance events, through recorded releases and through educational projects, we aim to excite, to inform, and to create awareness of the worth and potential of a multicultural society." ' ¹⁰⁵

In *Australia*, WOMAD is one of the most high profile festivals. But because of the influx of immigrants and the policy of multiculturalism, many of the folk music festivals that formerly presented the local development from the Anglo-Celtic folk heritage, have added the folk musics of the immigrant communities, and also are now essentially world music festivals with a high level of audience participation (i.e. music-making by those who attend otherwise as audience). ¹⁰⁶

In the *Congo*, 'The producers of spectacles in the sub-region gather on stage several forms of musics sometimes mixing groups from several countries. For ex: FESPAM; FIRES OF BRAZZA; the FESPACO; etc...' *Kenya* has many local festivals and two international festivals with considerable musical diversity.

In *Algeria*, 'Frequently, large productions are realized to provide a frame for national feasts or important cultural events. This was the case for the Panafrican Festival of 1969, the Summit of the African Union in 2001, the Pan-Arab Games in 2004, next to the celebrations of July 5 - Algerian Independence Day. Thousands of musicians of all horizons are gathered in heterogeneous adaptations marked by complete harmony.'

The *European* report gives a number of examples of 'intercultural' festivals in various European countries.

Live music performance: venues can offer sequentially what festivals offer concurrently. There are world music venues with a policy of presenting the diversity of the world's music. In *Australia*, as a result of the official multicultural policies, there are venues in the major cities that are committed to programming for a mainstream audience the musics of a variety of cultures. The best known are Kulcha

¹⁰⁵ <http://womad.org/>

¹⁰⁶ Examples: www.woodfordfolkfestival.com www.portfairfolkfestival.com/

(Perth), Nexus (Adelaide), The Boite (Melbourne), Eastside Café (run by Musica Viva, Sydney), BEMAC – Brisbane Ethnic Music and Arts Centre.¹⁰⁷

'There are some subsidised venues in *European* cities, funded to promote diversity. In the private sector there are almost no venues seeing musical diversity as their task, they have first of all to be commercial...' The European report gives examples in a number of countries. For example: 'Wereldculturencentrum Zuiderpershuis in Antwerp, Belgium: The Centre for World Cultures Zuiderpershuis is an Art Center which presents artists from all over the world. Our goal is to contribute to the artistic communication between different cultures and communities and to benefit the cultural exchange south-north-south.'¹⁰⁸

Media. If the above are not to be semi-secret activities, they need to be noticed in the media. There, they have to jostle for space with all the other entertainments on offer. Musical diversity is not of itself a hot topic and by and large gets only a warm press. In the Local Musics section below, the report from Indonesia indicates the importance of media recognition and validation to the survival of local musics.

As our European consultants note, support comes to the people active in this (or any other) area through *networking*. They cite as an outcome of world music networking, the creation of the trade fair for world music, WOMEX.

6.2 An aversion to musical diversity

Our consultants were asked to cite examples of entities that are averse to diversity.

As noted already, most governments of countries in this study support cultural diversity within their borders – some perhaps more in theory than practice. Some, by not having a clear policy in support of diversity or even in support of local musics, weaken it by default. More of that below.

In the musical world, some of our consultants interpret the specialisation of broadcasters, record labels, live music presenters as a negative for diversity, or even an aversion to it. We would be more inclined to see this as an expression of their own special interests in particular music genres, or the interests of their clientele, seen collectively as 'the market'.

Of course, since music and personal identification with particular musics (see below) are matters of passion, there are plenty of people who in enthusing about their own musical preferences, are derogatory about other musics. This reflects human nature but alas, does not support musical diversity.

6.3 Local musics

This study probably is motivated, above all, by a concern that many traditional musics are endangered species. For that reason, we will explore the situation in this area at some length.

Our European consultants note that the process of extinction is complete in a number of European countries; they no longer have traditional musics. In many developing countries, where traditional life has more recently begun to give way to new technologies, urbanisation and globalisation, traditional musics still survive but

¹⁰⁷ Information will appear at www.mca.org.au. Look in the multicultural music section of the *Music in Australia Knowledge Base*.

¹⁰⁸ <http://www.zuiderpershuis.be>

are predicted to disappear unless there is some timely form of rescue. We find a very good example in China, a situation to which the Chinese government has responded well. Our Chinese consultant:

'China, a country with a long history and a multitude of ethnic groups, enjoys a tremendously rich music history of eight thousand years, which has been proved by discovered evidences. The representative genres and classics of the traditional Chinese music are the "cultural soul" that dominate and influence the modern spiritual and material civilization of the Chinese nation.

'The rapid development of economic globalization has brought overwhelming and drastic changes in the lifestyle and production mode of the Chinese people. Social and cultural changes happen around us every moment in every day. Farmers have left the villages and mountain villagers have walked out of the mountains. They take off their traditional front opening jackets and put on western suits; they take off their head scarves and put on ties. They no longer sing at the singing contests of their villages but change their interests to pop music and Kara ok. All these changes pose strong challenges and big threats to the Chinese cultural tradition.

"Music Diversity" Policy A: Program of Rescuing the Chinese National Cultural Heritages

'Our notion is: economic globalization should coexist with multiculturalism. Music diversity must be respected and protected. To protect the traditional music culture is the responsibility of music workers.

'In line with this idea, the Chinese Ministry of Culture initiated in 1979 the grand program of rescuing the ethnic cultural heritage, which is called as "the Great Wall of Chinese Culture".

*'The program undertakes the collection, sorting, protection and development of the Chinese ethnic and folk literature and arts, and the result is the compilation of ten anthologies, books of literature and arts. Among them are *Anthology of the Chinese Folk Songs, Anthology of the Chinese Traditional Operas Music, Anthology of the Ethic and Folk Instrumental Music* and *Anthology of the Chinese Quyi Music*.*

'The program lasts for 26 years and thousands of music workers and culture workers of different provinces have dedicated themselves earnestly to it. They started from the most basic "field work" and have accomplished such jobs as collection, sorting, documentation and recording. To date, most manuscripts have been completed and are ready to be published successively. These four immense volumes of music are a great contribution to the rescue work of the Chinese ethnic cultural heritage and are a huge wealth added to the music treasury of the human race.

'After the survey, collection and classification work done by the scholars, experts and the local art workers, the Chinese cultural heritage is classified into 9 categories. The music category itself covers 71 items and over 40 national and folk genres.

Another important project with the purpose of rescuing the ethnic cultural heritage is to apply for the "Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity" of UNESCO. Since 2001, the "Kunqu Opera Art", the "Guqin Art", the "Art of Uyghur Muqam of Xinjiang" and the "Mongolian Traditional Folk Long Song" have been listed by UNESCO as "Masterpiece of the Human Oral and Intangible Heritage". This project gives great encouragement and enthusiasm to the Chinese music workers, in particular those who are engaged in ethnic minorities' music work, making them quicken their steps in searching and collecting music genres that are scattered

among the ethnic communities.’ [That is a very interesting and positive effect of the listings, to be kept in mind as a strategy in other places facing similar problems.]

‘In addition to the support of the Chinese government and international organizations, there are also numerous music workers in the Chinese music field who are involved in the collection, assorting and research work. They work very hard for the cause and their ideal regardless of the remuneration.’

The report gives as an impressive example a project in the Huan Xian County of Gansu Province. This involved the rescue of the local shadow play tradition not only by documenting it but also by training people to continue performing it. You can read about it in Appendix 8. The report goes on:

‘Recently there is an excellent example of individually initiated program of music diversity protection in China. That is the “*Tufeng* (Originality) Plan” proposed by Mr. Chen Zhe. This program, formally launched in October 2004, is aimed at “inheriting while keeping alive”. It takes the inheritance of the ethnic culture as its core task with the main focus on the construction of the system and environment. The significance of this program lies in the “keeping alive” and “inheriting”, which are distinct from the usually called “rescue”, which is static (only aimed at preserving them in the form of characters, audio and video).’

The consultant here puts her finger on one of the most important and difficult issues. To collect this music and put it in a museum is important, but only a partial solution for those who want it to find a new place in the life of the community. Mr. Chen Zhe is one who has sought a solution.

‘The place that Mr. Chen Zhe chose is the Pumi people’s village of the Lanping County in Nujiangzhou Municipality, Yuannan province. It is a small ethnic group with a population of 32,700, who have remained isolated from the mainstream culture for a long time. Thanks to the special geographical location - lying beside the Lancang River and surrounded by mountains - the economy of the area is not well developed but the ecological environment is fairly preserved. Against such a background, their traditional culture is almost completely preserved and the customs and humanities are considerably rich.

‘At present, Mr. Chen and his colleagues have formed an educational group named “Pumi People’s Traditional Culture Learning Group”, with the aim to inherit the whole traditional culture while focusing on music and dance. The group organizes the young people in the village to learn the traditional culture and performing skills with the senior artists. It is expected that the ethnic culture now facing extinction can be carried forward in this way.’

The consultant summarises: ‘However, the situation still remains critical with serious problems existing. The fundamental causes are the change and disappearance of the forms of production and the lifestyle that the Chinese people have depended on over thousands of years. Large-scale collective labour has disappeared, hence the extinction of the folk songs that were associated with those productive modes, e.g. work song (boat trackers’ work, transplanting rice seedlings, ramming), sacrifice ceremony music (sacrifice ceremony), etc. The deaths of the old people who were engaged in these labours have caused the disappearance of most of the music, too. Pessimistically speaking, I think it still remains questionable whether we can keep the traditions and cultures (including those listed by UNESCO) alive in China through the programs that have already been carried out or just put them into the museums.

‘How to protect cultural heritages? How to promote music diversity? Regarding this issue, there are quite a lot of questions to be answered both in theory and in

practice. The significance of real protection and inheriting lies in keeping them alive and in ensuring that the later generations are able to access these splendid heritages. Therefore, the successors of the traditions, who are in a small number and live mostly in poor life, must first be protected. Their life quality should be improved with much better life conditions so that they can teach orally the cultural heritage to the young people. In this respect, Japan and the South Korea have effective and successful experience and measures. We should learn from them and should make our own contribution to the protection of our brilliant music cultural heritage.'

The story in *Vietnam* is just as fascinating.

Since the commencement of the feudal dynasties (938-1884), the Vietnamese have had to contend with invasions and fight for their independence. Over the 15th to 18th centuries, the areas that minorities inherited were given their autonomy and blood relationships were established by marriage to the Vietnamese royalty. 'Thanks to that policy, the minorities were entirely free to preserve and develop their own ethnic cultures... That is why the diversity of culture generally and of traditional music of each Vietnamese ethnic group particularly, could develop and exist until our time.'

Then came the wars against the French and the Americans. 'Actually, we have had only 30 years of peaceful life to restore all the things destroyed in the war and begin to build all necessary things for development and global integration.

'Nowadays Vietnam is led by the Communist Party (CP). In the cultural sphere, the CP advocates to "*Build an advanced culture with a bold national identity*". Continuing the traditional equal and respectful relationship between ethnic groups during history, the CP and Government has given the people the freedom to inherit and express their traditional ethnic cultures. The CP and Government also encourage professional artists to learn and use the material from traditional cultures including all kinds of arts such as music, dance, theatre, fine arts, architecture and decorative arts to create new works.

'The national "*Law for safeguarding cultural heritage*" was adopted on 29, June, 2001 by the National Assembly. The objects which are protected by the law are *both the tangible and intangible cultural heritage of all Vietnam's ethnic groups.*'"

As in China, there has been a long-term major program to collect the traditional musics.

'Since 1950 in the North, the Section for collection, study and popularisation of traditional folk music of Vietnamese ethnic groups of both majority and minorities was established... After fifty years of work we have in our archives 25,872 music works collected which now we begin to translate to DVD and VCD in our recently established DATABANK, a part of which can be found on our website.¹⁰⁹

'Despite all the attention which the Vietnamese Government has paid the Vietnamese indigenous music, both traditional folk and European style new composed works, it is in danger of disappearance. What are the causes?

'i. The biggest part of traditional music is the folk music. This music was created and existed closely with the everyday life of the people, 95% of whom are farmers living in rural self-sufficient communities. Now the economy in the country is moving toward industrialising and modernising, the life of these people fundamentally

¹⁰⁹ Please visit the website <http://vn-style.com/vim/> or e-mail musicology@hn.vnn.vn

changes. Many social-cultural activities occupied a very important role in the former society; now they have lost the social bases for which they were created and existed. *They are no longer unseparated from the everyday life of the people.* The music which is a component of those activities is sharing a common destiny and it is also at the edge of destruction. For example: In the past, the rowers sang rowing songs to support their rowing rhythm when they rowed the boat. Now, all kinds of boats are motorized, the rowers do not need to sing the rowing songs and the songs have lost their former social function and basis. The song remains only as an artistic item - if it has artistic value - and it will be used occasionally as an item in musical festivals or in radio and TV programs. It might be forgotten after a time and we will find it in archives only as a memory of the past.

'The European-style composed music, especially the chansons, are considered by young people as "out of date". These songs are used only in the celebrations for commemoration of historical events.

'Symphonic music has its own separate audience which consists of mainly elderly people.

'Meanwhile, all kinds of rock, rap and so on "come to the throne". In the name of "meeting the demands of the young audience", this music occupies some of the biggest programs of radio and TV and other spaces in city life and a part of the life of the countryside. Lately, hip-hop was imported and right away it is considered by the young generation as a most modern and fashionable rhythmic music.

'ii. Moreover, during 30 years of war, we have had neither the time nor conditions to practise and transmit our traditional culture including the musical culture. Actually, there has been an interruption in transmission and continuity of the cultural-musical tradition among the Vietnamese generation which was born and grew up in this time period.

'Apart from that, during the same period, we have had a misunderstanding about the role and values of the traditional culture and music - that the culture and music of the past cannot respond to and supply the demands and rhythm of modern society. In order to become a part of recent society *they have passed a process of so-called improvement, modernisation and theatricalisation* which in fact is *a process of Europeanisation using traditional culture and music.* For example, for modernisation of national traditional orchestras, we organized a "national symphonic orchestra" consisting of all kinds of musical traditional instruments grouped following the model of the symphony orchestra. As a result, we have a disorderly orchestra because we cannot justify the pitches of strings of instruments. By nature, the strings are always used to create not fundamental pitches, but "ornamented" pitches created by various kinds of finger pressure or beating on the different string points.'

The Vietnamese have invented some interesting ways of taking their traditions beyond the museum and back into regular life. We will look at those in the final section of the study.

There have been collecting activities in many other countries over the last century, although not necessarily as a part of a public policy. In *Australia*, the Institute for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies has been a key player. But there is a very new project. In some communities the last of the traditional song men are in their final years and the National Recording Project for Indigenous Music is setting out to record them. This project is conducted under indigenous control with representatives from a broad range of communities. Recording and repatriation of songs to local knowledge centres will be supported by universities and other

institutions. This will assist indigenous communities to integrate their cultural knowledge into community governance and a broad range of community activities such as education, bilingual, and health programs. Learned senior men and women will control access to sacred knowledge in song texts.¹¹⁰

There is a rather different picture of government in relation to local musics in *Indonesia*. Our consultant says that there is a general policy of government in support of the musics of all Indonesian communities – but that its actions have actually brought about a ‘weakening the taste of listeners for the indigenous music [for example in its treatment of the Lokananta record company, section 2.3.3.2b]. [This], along with the policy of radio and television companies, cause traditional music to have even less chance to perform.’

The consultant gives a close insight into the process through which the breakdown of support for traditional musics and musical diversity can occur, even enlisting musicians against their better instincts.

‘The television programs broadcast only popular music that intends to reach as many audiences as possible. To reach this goal, television programs should carry the “popular taste” and ignore “the diversity of taste and values” originated in the proper communities. With this movement, many people who still have their own ethnic values and those who have a conception of the diversity of values in music do not have the chance to express their ideas in the mass media.

‘In local environments, because of the strong penetration of mass media into the people’s values and tastes, they also tend to follow the popular trend to appreciate the values originated in “popular taste.” Local musicians now doubt if their music is still relevant to their communities (because the mass media do not broadcast their music, newspapers do not write about the music, and less people are interested in the values expressed in the music) and some of musicians even start to think of participating in the “mainstream”, hoping to get the financial benefit from the “chaos situation.” Some singers also follow the movement, singing the style that they themselves do not necessarily like only because of feeling uneasy or doubtful of the values of the indigenous music. In spite of the “Broadcast Regulations” (Undang-Undang Penyiaran No. 24/1997, September 1997 that regulates all of the radio and television programs), profit now dominates their orientation, sacrificing the proper values that they may still believe to be relevant in the communities. Radio and television stations owned by the government do not “break the regulations” as much as the private ones due to the budget they receive from the government.’

The point about the lack of exposure for local music and musicians in the media is telling. The musicians presumably feel a lack of validation, feel that they somehow are being placed outside a society in which they should have an honoured position – and sense the possibility to regain a position if they please the media.

The author recalls an experience that seems relevant. In the 1970s he had a conversation in the USA with a man who organised an annual summer school to which were invited master teachers from a number of non-Western countries – India, Indonesia, Ghana and so on. We had just heard a wonderful performance by a sitarist. For reasons now forgotten, the author asked whether the importation of such performances into the USA might not be damaging to the traditions. The answer was ‘No – to the contrary. This music has been losing ground in India. But when the

¹¹⁰ <http://www.garma.telstra.com/statement-music02.htm>

Indians at home realised that their music was valued in the West, they began to give it more value themselves.' In a very recent conversation with an Indian sitarist, the author was informed that Indian classical music is in good health. Perhaps the global interest in the music has played a part in this. We are all susceptible to praise from outsiders.

These few paragraphs perhaps suggest some strategies to be proposed in section 7.

An informant from *East Africa* notes the role of the colonists in undermining local cultures and imposing alien concepts on various aspects of cultural and political life. He writes of three countries, Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania, referring especially, of course, to the situation of local musics. He makes the point that many African countries are constructs of convenience to the former colonisers, bringing together into a national structure peoples of many different languages and cultures. Given this history, the idea of *national* traditions is a difficult one. The colonial authorities and missionaries suppressed local cultures and imposed a Western education system that influenced the thinking of the Africans. In music, this has resulted for instance in composers working in hybrid genres, not necessarily to universal approval.

In Uganda there are surviving rural music traditions but they are of interest only in their own communities. The colonial governments caused the creation of a 'national' folklore which had media support after independence and is still widely practised. In Tanzania also, the first head of government of the newly independent country, Mwalimu Julius Kambarage Nyerere encouraged pride in national identity rather than in the identity of one's own community. It does now in fact have a more united identity than does Kenya or Uganda. Nevertheless, the traditional community songs are still sung.

The consultant from *Cameroon* traces the situation of music in recent decades. 'In Cameroon, music has been influenced in many ways throughout generations. Before 1960, musicians expressed themselves in their songs in mother tongues and put forward their respective heritage in the composition of their works. In the years 1960 to 1970, Rumba (music of Latin American origin, performed by very popular Congolese musicians) influences the whole of the Central-African sub-region. 60% of the musics broadcast by national radio stations were influenced by Rumba.

'As from the 1970s, there was a true musical revolution in Cameroon. Several artists emigrated to Europe and went their different ways. Some became important thanks to the wealth of the Cameroonian heritage, and worked on musical fusion by integrating the musics from elsewhere, (e.g. music from the Antilles). The *Makossa* – music of the coastal populations – became popular in several countries of Africa.

'The decline in the quality and level of Cameroonian musical works, noted for some ten years, raised awareness among certain artists who understood the need for investing themselves in the musics they have inherited. Unfortunately, it is a difficult step insofar as the producers are not interested in research, preferring to invest rather in consumption-ready products. The Government does not have any grant scheme for musical research.

'Nevertheless, some presenters of radio broadcasts and producers of events encourage the dissemination of the musics of the heritage. It is a rather difficult battle. *The Music Council of Cameroon* contributes to these efforts by setting up a project "*Cameroon Music Promotion*" which results in the annual production of a sampler of Cameroon's best musical works. Particular attention is given to musics inspired by heritage, as well as to hybrid musics.'

Algeria: 'If there is a place in the Arabo-Muslim world where musical diversity would find its essence, it would be Algeria. Any tradition is expressed there by means of its own language, the kabyle, the chaoui, the mouzabit, the chaambi, the zénète, the targui, the saouri, the abbassi, the tijani, the r'guibat, jakana etc.

'Music producers and publishers support the practice, promotion and dissemination of local traditional music. Among these: Atlas, Belda, Dounia, Soli, Tourath and others.

'Algerian traditional musics suffer to a great extent from the distance and the enclavement which is theirs. The size of the Algerian territory is so large that it would take whole decades to discover the richness of the heritage with regard to Algerian popular musics and songs. Cities like Algiers, Oran or Constantine are major economic and strategic centers, but represent probably only one tenth of the musical potential that can be found in localities like Abadla, Kerzaz, Iherir, Temacine and many others. These remote regions that are far away from any modern civilization have been able to keep the authenticity of the musical traditions. Since they were only to a small extent confronted with modern technologies and instruments, with new sonorities and tendencies, the artists of these areas reveal to us a genuine human music without any artifice. In spite of the difficulties which these musicians and singers (guardians of our musical heritage) encounter – ignored by the public, total lack of consideration by the authorities, lack of means, geographical distance from interest centres, music schools, academies etc. – they continue to practise, repeat, and to perpetuate ancestral musics, transmitted from generation to generation. One notes, in general, a keen interest and strong implications of young people on the occasion of initiation ceremonies or festive occasions.

'If one was to assess the state of health of the Algerian traditional music, the picture would be as follows:

- a) Apart from ANART (National Agency for Traditional Arts), whose current prerogatives seem to be more those of a chamber of craftsmanship than of an agency with a cultural and artistic agenda, the sector of traditional music and chant lacks a national structure to become organised and supervised.
- b) Complete lack of interest on the part of the government and the Ministry of Culture
- c) Insignificant financial and moral support in view of the impoverishment from which those artists suffer
- d) lack of means for initiation and training
- e) lack of promotion policy
- f) absence of cultural events dedicated exclusively to traditional musics (in particular those from the most remote areas)
- g) absence of a substantial national fund for the development and the promotion of traditional musics and chants
- h) growing interest from local music operators (producers, publishers, event organisers), as for a long time they were considered as being non-commercial
- i) lack of regulation framework protecting the works and the artists in the field of traditional music (under the pretext of having fallen into the public domain, the rights of authors and performers are flouted).'

From *Morocco*: 'Morocco is one of the countries with the highest musical diversity. But it is also the country with the greatest experience as far as multicultural

cohabitation in a spirit of tolerance, solidarity and peace among the ethnic groups is concerned. However, it is not possible to prevent the direct or indirect influence of powerful musical genres from the West or the emancipated Arab countries (Egypt, Lebanon) which can more or less affect the development and natural blooming of its musical diversity composed of minority styles; some of these might become extinguished or disappear forever, unless government and citizens protect and promote them properly (at mass media level) by distributing them nationally (through recordings, thematic festivals typical of one style or the other, cultural weeks abroad, documentaries, publications and print). Up to now this musical diversity has survived against all the odds. However, how much longer will it be able to survive in the face of globalization? This is a true 'Sword of Damocles' which can strike at any moment.'

By now, the reader will realise that the stories of local musics, while they share in their various fates a dependence on broader social circumstances, differ in very interesting ways. In many European countries, the technological changes that now endanger indigenous traditions in rural economies elsewhere have long ago had their effect. And then there are the particular circumstances for musical forms manipulated by governments to achieve some political purpose, including of course the consolidation of their own power. And without wishing to minimise the even more destructive effect of colonialism, it is perhaps worth considering whether colonial powers were not willing to impose on their own people some variants of the treatment they imposed on their colonies.

'The Western European self-conception as "nations of culture" is strongly linked to the tradition of European classical music. Particularly in *Germany* and *Austria* this musical style is seen as national tradition. This tradition historically grew to an aesthetic tradition of the upper classes, especially the "Bildungsbürgertum" (traditionally educated middle-class intellectual). Due to the comprehensive introduction of its canon in the public education system in Europe, it is often understood as THE model for all music.

'*Russia, Belarus, Ukraine* – narodnaja muzyka – national music style, were formed on the basis of local musical traditions during the soviet era. These music standards were formed as a kind of "comfortable" folk music and were exploited to praise the magnificence of the Soviet way of life. An official "folklore sound" was imposed, a regime-friendly repertoire sanctioned, a training network for 'culture workers' created. The difference from the original musics of local traditions grew. National music styles were heavily promoted by the state media, whereas local musical traditions were generally ignored. As a result, these local traditions are nearly totally unknown in society today. Although there is a growing interest in national roots, the majority of people only seem to know the products of Soviet musical policy. In opposition to the variety of local musical traditions, the national music style is highly standardised and thus counterproductive to musical diversity.

'In *Ireland*, the *Scandinavian* countries, the *Balkan* and *Caucasian* states, traditional music is quite vital and therefore often seen as national music. For example in *Bulgaria*, local music traditions have been crucial for the national identity for many centuries. Besides the orthodox Christian church, Bulgarian folklore was the only way to retain the national identity during Turkish occupation. In the Soviet era the local musical traditions were also considered as an instrument for maintaining national identity. Music scholars went to the villages, recorded the local tradition, then cultivated it, making "better" arrangements by using Western European elements or writing new songs in the same style. Then these new songs and arrangements were performed by professional ensembles of national folk music, then played on the radio

and so brought back to the places where the original songs were recorded. People learned the new versions, so what remained was a mixture of the original tradition and its "cultivated" version. In contrast to Russia, there is no big difference between the living musical tradition and the adapted one. Both are known in the society and crucial for the national identity.

'Until recently the vast majority of music traditions were local musical traditions. Today this situation is changing as a result of the dissemination of music through the media. Certain music styles, formerly having been local traditions in some regions, are spread worldwide today, like jazz, pop or classical music. People are much more attached to listening to the media than to making music or attending concerts of local musicians. The extinction of musical contexts in which traditional musics are performed, and the dissemination of some global music styles by the media, endanger local musical traditions, which at the same time means the loss of parts of local identity.

'There are still many regions in Europe where local musical traditions are vital and quite intact, like in *Ireland* and the *Scandinavian, Balkan, Caucasian* and the *Alps* regions. In *Russia, Belarus* and *Ukraine* there are some traces of once rich local musical traditions, which are now highly endangered. As well, you find revival movements for traditional musics in many regions in Europe. In *Eastern Europe* they result from the strength in regaining national identities after the collapse of the Eastern block and the Soviet Union. In Western European countries like the UK, France or Scandinavian countries these movements have rather cultural roots, but are also associated with national/local identity. A great number of festivals for traditional musics took place in the last 15 years, with their number increasing. This tendency has led to a noticeable revival of local musical traditions.'

The *Latin American* consultants give instances of support in a number of countries. In *Argentina*, they say, 'Local practices are not supported or weakened, they are ignored [!] *Perú, Chile* and *Bolivia*: In ancient times the Aymara culture occupied common territories of what nowadays are Perú, Chile and Bolivia. In October 2005, at Tiawanaku's sacred hill, these countries celebrated a first re-encounter of Aymara culture, revaluing native dance and music.¹¹¹ *México*: The National Council for Culture and Arts (CONACULTA) has several effective programs to support traditional genres. One of these programs promotes the creation of music with traditional characteristics. Another one offer grants for composers of national genres. There are workshops to develop performance, traditional techniques and the construction of instruments.¹¹²

In *Singapore*, 'many of the ethnic communities take an active role in performing and preserving their own music. The Indian community, for example, has several cultural organisations, all dedicated to educating and performing of Indian music and dance, similarly, the various Malay cultural organisations and the Chinese cultural organisations. The Eurasian community and Peranakan community, are also active in promoting, performing and preserving their traditional music on a smaller scale.

¹¹¹ Fondo para el Desarrollo de los Pueblos Indígenas de América Latina y el Caribe. Notiteca Indígena Digital. <http://www.fondoindigena.net/noticiero/index.shtml?x=751>

¹¹² Consejo Nacional para la Cultura y las Artes. <http://www.conaculta.com.mx/convocatorias/>

'Independent arts companies, for example Gamelan Asmaradana (dedicated to promoting all forms of gamelan music and other SEAsian music) have been active in running educational activities and performances to achieve this aim.'

Many consultants, Singapore included, say that the commercial music world has no special interest in musical diversity. 'There is no real support from the music business, so practitioners for local music have to be self-initiating.' From *Cameroon*: 'The producers and labels are not interested in musical diversity. They simply develop a commercial logic, which leads them to invest in what's fashionable at the moment.'

6.4 Transplanted traditions: the Jews, Roma, and migrants

Our European report describes the special situation of Jewish music and Roma music.

'Roma and Jews play a special role among European nations, because they are intrinsically European, but do not form a state in Europe. Both nations, living in Europe for centuries, have contributed enormously to other European cultures. Both nations have been subjects to assimilation and to genocide.

'There is no single phenomenon like Jewish or Roma music. Since these peoples live among different cultures and underwent assimilation in these cultures to a certain degree, the music is always a mixture of its own tradition with the local music forms.

'There are some living music traditions within Roma communities, one example would be Romania. I don't know about any living musical tradition among Sephardic Jewish communities in Europe, though the traces of these traditions surely can be found. Klezmer music (Ashkenasim Jewish) has stopped its existence as a living tradition after the Holocaust. Later, it was revived in the USA and brought back to Europe, where it has become one of the popular world music styles performed on stage by professional ensembles.

'Nevertheless music traditions of Jew and Roma have played a significant role for many European music cultures in the past centuries, e.g. their influence can be traced in most East European musics.

'In today's music scene Jewish and Roma music are hip, probably the most successful world music styles, and in this quality they continue to influence many other music forms, producing mixtures and hybrid forms, or giving other styles just a shadow, an accent.'¹¹³

¹¹³ One example could be the Taraf de Haidouks: *Taraf de Haidouks, a "band of brigands," includes up to a dozen musicians ranging from 20 to 80 years in age, performing an enormous and diverse repertoire appropriate to their many audiences, from fellow villages in rural southern Romania to connoisseurs of nearly obsolete folk genres and fans of global music.*

*Across Europe, Gypsies constitute very diverse peoples following many ways of life. Even in Romania, Gypsies are far from a homogeneous group. Members of Taraf come from Muntenia, the southern region of Romania located in the Danube Plain. The village of Clejani became home to Gypsies in the 19th century after their emancipation from surrounding monasteries. During the 1960s, when they first came to the attention of Romanian ethnomusicologists, there were perhaps a hundred men earning their living as professional musicians, or lautari. The Taraf found their way to such prominence partly through the work of ethnomusicologists who were responsible for releasing their first album in France [Ocora C559036 1988] and arranging their first tours. Opportunities for appearances throughout Europe soon followed. Most American enthusiasts of the band probably know them from their appearance in the film *Latcho Drom* which tells a story of Gypsy migration across Europe in a*

It should not be forgotten that the affluent West is not the only destination for immigrants. 'Communities from various Asian countries form one of greatest block music cultures that are found in East African Region. The Arabs having come and settled along the East African coast intermarried with the locals thus resulting into the Waswahili community. As the religion that was introduced by Arabs in the region, Islam has also some strong following amidst the inhabitants of the region. Apart from the notable influence on the instrumental resources in the region, a popular music genre the taarab is widespread all over the region where Muslims live.'

The Indians, that is Asians from the Indian sub-Continent, are also a part of the migrant communities in the region.

According to our informant, 'The Indian inhabitants of the region have culturally lived in great seclusion that makes acculturation a bit difficult...'

Nevertheless, it is not surprising that immigrants in a new country may, on the one hand, try to maintain their old traditions in a state of authenticity – in even greater purity than in the old country where there is the freedom to move on and evolve – or to combine them with the musics they find in the new country to construct hybrid musical forms.

6.5 Hybridity

Rapid changes in the environment stimulate adaptive behaviour. In the biological realm, adaptation is a lottery of mutations, accumulating slowly and possibly unsuccessfully. In the world of human society, the adaptations are behavioural and may be purposeful. They might be aversive, or motivated by curiosity about new possibilities.

In the musical world, probably the move by symphony orchestras to program pop music and film scores is not motivated by positive curiosity but rather, an aversion to financial collapse. They find a new audience, but not for the repertoire for which the orchestra was created. A successful adaptation financially could be the reverse side of a deterioration of musical quality or integrity – although we must leave open the possibility of an artistically motivated exploration of the possibilities for interaction between the 'classical' and pop genres.

sequence of wonderfully shot musical scenes. During the 1990s they established relationships with other musicians and promoters who have continued to facilitate their international career.

Meanwhile, while the number of musicians in Clejani has greatly decreased, every musical child is practicing harder than ever in the hopes of a similar career. Lautar such as the members of Taraf de Haiduks, are called upon to play a wide variety of music for their patrons. The most popular music in Romania today, for example, is known as manele. Its sounds fill the air of the common outdoor markets blaring from the stands of vendors selling inexpensive music cassettes. It is the music of everyday urban and town neighbourhoods across the country. Manele has been excoriated by Romanian cultural critics for polluting the wellsprings of Romanian music. The lautars of Clejani, like many professional musicians who serve more rural regions, must incorporate elements of this music for their local audiences. On stage at Royce, the Taraf are likely to perform pieces that share in the quintessentially contemporary, hybrid, popular, made-for-media character of the manele music. The Taraf will also play some of the oldest traditional Romanian song genres in the most conservative traditional style."

(Source: *Folkworks*, by Colin Quigley,
<http://www.folkworks.org/FWIssues/FWv05n03/FWv05n03.pdf>)

Generally speaking, the changes in the environment seem to have stimulated curiosity and experimentation. We see this in the world of popular music, with an ever-fragmenting fringe combining genres and spawning new multisyllabic or multi-word titles. We see it in world music, with endless combinations of ethnic styles with each other or with various forms of popular or art music.

As with any experimentation, success is not guaranteed. And by what criteria is it measured, in any case? There is especially a problem in the blending of ethnic musics.

An elderly and distinguished sitar player of our acquaintance is not in the least amused by ideas of 'music fusion'. He practices a musical discipline that has evolved over centuries. It has complex structures and procedures and expresses meaning - musical, intellectual, emotional - in the most subtle and intricate ways.

Such an incredible music. Let's combine it with a jazz saxophonist, a couple of Balinese gamelan instruments, and an African drummer! We love each of them separately so together they should be awesome!

OK, if we are going to do this, we have to find common ground. For instance, what scale will we use? Well, whereas the sitar is an unfretted string instrument with an infinite choice of pitches, the gamelan instruments are tuned percussion with fixed pitches and perhaps only a five note scale; the saxophone, while it has a twelve note scale, is unlikely to be in tune with the gamelan excepting if the player can adapt with extraordinary skill; and on the other hand certainly has much more limited pitch possibilities than the sitar. The choice of scale is severely circumscribed by physical realities. So already, in finding common ground, two of the players have had to abandon some of the basic sound materials of their musical traditions. (We bypass here the problem that the sitarist will think in terms of a 'raga', like a scale in that it is a pitch set, but with complex rules for its use.)

The group performs. The sitarist tries to play with his usual expressivity and we can hear the exquisite inflexions of the pitches in the slow sections and the headlong exuberance in the fast sections but the usual musical context has disappeared, the centuries old layering of meanings and allusion. In the usual sitar performance, these few notes played in this particular way could be understood by experienced listeners to carry a particular message, heightened (or not) by the memory of the ways many others before had played something similar. The other players also struggle with the loss of context. When our bebop saxophonist plays in a jazz band, we may hear in the back of our minds Charlie Parker decades ago, and find meaning in the comparison. That is lost, here - and if it is not lost, it may be in the way. For the musicians, finding common ground is to some extent abandoning meaning and working with the lowest common denominator.

It's not that there are never wonderful outcomes from these experiments nor is it at all suggested that it would be useful or desirable to stop this activity, even if that were remotely possible. Perhaps the lesson is that it is also very important that efforts are made to ensure that some people continue the original traditions, the source materials that give a grounding to the experimentation.

Looking at the regions explored in our consultants' reports, there is not a single country in which hybridisation is not occurring.

Since hybridisation is everywhere, a book could be written. More briefly, here are some comments from our consultants on the hybridisation activities, working through our regions of the Arab world, Asia, Australasia, Europe, Latin America and Sub-Saharan Africa.

Algeria: Several experiments to mix musics from different origins were carried out. In this respect, some encounters were held in Algeria:

- Gaada diwan from Béchar with the Belgian percussionist Michel Seba and Moustapha Fayé from Senegal,
- Athmane Bali and the Jazz ensemble Vincenti,
- Idir and Alan Steevel,
- Aliwen and the Triskèle.

Morocco The cohabitation of Arabs, Berbers, Jews, Andalusians and Africans made it possible to develop hybrid musical forms which have enriched the contemporary Moroccan heritage. Whereas a great number of artists combine ethnic music and Western pop, as shown e.g. by the experience of the African gnawa Blues, the ra'i, the chaâbi, etc., these musical styles are rooted in their original identity.

China: [The examples are really a hybridisation in the presentation of the music rather than the music itself.] Recently, many young people are chasing the world trend and are fanatical for pop music but few have interests in classical or national music. This phenomenon worries some composers and performers. Inspired by the combination of instrumental music and vocal music in the international sphere, they have made some experiments on national instrumental music. Typical examples include:

1. "The Twelve Girls Band". Twelve young girls in fashionable dresses play national instruments and dance against stage lighting and settings. It is an imitation of the four-girl band Bond, also called "classic spice girls", which is now popular throughout the whole world.
2. "National Music in Costumes". It is an innovation both in the content and design of performances by the Central National Music Orchestra. There are tremendous changes in both costumes and instruments. The costumes are no longer the conventional unified dresses and meanwhile some instruments have even been changed from wooden ones into fashionable transparent ones.

The above-mentioned changes of the traditional national music instrument playing have won high acclaim from the foreign audience and the young people in China. The Twelve Girl Band was fervently acclaimed in Japan, where the sales volume of its first recording reached 2 million while the total sales volume reached 3.7 million. However, these subversive changes to the national music have prompted doubts and critiques from the music circle and scholars of national music. They pointed out that these forms of performances are merely changes in the packaging, whereas the essence and verve of the Chinese national music has been deserted.

Indonesia: The diversity of music also makes people think about combining elements of a specific music with another. This is "natural" because musical ideas and values are always interacting with one another in the minds of musicians and composers (at the same time audiences also develop a taste that is based on the perception of the diversity of music)... In the Masters Program at Sekolah Tinggi Seni Indonesia (STSI), Surakarta, it is common that students take materials from the indigenous music and combine them with other elements of neighboring musics to compose a new piece for their recitals. This method is now flourishing among other people in communities especially to fulfill new expectations and values in music. Some people in communities, however, think superficially about the process of composition such as combining elements of music without considering that the elements should blend into a totality of musical expression... This is just like putting "salad and candy

together" and blending them to get a new food taste... This situation occurs because the musicians...want to participate in global changes. They think that global culture is the one that combines what they think to be modern (that is, the western elements) and the local ones, without necessarily think about the composition more seriously...

Singapore: There are several music groups in Singapore that develop hybrid forms of music. One the most active is Gamelan Asmaradana, a group that specialises in the performance of traditional gamelan music but now also does performances of gamelan with a western-style jazz combo. The group also has developed repertoire which features a combination of various Asian instruments with the gamelan, which we call Sounds of New Asia.

Vietnam: Yes, we can find out some different kinds as follow:

- A number of new songs, both popular or romantic, were composed by our composers on the themes of ethnic music...
- But there is not any combination of music from different ethnic groups.
- We have some cases that the contemporary composers used the materials of ethnic music to create new Rock style songs which are considered as "Ethnic Rock", such as the Rhade Rock, the Southern Rock etc.

Australia: Aboriginal traditional music is regarded as the property of the Aborigines. It probably is not very accessible to others, whether culturally, musically, or geographically. Overall, it seems unlikely to have a place commercially in the music world. If there is support to its practice, it would come from Aboriginal funding bodies such as the Aboriginal Arts Board.

This music is nevertheless used as an element or a colouration in the Aboriginal performances in more contemporary forms such as rock or country. The music scores of the Bangarra Dance Company, an Aboriginal dance company, typically set a traditional Aboriginal song into an electronic music work, to striking effect.

As to non-Aboriginal fusion music, there is a lot of it around. The report in Appendix 12 gives a number of examples.

New Zealand: The urban Pacific music scene that is successfully exploited by companies such as "Dawn Raid" is very much the result of hybrid influences, particularly Pacific beats and timbres with US-influenced hip hop and rhythm and blues.¹¹⁴

Europe: [The European report describes ethnically flavoured music created by immigrants for which they seek commercial success in the pop world.] 'Asian Underground' is a term associated with various British musicians of South-Asian (mostly Indian or Pakistani) origin who blend elements of Western underground dance music and the traditional music of their home countries. The first well-known example was the compilation album *Anokha - Soundz of the Asian Underground* released in 1997 and masterminded by Talvin Singh. It is not a strict musical genre per se, since the specific sounds can vary wildly (from Cornershops' Britpop to Panjabi MCs' jungle). Most of these artists are the children or grandchildren of immigrants and have grown up in Western culture, but still have a strong Asiatic background through their families.

¹¹⁴ See www.womad.co.nz/ , and www.dawnraid.co.nz/

Turkish hip hop emerged from the break-dance, graffiti und DJ movement within the Turkish community in Germany in the middle of 1980s. Bands like Fresh Familee, Microphone Mafia, Islamic Force and Cribb 199 were the first to spread their message in Turkish. The band Cartel achieved the breakthrough of Turkish rap in Turkey and in whole Europe.

'Many Turkish texts talk about living between two cultures, about the lack of acceptance in both societies and problems within their own tradition. After the assaults against immigrants in Mölln and Solingen the texts became more aggressive, topics such as revenge and retaliation came to the fore: 'We are Turks, and if you don't want us, then we don't want you, too.' Because of their texts, [the band] Cartel was abused for right wing as well as for left wing propaganda. Cartel filled stadiums and was celebrated by the media. They were the 'heroes' of the rapper scene in Turkey, the first, who won the 'fight' against pop.

'Today there are artists like Nefret, OndaOn, Ceza, Maho B, Hedef 12 and others, who point in their texts to social injustice and grievances. They tour through Europe and work with bands from Germany, France, Switzerland, etc. together. A network has been developed, within which concerts and jam sessions are organised and albums are produced.'

Latin America: Generally, hybrid and fusion music allows the use of native musical instruments in a modern context; this is an opportunity to rescue those traditional modes and instruments.

Mexico: The National Fusion Festival presents music groups' experiments which mix different traditional instruments and rhythms. It welcomes the idea of connecting cultures and through them generating new sounds.

The group Tribu defines their idea as follows: "We perform Mexican music of the new millennium, ancient alive instruments, and rescued tradition". They sometimes use Japanese instruments like the koto.

Concerning the group Aranda, it places importance on its use of 30 different percussion instruments coming from very diverse regions. Sometimes they use the Tibetan cymbal. There is also an Afro-Mestizo genre.¹¹⁵

There is support for rock in Nahuatl* and Seri* languages (*territorial native languages); blues played by local bands from Oaxaca; a jazz-influenced territorial music genre named jazztzozil; techno-zapoteco (zapoteco is a territorial ethnic group); rapcumbianchero (mix of rap-cumbia and *ranchera* music).

Paraguay: Diego Sánchez Haase y Luis Szarán mix classical music with local music. Yamil Ríos perform rap in Guaraní language.

Congo. Fusions are perceptible between the Western pop music and the traditional musics. Examples:

- the festival of Francofolies
- the festival of the Pygmees knowledge.

¹¹⁵ . El Primer Festival Nacional de Fusión, Propuestas Sonoras de México enriquecidas por la aldea global. Georgina Hidalgo. Sala de Prensa CONACULTA.
<http://www.cnca.gob.mx/cnca/nuevo/2001/diarias/nov/071101/fusion.htm>

South Africa: Most prominent is the development currently of African indigenous in combination with Gospel – a clear blend of different beliefs even, where drums with specific meanings in ancestral worship are incorporated into Christian practices. Gospel is the biggest seller in SA, so this is an important development that socially probably also reflects a development in the perception and practice of Christianity.

6.6 Music and identity

There is simply no question that people and groups and nations identify with particular musics, that their identities are in a sense partly musical. This is the water in which we swim. The identification is so much there that some consultants' reports do not answer the question put to them for this report, perhaps because they overlook the obvious.

Wherever you were a teenager, there was music of some sort playing and you are bound to feel an affinity with that music, I dare say even though you are not very interested in music. Is that part of your identity? Well, you can probably easily enough find music with which you have no experience or affinity. Is that part of your identity? Yes, in the sense that it is a part of what you are NOT.

In the West, where teenagers are identified as a particular group and market, and are supposed to be in revolt against their parents, they collectively adopt some particular styles of music: preferably, it is said, with characteristics that the older generation will find repugnant. Gangsta rap might be a good more or less current example. (Well, it was current in some places *last* year!) Music as who we are and who we are not.

The scientific confirmation? Look at the record sales, the radio program formats, the market analyses showing who is listening to what.

There is personal identity and identification with a group. Do we identify with this piece of music simply because it reaches us in some unconsidered personal way or because it is one of many pieces that are favoured by our group of friends or our religion or the place where we live or grew up? One of our consultants cites the participation in music competitions as a situation in which people confirm their identity or perhaps, their self-esteem. We could make this into a very complex question indeed.

But in the context of this inquiry into musical diversity, the issue becomes very pertinent in considering the survival of traditional musics. The implication of the existence of a traditional music is that it is important to the people of whose culture it forms a part. After all it was from their life circumstances, their part of the earth, that it grew. It was they who created it. Aurally, it is very likely to be in some sense, distinctively theirs and distinctively not someone else's.

But if that is the case, why in so many places is its very existence endangered? If it is so much a part of these people, how can they bear to part with it?

Here are some possible thoughts of some people in those circumstances.

'Oh yes, we used to sing that song when we pounded the rice. No-one has to do that any more. It's all done by machine.'

'They had that music back in the village. We were nearly starving to death. We moved to the city. I don't want to go back.'

'That's village music. It's so old-fashioned. If I sang those songs, my friends would laugh at me.'

These statements are all invented, but they are consistent with what we are told in the reports by some of our consultants. The traditional music has changed from being a part (even unconsciously) of positive identity, to a matter of indifference or even something which we are NOT. From the Congo: 'Young people born in the city consider traditional music as a disgrace...' Probably, this fervent aversion is balanced by an equally passionate identification with a city music.

The European consultants make a very acute observation: that our apparent identification with a particular musical genre may be at base an identification with the social context to which it is attached as much as to the music itself. If I am that person who fled from the no longer functional economy of a village where I was starving to another situation of greater promise, it probably would matter little whether the music was made on a zither or a flute or a set of gongs, whether it was pentatonic or quarter-tonal, or whether it was meltingly beautiful or harshly aggressive: I may no longer want it as part of my identity.

Similarly, there are all those people in the West who want nothing to do with the music of the symphony orchestra, not because they have listened and decided that they don't like the music itself, but because they associate it rightly or wrongly with a social group to which they have an aversion. An elite, by wealth or education or status (or supposition), of which they have decided they are not a member.

The Algerian report summarises some of these thoughts: 'Personal or community identity comes through the communion of one people sharing the same memory and expressing themselves in a common language. It is difficult to recognize an identity only through the civil status that makes an individual be the citizen of a nation or a people. It is another dimension – much more anchored in each one of us – that makes our personality, our preferences, our aspirations and represents a much deeper and more convivial aspect of our identity than the one we carry on our official documents. Music "wherever you are in Algeria" expresses this identity. All the musics affect us as much as ours, transmit stories, bring their people closer to us and connect us with them.'

The European report puts the case more formally: 'Music creates, presents and strengthens individual as well as collective identity. (The connection of music to particular spaces and cultures goes beyond symbolic representation by sounds, e.g. national anthems, songs, instruments or key systems, and includes situations of making or experiencing music, that are culturally specific.)'

It makes the additional important observation: 'Music as a medium of creation and representation of identity underlies constant and radical changes by globalisation, migration and progressing medialisation. Identities are constantly challenged, negotiated, mixed or defined in a new way.' We are not sure that 'underlies' (in the sense of causation) quite captures the situation, but clearly, when for instance one's affiliation to a traditional music – or to the traditional site where one learnt it – changes, identity has changed also.

Indonesia: 'Personal and community identity arise when there is a music festival where a group of musicians come together in a specific event to show their skills and musical creations. In this event musicians have freedom to express musical ideas, thus diversity of music is maintained. Because the musical composition of one group is challenged by other groups to win the festival, the composition should be unique and strong. This uniqueness represents the personal or community identity in the process of creation and composition of music... [An occasion to know musically who we are and who we are not.]

'Another example is when music is used for strengthening the group of people or to raise the identity of local governments. Until the last five years local regency governments were supposed to compete with one another especially to get an "award" from national government in keeping the area clean, in holding neat administration, and in keeping local identity. To achieve this goal each local government creates a new musical composition based on the local motto that they want to promote. There are musics that express prosperity, solidarity, friendship, etc. Some examples of the music are: "Solo Berseri" (The Beauty of Solo City), "Karanganyar Tenteram" (The Peacefulness of Karanganyar; it also an acronym for "Quiet, Shaded, Neat, and Safe"). Music is thus explicitly used to express identity of the group of people and government to achieve their goal.'

Singapore: 'This is certainly done within the various ethnic communities, in particular, during festive and celebratory occasions. Among the Malay and Indian communities, events such as weddings and temple ceremonies for the Hindus would include the performance of traditional music.'

Vietnam: 'For people, both as individuals or communities, ethnic music always is recognised as their "logo". But they are proud in their knowledge of the musical diversity of Vietnam's ethnic groups, especially in the Karaoke or festivals in which they are participants.'

Australia: 'Music is so strongly bound up with identity. There is little doubt that indigenous musicians express their identity through their music. The music of immigrant groups becomes all the more powerful as a statement of identity when they are far from their origins. Most teenagers use music as an identity and bond with their cohort.'

The definition of a national identity is an issue that seems to have troubled non-indigenous Australians throughout their 200 year history in the country – and indigenous Australians too, for the opposite reasons. One group came here and did not know any more who they were. The other group was here, and had its identity plundered.'

New Zealand: 'The New Zealand hip hop scene has been largely - but not exclusively - about Pacific and Māori youth identity and with some strong political overtones¹¹⁶. Over the past 3 years, however, this genre has become 'mainstream' with many of New Zealand's top-selling and award winning artists working in the hip hop genre.'

'The Pasifika Festival is held in Auckland each year in March, and is the South Pacific's largest Pacific community event. It includes a wide range of Pacific artistic and cultural expressions, including musical performances. It is an opportunity for New Zealand's large Pacific population to nurture and promote the cultures of individual Pacific nations, and to share this with people from other Pacific nations, and with other ethnicities in New Zealand.'¹¹⁷

Chile: 'The so called Andean music has an Aymara origin. During Pinochet's dictatorship, several groups created a kind of "protest songs" named "new song". Gradually, this genre meant a musical identity characterized by an intellectualization

¹¹⁶ eg Dean Hapeta. See www.tekupu.com/UPPERHUTTPOSSE.html

¹¹⁷ See www.aucklandcity.govt.nz/whatson/events/pasifika/default.asp and www.aucklandcity.govt.nz/whatson/events/pasifika/programme.asp

and stylization of popular genres of native origins. Because of its success this music is getting some international projection.’¹¹⁸

6.7 Research

Although the consultants were not asked to consider the role of research in issues around the promotion of musical diversity, the European report argues for its importance:

‘Research on the multiplicity of musics is not necessary - neither for musical practice, nor for obtaining musical diversity. The proof for this thesis is simple: there are musics that are not researched. Still research is a condition for many other "uses" of music besides practice, and these uses tend to be important in the highly diversified world of present day Europe.

‘The examination of musical diversity in education is a good case in point. In spite of the fact that many curricula explicitly demand the teaching of musical diversity, this requirement is often not fulfilled satisfactorily. Among the reasons for this, is a lack of adequate material for teachers or an adequate training for teachers respectively. The problem is related to the fact that musical diversity still is a new topic and in many cases academic research on this topic has not yet reached the class rooms.

‘Research on musical diversity is not only a condition for the educational sector. It can also act as a catalyst for other sectors such as the field of journalism. It is usually easier for a journalists to produce an contribution about a certain music or musical phenomenon if it is dealt with in academic literature. Hence, the relation of research on musical diversity is an indirect one: research is not necessary for musical diversity, but it helps to come to terms with it.

‘A classical function of research in the context of musical diversity is the preservation of music, and a classical device of storing music is the music archive. Music archives have been established in various forms all over Europe, especially since the 19th century. Today, there are archives specialising on certain media such as scores or sound recordings. Maybe even museums of musical instruments can be regarded as music archives in this context as well. There are scientific and other archives, but in the present context, it may be allowed to concentrate on scientific archives.

‘For musical diversity, archives of traditional music are of special interest, since – at least in Europe – they are often linked with national identities. Examples can be found in almost every European country, such as the Volksliedarchiv, Freiburg i. Br. in Germany, to give just one example. Among others, these archives tend to preserve musics from the past. Since musical realities often changed over time, the archives preserve musical situations that do not exist anymore. Therefore, they act as a memory. Concerning musical diversity, this function is vital, especially regarding the fact that national identities are of special importance to the inhabitants of present day Europe.’ Which takes us full circle back to the archival activities in China and Vietnam.

¹¹⁸ Música Andina: quiénes son los Kjarkas? –

<http://www.aymara.org/lista/musica.php>

7. Musical diversity: challenges and responses

In this section we combine Terms of Reference 7 and 8: the challenges to musical diversity, and possible responses to the challenges. To list the challenges and responses separately requires endless movement back and forth between sections. The arguments are more easily comprehended if the two are kept together.

Term of Reference 7: The obstacles or challenges to be overcome in order to ensure better protection and promotion of musical diversity

- *On an analysis of the situation as you discover it in responding to previous questions, how would you define these obstacles and challenges, and by what methods do you envision them being overcome?*

Consider both the international and national spheres.

International issues include the challenges posed by trade liberalisation agreements. For instance, does a particular agreement limit a country's:

- *right to subsidise music production, but not to offer national treatment to foreign applicants -- e.g. provide subsidy only to locally based music producers*
- *right to fund state music institutions even though this gives them a competitive advantage over foreign providers*
- *right to fund national broadcasters even though this gives them a competitive advantage over foreign providers -- e.g. when broadcaster does not give national treatment to foreign music producers*
- *right to limit or direct foreign investment -- e.g. so that the music broadcast industry remains under local control and demonstrates a greater commitment to local music than might a foreign owned industry*
- *the right to regulate in favour of the local cultural sector.*

There are special issues concerning the protection and promotion of traditional musics as the societal contexts from which they arose dissipate or evolve. Challenges include the attitudes of younger generations, the opportunities for musical evolution or innovation, the adequacy and structure of music education, the presence or absence of an economic basis for survival.

These suggestions are intended only as guidance and do not exhaust the possibilities.

Term of Reference 8: Bring to light those good practices and actions that need to be strengthened and widely practised in this field.

This will follow from the previous analysis. Please write this section according to your perceptions of the situation. The following ideas are intended only as suggestions.

The study could list the states that actively support musical diversity within their own borders. It might develop a typology of approaches, considering inter alia support to musical diversity within the school music education curriculum, in music subsidies, in

music broadcasting, in special support to indigenous music, in measures to encourage cultural production by non-profit and for-profit organisations, in support to public cultural institutions and broadcasters?

You might seek examples of initiatives such as these:

- *programs to support local at-risk indigenous musics*
- *state support for local participation in internationally viable genres – e.g. western popular music, western classical music*
- *state encouragement for free exchange of music across their borders*
- *state encouragement for importation of music from developing countries*

Which states would more actively promote musical diversity were funds available?

Which states intend to or are likely to contribute to the International Fund for Cultural Diversity?

NOTE: Although this term of reference asks for examples of successful practice, our consultants have in the main brought together their ideas for practices as yet untried. These proposals are included along with already existing practices, *but the latter are shown in italics.*

7.1 Private sector and civil society

7.1.1 The challenge of the loss, potential or completed, of traditional musics

Traditional musics are being lost because:

- The traditional lifestyles and economies from which they were created and in which they are/were practised are declining or disappearing
- People are leaving those communities, often for the cities, and there is no basis in work or custom in their new places of residence for practise of the traditional musics of the communities they have left
- Some people, including many of the young, do not wish to identify either with the traditional communities or the traditional life styles, and/or the music that is associate with them
- The contemporary music world offers many more choices of musical genres to which to listen and identify, making it easier not to choose the traditional musics
- Some of these competing genres are promoted with enormous marketing power by the international pop music industry; they also may be associated with an affluent life-style to which listeners aspire.

7.1.1.1 *The challenge to collect, catalogue and make easily accessible the traditional musics that are endangered.*

It may be that in the present circumstances it is not possible, or there is no motivation, to restore the practice of traditional styles in daily life.

Also, we know that in some locations the last bearers of the living tradition are in old age and there is the risk that with them will die the knowledge of the traditions and their practice.

In order that a) there is a historic record and b) there is a resource to which those who in the future may wish to restore the traditions may turn, it is important that the traditions are documented as fully as possible.

This has been the work of ethnomusicologists over many decades, and so there are ethnomusicological archives. However, in any particular territory that work is not necessarily systematic nor complete, so there also are in our times major concerted efforts by some governments to collect, or to fund the collection of, the traditional musics.

Our Moroccan consultant confirms such a need in his country:

'To commit to memory the traditional music and dance heritage in audio-visual recordings and a classification of musical genres and styles together with a detailed historic study for possible publication or distribution (mass media, books, documentation, etc.)

'To encourage interested NGOs to preserve certain traditional musical genres (andalusian, melhun and gharnati)'

We have had accounts of successful practice in such programs in China and Vietnam (section 6.3.)

Concerning the part that expanded choice plays in the loss of the traditions (as noted by our Vietnamese consultant), we would not wish to propose a reduction in choice, a reduction in access to musical diversity. We would seek only that the traditional musics are a part of that choice.

So that factor, and the effects of the international pop industry, will be addressed shortly.

7.1.1.2 The challenge to find ways to restore traditional musics to the daily life of at least some of the people.

This is one of the most important and difficult issues.

To relegate the traditional musics to a museum is only a partial and unsatisfying solution. As our Chinese consultant says, we do not wish only to 'rescue' the traditions, but to 'inherit' them, 'keep them alive'.

But what does this mean, exactly? They were a part of daily life or seasonal ritual. If the life circumstances of which they were a part have disappeared, by what circumstances would their restoration be supported? Detached from their origins, they lose meaning. What would their meaning be when grafted onto a different life style?

They might become 'art objects', performed as museum pieces according to the musical rules, so far as they can be determined, that applied in their original more-than-musical situations. This would keep them more or less intact, though the rest of the culture moves on.

Or in theory, they might become a part of the living culture, somehow integrated into urban lifestyle or the new lifestyles of technologically advanced rural communities. In that case, they surely must change. Will that be satisfactory for those who want to prevent the disappearance of traditional musics?

In their original context, they may have been the whole of musical life. Our Algerian consultant notes the robust continuation of local musics in many isolated Algerian communities, explained by the lack of incursion by outside musics.

In the contemporary world in many countries, including developing countries, musical life is dominated by pop music. It probably is futile and, for those promoting diversity, pointless, to envisage contemporary musical life dominated by a return to local traditional musics. It is suggested that success in this form is neither a realistic nor perhaps, in the interests of musical diversity, a desirable objective. We might hope for a general ability across the relevant population to appreciate or practise the traditional forms, and for some, probably a minority, a lifestyle that includes such practise.

The author speculates that it might be helpful to conceive of such a future in terms of the personality types of various actors in the cause. Conservative (including the sense of conservationist) people may be more interested in maintaining the traditions in their 'pure' or 'authentic' form, and resisting any change. Others of a different disposition may see the traditions as the basis for evolution and experimentation. Some with a strong social orientation may seek out the social circumstances in which people can be brought together around the practice of the traditions. A professional psychologist could doubtless make more of this line of thinking. The point is that ideally, all of these activities could be present simultaneously in keeping alive the traditions in a particular society.

Recall the Indonesian consultant's view that part of the decline of local musics is the result of their absence from the media, which by default tell people what is and is not important in life. The media have an effect on the market for this music and thus, for performers, the feasibility of depending upon it for a living. A decline in the currency of the music is exacerbated by the departure of its professional performers.

And that raises the larger issue of discovering ways in the new circumstances of making the practice of the traditional musics financially viable, either through the market or a combination of market and government assistance. (We have no examples of a successful systematic intervention with the media to induce adequate coverage of traditional music or of musical diversity generally. They will cover it only if by some other means it already is popular or regarded as important.)

Some proposals from our consultants.

China. Recall that our Chinese consultant says that we must take care of the surviving bearers of the traditions. "The significance of real protection and inheriting lies in keeping them alive and in ensuring that the later generations are able to access these splendid heritages. Therefore, the bearers of the traditions, who are in a small number and live mostly a poor life, must be first protected. Their life quality should be improved with much better life conditions so that they can teach orally the cultural heritage to the young people. *In this respect, Japan and the South Korea have effective and successful experience and measures.* We should learn from them and should make our own contribution to the protection of our brilliant music cultural heritage.'

Indonesia. The Indonesian consultant is troubled by the influence on the bearers on the one hand by foreign popular musics and on the other by the tertiary music institutions that give special status to high art forms and so implicitly take status away from everyday traditional forms. 'Indigenous music should be kept alive by letting experts, singers, and musicians develop their own music in the proper contexts such as ceremonies, rituals, schools, and community events. These artists

should be given enough space and the chance to work internally without being bothered by "hegemonized ideas" from other places especially institutions of higher learning that may indirectly dictate strategies and methods to work in their indigenous communities.'

Morocco also use ceremonial and other events to encourage the bearers: ' To create commemorative events and to pay tribute to the rouayes (leaders) of folklore and traditional musics or creators of new musical movements based on Morocco's artistic and cultural heritage as marks of history. *Examples: the "Golden Rabab", the "Virtuosi Ziryab", the "Golden Fibula" created and awarded by the National Music Committee under the patronage of the IMC.'*

Algeria is thinking quite elaborately along these lines. The consultant proposes these steps:

- Institutionalise the various traditional music genres, Musics of National Heritage (label) and encourage those who keep them alive
- Create a national fund dedicated to the funding of traditional music ensembles and artists
- Offer regular performance opportunities for these artists so that they can meet, know and maintain their publics.
- Define and introduce a policy for the promotion of traditional music at national and international level (festivals, professional fairs, cultural weeks)
- Found an institution whose unique mission would be the protection and the promotion of traditional music
- Create a repertory/inventory of traditional music
- Re-evaluate the Ministry of Culture budget for the part concerning traditional music
- Involve to greater extent local and regional authorities and communities (wilayas, dairas, municipalities, companies) in the development and the promotion of traditional music

Algeria gives an example of successful practice: '*Concerning initiatives of support for endangered traditional musics, we note the action of a collective of volunteers which created in 1998 an associative movement dedicated to the safeguarding of a musical genre called "Imzad". The principle objectif of the association "Friends of the imzad" based in Tamanrasset is the safeguarding of this old monocorde instrument, which is exclusively played by Tuaregs women. A school offers courses in instrument making, musical theory and practice of the imzad. This association functions with public funds (National fund for the promotion of culture), with its own capital (sale of instruments, publishing of cassettes and CD), and private donations. There are only 7 musicians left in Algeria who have a complete knowledge of this instrument.'*

Vietnam. Our Vietnamese consultant has a number of proposals:

- 'i. Encouraging and supporting the provincial and national musical troupes and theatres to perform traditional items
- 'ii. Encouraging to restore, revitalise traditional musical genres in community where they are created and developed in the past because they are historical evidence of creative talent of the Vietnamese people.

'iii. Enforce and realise the paragraph number 14 of the *Law for protection of intellectual ownership* which states that the law protects "all kinds of folk literature and folk arts"

'iv. The radio and TV must have a permanent program to introduce traditional cultural expressions of ethnic groups.'

The Vietnamese have put in place some ingenious solutions. We might almost think of them as bringing everyday life to the musical traditions as much as bringing the music into everyday life. One observation from our consultant is that the problem in part is that the young do not have the *opportunity* to make music in the traditional settings.

'Restore and turn into contemporary life some selected available cultural activities or expressions in which a musical genre is an unseparated component, to create a socio-musical environment. For example: Restore the competitive rowing race which had been a cultural activity in a village's springtime ceremony for praying for prosperity. While rowing, the young people sing a traditional rowing song cycle. In this way, the traditional rowing song was revitalized and came to the young people not only as an artistic-musical item performed on the stage but also appeared as a real image of a living tradition.

'Another example: In the past, the courtship love song alternating singing between girls and boys was often used in springtime ceremonies as a symbol of the combination of male and female elements made as a magical action. Now we are restoring the springtime ceremony which we realize mainly as a cultural festivity (previously it was a sacred-religious action to pray for prosperity). And the alternating competitive singing between girls and boys also takes place. In our experience these forms of activity have attracted and excited the young people.'

A third example: *'Using the artistic nature of traditional musical genres as an attractive factor to encourage the young people to learn and take part in the competitions of traditional musics organized annually between two neighbouring villages, at district and provincial levels. The Union of Vietnamese Women has organized a campaign among its members to use lullabies in lulling their own babies to sleep.'*

A fourth: *'After the announcements that our former Court Music (The Nha Nhac) and the Gong ensemble's music of Highlanders were awarded the UNESCO title "Master pieces of oral and intangible cultural heritage of Humanity", a new "fashion" now appeared among our young citizens to study to become "competent man" of their own traditional music. A number of them even began to learn to play these musics.'*

Oceania. Such validation by the outside world has also helped in Oceania. As in so many other non-Western cultures, the young kids of Oceania are singing western pop music and may show little interest in their own traditions. There are local cottage industries to make recordings of local music, but much of it is in Western popular genres.

Recall the Festival of Pacific Arts. *One of the most important purposes of the Festival is to encourage the rediscovery and/or revitalisation of traditional arts. It is a great honour for young people to be chosen for inclusion in their country's artistic delegation to the Festival and so their work in reviving the traditions is quickly rewarded. This has motivated new interest among the young.*

New Zealand. New Zealand participates in the Festival of Pacific Arts. Its national funding body, Creative New Zealand, includes the **Te Waka Toi**, the Māori arts

board, which has the responsibility to support the arts of Māori including the traditional arts. Individuals, groups and organisations can apply for funding for clearly defined, one-off projects.

Australia. The Australia Council, the national funding body, has a similar section, the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Arts Board, to fund artistic activity by indigenous artists, including traditional arts. There is separately an indigenous radio network through the remote regions of north and central Australia, with some broadcasting in indigenous languages. The Garma Festival is an annual festival in and Aboriginal community in the north that draws participants and audiences from a wide area and includes performances of living traditions as well as in more contemporary genres.

Congo. The consultant from the Congo seems to suggest the survival of the traditions by adapting them to the contemporary context. 'The contest of the best song based on the criteria of authenticity and the "Prix Découvertes" of RFI made it possible to discover titles that become classics such as "ancien combattant de Zao", a title conceived on the basis of ZEBOLA. In DRC, the artist Ray LAMA owes his notoriety to the practice and the use of the traditional musics of his country.'

He says that 'The Congolese State, with its contribution of 90% of the FESPAM budget, supports thus this diversity. The FESPAD (Panafrikan Festival of Dances) organized in Kigali, is a palpable example of the will of the States to preserve and promote the African traditional cultures.'

Belgium. A final example of successful practice. This fits within the European consultant's proposition that solutions at the very important small scale level can be encouraged greatly through the provision of good infrastructure. We will take that up in the next section: "Musiques caches", Brussels, is a project of the Belgian association "Muziekpublique". Its aim is to support traditional musicians that are present and active in Brussels and Belgium. Often these musicians have to work "in the shadow" due to lack of funding or means to produce a performance that can be appreciated to open the doors to the Belgian music scene. "Hidden Musics" wants to support them through assisting them with organisational and technical issues to help them to leave anonymity. This project is in collaboration with the Intercultureel Centrum voor Migranten (Intercultural Centre for Migrants), the Centre Bruxellois d'action interculturelle (the Brussels Centre for intercultural action) and the association Le Foyer. It is supported by Fondation Roi Baudouin, the National Lottery, Le Ministère de la Communauté flamande (the Ministry of the French Community), and the cultural administration of the Flemish Community (VGC).¹¹⁹

Our overall comment in this matter of the restoration of traditional musics to daily life is that while collectively the consultants offer many good and useful ideas, it is an area that needs much more comprehensive and systematic study and the testing of various solutions in the varied circumstances found in these many cultures. The matters for study are suggested by the observations at the beginning of this section.

7.1.2 The challenge more broadly to local musics and musical diversity

Not all local musics are traditional musics. Many styles are of relatively recent origin but are distinctive and contribute to musical diversity. Some are ephemeral, not

¹¹⁹ www.muziekpublique.be

because of a change in the cultural underpinnings as dramatic as the disappearance of traditional rural life, but perhaps more as a matter of changing fashion. There does not seem to be such a concern about the appearance and disappearance of such forms provided that as one dies, another has been born. So we need to make room for a consideration of this larger territory of local musics and the need to keep local musics alive and healthy, and not only to rescue and restore endangered traditional musics.

Our *European* consultants note that 'The wealth of local musical traditions together with musical practice forms the core and the very substance of the diversity of music forms. The manifold of local musics constitutes the real diversity of our cultural environment. Local traditions are also essential for maintaining local identity.'

The Europeans wisely suggest a number of basic issues underlying the well-being and development of musical diversity. These include infrastructure, networking, sustainability, a depth of participation through amateur music making, positive promotion, and assistance to local music traditions.

First of these proposals is the need to ensure that there is an **effective supporting infrastructure** which acts as a catalyst to musical activity. The infrastructure can enable small-scale bottom-up development.

'Promotion of musical infrastructure can be seen in analogy to the "normal" market of commodities and services... Infrastructural measures work like catalysts, they increase and accelerate development.

'Musical infrastructure can be promoted amongst others by supporting smaller and middle venues, rehearsal rooms and studios, mobility (tour support).

As an example of the provision of physical infrastructure:

The ORWOhaus is an industrial building built from the 1980ies, in the Eastern part of Berlin, which hosted the film company ORWO until the decline of the former GDR. After having been empty long time, many music bands nested themselves here, using it as rehearsing space, illegally. The building should have been cleared in 2004, but protests and the foundation of the association "ORWOhaus e.V." got a lot of awareness in the Berlin public, so that in 2005 could be bought. Currently, the association is working out a concept in collaboration with the authorities of the Berlin district of Marzahn-Hellersdorf, the senate's administration for culture and economy and the Gesellschaft für Stadtentwicklung GmbH (society for urban development) and the Stiftung SPI (foundation SPI). A lot of known musicians support the project. It created a lot of awareness in the media and collaborates with the radio station MotorFM.

*'Plans seek to secure the ORWOhaus for bands on a long term base and to extend the capacities for rehearsing space, so that finally about 200 bands with about 800 musicians can rehearse. "Musical" services like studios, agencies for booking, event-management and promotion, labels, designers, equipment-hiring and music retailers are planned to be settled here to create synergies. The big warehouses of the building are planned to be used for concerts, workshops and tour-preparations. The square in front of the building is a good place for open air concerts, because it is one of the few inner city spaces where no neighbours might be bothered.'*¹²⁰

The Europeans continue:

¹²⁰ <http://www.community.orwohaus.de>

'Above all we recommend all kinds of supportive measures that promote and preserve access and accessibility (to fair conditions): access to media, access to archives, access to education, access to concerts, access to musical practice etc. ...

'Another important motor for a healthy and diverse musical landscape would, from our perspective, be the promotion of an adequate, sufficient and proactive information policy concerning legal requirements, social security laws and regulations, royalties, subsidies, promotional programs, grants, prizes etc.- in short: the financial situation of musicians and music workers, as well as the promotion of training in self-management and marketing for musicians and music workers.

'We also recommend to support free festivals that promote musical diversity, as well as all measures and activities that seek to maintain the free flow of information...

'To achieve the plurality and diversity of music, the way seems to be in promoting the margins instead of the mainstream, so that a plurality of unities will evolve.'

Networks are an aspect of infrastructure, assisting the various parties to collaborate or benefit from each other's initiatives and knowledge. The European consultants suggest the introduction of "network therapists", who would coach networks in finding their position in the market or in the politics.

As an example of successful practice, the Europeans cite the 'Red House Center for Culture and Debate, Sofia. *The Red House Centre for Culture and Debate (Sofia) provides an opportunity for the youngest generation to participate in public life, brings together young artists who are ready to question the prevailing perceptions and offers them a place to realise and present their projects. Through its socio-political programmes, the Red House Centre for Culture and Debate creates a forum which stimulates public debate, brings new ideas into public politics, educates a new generation of political leaders and brings together the cultural and political elite of the nation. The Red House Centre for Culture and Debate organises and presents socio-political as well as artistic, cultural and training programmes.*'¹²¹

The Europeans note that the initiatives taken in support of musical diversity should have an outcome that is **sustainable**. A number of examples are given (see Appendix 14) among which, for instance, is 'a new school teacher education in music with emphasis on intercultural competencies and musical diversity, planned as a cooperation of three German Universities in Hannover, Hildesheim and Göttingen.' Teachers who have received this training then educate students in diverse musics and create a long-term audience.

Musical practice (making music) is the prerequisite of the diversity and plurality of musical creation. Only when a lot of music is made can you assume that musical diversity will emerge.

To prevent the drying out of the pool of music making, it is necessary to support **amateurs making music**... 'Learning and training musical skills needs a lot of time. So the ideal situation is, if children already grow up in an atmosphere of making music. Kindergarden could be a place where measures and projects could start.'

The Europeans want to see musical diversity **promoted**. To this end, they see the value in prizes and competitions. These are widespread in the musical world, and certainly in Europe. Nevertheless, it should be observed here that competitions are anathema to some, who see them as damaging to the interests of music and the

¹²¹ http://www.redhouse-sofia.org/index_e.html

participants, especially those who don't win. However, we allow the Europeans to make their point:

'Musical practice is automatically promoted by all kinds of activities and events that require musical participation. So prizes and competition, not only on professional, but also on lower levels, stimulate activity and practice.

'A good example is the German Creole-Wettbewerb (s. section 6) and its regional edition Musica Vitale in Berlin, a competition for newcomer bands in traditional and world musics.'

Musical diversity can be promoted to the general public in many ways and perhaps one of the most effective is through the music festival. A festival presents multiple performances over a relatively extended period and so provides the circumstances in which a choice for diversity can have a real outcome. Also, while festivals present performances for a passive audience, they also can offer opportunities for amateurs to make music and to receive instruction from visiting professionals.

The Europeans offer as examples the Fête de la Musique, France (see Appendix) and Karneval der Kulturen (Carnival of Cultures), Berlin:

The Karneval der Kulturen is held annually in May on the weekend of pentecoste. It was initiated by a group of artists, social workers and people working in artistic or social education and had the London Notting Hill Carnival as its model. From about 50.000 spectators and participants in the beginning, it grew into a very big street event which attracts now up to 1.000.000 spectators. It is held on four days in the form of a street festival with stalls and stages. Around 4.500 participants perform in about 70 different groups and bands. The route leads right through the "multicultural" quarter Kreuzberg, an area with a highly mixed population. The bands and their members come from the most diverse cultural backgrounds. There are professional artists and musicians performing as well as amateurs, you find folklore dance groups, school projects, NGOs like amnesty international and Greenpeace, discos and dance clubs, percussion classes, samba schools and friends who formed a band. A wide range of styles and genres is presented as well in costumes and performances as in music. Though there is a clear emphasis on latin-american-derived cultures that are presented - salsa, tango, Bolivian carnival elements as well as Brazilian carnival expressions (Samba, Bomba Meo Boi, Afoxé, Maracatú) -, there are also presentations of European folklore - Hungarian, Polish and Sorbic folk dances, Guggemusik ("crazy" brassbands from Southern Germany); karate and kung fu clubs perform - and you will find African percussion and traditional costumes and dances as well.¹²²

The French policy for local musics is offered as an exemplar of successful practice in promotion:

'France implements probably the most successful cultural policy promoting local music culture(s)... It includes a complex of promotional measures based on a rather high budget for culture. The measures include:

- *A great number of music festivals and other musical events with high participation*

¹²² <http://www.karneval-berlin.de/>

- *Radio quote for French language*
- *A powerful music export office*
- *Subsidies for music productions from France*

'In 1985, the Federation of Traditional Music Associations (FTMA, today FTMDA) was founded and traditional music centres were built in the regions. The latter came into existence by relying on structures that already existed and were labelled by the Ministry and signed an "objectives agreement" with the State. Research, training and distribution are all part of the regional centres' programme of activities. The creation, in 1992, of the Traditional Music Information Centre completes the picture.

'Little by little, the network was built up on French territory, directed according to a north-west / south-west axis and determined by the regions that had kept up a strong practice of traditional music and dance. The most urban regions have also seen a fast development of musical practices. The Rhône-Alpes region, but in particular the Ile de France (Paris region) have the strongest concentrations of artists devoted to world-music and intense distribution, thanks to both the large cultural facilities and the smaller places. It may be said that this is the result of a deliberate policy "of territorial development" through a network that is unique in Europe and that continues to pursue its actions today.

'Promoting local music cultures in the new media environment could include

- *Incorporation of local and traditional musics in advertisement*
- *Employment of traditional songs as ring tones for mobile phones*
- *Putting playlists with local music into new mobile phones and mp3-players.'*

The consultants for other areas did not address issues of local musical diversity in the way implied by this section – excepting for our two Arabic contributors, who conceived broadly of the issues.

The Moroccan consultant sees the need `To create a true infrastructure for the musical sector (construction of adequate theatres for all genres of music and choreographic dance, creation of state and private music schools in order to protect and perpetuate disappearing genres, creation of quality studios and radio stations which broadcast typical traditional music, creation of youth and cultural centres containing discotheques, audio-visual documentaries of national and foreign traditional music, transformation of the cottage industry of building traditional music instruments into a true industry headed by national and foreign specialists).

'To subsidize music projects which improve or protect the musical heritage in all its diversity.'

Both the Moroccan and Algerian consultants are thinking in terms of infrastructure. The Algerian consultant outlined a very comprehensive plan for traditional musics, already presented in section 7.1.1. Add to that these broader recommendations:

- Revitalise a biennial festival of Algerian Popular Arts, inter-regional encounters of traditional music and chant
- Create a national observatory whose objective would be to encourage any artist or initiative related to music and song (guidance and bursaries)
- Improve the material and logistic conditions for artists and associations (availability of rehearsal venues, etc.)

- Group artists in societies and trade unions of authors, composers, performers - representatives of the profession, in order to better defend their interests (research and introduction of a better adapted legislation, collection and restitution of the rights, legal counsel, etc),

We should remember in this section also the newly local musics brought by immigrants – traditions and newer forms carried from the old country. These do not necessarily take root in the new country unless there is some sort of place for them, some form of encouragement.

From the Australian report: 'The traditions that immigrants have brought with them are also a focus of public policy, again suggesting that survival and/or development is at risk. As with indigenous traditional music, these musics presumably are not supported by their new habitats in the same way that they were in their countries of origin. Public funding however is extremely modest, so their survival is not assured either from that source.'

Australia also notes that Western classical music is a part of local music diversity. Its position is not as assured as it was only ten or twenty years ago and conceivably it could be under threat in the medium term. 'Western classical music is perhaps at the top of the [risk] list. The core audiences for classical music are those for the large ensembles – the orchestras and opera companies. These 18-19C entities now must live in a 21C economy and they are not suited to it. They cannot do without substantial subsidy, and in Australia that subsidy comes mainly from governments. In the end, the subsidy can be given only with the assent of the governed and the majority of tax payers prefer other, unsubsidised music. The situation is inherently precarious. The challenge is to persuade and maintain a majority of tax payers in the belief that music is good, classical music is good, and it is a good idea for the government to ensure its survival.'

7.1.3 The challenge of the loss of local musics to the forces of globalisation

It would be difficult to overemphasise the status of this problem, as seen by our consultants.

The forces of globalisation are felt by them primarily as the overwhelming incursions of the international pop music industry, its multinational corporations, and their marketing power. They not only dominate, but use their domination to support *their* music. And the more powerful they become, the narrower, it seems, is the band of music they will support.

The author, with a personal affiliation to classical music, recalls for instance that a decade or so ago the multinational record companies, which all have Australian branches, used occasionally to issue recordings of Australian classical music performers or even compositions. This now never happens. The catalogues are of popular music and niche tastes are left to small companies – mostly very small companies. Indeed, in the case of world music, so small that the majority of recordings are artist self-releases.

There probably are no solutions, but there may be ameliorations.

Firstly, if the multinational record corporations cannot make a profit in a particular country, their interest in marketing their catalogue is moderated. There is a discussion of this situation in section 4.2.5, which proposes the heretical view that for a developing country, an orderly, enforced copyright regime has its down side, and the issue needs to be considered in all of its ramifications.

Secondly, if the multinationals do have a presence, pressure can be applied to have them issue recordings by local musicians working in the internationally popular idioms or better still, in local variants of those idioms, or still better than that, in idioms that are totally local or basically local with some market-based modifications. (Since record sales are linked to broadcast air time, a strategy to impose quotas for the broadcast of non-pop idioms could lift sales and lure the record companies into issuing recordings in these genres.)

The recording industry globally, and implicitly the major record companies that pursue the international market, was criticised for not supporting local musics. Issues in 2001 and 2002 of *IFPI Network*, the online newsletter of the International Federation of Phonographic Industries, the association of national record industry associations that generally are dominated by the major companies, defended their record, stating that the international record industry is indeed producing recordings of local artists, and that sales of these discs worldwide had increased from 58% of the total in 1991 to 68% in 2000. There are many reasons that these statistics may not be totally dependable. However, they do at least demonstrate that as recently as 2002, this was an issue regarded by the industry as sufficiently sensitive to warrant such a response.

Thirdly, governments can seek to ensure that local music does have a place in the local marketplace, especially through recordings and broadcasting, even in the face of the overwhelming push by the international industry to remove all government measures that prefer local music over the music of the negotiating partner(s). We will pursue the details further in the international section below.

Quotes from two of our consultants, giving a particular perspective from their countries:

'Morocco is one of the countries with the highest musical diversity. But it is also the country with the greatest experience as far as multicultural cohabitation in a spirit of tolerance, solidarity and peace among the ethnic groups is concerned. However, it is not possible to prevent the direct or indirect influence of powerful musical genres from the West or the emancipated Arab countries (Egypt, Lebanon) which can more or less affect the development and natural blooming of its musical diversity composed of minority styles; some of these might become extinguished or disappear forever, unless government and citizens protect and promote them properly (at mass media level) by distributing them nationally (through recordings, thematic festivals typical of one style or the other, cultural weeks abroad, documentaries, publications and print). Up to now this musical diversity has survived against all the odds. However, how much longer will it be able to survive in the face of globalization? This is a true 'Sword of Damocles' which can strike at any moment.'

Congo: 'The influence of the very powerful foreign media, relegates the local media; this can constitute a restraint for the blooming of the local musics. The radio, for example, in similar circumstance, becomes an element of sovereignty.'

Indonesia – an interesting observation about values, which probably is true enough about the world of the commercial music industry: 'Foreign music producers may be thought of as rivals to national producers assuming that they are financially stronger than the national ones. **Because they believe that music values are relative, in the sense that there is no higher value of one music over another music, the financial aspect can be a factor in the consideration to protect the life of music.** [We would add: 'or not protect']

7.1.4 The challenge of building financially successful local music sectors

This is an enormously complex issue. It will be taken up by the International Music Council (subject to the availability of funding) in a major research project probably conducted over a number of years.

This seems also to be a very *important* issue since clearly a lack of funds normally sits alongside a lack of activity. And the lack of both must affect the availability of music to everyone, musicians and audience. Governmental development programs may not even consider the possibilities for the contribution of the music sector, and in the absence of enabling legal infrastructure and for instance, suitable financial instruments, the private sector is unlikely to be sufficiently knowledgeable and experienced to act beyond its own immediate interests. For example, our consultant from Cameroon noted that the local 'music sector is not organised and does not have recognition as a vector of development in Cameroon.'

But before going further down this path, there is a need here to define our terms.

By 'sector' is meant, for our purposes of the moment, the aspects of musical activity that are engaged in commerce: live performance, recording in particular, distribution, dissemination via broadcast, retail, the internet. Might be called 'the music industry'.

We need to define 'financially successful'. There are perhaps only three countries that are net exporters of music (the USA, UK and Sweden). To include as a criterion that the successful music sector is a net exporter therefore sets the bar too high. It would suffice if the sector is profitable in its domestic market.

Why must a sector be *financially* successful in order to be thought to be successful? If it were culturally successful but depended upon government subsidies not to make a loss, would that be successful enough?

It seems on the face of it that musical activity would be healthier and more secure if the sector is financially self-reliant. Unfortunately, that seems to mean that commercial values will dominate and will direct resources to a narrow band of commercially successful genres and leave to the cottage companies the support to musical diversity. Financially successful may mean culturally unsuccessful.

From the perspective of this study, a successful music sector would find a financial basis for the survival of traditional musics. But on the evidence, where there is a survival problem, the commercial sector cannot be depended upon for support and indeed may nowhere be seen; it may be unrealistic to depend on the emergence of a solution based on profit. Government financial encouragement may be needed.

Nevertheless, a partnership of government and commerce may be preferable to support exclusively from government: it brings the music more into everyday life, reduces the burden on government, and may be able to engage the marketing skills of the private entrepreneurs of live or mediated performances.

From the European consultants: 'The highest (musical) diversity results from a balanced collaboration of the free market, governmental regulations and the commitment of the citizen of a functioning civil society (s. Introduction). These three principles complete each other. Because culture/music is a market value as well as a cultural value, it should not be simply left handed over to the principles of a free market.

'Broadcasting in Western Europe forms a good example of a functioning balanced cooperation between market, state and civil society – here we have public

broadcasters, private radio stations and the third tier like community radio, open channels and all the projects that are based on the commitment of the citizen. The result is a broadcasting market that shows a high degree of diversity and quality, there is supply for everyone. The principle of pluralism seem to be realised here.’ However, it is not clear from this description that there are public/private partnerships, so much as three distinct realms.

If a music sector is to seek financial success, then typically it will invest above all in popular musics. Despite the above comments, that also can be seen as a desirable activity, especially if, rather than simply importing the foreign top 100, resources are put into building the success of local musicians and preferably, local dialects rather than direct imitations of the international pop language. Although success in achieving this objective may not transform a country into a net music exporter, it will at least result in the substitution of local musics for some of the music previously imported, and so ameliorate music’s negative trade balance.

In Appendix 4, there are brief descriptions of many projects that have sought to improve the operation of some aspect of the music sectors of countries of the developing world. These address particular problems but mostly do not look comprehensively at the performance of a music sector. We mention again the project in Australia to make such an analysis from which broad solutions will be generated. This works as a partnership between industry and government under a program called the Industry Action Agenda. The reader is referred also to a paper that looks at best practice in projects in the developing world, summarised briefly in the Appendix.¹²³

The development of a financially successful local music sector can benefit from government assistance or cooperation. This might be more forthcoming if the government can be presented with convincing economic arguments about the potential financial value of the sector, employment numbers, and its strength as a tool for marketing the country internationally.

Countries in the developed world do support their local music industries. There is considerable activity in Europe in building music exports, for example, as reported already, the French Music Export Office. New Zealand’s activities have been described in some detail already. Here is another example of their international promotions:

‘Young New Zealand musicians, an acclaimed singer/songwriter and an exponent of traditional ancient Māori music were showcased at the 2005 Australian International Music Market with Creative New Zealand support.’¹²⁴

‘New Zealand’s inaugural presence at the market in Brisbane included performances by Nesian Mystik, Tha Feelstyle, Hinewehi Mohi and James Webster.

‘New Zealand’s participation in the market was part of Creative New Zealand’s push to build international audiences and markets for New Zealand work. The artists’ presence was supported by a DVD and catalogue featuring 35 contemporary musicians.

¹²³ ...and available at http://www.wipo.int/about-ip/en/studies/pdf/study_r_wallis.pdf

¹²⁴ www.creativenz.govt.nz/news/archive.html?record=1716.

The Australian International Music Market is held in conjunction with the Queensland Music Festival and is attended by delegates from Australia, Asia, the Pacific, Central and South America, Japan, Europe, Canada and the United States.'

7.1.5 The challenge of reasserting the primary value of culture over commerce

Local music can be assisted by an appropriately orientated local music industry. However, our values are increasingly dominated by the market, which says that what is worth having is that which is profitable rather than that which may not be profitable or may be less profitable, but is of spiritual or emotional or intellectual or cultural value. Musics that satisfy a mass audience may or may not have these values. They are certain to have those qualities that appeal to the many people for whom music is a passing entertainment that they do not seek to explore or understand at any depth - music that the marketing machine tells them that they should like.

A financially successful local music industry could be expected to have exploited the mass market. Its success, which under one hat we seek, lends strength to the advocates of commerce possibly at the expense of cultural values.

We in the west who are politically active on behalf of music find that we may need to make our arguments in terms of its economic or commercial value. We can make those arguments so many times that we begin to believe them ourselves. But it is our task more than anyone else's to draw attention to the key, intrinsic values of music and the musical experience.

The Indonesian consultant gives one view on the danger of dancing with wolves:

'Local participation in national and international level to get better perspectives is necessary because this will help the local musicians to perceive concepts, values, and methods of preserving, making, promoting music in the proper contexts. This should be done carefully because it may result in the wrong direction in which musicians take the elements of foreign music physically rather than taking the spirit of the music. Musical life is not only the physical materials but rather more importantly the "conceptual statement" of what musicians think about the life in the communities and the values behind them. Perhaps, conducting workshops is a good method to understand the underlying concepts in other music. When they get the "deep concepts" I believe that they will not make [such a] mistake.'

7.1.6 The challenge of transmitting the musical cultures through programs outside of the formal education system

The role of the formal education system will be addressed in the Government section below.

The musical culture may be transmitted through the formal system but in many countries both developed and developing, this has not produced a satisfactory outcome. Developing countries face a scarcity of resources. Many developed countries have the resources but their values lie elsewhere and they give priority to other curricular areas.

But in any case, there are issues around whether the formal education system is capable of providing an education in musical diversity or, indeed, in musics that do not lend themselves for one reason or another to the training of school music teachers or inclusion in the school curriculum. Traditionally, music was not learnt in schools but passed down in communities. This is the case still with many of the musics that concern us.

So there are essentially two reasons for our interest in music education outside the education system: firstly, that the system may not provide at all, or may not provide for some practices of special relevance; secondly, that in some settings it is possible to learn musics intact in their original social context, or at least to learn them in a community environment that demonstrates that they are valued in the 'real world' outside school.

In some communities, the informal transfer of music traditions continues as it always has. In others, where something extra is needed to make something happen, there are many, many instances of success. Consider the extraordinary youth orchestra program in Venezuela, emulated in other Latin American countries. (Section 2.4)

There is a special instance of this problem where migrants somehow lose their musical cultures in their new home countries. There may be many migrant cultures in the new home and it could be simply beyond the school system to offer activities and instruction in all or even some of them. A solution is that the musical practices are taken up within the relevant immigrant communities. The more vivid is the public outcome of such programs, the more interest and support they are likely to elicit, so it could benefit the communities to consider how that might be brought about. Validation by the larger society can help. Some government assistance or encouragement also.

Latin America seems to have a marvellous facility for creating community programs to pass on music skills to children. For examples in many Latin American countries, see sections 2.4.1 and 4 2.3.

The Europeans make the point that these programs can be used to build bridges between cultures (going back to UNESCO's original motivation for involvement in issues of cultural diversity (see the beginning of section 3).

'Music (in as well as outside school) can be employed to convey social values, and help to fight intolerance and promote integration in the sense of respect for and positive awareness and handling of differences. This is already done in projects like the Norwegian "Klangrikt Felleskab"-Prosjekt (Sonorous Fellowship) and the Belgian "Chemin de traverse" that we described in section 4.(See Appendix 14.)

In the eighties Scandinavia experienced a new right wing movement and racist attacks against immigrants. In reaction Norway financed several large-scale projects, which introduced world music to Norwegian schools. One of the more spectacular took place from 1989 to 1992 when Rikskonsertene – the National Norwegian Concert Organisation, implemented the "klangrikt felleskab" (sonorous fellowship) project. 750 school classes at class level 4 (age group 10-12) in 18 schools in Oslo were during a three year period introduced to music and dance from Asia, Africa and Latin America.

There was a very clearly defined goal for the project. That goal was to "change attitudes towards immigrants amongst children and youngsters".

A comparative evaluation concluded after the project, "children that had taken part in the project now had a more "friendly attitude towards immigrants than those who didn't" The report also concluded that the amount of "ethnic confrontations" diminished in those schools that took part in the project. And finally the project according to the evaluation showed that "the immigrant kids got their cultural identity strengthened and dared to stand forward with their own culture".

The project inspired Danish world music organisations to introduce a similar project in Denmark called World.dk and again development money was an essential part of the financing and the conclusions of the project were similar to those in Norway.¹²⁵

Projects like these should be extended.

7.1.7 The challenge of creating in the private sector the broadest possible access to musical diversity

While we might usually think that ensuring equity of access is a job for governments, there are problems that the private sector can deal with, sometimes because it has created them.

Our European consultants point to various problems on the internet. The internet is extraordinarily well structured to offer access to diversity, but due to the policies of record companies and their contractual arrangements with online providers, a great part of the existing catalogue is still not available. The problem is even greater for niche genres than the mainstream popular genres.

'A lot of musics are not to be found on the internet, though this would make the most diverse musics accessible to a broad public globally. Bureau Européen des Unions de Consommateurs has tested the diversity of musics offered by the leading download platforms. And this is the result:

- Two thirds of current "popular" music albums requested are not available.
- Up to 90% of requested classical music albums could not be found.
- This lack of diversity is mainly linked to the record companies represented on these websites: if you want to find your favourite music that was published for example by Sony records, you will not be able to find it on a website where this record company is not represented. Smaller and specialized labels are generally absent.
- The search engines used by most of these websites performed poorly and it was sometimes difficult to find a desired album or track. This was true for classical music in particular.

'In summary, these websites display a very low level of "cultural diversity" and the music download retail industry doesn't seem to be committed to cultural diversity. This is all the more worrying as these websites can potentially 'tie-in' consumers to their music file format. In the longer term, consumers could restrict themselves to that choice of music. Specialized musicians and record companies could be squeezed out of the market.

'Furthermore, the content of these websites is not selected primarily for its musical diversity but drawn from record company catalogues. Online distribution lends itself to buying 'complete catalogues' and in this way limits consumers' musical choice. Another problem which curbs cultural diversity is that many of the smaller labels, particularly those dealing with back-catalogues (i.e. older recordings that the record company does not actively promote but is still in their catalogue of sales – like the Beatles recording for example), may not be readily available in digital form. Some of

¹²⁵ (Source: Ole Reitov "The politics of world music in Scandinavia: One step forward – two steps backward") Klangrikt Felleskab <http://www.rikskonsertene.no/rk/0109.html>

these labels may also be licensing music from other sources but do not have permission to distribute them to online music-download websites.

'It is clear that online music business models are designed in a way that restricts rather than promotes cultural diversity. In the area of digital content, much remains to be done: more content needs to be made available.'¹²⁶

Search engines could be improved and no doubt will be. Important earlier recordings may not be available in digital format but if they are indeed important, they may be on someone's list.

According to the European consultants, there are valuable and extensive music archives, in private hands, that are not accessible to the public. They easily could be, and perhaps are constrained only by inertia or not seeing the opportunity. The Europeans write only of the European archives, on the face of it. We have not heard that there are difficulties in gaining access to the collections of traditional music in other regions.

'Music archives ... are part of musical diversity. The archives' successful function as memory though is dependent on their accessibility. As long as their content is not really open to all public groups (musicians, journalists, broadcasters, teachers), this is a waste of governmental resources as well as academic work: diversity is stored then, but only poorly or selectively retrievable. Unfortunately this is the usual case in music archives today. Example would be *Berliner Phonogrammarchiv*, one of the most significant collections of traditional music worldwide, which has no online catalogue; its database can be only used by the staff of the archive.

'A single gateway to stored recordings and corresponding information would be the best solution: it will make the use of archives easy and transparent for the public. *An interesting EU project DISMARC (Discovering Music Archives) is working in this direction: it will create an online public access to all metadata about the recordings stored in leading european scientific and radio music archives.*'

Small providers do offer their services to small record companies or musicians, have greater interest collectively in the non-mainstream catalogues and may eventually offer access.

The Latin American consultants see some private responsibility in creating archives, and not only in making them accessible. 'Governmental projects, civil organizations and international organizations must finance the creation of compilations concerned with culture and diversity.'

They also remind us that not only mediated performance and documentation, but also live performance should be accessible. 'Regional music must be presented through the tourist spaces; it is, not just in festivals and massive performances, but in hotels, restaurants and other similar spaces.'

¹²⁶ Bureau Européen des Unions de Consommateurs, *Test on cultural diversity of online music distribution*, 07 November, 2005

http://www.consumersdigitalrights.org/mdoc/x044cku2005e_75885.pdf

7.2 Government sector

7.2.1 The challenge of government ignorance or indifference: where the development of music and musical diversity is not even on the agenda

A number of our consultants contend with such governments.

The solution, which may or may not work, is skilled advocacy: well formulated policy proposals backed up by research if necessary, presented to the government so far as is possible in terms of its own priorities. The advocacy is more powerful if the support of the community or of people admired by the government can be demonstrated, and if it is delivered in part through continuing personal contact.

There is no shortage of examples of success and of failure. It would perhaps not be particularly instructive to cite them here because each advocacy campaign must be tailored to circumstance.

The Europeans remind us of 'The ignorance of the state in Russia, Belarus and Ukraine to the forthcoming extinction of local music traditions' and that nationalism or dictatorship endangers musical diversity.

7.2.2 The challenge to governments to formulate and enact policies and legislation that protect and promote musical diversity

Such policies potentially can cover every conceivable aspect of the operation of a music sector as it applies to musical diversity.

To approach the objective most directly, there are the specifically supportive policies such as the Australia Council's Arts for a Multicultural Australia.¹²⁷

Other policies are directed to the support of local musics, in particular traditional musics. See section 6.1.

The Australian report lays out some basics: 'Government policies should ensure the rights of all citizens to participate in their own cultures.

'Governments should refrain from suppressing any cultures, majority or minority, practised by their own citizens, excepting where they breach the rights guaranteed by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other such documents.

'Through support both regulatory and financial, governments should foster musical diversity within their borders. Such support can go to local musics of all genres, with emphasis on the genres that are unable to be financially self-sustaining and face market failure. It can also go to facilitate access to music from other countries, whether live or mediated.'

Morocco gets down to specifics: 'To grant the right: to finance state music institutions; to subsidize any national music production; to finance national radios (a decree provides for radio broadcasters to broadcast in Morocco after agreement by the national agency for the regulation of telecoms, a public authority under the presidency of the prime minister).'

The *Congolese* consultant has some observations about the situation in Africa: 'Many African States do not have a valuable cultural policy - they have almost all the same problems. This is to say that the convention on the protection and the promotion of the diversity of the cultural expressions becomes a palliative (sic), which might result

¹²⁷ www.ozco.gov.au

in that questions related to culture are taken into account in the various development plans.

'The example of the Republic of Cameroun is to be encouraged; in the same way other countries such as Senegal, Libya, Kenya, Burkina-Faso, Mali (organizing of the festival of the traditional hunters) and many others would be more active. They would make others follow. The contribution to the international fund for cultural diversity would constitute a strong signal of this commitment.'

(Some consultants from developing world countries generously offer their country's contributions to that fund. Better in this case that they receive (and match!) than give.)

Some counter-productive positions. Government policies can work against musical diversity simply by omitting to fund or otherwise support it. The European consultants point to three issues:

- A lack of equitability in music funding, which sees in many European countries a very large percentage of available subsidies allocated to classical music. (The consultants insist that they do not wish to see any withdrawal of support to classical music, which itself is a traditional music that contributes to diversity, but do not offer a solution to the resulting conundrum.)
- A tendency of arts funding bodies to support large, 'lighthouse' events that give the opportunity for a good media profile for politicians but draw funds away from the small, low key, systematic efforts to build a vital, diverse music sector.

*'The Nordic Council in 2005 decided to re-organise its cultural policy and to focus on (politician driven) "actions/cultural presentations". This new tendency can easily lead to huge international manifestations, which very seldom lead to long term effects and have a tendency to be driven by "themes". The risk is that a few project makers will get all the money for "actions" that attract political interests and media coverage. What is needed – however – is the hard and not very glorifying work of establishing and committing networks, influencing educational institutions, lobbying the media and initiating relevant research.'*¹²⁸

[On this matter, one cannot resist observing that the lure of show business is sometimes too much for politicians or arts funding bodies. Why only fund other people to have the fun and glamour?! (Of course, glamour is in short supply in those 'small, low key, systematic' projects. For glamour, you need a lighthouse project.)]

- Repressive dictatorships such as that in Belarus where the government has imposed an overly high 75% local music quota on broadcasters and also has obstructed the opportunities for public performance by performers who are critical of its actions.

7.2.3 The challenge of formulating, enacting and enforcing the copyright legislation and regulations that will be most beneficial to music and musical diversity in a given country

The basic dilemma facing developing countries that wish to support local musics and musical diversity is elucidated in section 4.2.5: the enforcement of effective

¹²⁸ Ole Reitov "The politics of world music in Scandinavia: One step forward – two steps backward"

copyright legislation can have the effect of reducing diversity. The solution: choose your poison. Or possibly, find a middle path that will benefit the local industry without turning musical life over to the multinationals; or moderate the activities of the multinationals. The exploration should look at new intellectual property formulations such as that put forward by Creative Commons.

Some consultants reported chaos or corruption in the administration of copyright, inevitably to the cost of the artists. (4.2.5 – e.g. Cameroun, Algeria). Presumably, while this should be approached in a way focused on solving those specific problems, within a government that tolerates ineffectual or corrupt administration there may be wider problems that make a solution more difficult.

Concerning traditional musics that are in community ownership, a country with an effective copyright regime should enact legislation covering indigenous copyright. There is at least one model to call upon – the South Pacific Commission's *Regional Framework for the Protection of Traditional Knowledge and Expressions of Culture*. There has also been work in this area in Australia but as yet, no legislation.¹²⁹ There seems generally to be plenty of discussion around the world but little action.

The unfinished business around community ownership of copyright in traditional music has apparently led to difficulties for the Europeans: 'Legal rights and status of recordings of traditional musics are very often unclear, which prevents their dissemination and further use. They cannot be licensed and employed in any audiovisual productions, neither can they be published nor copied for academic or educational purposes and private use.' This suggests that copyright is seen to exist but that use cannot be negotiated, a curious situation.

In the developed world, online creation and delivery of musical works creates the need for updated intellectual property laws. There is division between the industry which seeks maximum control of rights, and consumers or those who act for them, who seek to limit these controls in favour of accessibility. There are oppositional groups such as the Electronic Frontier Foundation, who tend to come down on the side of the consumer or, where this is pertinent, the interests as they see them, of developing countries. A substantial online literature is available, presenting the arguments of both sides but rarely, unfortunately, a truly balanced appraisal. This study does not take a position on either side of this argument.

The Algerian consultant clearly has a view on the need for an orderly industry, presumably requiring a dependable copyright administration. 'With regard to the phonographic industry, anarchy of regulations prevents international producers, publishers, and masters to invest into the Algerian records market. Thus, no imports of records.' This last is a very interesting consequence, given our conjectures about Nigeria.

7.2.4 The challenge of the lack of provision of an effective, long-term, sequential, diverse music education

Readers may recall the argument put in section 1 that since it is a basic human right that every person should be able to participate in their own culture, and since to do so requires a knowledge of the culture and how to participate in it, and since in some countries there is a dependency on the schools to be the transmitters of the culture, if they do not fulfil that role they are breaching a human right.

¹²⁹ www.dcita.gov.au

The Latin American consultants meet that proposition full on: 'Protection of musical identity in each region is reached just through education. Music as a scholarly assignment and the teaching of musical traditions should become obligatory.'

Whether or not one accepts the legalistic argument, of course we support the proposition that schools should provide to all children an effective, long-term, sequential, stylistically and culturally diverse music education.

It should be effective because otherwise what is the point? It should be long-term because musical abilities do not develop over a short time, and it should be sequential because, for instance, the physical skills must develop progressively. It should be diverse for all the reasons this study is being written.

Such a curriculum can be delivered only by trained teachers. One of the issues brought to our attention by the consultants is the lack of trained teachers.

In some cases – e.g. per the advice by the Indonesian consultant, the issue is the teaching of the traditional musics and the lack of teachers trained in those areas. The European consultants note below that most teachers are trained to deliver a western classical music curriculum rather than a stylistically diverse curriculum. Elsewhere, we have seen that this is the case in former Western colonies such as in Sub-Saharan Africa. The Europeans also note that a multicultural curriculum is more easily and more often available in what they call the theoretical area, as opposed to the area of practice or performance. This is hardly surprising since it is much easier to listen to or read about the sitar than to play it. And you can't even begin unless you have the sitar...

From the European consultants:

'The ability to perceive and value musical diversity is based on musical skills, knowledge and understanding as well as knowledge about different forms of music and musical traditions. Too little music education in school, shortage of professional training of teachers in the subject "music", scarce or no support and subsidy of music schools and private music lessons thus contribute to endangering musical diversity.'

They continue: 'There is a significant deficit in introducing musical diversity in schools. European classical music dominates the picture and is seen as a model for all music. Even when curricula provide plans for introducing other music cultures, they are often not implemented. Main reason for this is the lack of teachers educated in this field. *Raimund Vogels, vice president of the University of Music and Drama Hannover says: "Musical diversity is a Terra Incognita within the German school system today. Eurocentrism is being taught." He plans to establish a new school teacher education in music with emphasis on intercultural competencies and musical diversity.*

'We recommend that the existing music education in school (not only the curricula, but also its realisation) should at least teach that much musical diversity, that pupils are capable to move and orientate themselves in the musical landscape that surrounds them as "conscious musical citizens" of the society.'

The New Zealand curriculum apparently has moved beyond the model described above, and includes the traditional musics of the indigenous population, although there is no mention by the consultant of, for instance, the musics of immigrant peoples. *'The arts (including music, dance, drama and visual arts) are included in the curriculum of New Zealand schools. Guidance for programme planning is provided in a document entitled The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum. That statement*

*promotes learning about the musical heritages of New Zealand's many diverse cultures and about the genres and styles of traditional and contemporary Māori music.*¹³⁰

In Vietnam the curriculum extends beyond Vietnamese music: 'There is in the curriculum of musical educational institutions a section for the traditional music of Asian countries.'

There is incessant work on curriculum development. There are few problems in finding curricular models for whatever type of program might be desired. The problem usually is political, which means for the music community it is one of advocacy.

7.2.5 The challenge of providing the broadest possible public access to musical diversity, including access to local musics

Governments are the guardians, hopefully, of equity, of equal opportunity for all citizens to gain access to various rights and privileges. We assume here that musically diverse activity exists and the issue is to open equitable access to it.

The cost to government is bound to be an issue. It would be better not to begin our project by advocating the provision for all citizens of subscriptions to the opera. The most efficient way to provide access is probably through the media. Generally the best medium for access to music is radio, although that may be overtaken very soon by other systems that deliver the music the listener wants to hear when s/he wants to hear it.

If radio stations are broadcasting, anyone with a radio can listen. Access is in that sense not a problem. But if the stations are not, collectively, broadcasting a musically diverse program, then access is not the problem. What can governments do to ensure that the programming meets the interests of the entire audience? Presumably those interests would be very broad.

There are two possibilities.

The first is the regulation of the commercial broadcasting sector. The points at which the government can introduce its powers to regulate are these:

Governments license broadcasters to use broadcasting spectrum, which is a scarce natural resource. If there were no such licensing, anyone could broadcast on any piece of spectrum they wished, changing from hour to hour. Listeners might have no consistent way of finding their preferred stations. The most powerful transmitter would dominate. Government licensing imposes order on that chaos, to the benefit of a no doubt grateful industry.

In return, it can set conditions. A piece of the spectrum can be granted to a broadcaster on the condition that it conforms to various regulations including, if the government so wishes, programming regulations. These might be that it broadcasts a world music format. This broadcaster would be less grateful, because the financial prize of the international top 40 has been withheld. But the public has access to a diversity that otherwise probably would not have been available.

The government can also have as a requirement that broadcasters assign a specified minimum of broadcast time to local music, however that may be defined and measured. Such a regulation is intended to counter the stations' contrary tendency

¹³⁰ See page 53 - www.minedu.govt.nz/web/downloadable/dl3519_v1/thearts.pdf

to broadcast only imported music, usually but not necessarily of one genre or another of popular music. As we saw in 4.2.1, this type of regulation is widespread although often more on the page than in the enforcement. It has been counted successful in Australia, Canada and France, probably among others, and those regulatory regimes can be accessed on the website of the respective authorities. (In Australia, the industry is self-regulatory and the protocols can be inspected on the website of Commercial Radio Australia or as relayed by the Music Council of Australia.¹³¹)

In those countries that have a community radio sector, licences can be granted on a similar basis. Usually, community radio stations are small, with limited funds and dependent on volunteers. There is no point in them attempting to compete with highly resourced, high powered commercial pop stations. So they find other niches in the broadcast ecology. If the niches are about music, they could support young local players or musical genres with small, specialised audiences.

The regulations need to stipulate that the targeted content is broadcast at times when it is convenient for people to hear it.

(As an aside, it might be noted that the community stations in some countries depend upon listener subscriptions to sustain them. While the commercial stations blow in the wind of audience ratings and the support of advertisers, we might consider the anomaly that the community stations are in a sense even more commercially vulnerable. Their subscribers are paying for a service that delivers them the music they want to hear, but they can still listen to the station free of charge if not sufficiently enthused. Even community stations are pressed to please their listeners and to expand their number. And we know what attempting to expand the number can lead to. These vagaries can be settled to a degree by a firm regulatory regime.)

The second way that governments can ensure access to musical diversity through the broadcast system is through the operation of public radio stations. Through the legislation that establishes or regulates these stations, they can define program policies and responsibilities. These could include a requirement to broadcast local music, or to serve the musical interests of named communities, or to broadcast specific other musical styles or a diversity of musical styles. (There could be requirements also that preclude various types of program content.) Any of these things is possible, subject to the political situation. In which, of course, the proponents of musically diverse programming can be vigorous participants.

As noted already, public broadcasters in democracies are routinely faced with the dilemma of needing to demonstrate that they are serving the entire populace by achieving high ratings, or needing to demonstrate that they are not simply replicating the services of the commercial sector, by presenting distinctive programs but so getting lower ratings. Our informant from public radio in Scandinavia reported that in pursuit of ratings it had borrowed from commercial radio a sort of 'format' programming that had reduced its program diversity. If such a broadcaster is able still to demonstrate that it is meeting the requirements of its legislation, then the forces for diversity would have to persuade the government to change the legislation. If it is not meeting the legislative requirements, the diversity lobby must persuade the government to enforce them.

¹³¹ http://203.98.79.137/fileadmin/user_upload/PDFs/CODE4-PP8-12.pdf

There are other ways that governments can broaden access. They can subsidise activities that contribute to musical diversity, so enabling activities that because of lack of resources otherwise could not have taken place, or making it possible to reduce ticket prices to a level that the audience can afford. It can support touring that takes musically diverse performances to distant communities that otherwise could not see/hear them. These are common activities for governments that have sufficient financial resources and policies that are friendly to music.

The problem is with governments that have sufficient financial resources and are unfriendly to music. Another job for advocacy.

7.2.6 The challenge of evaluation of the effectiveness of measures taken by governments in support of music and musical diversity

We need to know what works. There is expertise in evaluation that governments could apply in this area.

If the International Music Council or UNESCO could serve as a repository for such information, it could be publicised and made available to entities that are becoming active in this cause. Possibly, there could be a partnership with the International Federation of Arts Councils and Cultural Agencies (IFACCA).¹³² It is the intention of the IMC to establish itself as an international music development agency. If it were successful in this, it would be well placed to take such a role.

As a further development, it would assist if one or other of these organisations were available to give expert advice and consultation.

7.2.7 The challenge of mounting adequate research into the factual situation concerning musical diversity

This challenge does not necessarily fall only to governments, but their direct involvement in research or financial support to research in the non-government or private sectors would be of great assistance.

The European consultants make an extended argument for the need for such research, beginning with a definition of terms, even terms as basic as 'musical diversity.'

There is a need for

- a proper definition of musical diversity
- operational criteria for measurement and comparison of musical diversity
- regular iterative analyses of the status of musical diversity
- objective criteria for reports respectively independent reporters

They complain that government documents on musical diversity tend to discuss how things ought to be rather than to present the facts on the ground. The argument can be read at greater length in Appendix 14.

The Europeans make the interesting observation, already quoted in part, that 'Music as a medium of creation and representation of identity underlies constant and radical changes by globalisation, migration and progressing medialisation. Identities are constantly challenged, negotiated, mixed or defined in a new way.'

¹³² <http://www.ifacca.org/ifacca2/en/default.asp>

'This constant change calls for constant reports and research, otherwise the danger is increasing, that political or economic instruments and measures outdate and stay behind current developments.'

There is a need for statistics and statistical analysis. The Europeans say that the available statistics tend to serve the needs of the commercial sector – e.g. value and number of sales, number of employees – and bypass categories in non-commercial practice.

A member of the International Music Council says that because the statistics in the commercial sector are indeed intended to serve its needs, they are notoriously unreliable. That may be. The author has some experience in the collection of statistics for the music sector, and has seen that much depends on methodology and sources and that great variations in statistical outcomes can be innocently generated. Certainty would be comforting but in the real world, we sometimes have to settle for illustrations or approximations.

The author has participated in the production of a very broad statistical framework for the music sector.¹³³

7.3 International sphere

7.3.1 The challenge of sustaining local musics in the face of the incursions of international free trade agreements

The move to the global liberalisation of trade is powerful. It has powerful protagonists, most notably for our purposes, the United States, and they have created powerful global institutions such as the World Trade Organisation and the World Intellectual Property Organisation.

A basic tenet of the free traders is the principle of comparative advantage: it is to our benefit to clear the way for the nation that can *most efficiently* produce a good or service, to trade freely and to dominate the global market in that category of trade.

So at the moment, we in the west are mostly wearing clothing and footwear made in China, where a combination of low labour costs, improving technology and an artificially fixed currency are giving it a comparative advantage. Collectively we watch more films from the USA than anywhere else, not necessarily because it is more efficient in producing them but because costs can be recovered from a large and inward looking market, it is skilled in appealing to mass taste and it has enormous marketing expertise and power.

It is one thing to send the manufacture of shirts offshore. Without looking at the label, one would not necessarily know whether one's shirt was made in China, Spain or Egypt. To other than steak tragics, a T-bone steak tastes fairly much the same whether it comes from Argentina or Texas.

Culture is another matter. Under the principle of comparative advantage, the Western world's film production should simply be handed over to the Americans. But actually, we all want our own films. We want to be able to see ourselves reflected on the screen. We want to tell our own stories. And we want our own music. (Or some of us do. It's not quite as clear with music because we so long ago capitulated to the

¹³³ http://www.dcita.gov.au/swg/publications/Music_Sector_Report_April_2005.pdf

USA. When I was a child in Australia, virtually the entire 'hit parade' was American. We only in recent times clawed our way back from that.)

The French would not be interested in contracting to the Americans the production of French films or the composition of French symphonies. The concept is absurd. You cannot *pay* a foreign country to develop your own culture.

In television production, the US recoups its considerable production costs from the domestic market and then can sell the programs overseas for whatever they will bring. Australian television stations can rent a high rating US TV series for roughly 15% of the costs of making a local production to fill the same hour. What is a poor television proprietor to do? Around 70% of the drama shown on Australian free to air television comes from the USA. (According to a source that the PI has not substantiated, about 4% of the entire free to air television programs in the US come from foreign sources.)

The reason that only 70% of Australian drama programs come from the US is that some come from the UK, but more importantly, that the government imposed local content quotas on the television stations, as on the radio stations. The intention is to reserve a part of the market for Australian productions, Australian culture.

However, in the negotiations for the free trade agreement between Australia and the USA, the US attempted to force the Australian government to abandon the local content quotas. It probably would have complied were it not for a loud public advocacy campaign by the film and music industries.¹³⁴

The global response to this issue over more than a decade has been an increasing resistance to allowing the culture of one country to be shaped by the trade ambitions of another. The French coined the concept of the cultural exception – the carving out

¹³⁴ The Australian government had earlier demonstrated that it knew very well the economically marginal circumstances of an Australian culture totally exposed to 'free trade'. In the context of GATS negotiations and before it began negotiation of a free trade agreement with the USA, it articulated a policy which argued the necessity for its intervention in support of Australian culture:

Australia has long recognised the essential role of creative artists and cultural organisations in reflecting the intrinsic values and characteristics of our society, and is committed to sustaining our cultural policy objectives with the context of multilateral trade negotiations...

As reflected in the proposals, there are factors which distinguish cultural goods and services from other goods and services. Cultural activities make a unique contribution to the social, economic and political fabric of any country.

Market forces alone are rarely sufficient to allow cultural organisations and individuals to be fully self-supporting. This is true for the cultural sector worldwide, but in Australia's demographic and geographic circumstances it is particularly the case... The important mix of subsidy, regulation and tax concessions ...(is) a necessary subvention in the national interest to sustain Australian creative resources... (Australian Intervention on Negotiating Proposal on Audiovisual Services, CTS Special Session, Geneva, July 2001)

It has adhered to this position in the GATS negotiations and made no offers concerning culture.

However, this position was abandoned under pressure in the bilateral agreement struck with the USA. The deal was: if you want us to give way on agriculture, you have to give way on 'entertainment'. Given the dominating position of the US in the world cultural market, agreements to surrender cultural sovereignty to the US are so pervasive that it may almost be irrelevant that this sovereignty is not (yet) threatened under GATS.

of culture from all free trade negotiations. This resistance was in due course formalised through firstly the *UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity* and then in 2005, to the adoption of the *UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions*.

A Latin American example of the unease of the cultural sector with free trade agreements:

'Miguel Necochea exposes that the North America Free Trade Agreement (Canada, United States and Mexico) has seriously damaged Mexican culture, because of the economic superiority of the USA and Canada and also because the Mexican government, in order to reach a range of competition with them, agreed to transfer to unclear and confusing clauses the obligation to establish cultural policies, taking them out from their natural social environment and placing them in the balance of capital and private commerce.'¹³⁵

While 'transparency' is a ubiquitous requirement of free trade agreements, ironically one of the great difficulties is that the language is in the hands of experts who are as likely to use it to conceal as reveal.

It should be noted that at the moment, the greatest risk to culture is in the bilateral (cf. multilateral) agreements, notably those in which the USA is one of the parties. The risk results not only from the fact that the US is a party, but also because these usually are 'negative list' agreements: every aspect of trade between the parties is covered and must conform to the free trade requirements excepting those that are specifically excluded.

The great difficulty with negative list agreements is that at the time of negotiation all future possibilities must be envisioned and allowed for. This is impossible.

As an embarrassing example, Australia and New Zealand have a negative list agreement. This has an exclusion allowing Australia to impose local content quotas on television. Some years after the agreement was concluded, New Zealand television program producers brought a legal case against the Australian government claiming that under the agreement, their productions should be classified as 'Australian' and therefore could be programmed to fulfil Australian content requirements. They won. So New Zealand productions not only are eligible for the time not reserved for Australian content, they are able to move into the main bedroom, share the bed with the Australian householders and take up television time that was reserved for Australian productions. Since the productions come from New Zealand, this has not been an overwhelming problem. But imagine if this were the unanticipated result of a negative list FTA with the United States!

The response to the tale might be that if the drafters of the agreement had been more astute, the problem would not have arisen. That may be the case, but the more general issue is that no drafter can have the prescience to anticipate the cultural changes that will follow upon new technologies. Who even three or four years ago would have anticipated that mobile (cell) phone ringtones would be a major source of revenue for the music industry?

¹³⁵ (Complete reference in: México en la Cultura: A diez años del Tratado de Libre Comercio de América del Norte. Miguel Necochea. Representante de la Asociación Mexicana de Productores Independientes y de la Coalición para la Diversidad Cultural de México. <http://www.artv.art.br/cenal/internacional19.htm>)

The Europeans offer a quote from a paper by Verena Weidemann, concerning the position of the EU with regard to the treatment of culture under the WTO.

'The European Union and its member states consider cultural goods and services to be unlike any other commodities, because of the fact, that they play a unique role in their societies for cultural identity and diversity. The Community and its member states have developed a great number of measures and policies protecting and promoting its national and local cultures and the diversity of cultural expressions (s. Section 4). Thus the EU is against trade liberalisation in the cultural sector, because such liberalisation would endanger cultural diversity, which is crucial for the European identity.

'The EU argues against the WTO negotiations, that the European markets are open and its policies in the cultural sector and in the audiovisual services in particular are not protectionist. The Community is pointing at the high market share of US audiovisual productions in Europe. In 2000, the overall market share of US audiovisual programmes on European TV channels amounted to 69%. In the same year, the EU trade deficit with the United States in the audiovisual sector amounted to 8.2 billion US \$. This evidences that the lack of liberalisation commitments of the Community under GATS does not represent a market barrier for foreign audiovisual service suppliers in Europe.

'If the liberalisation in the cultural sector would be enforced, following limitations of the nation's rights to promote local and national culture sector would arise:

1. Because of the Most Favoured Nation clause of the GATS all EU subsidy programs for the inner European cooperation in culture and the promotion of European cultural products would become meaningless.
2. The National Treatment Principle would force national quota regulations (e.g. in France) to be dropped.
3. The Subsidies Clause, if adopted, might lead to the extinction of public service broadcasters as such, since they might be considered as distorting trade in services.
4. Once European regulations of the audio-visual media will be subject to the test of transparency and proportionality of domestic regulation in the GATS, all regulations, including measures safeguarding media pluralism would in principle be subject to the scrutiny of a GATS dispute settlement body.

'The European Community is also against the proposal brought up by the United States at the present round of the WTO trade negotiations to liberalise all new audiovisual services delivered on-demand as well as all multimedia content delivered over the Internet. This approach would make all EU regulatory frameworks for culture irrelevant, since in a few years all audiovisual services will be produced in digital and delivered electronically on-demand. The Community insists on the principle of technological neutrality, which means that the technology used to transmit an audiovisual programme does not make any difference with respect to the content and the rules governing this content. [As noted already, this does not solve the problem where old regulations do not fit new media.]

'The European Community will make no liberalisation commitments on audiovisual services in the present WTO round. The Commission has recently confirmed this view explicitly in a public statement.

'On the other side, the EU Community law prohibits any state aid (subsidies), unless they can be justified, for example, if they serve to provide services of general interest, such as public service broadcasting. This legal framework routinely invites commercial media companies to challenge the activities and the financing of public service broadcasters on European level. Consequently, there is a growing case law on the decisions of the European Commission scrutinising the funding schemes of public service broadcasters in the Member States, and, lately, a tendency by the Commission to limit the activities of public service broadcasters, in particular in the new on-demand media. The Commission's increasingly critical approach to public service broadcasting in the digital environment reflects its general emphasis on free markets in the information and communication sectors (ICT), an emphasis also evident in the decision taken by the Barroso Commission in late 2004 to deal with media policy issues in the context of the Communities ICT policies instead of, as had been the case in the past, in the context of the Community's cultural policies.'¹³⁶

We do not have any submission of corresponding detail from another region of the globe but it is worth noting the perspective from another culture:

Congo: 'The laws of the WTO which preach the free exchange can be an obstacle for the blooming of the local musics because they do not always benefit from the same conditions and infrastructures as those of the Western countries. One therefore notes the domination of the music of the rich countries over that of the developing countries.'

7.3.1.1 The possible responses to the threats to musical diversity from international trade agreements.

- a) The country should ratify the *UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* and so secure whatever protection that agreement may ultimately be shown to offer. The main possible protection is the maintenance of 'cultural sovereignty' – a government's right to give preferential support to its own culture over the cultural product of the partner(s) in the agreement.
- b) With regard to these agreements, argue for the adoption of positive list agreements rather than negative list. GATS agreements are positive list. GATT agreements are negative list. Most bilateral agreements are negative list. Under a positive list, only those activities that are specified in an agreement are included. As already explained, under a negative list, only those activities that are specified are excluded and everything else is included; in the cultural domain, this could be disastrous.
- c) The country should adopt a policy for a total cultural carve-out. This would then include the following specific provisions, but failing a complete carve-out or in pursuit of further clarity, they can also be undertaken separately.
- d) A country should reserve the right to support its culture in any specific ways it wishes, including by subsidy or regulation, subject to observance of the international conventions for the protection of human and cultural rights.

¹³⁶ Dr. Verena Wiedemann, LL.M., Brussels, *What the UNESCO Convention for Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions means for the media*. To be published, but not yet, in a book edited by Joost Smiers.

- e) Establish local music content quotas for broadcast media.
- f) Establish provisions to ensure an adequate presence of local content on new media.. Content quotas may be inappropriate to the medium. In that case, requirements for production expenditure may be appropriate. Requirements for 'shelf-space' may be appropriate. For media as yet uninvented, provisions are likewise.
- g) Keep cultural content out of any agreement about e-commerce.
- h) It is not suggested that local content quotas should be so high as to block access to a good representation of the world's music. The picture is that, for instance, a percentage of radio broadcast time is reserved for local music, with the remainder available to music from anywhere. This is in principle the best construction. However, on the evidence, the available time will be dominated by the most powerful international traders. The outcome could be a choice only between the local music and, for instance, US music. It may be appropriate, although we do not know of any country that has done this, and in any case discussion is needed, to limit the percentage of broadcast time allotted to the music of any one foreign country or to introduce measures to encourage the use of a diversity of cultural sources.
- i) A country should not agree to give national treatment in the cultural area to co-signatories of trade agreements. Similarly, it should not agree to give most favoured national treatment.
- j) A country should exclude all operations of its national broadcasters from international free trade agreements.
- k) A country should take extreme care and ensure expert analysis and advice before entering into any undertaking concerning intellectual property law or regulation as applied to cultural content in the context of a general free trade agreement.
- l) A country should retain the right to regulate or exclude foreigners from ownership of cultural entities such as media outlets.
- m) A country should not agree to allow foreign corporations (as distinct from foreign governments) to take legal action against it for alleged breaches of a free trade agreement.

Our Latin American consultants have some other specific propositions especially for their own region:

1. 'To create free trade agreements with the European Community and with countries of other continents, to avoid a single cultural and powerful influence: that of the United States.
2. 'A plebiscite must be demanded by governments before they sign a Free Trade Agreement. Concerning music, national music councils and international organizations belonging to IMC/UNESCO would be interested in propagating the information about its status to musical, artistic, and intellectual communities, and to general public.
3. 'To extract from or not include in Free Trade Agreements the clauses concerning culture and copyright. The reason why they shouldn't be included is because "Culture" - as it is treated by markets and free trade agreements and when there is an unequal development among member countries - becomes advantageous to

the interests of the rich parties, which impose their dominance. Therefore, the challenge is to repair mistakes from the past and avoid their repetition.'

The consultants suggest possible bases for political action to achieve such objectives – one based upon national coalitions:

'Consolidation and action of diverse national coalitions might be an effective method to overcome obstacles and challenges established in free commercial trade.

'Chile is the single country which has introduced exception clauses or cultural reservations in its commercial agreements. *"In the Free Trade Agreement [...] we signed cultural exception and reserve clauses in order to preserve the cultural industry and maintain autonomous development based on a strong identity"*.'¹³⁷

-- and the other proposing a single Latin American coalition:

'That might be a civil victory over unfair clauses favouring owners of the global economic power. Society could establish a single Latin-American Coalition for the Protection of Cultural Diversity and Copyright –included in free commerce trades– putting pressure on governments to exclude popular culture from negotiation.'

Our Congolese consultant takes a sunny view of the UNESCO Convention: 'All these obstacles can be surmounted with the implementation of the convention on the protection and the promotion of the diversity of the cultural expressions. For this reason it is necessary to fight so that the various States of the sub-region ratify it as soon as possible.' We agree about the need for early ratification and hope that the Convention can withstand the submarine attacks that are bound to follow.

7.3.2 Challenge of the use of the UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions to repress rather the protect and promote musical diversity.

Some persons have expressed concern that their governments, on a superficial reading of the Convention's authorisation of their 'cultural sovereignty', and ignoring its requirements to act only within the constraints of the international conventions for the protection of human and cultural rights, will use the Convention to repress cultural diversity within their borders.

One can foresee an inherent difficulty in making an effective challenge to such use of the Convention. The Convention itself allows only for the arbitration of disputes between signatory governments, but it seems unlikely that one government will challenge another for such a breach of the Convention. It may be seen as appropriate to mount a challenge when the actions of the challenged government affect the circumstances of the complainant government. In this case, however, the aggrieved parties are the offending government's own citizens and there is no legal recourse provided to them under the Convention. For another government to bring a complaint in those circumstances could be seen as interfering in the internal affairs of the offending country.

¹³⁷ América Latina: Cuánto vale la cultura. Diego Cevallos. Internet Press Service New Agency (IPS) – <http://ipsnoticias.net/interna.asp?idnews=31160> Editor's note: while the Chilean agreement does include such reservations, it appears that it has not achieved protection in areas such as cultural content in new media and e-commerce.

No easy solution has manifested itself. It perhaps could be possible to amend the Convention to allow consideration of complaints from any parties including citizens. However, if that were the nature of the Convention, the governments most likely to offend would be least likely to ratify it.

7.3.3 The challenge to encourage the free cross-border flow of musics from other countries and cultures

This seems not to be a very great challenge, although for some countries it apparently would be a problem. China, for instance, seems to allow a free flow of music across its border but it admits only a very small number of foreign films each year.

The main problem, already referred to, is that if the multinational recording industry finds that it is profitable to export to a country, its products will very likely dominate the free flow and the end result may not include very much musical diversity.

Indonesia: 'Importation of music from developing countries may stimulate fresh ideas among musicians, as long as it does not interfere and dominate the local ideas. The foreign and local ideas should be given chance to interact in the minds of musicians and audiences so that they may result in the formation of new ideas based on the "contradictory concepts." There will be serious problems if other countries like USA, now it does not seem to happen in Indonesia, take out the whole market because we cannot compete with the capitalist culture. Even if the ideas from USA like the use of idioms and techniques – such as in "rock music" – seems strong but it is still minor to Indonesian culture. Thus, to let USA music come in and at the same time make room for other countries music, if that should happen, is not an easy problem to solve. We have to think more in terms of what should we do to adopt the "proper" ideas and to ignore the "improper" ones.'

Nevertheless, says our consultant, who always thinks first of musical integrity: 'Free exchange of music across borders should be done to provide more perspectives of the format of other musical styles. Without pretending to penetrate and "teach" local musicians this method will give chance to the musicians to form thoughts that may be useful in the development of creative process among them. The introduction of other "contradictory" styles (the style that is really foreign such as "rock music" for indigenous people) to the local styles may also be beneficial to form "musical constructs" with proper values that can benefit to the life of the people and communities. In sum, we should let local people to develop imagination based on their own creation, not from other perspectives and traditions.'

From *Europe*, some thoughts along similar lines: 'Intergovernmental cooperation in the field of music shows a lingering emphasis on the styles, institutions and composers of the 19th century. When forms of cooperation are analysed, it becomes visible that there remains an import/export mentality towards music in many countries, with the inclusion of many events that are purely about the transference of national image rather than the exploration involved in true collaboration. Where cooperation can be seen to be most stimulated by governmental policy is in the area of youth schemes and events'.

Here are some other views of the related issues as observed by our consultants.

Morocco and the Arab world: 'Certain countries, like Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia and Egypt, are aware of the vital role music can play politically, economically, artistically or culturally, whether for tourism – through festivals – or in the field of musical and cinematographic operations – in particular in Egypt. For all those countries, musical diversity is more or less desired, and moreover they seem to be in favour of free

trade of music beyond their borders; these governments would encourage the import of music from developing countries and local participation can be envisaged in musical genres which are internationally viable as far as popular and Western classical music is concerned. It is even possible that these countries might contribute to the International Fund for Cultural Diversity.'

So governments can *allow* a free flow across borders, or they can actively *assist* it.

Algeria: Apart from the Panafrican Festival which Algeria organised and hosted in 1969, and the year of Algeria in France in 2003, no action was undertaken by the State with regard to the free exchange of music across borders.

Governments can allow music in, or send it out.

Vietnam:

- We send teachers of Vietnamese traditional music to teach in conservatories of some countries such as Thailand, Laos, Sweden.
- I [the Vietnamese consultant] have presented the traditional music of Vietnam's ethnic groups in some international musical workshops held in Thailand, Japan, Southern Korea, China, Cambodia, Laos, Philippines, India, USA and mainly held by ICM, ICTM, APSE (Asian-Pacific Society for Ethnomusicologists) and participated in long term (1989-1997) Music Program held by the ACCU (Asian-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO-Japan)
- Now Vietnam's Government subsidises the "Comparing Musical Program" between Vietnam and Laos for collection, comparing studies on traditional musics of ethnic minorities living on each side of the borders of our two countries.

Morocco would like 'To create international forums and meetings of all cultures of the world, with a view to communicating and to exploiting the knowledge about protection and the enhancement of folklore (music, song and choreographic dance), taking as an example the Festival des cultures du monde (festival of the cultures of the world) in Gannan, France, or by asking advice from the CIOFF (International council of the organisation of folklore festivals)

'To organise artistic and technical training courses abroad and music workshops with national and foreign musicians.'

Latin America wants regional cooperation: 'The States ratifying the Convention must establish programs to increase and improve the traditional music knowledge and the actual artistic production. The objective would be the diffusion of this diverse music through media communication, scholarly programs and international Latin American artists' interchange. In that way new generations would have more access to the knowledge of musical diversity and youth would be stimulated to participate in their region.'

Here is the state of play in *Europe*:

'France, the UK, Germany, the Netherlands and Italy are the main generators of collaborative events, whereas most countries in Eastern and Central and some in Western Europe are net receivers of events, "cultural cooperation" being often understood there as hosting the presentation of foreign works and companies. Governments often count as action under their cultural agreements appearances, festivals and productions that would probably happen in any case. Formal exchanges under bilateral cultural cooperation agreements are going out of fashion. While the agreements may still be in force, the use made of them directly by governments is moderate, compared to the general volume of internationally driven activity.'

Increasingly the real impetus comes from devolved agencies, networks or individual promoters.

'As the system becomes inevitably more multilateral in its operations, professional networks will increasingly become the most effective deliverers of activity. It is therefore in the interest of governments to use the networks to forge mutually-beneficial partnerships, even where there is no direct national link. This can be done both through direct support (whether at national or EU level) and by enabling their own music organisations to participate and to contribute a realistic sum to working costs.

'Although cooperation among professional music training institutions is one dynamic area, with a particularly strong development in some regions such as the Baltic countries, the individual character of the training and the long developmental process which are vital characteristics of professional music training complicate a more active approach to European cooperation in this field. It would be important for governments to realise that new music and new ways of presenting music and imaginative programming that takes musical life beyond the routine and the expected will pay greater dividends to both audiences and governments.¹³⁸

Europe proposes some cross-border cooperation in music education:

'A project which monitors music education in Europe would be very advisable to get a better overview of the status, the shortages and lacks as well as the possibility to constitute a platform for exchange, and support the coordination of initiatives in music education on a European level. *As we know, a project like this is already planned by the EAS – Europäische Arbeitsgemeinschaft für Schulmusik (European Association for Music in Schools).*¹³⁹

From *Australia*, some thoughts about how governments could assist the musicians of developing countries: 'Governments could search for ways to support the importation of music and musicians from developing countries. They could consider actions such as facilitation of the provision of temporary work visas, subsidies to presenting organisations, subsidies for the provision of recordings to broadcasters with an interest in programming these genres, cultural exchange programs and agreements, study grants for nationals of developing countries (these obviously would not be for study in Australia of their own music, but might cover issues such as copyright or small business management).'

7.3.4 A brief proposal for a global agency for musical diversity

There is in this report much good information from its consultants. However, as we reach the final pages, it has to be said that in global terms we have some idea of the issues but that our knowledge of the circumstances for musical diversity are still very limited.

The big concern is the situation with traditional musics, and especially the endangered musics. As a basis for priorities for action, it would be very valuable to have the following:

- an inventory of the traditional musics and their circumstances
- identification of those musics regarded as endangered

¹³⁸ (Source: Report on the state of cultural cooperation in Europe von EFAH/FEAP, 3.10.03)

¹³⁹ <http://www.eas-music.net>

- an inventory of the nature and extent of the documentation of traditional musics, with special attention to those that are considered to be endangered
- an assessment of the accessibility of this documentation to those who would utilise it to strengthen the situation of the musics
- a record of the detail of successful strategies used to restore traditional musics to daily life
- details of the consequences for those musics: How have they changed? What role do they play in daily life? Who are the participants? What are the financial circumstances? And so on.

Ideally, this information would either be collected by or available to an agency which then could directly initiate, and/or support others in initiating, projects to 'rescue' and 'restore' traditional musics.

The International Music Council is interested in playing such a role and sees itself well-positioned to do so.

There may be other interested organisations. It should be noted that the European consultants proposed (see Appendix 14) the establishment of an observatory and research organisation somewhat along these lines for Europe.

Appendix 1

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

TERMS OF REFERENCE

APPENDIX 1

TERMS OF REFERENCE

The Terms of Reference set forth by UNESCO were these:

In the framework of UNESCO's efforts in favour of the promotion of cultural diversity and with a view to publishing a report on the state of cultural diversity in the world, it is necessary to undertake a study on cultural diversity in the field of music.

The study will be based on cultural experiences marked by musical diversity, which may serve as models of integration in the context of a space for dialogue between the different components of a particular society while encouraging exchanges with the rest of the world.

More specifically, the study will analyse:

- the complementarity or reciprocity between the protection of musical diversity and that of human rights;
- the links between musical diversity, sustainable development (e.g., the relationship between culture and the economy, the fight against poverty) and peace (exploiting diversity for political ends);
- the standards regulating musical diversity;
- the tendency to favour a uniform and non-pluralistic interpretation of the notion of identity hindering the manifold and free expression of cultural diversity;
- the manner in which diversity is addressed by cultural actors and expressed in various forms of musical creation, and its relationship to identity;
- the obstacles or challenges to be overcome in order to ensure better protection and promotion of musical diversity;
- bringing to light those good practices and actions that need to be strengthened and widely practiced in this field.

Appendix 2

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

ELABORATION OF THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

APPENDIX 2

EXPLICATION OF THE TERMS OF REFERENCE, AS PROVIDED TO THE CONSULTANTS TO THE STUDY

It was though desirable to offer an interpretation of the Terms of Reference and to specify issues to be addressed under each one. The seven terms of reference were expanded to eight by dividing the second into two: the links between musical diversity and sustainable development, and between musical diversity and peace. Consultants were free to link all three.

The explication as shown here was devised for consultants who would provide information about an entire region. In the event, some consultants were engaged to report only on one country and they received an appropriately modified document.

Consultants were informed that their 'task is for the most part to provide examples from within your region of the various phenomena listed below.'

1. The complementarity or reciprocity between the protection of musical diversity and that of human rights

- Cite examples where music expression or music diversity have been repressed by direct action of government or action by others directed by government, or by others acting to pre-empt direction by government.
- In the countries where there is such repression of musical expression or diversity, are there other notable breaches of human rights?

2. The links between musical diversity and economic development and the fight against poverty

- Cite examples of the use of music to assist in non-music economic development.
- Cite examples of government or agency action to develop aspects of the music industry or the music industry as a whole
- Cite examples of the use of music to alleviate poverty or the conditions contributing to poverty.

3. The links between musical diversity and the promotion of peace

- Cite examples of the use of musical diversity to promote peace.
- Can you cite instances where musical diversity has caused or been strongly associated with social disharmony?

4. The standards regulating musical diversity

- Cite examples of government or government-induced regulations intended to promote musical diversity or freedom of musical expressions OR to limit them. Refer to the fields shown below. In each case, if possible, give briefly the rationale for the regulation. In each case, are the regulations enforced?
 - Broadcasting. For instance, are there examples of the use of regulations to require the broadcast of local music, or regulations to require the broadcast of some forms of music but not others, or regulations to prohibit the broadcast of some forms of music?
 - New media. Are there parallel requirements in the regulation of new media that would favour or disfavour some forms of music? (New media: for instance, the internet.)

- E-commerce. Are there parallel requirements in the regulation of e-commerce that would favour or disfavour some forms of music? (E-commerce in music: trade in music digitally embodied or delivered. Overlaps with new media.)
 - Education. Are there regulations requiring education in local music traditions, or in a diversity of musical genres?
 - Subsidy. Are there regulations that require that government subsidy should be given to, or withheld from specific musical genres, or to a diversity of musical genres? Are there regulations that require that government subsidy can only be given to citizens of the particular country, or regulations along those lines? Are there regulations that require that all applicants for subsidy must be considered equally, whether citizens or foreigners? Or are there variants on any of the above?
 - Other. Are there similar regulations in areas of activity not mentioned above?
- What is the situation of copyright law in the countries in this region? Has it been enacted? Is it enforced?

5. The tendency to favour a uniform and non-pluralistic interpretation of the notion of identity hindering the manifold and free expression of cultural diversity

- Cite examples of government promulgation of a single musical or cultural identity and any associated constraint on other musical or cultural identities.
- Cite examples of similar promulgation by the citizenry or sections of the citizenry.
- Does it appear that in your region there are some states that are less likely to ratify the UNESCO Convention for cultural diversity if issues of internal cultural diversity or open cultural borders are pressed?

6. The manner in which musical diversity is addressed by music workers and expressed in various forms of musical creation; the relationship to identity

- Cite examples of cultures in which musicians and/or the various participants in the music business (producers, presenters, record companies etc) are interested in musical diversity – in the sense of the simultaneous practice or presentation within a society of many forms of music.
- Cite examples where they are averse to musical diversity.
- Cite examples where they support, or weaken, the practice of local traditional or indigenous music.
- Cite examples where they are interested in developing hybrid musical forms – e.g. music that combines two or more ethnic musical genres, or combines an ethnic music with say, western popular music, or combines various forms of non-ethnic music.
- Cite examples of the expression of personal or community identity through music, and especially through musical diversity.

7. The obstacles or challenges to be overcome in order to ensure better protection and promotion of musical diversity

- On an analysis of the situation as you discover it in responding to previous questions, how would you define these obstacles and challenges, and by what methods do you envision them being overcome?

Consider both the international and national spheres.

International issues include the challenges posed by trade liberalisation agreements. For instance, does a particular agreement limit a country's:

- right to subsidise music production, but not to offer national treatment to foreign applicants -- e.g. provide subsidy only to locally based music producers
- right to fund state music institutions even though this gives them a competitive advantage over foreign providers
- right to fund national broadcasters even though this gives them a competitive advantage over foreign providers -- e.g. when broadcaster does not give national treatment to foreign music producers
- right to limit or direct foreign investment -- e.g. so that the music broadcast industry remains under local control and demonstrates a greater commitment to local music than might a foreign owned industry
- the right to regulate in favour of the local cultural sector.

There are special issues concerning the protection and promotion of traditional musics as the societal contexts from which they arose dissipate or evolve. Challenges include the attitudes of younger generations, the opportunities for musical evolution or innovation, the adequacy and structure of music education, the presence or absence of an economic basis for survival.

These suggestions are intended only as guidance and do not exhaust the possibilities.

8. Bring to light those good practices and actions that need to be strengthened and widely practised in this field.

This will follow from the previous analysis. Please write this section according to your perceptions of the situation. The following ideas are intended only as suggestions.

The study could list the states that actively support musical diversity within their own borders. It might develop a typology of approaches, considering *inter alia* support to musical diversity within the school music education curriculum, in music subsidies, in music broadcasting, in special support to indigenous music, in measures to encourage cultural production by non-profit and for-profit organisations, in support to public cultural institutions and broadcasters?

You might seek examples of initiatives such as these:

- programs to support local at-risk indigenous musics
- state support for local participation in internationally viable genres – e.g. western popular music, western classical music
- state encouragement for free exchange of music across their borders
- state encouragement for importation of music from developing countries

Which states would more actively promote musical diversity were funds available?
Which states intend to or are likely to contribute to the International Fund for Cultural Diversity?

Appendix 3

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

HUMAN CULTURAL RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS

APPENDIX 3

HUMAN CULTURAL RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS

Statements defining and supporting human cultural rights and freedoms are found in a number of important international declarations and agreements. This study may be a good place to bring these together. The following excerpts give a more than adequate rendition of these statements and if any have been omitted, it is unlikely that their addition would add new substance to what is here.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights ¹⁴⁰

This Declaration is the key agreement on human rights. Rights are defined building from the most fundamental, such as the right to life itself, to those upon which cultural rights and freedoms depend. The Articles that are most relevant to the expression of culture are these, most explicitly Article 27.

Article 18

Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion; this right includes freedom to change his religion or belief, and freedom, either alone or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief in teaching, practice, worship and observance.

Article 19

Everyone has the right to freedom of opinion and expression; this right includes freedom to hold opinions without interference and to seek, receive and impart information and ideas through any media and regardless of frontiers.

Article 22

Everyone, as a member of society, has the right to social security and is entitled to realization, through national effort and international co-operation and in accordance with the organization and resources of each State, of the economic, social and cultural rights indispensable for his dignity and the free development of his personality.

Article 27

(1) Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits.

(2) Everyone has the right to the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author.

Other declarations include similar statements, made in differing contexts.

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights) ¹⁴¹

¹⁴⁰ www.un.org/Overview/rights.html

Article 1

All peoples have the right of self-determination. By virtue of that right they freely determine their political status and freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development.

Article 19

1. Everyone shall have the right to hold opinions without interference.
2. Everyone shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of his choice.
3. The exercise of the rights provided for in paragraph 2 of this article carries with it special duties and responsibilities. It may therefore be subject to certain restrictions, but these shall only be such as are provided by law and are necessary:
 - (a) For respect of the rights or reputations of others;
 - (b) For the protection of national security or of public order (ordre public), or of public health or morals.

Convention on the Rights of the Child (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights) ¹⁴²

This Convention states in comprehensive terms the rights of the child to safety, justice, nurture and so on, just as thoroughly as does the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The issue of cultural rights emerges already in the Preamble:

...Taking due account of the importance of the traditions and cultural values of each people for the protection and harmonious development of the child,

The statement of cultural rights is most direct in Articles 31 and 30.

Article 31

1. States Parties recognize the right of the child to rest and leisure, to engage in play and recreational activities appropriate to the age of the child and to participate freely in cultural life and the arts.
2. States Parties shall respect and promote the right of the child to participate fully in cultural and artistic life and shall encourage the provision of appropriate and equal opportunities for cultural, artistic, recreational and leisure activity.

Article 30

In those States in which ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities or persons of indigenous origin exist, a child belonging to such a minority or who is indigenous shall not be denied the right, in community with other members of his or her group, to enjoy his or her own culture, to profess and practise his or her own religion, or to use his or her own language.

¹⁴¹ http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/a_ccpr.htm

¹⁴² <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/k2crc.htm>

There are other articles dealing with cultural rights.

Article 13.1

The child shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of the child's choice.

Article 17

States Parties recognize the important function performed by the mass media and shall ensure that the child has access to information and material from a diversity of national and international sources, especially those aimed at the promotion of his or her social, spiritual and moral well-being and physical and mental health. To this end, States Parties shall:

- (a) Encourage the mass media to disseminate information and material of social and cultural benefit to the child and in accordance with the spirit of article 29;
- (b) Encourage international co-operation in the production, exchange and dissemination of such information and material from a diversity of cultural, national and international sources;
- (c) Encourage the production and dissemination of children's books;
- (d) Encourage the mass media to have particular regard to the linguistic needs of the child who belongs to a minority group or who is indigenous;
- (e) Encourage the development of appropriate guidelines for the protection of the child from information and material injurious to his or her well-being, bearing in mind the provisions of articles 13 and 18.

Article 28.1

States Parties recognize the right of the child to education, and with a view to achieving this right progressively and on the basis of equal opportunity, they shall, in particular:

- (a) Make primary education compulsory and available free to all;
- (b) Encourage the development of different forms of secondary education, including general and vocational education, make them available and accessible to every child, and take appropriate measures such as the introduction of free education and offering financial assistance in case of need;
- (c) Make higher education accessible to all on the basis of capacity by every appropriate means;
- (d) Make educational and vocational information and guidance available and accessible to all children;
- (e) Take measures to encourage regular attendance at schools and the reduction of drop-out rates.

Article 29.1

States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to:

(a) The development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;

(c) The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own;

United Nations International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ¹⁴³

Preamble (excerpt)

Recognizing that, in accordance with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the ideal of free human beings enjoying freedom from fear and want can only be achieved if conditions are created whereby everyone may enjoy his economic, social and cultural rights, as well as his civil and political rights,

Article 3

The States Parties to the present Covenant undertake to ensure the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights set forth in the present Covenant.

Article 6

1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right to work, which includes the right of everyone to the opportunity to gain his living by work which he freely chooses or accepts, and will take appropriate steps to safeguard this right.

2. The steps to be taken by a State Party to the present Covenant to achieve the full realization of this right shall include technical and vocational guidance and training programmes, policies and techniques to achieve steady economic, social and *cultural* development and full and productive employment under conditions safeguarding fundamental political and economic freedoms to the individual.

Article 15

1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone:

(a) To take part in cultural life;

(b) To enjoy the benefits of scientific progress and its applications;

(c) To benefit from the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author.

2. The steps to be taken by the States Parties to the present Covenant to achieve the full realization of this right shall include those necessary for the conservation, the development and the diffusion of science and culture.

3. The States Parties to the present Covenant undertake to respect the freedom indispensable for scientific research and creative activity.

¹⁴³ <http://www.hrcr.org/docs/Economic&Social/intlconv.html>

4. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the benefits to be derived from the encouragement and development of international contacts and co-operation in the scientific and cultural fields.

UNESCO Declaration of the Principles of International Cultural Co-operation (Paris, 1966) ¹⁴⁴

Article I

1. Each culture has a dignity and value which must be respected and preserved.
2. Every people has the right and the duty to develop its culture.
3. In their rich variety and diversity, and in the reciprocal influences they exert on one another, all cultures form part of the common heritage belonging to all mankind.

Article II

Nations shall endeavour to develop the various branches of culture side by side and, as far as possible, simultaneously, so as to establish a harmonious balance between technical progress and the intellectual and moral advancement of mankind.

Article V

Cultural co-operation is a right and a duty for all peoples and all nations, which should share with one another their knowledge and skills.

Article VI

International co-operation, while promoting the enrichment of all cultures through its beneficent action, shall respect the distinctive character of each.

Article X

Cultural co-operation shall be specially concerned with the moral and intellectual education of young people in a spirit of friendship, international understanding and peace and shall foster awareness among States of the need to stimulate talent and promote the training of the rising generations in the most varied sectors.

In recent years, international declarations and now, an agreement or convention, have appeared in support of cultural diversity and cultural sovereignty.

Declaration on Cultural Diversity, Council of Europe, 2000 ¹⁴⁵

Article 1.2

Cultural diversity cannot be expressed without the conditions for free creative expression, and freedom of information existing in all forms of cultural exchange, notably with respect to audiovisual services;

UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity, 2001 ¹⁴⁶

¹⁴⁴ http://www.unesco.org/culture/laws/cooperation/html_eng/page1.shtml

¹⁴⁵ http://www.ebu.ch/CMSimages/en/legal_docs/decl_coe_decl_cultural_diversity_071200_tcm6-4311.pdf

¹⁴⁶ <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001271/127160m.pdf>

The Universal Declaration has been in a sense superseded by the *Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* (below), which takes the principles of the Declaration into a binding international agreement.

UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage 147

Mention is made of this convention because it is relevant to our consideration of musical diversity and has some common purpose with the previous and following documents. It does not deal at any length with human or cultural rights, but does base itself at the outset in the Preamble on human rights instruments.

Referring to existing international human rights instruments, in particular to the Universal Declaration on Human Rights of 1948, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of 1966, and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights of 1966,

Considering the importance of the intangible cultural heritage as a mainspring of cultural diversity and a guarantee of sustainable development, as underscored in the UNESCO Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore of 1989, in the UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity of 2001, and in the Istanbul Declaration of 2002 adopted by the Third Round Table of Ministers of Culture,

Considering the deep-seated interdependence between the intangible cultural heritage and the tangible cultural and natural heritage,

Recognizing that the processes of globalization and social transformation, alongside the conditions they create for renewed dialogue among communities, also give rise, as does the phenomenon of intolerance, to grave threats of deterioration, disappearance and destruction of the intangible cultural heritage, in particular owing to a lack of resources for safeguarding such heritage...

UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions 148

This Convention is the most directly relevant to the purposes of the present study. Its guiding principles link support for cultural diversity to all of the important human and cultural rights and freedoms.

Article 2 – Guiding principles

1. Principle of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms

Cultural diversity can be protected and promoted only if human rights and fundamental freedoms, such as freedom of expression, information and communication, as well as the ability of individuals to choose cultural expressions, are guaranteed. No one may invoke the provisions of this Convention in order to infringe human rights and fundamental freedoms as enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights or guaranteed by international law, or to limit the scope thereof.

¹⁴⁷ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=15782&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁴⁸ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=11281&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

2. Principle of sovereignty

States have, in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations and the principles of international law, the sovereign right to adopt measures and policies to protect and promote the diversity of cultural expressions within their territory.

3. Principle of equal dignity of and respect for all cultures

The protection and promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions presuppose the recognition of equal dignity of and respect for all cultures, including the cultures of persons belonging to minorities and indigenous peoples.

4. Principle of international solidarity and cooperation

International cooperation and solidarity should be aimed at enabling countries, especially developing countries, to create and strengthen their means of cultural expression, including their cultural industries, whether nascent or established, at the local, national and international levels.

5. Principle of the complementarity of economic and cultural aspects of development

Since culture is one of the mainsprings of development, the cultural aspects of development are as important as its economic aspects, which individuals and peoples have the fundamental right to participate in and enjoy.

6. Principle of sustainable development

Cultural diversity is a rich asset for individuals and societies. The protection, promotion and maintenance of cultural diversity are an essential requirement for sustainable development for the benefit of present and future generations.

7. Principle of equitable access

Equitable access to a rich and diversified range of cultural expressions from all over the world and access of cultures to the means of expressions and dissemination constitute important elements for enhancing cultural diversity and encouraging mutual understanding.

8. Principle of openness and balance

When States adopt measures to support the diversity of cultural expressions, they should seek to promote, in an appropriate manner, openness to other cultures of the world and to ensure that these measures are geared to the objectives pursued under the present Convention.

These guiding principles are then explicitly recognised in the Articles that mandate or encourage action, including the most central Article:

Article 5.1

The Parties, in conformity with the Charter of the United Nations, the principles of international law and universally recognized human rights instruments, reaffirm their sovereign right to formulate and implement their cultural policies and to adopt measures to protect and promote the diversity of cultural expressions and to strengthen international cooperation to achieve the purposes of this Convention.

Appendix 4

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

MUSIC IN DEVELOPMENT, MUSIC DEVELOPMENT: A LITERATURE SURVEY

APPENDIX 4

MUSIC IN DEVELOPMENT, MUSIC DEVELOPMENT: A LITERATURE SURVEY

A study by Gould and Marsh looked at 350 examples of development projects in which culture played a part.¹⁴⁹ The authors were able to categorise the use of culture in four ways:

- Culture as context – the wider social environment and setting
- Culture as content – local cultural practices, beliefs and processes
- Culture as method – cultural and creative communication activities, mainly through artistic forms including music
- Culture as expression – creative elements of culture linked to beliefs, attitudes and emotions, ways of engaging the world and imagining the future.

Generally speaking, the issue of culture in development is discussed around a broad definition of culture, such as that published in the *Mexico City Declaration of Cultural Policies* of 1982¹⁵⁰: 'the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterise a social group...not only arts and letters but also modes of life, fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs.'

This study, on the other hand, addresses only the place of one of the art forms, music, in its relationship to development. In a beginning survey of development projects, various relationships were discovered between music and economic development. They range along a continuum. At one end is music as a part of the cultural context (broadly defined) in which economic development takes place (music *in* development); at the other end of the continuum, the development of a music industry contributes receipts directly to overall economic development (music industry development).

The Gould and Marsh typology can be applied to our findings. However, we have categorised the identified projects more directly from the nature of music's role. Also, in accordance with the terms of reference, we mention some projects in which culture and music were turned to the promotion of peace.

Musical diversity and development

The developmental projects so far discovered do not state as a primary interest the utilisation of musical diversity as a force for economic development nor as an important aspect of music industry development, except by implication in that latter case, if the audience sought for the music is a 'world music' audience. However, most of the projects cited below are concerned with the successful use of a local musical genre, and that success strengthens musical diversity as *between* countries but not necessarily *within* them.

Music in development

An economic development program in some aspect of agriculture will take place in a context of existing agricultural practices. It may be that some of those practices are

¹⁴⁹ Gould, H and Marsh, M: Route-mapping Culture and development: a pilot research project for the Department for International Development. London, Department for International Development. www.creativexchange.org/html/projects/cultdev.html

¹⁵⁰ At the World Conference on Cultural Policies, 1982

at odds with proposed innovations. Furthermore, the practices will be embedded in and linked to many aspects of the overall culture. Successful introduction of the innovations may well depend upon appropriate sensitivity to existing agricultural practices and their cultural context.

Insofar as it concerns a move from old agricultural practices to new, the relationship between tradition and innovation is in this example very direct and literal. The development of a music industry will similarly need to address the differences in the means of production and dissemination in old and new practices. But because of their ability to express and communicate, music and other arts are utilised also in strategies for non-musical development. Agriculture is unlikely to support music in the way that music can support agriculture; it is not a symmetrical relationship.

Following are some project descriptions, mostly in the words of or derived from the project reports.

a) Music as a source of funds for non-music development projects

There are projects that collect or produce music performances or recordings and then sell them as a way of funding non-music activities.

The Greenstar project records traditional music and other art forms in small villages and markets the products globally via the internet. The funds support a solar-powered community centre that delivers electricity, pure water, health and education information to villages in the developing world.¹⁵¹ While the objective is non-musical, the means obviously are directly supportive to the music and those who produce it.

b) Music as a tool of advocacy for development

The expressive arts -- such as drama, storytelling, music, and graphic arts -- are used effectively in carrying a message to encourage certain types of knowledge or behaviour: for instance, to educate targeted populations about HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment.

In this instance, they can also be useful as means to promote tolerance and compassion for victims and their families and can help decrease social exclusion and other harmful social effects of HIV. Learning a lesson from the advertising industry, the expressive arts are often more likely to result in behavioural changes than are more formalized or didactic approaches. As a result, they are now employed in development projects of all types. The approach can be executed in a culturally appropriate manner, especially when folk and popular arts and local languages are used. Techniques that use genres such as socio-drama, soap opera, and comics are particularly successful with younger populations, commonly at highest risk for becoming HIV- positive.¹⁵²

The Rage for a Revolution Concert, organized by OppiKoppi, invited South African musicians to perform in Cape Town in an effort to deliver positive messages about awareness and responsibility concerning youth and HIV/AIDS. By inviting a diverse range of musicians to perform at the concert, the organizers sought to unify

¹⁵¹ <http://www.greenstar.org/>

¹⁵²

<http://topics.developmentgateway.org/culture/highlights/viewHighlight.do~docName=bExpressive%20Arts%20brAn%20Effective%20Tool%20for%20HIVAIDS%20Education%20and%20Preventionbr~activeHighlightId=7689>

disparate sub-cultural followings for the common cause of identifying the major social harms affecting youth in South Africa today, and subsequently, addressing those issues using the positive and vibrant rhetoric of music. It is hoped that events such as Rage for the Revolution, will spark a series of open-minded, youth-oriented, socially conscious productions where South African youth will involve themselves directly in their development, and do so in unique and creative ways. The aim is to create an uplifting opportunity for socially aware musicians to identify some of the true enemies to social harmony and development. ¹⁵³

The Story Workshop and Educational Trust uses music and other entertainment in advocacy for human rights, democracy, economic development and other objectives in Malawi. ¹⁵⁴

UVA Community Radio – Sri Lanka was launched by UNESCO and uses low-cost digital radio production technology to enable communities to produce media content that addresses their own development needs. The programming includes music, of course. ¹⁵⁵

c) Music as a lure to involve people in development programs

Concerts attract youth then target them. Population Services International (PSI) is collaborating with MTV Russian on a series of music concerts and a website (www.zhivi.ru) which target youth with drug reduction messages. Music is used as a lure and as a vehicle for conveying the messages. ¹⁵⁶

Music television shows in Gujarat, India, introduced same-language subtitling. Often, illiterate people sing along with TV music programs. The subtitling ran word-for-word with the lyrics, reinforcing the development of literacy skills. ¹⁵⁷

Entra en Accion / Act Now Website take a comprehensive approach to adolescent development by allowing young adults to express themselves online while having fun as they learn about health, sexuality, nutrition, democracy, environmental conservation, drug and alcohol prevention, vocational training, and life skills. ¹⁵⁸

d) Music as an element in non-music development

In many Latin American countries, music is used to boost the tourist industry. In Ecuador, as in many other countries, traditional music is performed in tourist areas. Bolivia is planning to establish *Misiones de Chiquitos* (a city declared Cultural Patrimony of Humanity), a tourist destination, adding a wide artistic and cultural schedule. The International Festival Viña del Mar, Chile, although it privileges commercial music, is established to attract tourism. In México, the *Festival Internacional Cervantino* is a forum open to classic and popular arts, and it is an instrument to attract tourists. In Mexico, the national music is particularly used to

¹⁵³ <http://www.comminit.com/africa/experiences/pds22005/experiences-2994.html>

¹⁵⁴ <http://www.storyworkshop.org/whatwedo.html>

¹⁵⁵ <http://www.unites.org/cfapps/wsis/story.cfm?Sid=28>

¹⁵⁶ <http://www.psi.org/news/0304a.html>

¹⁵⁷

<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/OPPORTUNITIES/GRANTS/DEVMARKETPLACE/0,,contentMDK:20100393~menuPK:214469~pagePK:180691~piPK:174492~theSitePK:205098,00.html>

¹⁵⁸ <http://www.entraenaccion.org/>

promote tourism, and is used in commercial and governmental advertising. República Dominicana's Festival del Merengue ¹⁵⁹ is organized by the Tourism Secretary, and is a plentiful tourist attraction. (See Appendix for Latin America)

In Viet Nam too, there is some use of music by tourist destinations as an attraction in 'cultural ecological tourism'. For example, the traditional chamber music of the former aristocratic sphere now is performed by musicians and singers on the tourism boat flowing on the Parfum River, Hue city, Central Vietnam. The Nha Nhac-former Hue court music is now performed in the former royal hall for tourists. The music called 'Of Amateurs' in the southern area often attracts the tourists.

Development of a music industry

a) Some research studies and theoretical papers

Our focus is on the developing world. There has been research into the circumstances of particular countries or regions, and studies also of more pervasive issues such as the development of the creative industries and its applicability to cultural industries.

Singing All the Way to the Bank: The Case for Economic Development through Music in Cape Verde. This, at the time published, was not a development project but rather, an analysis of the prospects for development of a music industry in the Cape Verde islands, off Senegal. Two views of development: 'According to one view, development is a process of economic growth, a rapid and sustained expansion of production, productivity and income per head... According to the other, espoused by UNDP's annual Human Development Report and by many distinguished economists, development is seen as a process that enhances the effective freedom of the people involved to pursue whatever they have reason to value. (p.10) ¹⁶⁰

The Senegalese music industry: international production chains - Dakar and Paris. This is a research study in two parts. The first funded by the United Nations Commission on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) seeks to explore the contribution of cultural industries to economic development in less developed countries. The project focuses on the music industry in Senegal (home of artists such as Ismael Lo, Baaba Maal, and Youssou N'Dour). The first phase of the work is to compile a report on the nature, structure and organisation of the music industry in Senegal. The second part of the project concerns the role that Paris plays in the francophone world music industry, in particular the Recording/Post-production/Festival aspects of the world music production chain: in short, how music from Senegal reaches a 'world' market. It is hoped to expand the analysis in three directions: the 'African Quarter' as a trans-national music locale in Paris, the difference between the French music system and the UK system, and a comparative analysis of notion of the construction 'world music' in the UK and France. ¹⁶¹

Assuring the autonomy and viability of festivals as a vehicle for local economic and

¹⁵⁹ <http://www.dominicana.com.do/festival-merengue.html>

¹⁶⁰ <http://ideas.repec.org/p/wpa/wuwpdc/0505013.html>

¹⁶¹

<http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/geographyAndEnvironment/whosWho/profiles/pratt/pdf/Senegal.pdf>

social development. New networking initiative.

In the framework of its strategy to strengthen the capacity of cultural actors in developing countries, the Global Alliance is initiating an analysis of the development of a festival and cultural events network in countries of the African, Caribbean and Pacific regions (ACP). In the initial stage, the Global Alliance is identifying the major obstacles in sustaining and professionalizing festivals, mainly dedicated to music, by distributing a preliminary questionnaire in order to devise a coherent pilot project.

The ultimate objective will be to facilitate the collaboration of festivals within the network by offering a better exchange of know-how and relevant skills in order to assure the festivals' autonomy and their viability as a vehicle for local economic and social development. This project is specifically designed in response to the objectives presented by the cultural ministers of the countries in the African, Caribbean and Pacific regions during their first conference in Dakar, Senegal in June 2003.¹⁶²

Copyright-Based Industries in Arab Countries This paper analyzes the economic performance of four key copyright-based industries (book publishing, music sound recording, film production, and software) in five Arab countries (Morocco, Tunisia, Egypt, Jordan, and Lebanon). Using the Porter (Diamond) model as its theoretical background, a survey was conducted in the years 2002-03 among 242 experts, covering firm representatives, industry, and government experts. The results were incorporated into five national case studies. The two major objectives of the study were to estimate the economic importance of copyright-based industries and to understand the factors affecting that performance. The study results suggest that copyright-based industries in Arab countries are substantially underdeveloped, and there remains a great potential that should be systematically mobilized. The author suggests that this can only be achieved through a well-designed and implemented process of upgrading and innovation in companies, industries, and clusters. The author concludes by specifying the role that public policy can play to enhance this process.¹⁶³

Best practice cases in the music industry and their relevance for government policies in developing countries. Roger Wallis and Zelijka Kojul-Wright. This is a most valuable study that looks at a great number of the key issues to be addressed in any music industry development initiative.¹⁶⁴

Creative Industries and Development. The UN Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) published a report on Creative Industries and Development on 4 June 2004. It observes that, because the world's creative industry sector lies at the crossroads between the arts, business and technology, creative industries are forecast to grow, on average, by 10 percent a year. "Creativity, more than labour and capital, or even traditional technologies, is deeply embedded in every country's cultural context" yet sector players, states the Executive Summary, are often marginalized by a "combination of domestic policy weaknesses and global systemic biases." Core creative industries are identified as the recording industry; music and

¹⁶² http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=26597&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁶³

<http://www.gdnet.org/cf/search/display.cfm?search=GDNDOCS&act=DOC&docnum=DOC18718>

¹⁶⁴ http://www.wipo.int/about-ip/en/studies/pdf/study_r_wallis.pdf

theater production; music publishing; motion picture industry; book, journal and newspaper publishing; computer software industry; photography; commercial art; and the radio, television and cable broadcasting industries.¹⁶⁵ The World Bank published an article about the growth of creative industries, based around Richard Florida's observations about a 'creative class'.¹⁶⁶

b) Training the professionals

Some projects invest in the skills of key people so that they may then take initiatives in development of the industry.

Creating opportunities for Cuban musicians to develop their professional capacities
Havana, February 2004 Establishment of a course on a permanent basis

The Global Alliance, together with the Cuban Higher Institute of the Arts (ISA), has launched a pilot project to train musicians in the fundamental principles of copyright, neighbouring rights and the contractual practices applied both nationally and internationally in the music market.¹⁶⁷

Professional training programme for promoters of the African music industry with the aim of increasing their participation in international markets. Within the framework of the "Africa Fête" festival, held in Dakar in December 2003, the Global Alliance launched a pilot project to provide tailor-made training and on-site support for 12 professionals from the African music industry invited by the Conseil Francophone de la Chanson to attend the MIDEM, the biggest international trade fair for music, in 2004. Trainers experienced in the promotion, communication and commercialization of world music made their expertise available for the professional training programme. The techniques and knowledge acquired thus enabled participating musicians and producers to improve their strategy of involvement in international music industry gatherings and trade fairs. The participants applied their newly gained skills one month later in January 2004 at the MIDEM with the guidance and support of an on-site trainer.¹⁶⁸

Training at cultural goods retail outlets in Cuba: strengthening promotional and marketing techniques. A model for a wide-ranging training course programme created.

Cuban culture represents one of the island's main attractions for the seven million visiting tourists each year. Nevertheless, this market, which has a significant potential for generating foreign exchange, is far from being adequately exploited, mainly owing to a lack of cultural goods retail outlets adapted to the needs and expectations of consumers. To remedy the situation, a partnership between the Santillana Group (a prestigious European business specialized in the distribution of cultural and leisure goods), the Cuban authorities and the main local distribution companies (ARTEX, EGREM, Ediciones Cubanas and Casa de las Américas) helped to realize a professional training and career development programme for cultural retail outlets in order to ensure better organization and management in music, book and

¹⁶⁵ http://www.unctad.org/en/docs//tdxibpd13_en.pdf

¹⁶⁶ <http://www1.worldbank.org/devoutreach/nov03/article.asp?id=221>

¹⁶⁷ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28579&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁶⁸ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28581&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

multimedia stores.

Twenty participants, including managers, salespeople and administrators of key tourist shops in the cities of Habana, Varadero, Trinidad and Miramar in addition to Cuban airports, all benefited from training that focused on improving marketing strategies that target tourists. In concluding the workshop, a meeting between the local and international trainers, the directors of the 4 participating companies, the Director of Cultural Industries of the Ministry of Culture and the UNESCO representatives allowed everyone to reach the first conclusions of this initiative to plan the following steps.

All of the partners agreed on the fact that in the short term, this project will result in cultural goods retail outlets functioning as effective points of contact between Cuban creative artists and both the local and foreign public. In addition, it has potential to integrate a broader strategic plan to develop cultural tourism through the organization of events and festivals, to encourage the export of Cuban music and to promote artistic exchanges and co-productions. Based on this model experience similar workshops are being planned in order to cover a wider number of shops and professionals in the country.¹⁶⁹

c) Development projects

Some of the most interesting projects have been facilitated by UNESCO's Global Alliance for Cultural Diversity.

Musicians' cooperatives: a new model for developing the African music industry.
Implementation of a first cooperative in Burkina Faso launched in November 2004.

Initiated by the International Federation of Musicians (IFM), this project was launched on December 2003 in the Cape (Republic of South Africa) on the occasion of a workshop on the formation of musicians' cooperatives. Organized with the participation of experts from the South African Government's Department of Arts and Culture, the International Labour Organization (ILO), the non-governmental organization International Cooperative Alliance (ICA), the Musicians' Union of South Africa (MUSA) and the British Musicians' Union (BMU), the workshop identified the basic principles of the cooperative concept, stimulating the development of new forms of entrepreneurship which are better adjusted to local structures and offer new professional prospects for African musicians. Following this preparatory work, the Global Alliance and IFM, together with the UNESCO Offices in Bamako, Maputo and Windhoek, support the creation and supervision of the first musicians' cooperatives in Burkina Faso and Namibia to promote the grouping of local musicians, and in particular musicians working mostly in the informal sector, and the pooling of production resources, individually insufficient to ensure the economic viability of a small or medium-sized business but collectively able to constitute a foundation for sustainable activity. At the same time, if the model for musicians' cooperatives turns out to be an effective way of overcoming obstacles in the development of cultural industries in the music branch and helps to formalize and improve the status of musicians, the creation of cooperatives in the rest of the continent will be encouraged with a view to the constitution in the medium term of a pan-African

¹⁶⁹ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=28575&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

network. Consultations of all stakeholders are underway in Namibia. ¹⁷⁰

Music development opportunities for New Zealand's Māoris. Te Māngai Pāho is a Crown Entity established to make funding available to the national network of Māori radio stations and for the production of Māori language television programmes, music CDs and videos. ¹⁷¹

Development of a national strategy for the Jamaican music industry. National strategy approved. Projects under preparation

The Jamaican authorities have been convinced since the 1990s that Jamaican music is not only an effective way of making the national culture known, but also a powerful engine for economic and social growth. Several initiatives have been undertaken by Jamaican agencies and regional and international bodies such as UNCTAD, WIPO and CARICOM to tackle the numerous obstacles, such as the lack of technical equipment and adequately trained human resources and weak enforcement of copyright, that stunt the music industry's growth. However, these efforts have not secured the long-term involvement and trust of the musicians, performers, producers and record labels, so that the accomplishment of the objectives pursued has constantly been hampered by the lack of cooperation and dialogue between the various actors in the sector as well as by private market participants' distrust of public intervention. In this context, the Global Alliance has commissioned a report that has now been published, proposing a national strategy for the music industry that, while building on previous efforts, will adopt a genuinely inclusive approach to public policy decision-making. Based on a thorough review of existing studies on the Jamaican music sector and interviews with relevant stakeholders from the music industry, private and public sectors, banks and government bodies, the report suggests a number of general strategies to be followed and lists further concrete priority areas for immediate action. ¹⁷²

Cuban Music Industry Development and Marketing Plan. A paper in the series *Developing Countries Becoming a Global Player: Opportunities in the Music Industry. Expanding the Economic Potential of Developing Countries: the Music Sector in the Caribbean Region.* World Intellectual Property

Organization/ UNCTAD Unctad/Wipo Joint Project. ¹⁷³

¹⁷⁰ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=25714&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁷¹ <http://www.tmp.govt.nz/index.html>

¹⁷² http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=17176&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁷³ http://www.wipo.int/about-ip/en/studies/pdf/study_a_gray.pdf

Reinforcing the independent popular music industry in Colombia. Division of Arts and Cultural Enterprise The Colombian Government is developing a national strategy aimed at improving the position of the Colombian popular music industry nationally and internationally. The project, based on coordinating the efforts of the main public and private partners in the sector, will help to professionalize and structure the branch, strengthen independent production and distribution and continue the introduction of pioneering anti-piracy policies. ¹⁷⁴

Sustaining and Professionalizing the Festival in the Desert (Mali) Division of Arts and Cultural Enterprise. Partners and funding sought. The Festival now provides solutions to the pressing development needs of northern Mali and is a key event not only for culture but also for the development of cultural tourism and the Malian economy, while simultaneously serving as a factor for peace and security. However, the Festival in the Desert is facing several substantial challenges, which its organizers are finding increasingly difficult to cope with and which call into question the long-term viability of the event and the control of its organization by local communities. Against this backdrop, the Global Alliance and the Forum Francophone des Affaires, in close cooperation with the UNESCO Office in Bamako, are developing a project based on the technique of twinning, calling in professionals from the sector who have considerable experience in the management of world music festivals so as to facilitate the transfer of professional skills. The project thus aims to equip the organizers and partners of the Festival in the Desert with the tools and know-how that will enable the Festival to produce its own resources, and become established as a genuinely viable and dynamic cultural industry. ¹⁷⁵

¹⁷⁴ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=22015&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

¹⁷⁵ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=23272&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

Appendix 5

The Protection and Promotion of Musical Diversity

BIOGRAPHIES OF THE CONSULTANTS

APPENDIX 5

PERSONNEL: BIOGRAPHIES OF CONSULTANTS

PRINCIPAL INVESTIGATOR

Richard Letts

Richard Letts was elected President of the International Music Council in 2005. He is the Executive Director of the Music Council of Australia, which he founded in 1994. He holds a Ph.D. from the University of California at Berkeley and lived for 18 years in the USA where he directed music schools in San Francisco and for the University of Minnesota in Minneapolis. He has been Director of the Music Board of the Australia Council, the national funding body, and of the Australian Music Centre. Earlier he was a pianist and composer. He has undertaken research, has had four books published (two were major reports), founded and edited magazines, written hundreds of articles, reports, policy documents, speeches; he has produced recordings, published scores and books. Recent research includes a project for the International Music Council, *The Effects of Globalisation on Music in Five Contrasting Countries*, and with Hans Hoegh-Guldberg for the Australian Cultural Ministers' Council, *A Scoping Study for a Statistical Framework for the Music Sector*. In 1996 he was awarded Australian Honours by his government for his services to music.

ARAB WORLD CONSULTANTS

Athmane Tadjenant-Trottet (Algeria)

Mr. Athmane Tadjenant-Trottet is a member of the Algerian National Music Council.

Hassan Mégri (Morocco)

Hassan Mégri, song writer and performer, has created a particular musical movement in the 1960s. The musical career of Hassan Mégri was crowned by a performance at the Olympia in 1976, later with the awarding of the "Rabab d'Or" (Gold Rabab) in 2003. He composed music for several Moroccan artists and for all styles. His journeys across the world allowed him to impregnate with several musical cultures which have then influenced its artistic evolution. As founding president of the National Music Committee, he initiated several partnerships with renowned organizations such as the National Festival of Popular Arts and the Bouregreg Association, among others. The National Music Committee awards also other trophies like the "Ziryab of the virtuosos" and "Al Farabi".

ASIAN CONSULTANTS

Santosa Soewarlan (Indonesia)

Graduated from Sekolah Tinggi Seni Indonesia (STSI) Surakarta in 1980, I was assigned as a lecturer there to teach courses in Ethnomusicology program. Also, I supervise students writing academic papers on gamelan and folk music.

I have been teaching gamelan abroad such as in: University of New England, Australia (1988), Northern Illinois University, U.S.A (1998-1990), World of Music (San Francisco, 1989), Southeast Asian Summer Institute (SEASSI), USA (1990), Asian Institute for Language and Music (Manila 1992), University of California

Berkeley (U.S.A. 1994-2001), La Salle-Sia College of Performing Arts (Singapore 2003, 2004). In addition, I have conducted research on: "Pathet In East Java (1985), "The Development of Musical Treatment" (1986), "The Music of Rebab" (1990), "The Social Context of Javanese Musicians" (1991), "The Meaning of Musical Texts" (2003).

I have been active in various meetings such as: the "Managing Cultural Integration in Development Program (MCIDP)" (SPAFA, Bangkok, 2004), "Asian Music Forum" (Manila, 2004), "Consultative Meeting: Between Tradition and Trend" (Bangkok, 2005).

Among my publications are: *Etnomusikology* (1995), "Arts and Technology" (2003), "The Meaning of Musical Texts of Nartasabda (2003), "How to Interpret Music" (2004).

Joyce Teo (Singapore)

Joyce Teo has an MA(Hons) in Ethnomusicology, specializing in gamelan music, from the University of New England, Australia. she is a lecturer with LASALLE-SIA College of the Arts, focusing on the teaching of Ethnomusicology, Arts Education and continuing her research on Southeast Asian music. Joyce was the first qualified gamelan music teacher in Singapore, specialising in Javanese and Sundanese gamelan. Since 1992, she has conducted gamelan courses for schools and various community organizations in Singapore. In 1993, she started the very active LASALLE Gamelan Ensemble. In 2002, she started Gamelan Asmaradana, Singapore's first professional gamelan ensemble and is currently the Artistic Director of the company.

Joyce has been active in the arts in Singapore as an artist, critic and educator. Apart from teaching, performing and composing, she is also a free-lance writer for publications ranging from *The Straits Times* to local and international arts and academic publications. She has also contributed to arts education in Singapore mainly through her association with the National Arts Council's Arts Education Programme. She has composed and directed music for dance and theatre production.

She is volunteer consultant with the Asian Civilisations Museum, advising them on their Gamelan instrument collection and their conservation. She was also a member of the Ministry of Education's Working Committee on Music Education, and is currently involved with the training of music teachers and students in the area of world music, in conjunction with the new school syllabus.

To Ngoc Thanh (Vietnam)

Dr To Ngoc Thanh is Professor, Doctor of Sciences in Ethnomusicology, and President of the Association of Vietnamese Folklorists (AVF). He is a member of the Executive Board of the International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM). His research focuses upon the folk culture and folk music of Vietnam's 53 minority groups. He has many important publications from 1969 onwards including papers on the Thai minority from North-Western Vietnam, the Muong minority, Austroasian ethnic groups in Vietnam, the Bahnar minority Tay - Thai ethnic groups in Vietnam, and ethnic minorities living in Highland - Central Vietnam. He has also written on Vietnam's Court Music.

Zhang Xian (China)

Zhang Xian graduated from the Secondary School attached to the Central Conservatory of Music in 1965, and from the Musicology Department of the Conservatory in 1970. She worked at the Music Research Institute of China Art Research Academy from 1973 to 1975. She has been working with the Editorial

Department of the magazine *People's Music* since 1976, successively as editor, Director of Editorial Department, and Deputy Editor-in-Chief and Editor-in-Chief. In 1993 she was offered the position of Editing Supervisor. She has been Member of the Senior Professional Title Evaluation Committee in CFLAC's Publishing Field since 1996.

For nearly 20 years, she has been the chief person responsible for the *People's Music*. She has edited articles for publication which amount to over 20 million Chinese characters and has written and translated many monographs and treatises.

Since 1998, she has been responsible for CMA's periodicals and foreign affairs. As far as foreign affairs is concerned, she has planned and organized such important international music events as the Besancon International Young Conductors' Competition Preliminary Round in Beijing and the Beijing Golden Autumn International Music Festival.

She is now Deputy Secretary General of the Chinese Musicians' Association (CMA), Secretary General of the Jeunesses Musicales China, Secretary General of the CMA Music Performers' Rights Protection Centre, and Editor-in-Chief of the *People's Music* magazine.

AUSTRALASIAN CONSULTANTS

New Zealand's Ministry for Culture and Heritage (<http://www.mch.govt.nz/>) is an organisation of almost a hundred people and provides advice to the New Zealand government on culture and heritage matters. It assists the government in its provision and management of cultural resources for the benefit of all New Zealanders, and undertakes a number of activities that support and promote the history and heritage of the country. It provides advice and support covering three ministerial portfolios: Arts, Culture and Heritage; Broadcasting; and Sport and Recreation. Other responsibilities include the management and disbursement of payments to a number of arts, heritage, broadcasting and sports sector organisations, and monitoring the government's interests in these organisations; the research, writing and publication of New Zealand history and the administration of grants and provision of advice about New Zealand history; and the research, writing and publication of major reference works including the [Dictionary of New Zealand Biography](#) and [Te Ara: the Encyclopedia of New Zealand](#).

The Ministry is also responsible for the management of national monuments, war graves and historic graves; and the administration of legislation relating to the symbols and emblems of New Zealand sovereignty (including the administration of the [New Zealand Flag](#), [New Zealand National Anthems](#) and the [New Zealand Coat of Arms](#)) and to commemorative days.

Richard Letts (see above)

EUROPEAN CONSULTANTS

Polina Proutskova, coordinator

Ethnomusicologist, software developer and folklore singer. I work on planning and creating a worldwide music heritage database - a single online gateway to all information about (traditional) music recordings stored in music archives worldwide. I also work on my PhD on networking among music archives and the subject of computational ethnomusicology. As a singer I perform with ETO_X playing a mixture

of jazz and drum&bass based on russian ritual folk songs. I do field research in rural Russia and lead Germany's first ensemble for authentic russian folklore.

Born and raised in Saint Petersburg in a Russian Jewish family, I studied mathematics, computational linguistics and bioinformatics and trained in singing and music theory. I developed cloning software for gene research labs, worked on a mathematical description of a new data technology, sang Sephardic, Persian, Armenian, Russian, Georgian, Bulgarian songs.

www.proutskova.de polina@proutskova.de

Team members

Mirjam Gericke, M.A. in Musicology and German Literature.

Masters on *Musical design of national socialist culture of celebration*, PhD Project on the subject of music, identity, interculturality and popular cultures of celebration, working title: "When the music stops you feel the pain..." - sociomusical behaviour in the context of summer carnival events"

Maurice Mengel, M.A. in Musicology, Cultural Anthropology, English in Cologne. Masters on the conditions, possibilities and limits of biography in ethnomusicological research. PhD project on the history of Romanian Ethnomusicology. Maurice Mengel currently works in the music archive of Ethnological Museum in Berlin whose collections include the holdings of Berlin Phonogram Archive.

Deniza Popova studied Music, Musicology Ethnomusicology and Bulgarian philology in Berlin. Masters on Byzantine church music in Bulgaria. PhD project on the concept of authenticity in Bulgarian music discourses focussing on the role of cultural storage systems: archives, libraries, museums, and media. She is an active performer and works as a journalist.

We are members of **Forum440** – a network of academics and artists, challenging theoretical and methodological concepts crossing the borders of academic disciplines. It aims to develop a music media theory, that allows new models of describing the mediative function of music and the implementations of musical or acoustical media (on music) with a strong focus on music as social practice.

LATIN AMERICAN CONSULTANTS

Graciela Agudelo is the author of an extensive catalogue; she has also dedicated herself to music pedagogy and the dissemination of music, through organisational activities, broadcasts, lectures, academic and editorial work, and is also an engaged worker on the international level. Ms Agudelo received commissions from renowned musicians and cultural institutions; her works are being performed in Mexico and abroad.

She was the beneficiary of the Fellowship for Intellectual and Artistic Creators and has been a member of the National Arts Creators System. A number of her projects in the field of music pedagogy, training, education and dissemination were supported by the FONCA (Support Program for Cultural Projects and Joint Investments).

Ms Agudelo was Secretary of the Academic Branch of the UNAM National Music School and Director of the School for initiation to music and dance of a cultural community centre in Mexico City. She has also on occasions been writing, was director of a magazine and founded another one dedicated to children.

Since 1998, Ms Agudelo has been President of the Mexican Music Council and since 2004, Chairman of the Music Council of the Three Americas.

Gabriela Soto Villaseñor has a background in school music education and as physiotherapist for children. Her professional work has focused on arts education but she has always shown a special interest in research into the beneficial effects of arts on the human being.

Ms Soto worked as teacher and academic coordinator at the School for Initiation to Music and Dance of a cultural community centre in Mexico City, where she also developed a multidisciplinary academic project.

She participates regularly in national and international meetings on music education and edited a volume of papers presented at the Pan-American Forum on Music Education in Mexico City, October 2002. As executive producer, she oversees the edition of recordings and offers editorial collaborations on various occasions.

Ms Soto is Vice-President of the Mexican Music Council and General Secretary of the Music Council of the Three Americas. At the same time, she is involved in the implementation of diverse artistic and pedagogic projects.

Leticia Montaña has been committed to music since her early childhood. She first studied piano and flute but eventually started a career as cellist. A fellowship from the National Culture and Arts Council (CONACULTA) allowed her to achieve specialisation in Baroque cello at the Amsterdam Conservatorium. As part of an ensemble, she toured throughout Japan to promote Mexican music. Ms Montaña participated in a number of advanced courses with renowned musicians. She lived and performed in Italy and Spain where she also gave a series of concerts dedicated to the dissemination and interpretation of works from the Latin American colonial Baroque period. She taught chamber music as well as Baroque interpretation style at the National Music Conservatory and the National Arts Centre (Mexico City), as well as in schools in Barcelona and Italy. At present, she lives in her home town where she continues to give recitals, alongside her work as teacher.

SUB-SAHARAN AFRICAN CONSULTANTS

Luc Yatchokeu (Cameroon)

Luc Yatchokeu's first contact with the artistic world dates back to 1982 when he worked as accountant for a cabaret. In light of Yatchokeu's passion for the arts, the owner of the cabaret entrusted him later with the management of the club, which meant the beginning of his career as cultural operator, producing recordings and concerts between 1987 and 1990. The difficulties he encountered in the music sector in Cameroon led him to found an association of music professionals (CIGALE), whose objective was to contribute to the development of the music sector in the fields of training, creation and distribution. In 1998, in response to demands from colleagues in the sub-region, he initiated the REPAC (Grouping of arts and culture professionals in Central Africa). This group's mission was to inscribe culture as vector for economic and human development in Central Africa. Since 2003, REPAC has been organising a performing arts market that became an instrument to promote and accompany performances in the sub-region.

Hugues Gervais Ondaye (Congo (Brazzaville))

Hugues Gervais Ondaye is a cultural operator with a background in economics and international relations. His professional career began in 1982 with the foundation of the Ballet Rouge d'Oyo, which accompanied the socio-political manifestations of the Cuvette Region in his country.

His professional work mainly focuses on the production of performances of Congolese orchestras. Initiator and promoter of "Feux de Brazza", a popular festival of traditional music, he is also the Managing Director of *Gilpha* Production, which is specialised in the production of performances and in artists' management.

In 1998 he was the organiser of the concert for national reconciliation, gathering nine orchestras in the presence of the Head of the DRC.

Besides his busy production agenda, he participated in several important seminars on culture and development and on the fight against piracy of musical works.

In July 2005, he was part of the organising team of the Panafrican Music Festival (FESPAM) where he was in charge of artistic questions and post-production.

Van Niekerk, Caroline (South Africa)

Caroline van Niekerk is full professor at the University of Pretoria, South Africa, and has supervised over 80 postgraduate theses. Her initial studies resulted in a degree in Music and English, a teacher's diploma, licentiates in School Music and in Theory of Music, an M.Mus and then a PhD. She also holds qualifications in fields as diverse as translating, editing, television presentation, leadership and negotiating skills. She returned to the University of Pretoria at the beginning of 1996 from her previous post as Director in the South African national Department of Education. Prior to the five years she spent in national government she lectured at a variety of tertiary institutions.

She has been both President and Secretary-general of PASMAE and Board member of ISME. She was responsible for all the arrangements for the Conference programme for ISME 1998 in Pretoria, and currently chairs ISME's Conferences Standing Committee.